

1 **Climate-driven coral reorganization influences**  
2 **aggressive behaviour in juvenile coral-reef fishes**

3

4 Judith E. Kok<sup>1</sup>, Nicholas A.J. Graham<sup>2</sup> and Mia O. Hoogenboom<sup>1,2</sup>

5 *<sup>1</sup>College of Marine and Environmental Sciences, James Cook University, Townsville, QLD*

6 *4811, Australia*

7 e-mail: judith.kok@gmail.com

8 *<sup>2</sup>ARC Centre of Excellence for Coral Reef Studies, James Cook University, Townsville, QLD*

9 *4811, Australia*

10 *<sup>3</sup>Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster, LA1 4YQ, UK*

11 **Abstract**

12 Globally, habitat degradation is altering the abundance and diversity of species in a variety of ecosystems. This  
13 study aimed to determine how habitat degradation, in terms of changing coral composition under climate change,  
14 affected abundance, species richness and aggressive behaviour of juveniles of three damselfishes (*Pomacentrus*  
15 *moluccensis*, *P. amboinensis* and *Dischistodus perspicillatus*, with decreasing reliance on coral). Patch reefs  
16 were constructed to simulate present-day reefs that are vulnerable to climate-induced coral bleaching versus  
17 reefs with more bleaching-robust coral taxa, thereby simulating the likely future of coral reefs under a warming  
18 climate. Fish communities were allowed to establish naturally on the reefs during the summer recruitment  
19 period. Results showed that climate-robust reefs had lower total species richness of coral-reef fishes than  
20 climate-vulnerable reefs, but total fish abundance was not significantly different between reef types (both across  
21 all species and life-history stages). The nature of aggressive interactions, measured as the number of aggressive  
22 chases, varied according to coral composition: on climate-robust reefs, juveniles used the substratum less often  
23 to avoid aggression from competitors, and interspecific aggression became relatively more frequent than  
24 intraspecific aggression for juveniles of the coral-obligate *P. moluccensis*. This study highlights the importance  
25 of coral composition as a determinant of behaviour and diversity of coral-reef fishes.

26 **Keywords:** *Benthic composition, habitat degradation, intraspecific and interspecific*  
27 *aggression, species richness, community dynamics*

28

## 29 **Introduction**

30           The species composition of communities is changing in a wide variety of ecosystems  
31 worldwide (Dornelas et al. 2014), and many of these changes are likely attributable to habitat  
32 degradation. For example, habitat degradation has caused many endemic species in  
33 biodiversity hotspots to become extinct or threatened with extinction (Brooks et al. 2002).  
34 Habitat degradation can influence organisms directly, for example through impaired  
35 performance under adverse conditions. Alternatively, indirect effects can occur when changes  
36 in the quality and/or quantity of resources result in changes in the intensity of competition and  
37 predation, in the demographic rates of species, like fecundity, or in the behaviour of  
38 individuals (Fahrig 2003; Fischer and Lindenmayer 2007). To date, studies examining habitat  
39 degradation have been largely observational, describing how communities have changed  
40 (Fahrig 2003; Dornelas et al. 2014), while empirical studies examining the mechanisms  
41 responsible for these changes are limited. High-diversity coral-reef ecosystems are  
42 vulnerable to climate change and habitat degradation (Hughes et al. 2003; Wilson et al. 2006;  
43 Graham et al. 2015). Globally, coral cover and structural complexity are declining (Gardner et  
44 al. 2003; Bellwood et al. 2004; Alvarez-Filip et al. 2009), due to a variety of stressors,  
45 including storm dislodgement, declining water quality, and coral bleaching induced by high  
46 seawater temperatures (Bellwood et al. 2004; De'ath et al. 2012). For instance, coral cover in  
47 the Indian Ocean declined on average by 46% following the 1998 global mass-bleaching  
48 event (Hoegh-Guldberg 2004). Coral taxa show clearly defined differential susceptibility to  
49 stressors (Hughes and Connell 1999), like coral bleaching (Marshall and Baird 2000; Loya et  
50 al. 2001) and storm-related mortality (Madin et al. 2014). The frequency and severity of  
51 climate-induced coral bleaching is expected to increase over the coming decades due to  
52 increases in ocean temperatures (Hoegh-Guldberg 1999). As a result, coral communities are  
53 expected to display long-term shifts from currently abundant and bleaching-vulnerable coral

54 taxa to more bleaching-robust taxa (Marshall and Baird 2000; Hughes et al. 2003; Graham et  
55 al. 2014), with associated losses in coral cover and structural complexity.

56         Shifts in coral-species composition are expected to cause associated changes in coral-  
57 reef fish communities, in terms of abundance, diversity and species composition of fishes.  
58 Mechanisms driving the effects of coral-reef degradation on reef-fish communities potentially  
59 include changes in recruitment of juvenile fishes (Feary et al. 2007; Coker et al. 2012a),  
60 emigration of fish from degraded to healthy habitats (Coker et al. 2012b), direct fish mortality  
61 due to habitat degradation, and indirect mortality through increased predation and/or  
62 competition as the availability of suitable or optimal habitat decreases (Pratchett et al. 2008).  
63 Loss of live-coral cover has strong and immediate, yet selective, negative effects on fish that  
64 directly depend on live coral for food and shelter (e.g., reviewed by Wilson et al. 2006;  
65 Pratchett et al. 2008; Pratchett et al. 2011). Loss of structural complexity can also cause  
66 general declines in fish abundance and diversity (reviewed by Pratchett et al. 2008). Many  
67 fishes that do not depend on live-coral cover specifically, still depend on topographic  
68 structural complexity provided by corals, as complexity is thought to moderate the  
69 interactions between individuals (Graham and Nash 2013). However, it is largely unknown  
70 how the changes in coral composition anticipated in the future will affect the abundance and  
71 interactions between coral-reef fishes.

72         Aggressive behaviour is commonly observed in coral-reef fishes (e.g., Myrberg and  
73 Thresher 1974; Bay et al. 2001; McCormick and Weaver 2012) and direct interactions among  
74 individuals, like interference competition and territoriality, are often mediated by aggressive  
75 behaviour (Peiman and Robinson 2010). Coral-reef fish often use aggression to secure  
76 resources (e.g., Myrberg and Thresher 1974; McCormick and Weaver 2012), including food  
77 (Jones 1986), territories (Myrberg and Thresher 1974) and refuge from competitors and  
78 predators (Shulman 1984). For example, juveniles and small fish, which are especially

79 vulnerable to predation, aggressively interact for feeding locations close to the reef, where  
80 both food and refuge from predation are available (McCormick 2009). Aggression can affect  
81 an individual's fitness by influencing resource intake, growth, survival, and reproductive  
82 success (Peiman and Robinson 2010), and the ratio of intraspecific to interspecific aggression  
83 indicates whether the negative effects of aggression primarily influence conspecific or  
84 heterospecific individuals.

85         Loss of structural complexity can potentially increase aggression, by increasing the  
86 frequency with which individuals encounter each other, and/or because there are fewer  
87 resources available, which leads to enhanced aggression to obtain resources (Schoener 1987;  
88 Barley and Coleman 2010). Indeed, a decrease in the availability of refuges led to more  
89 intense aggression in temperate reef fish (Basquill and Grant 1998) and freshwater fish (Baird  
90 et al. 2006; Barley and Coleman 2010). Loss of coral health increased the intensity of intra-  
91 and interspecific aggression in juvenile coral-reef fishes (McCormick 2012), with smaller and  
92 competitively inferior individuals being pushed further from refuges, exposing them to higher  
93 predation-induced mortality (McCormick 2009,2012). Further research is required to assess  
94 whether and how intra- and interspecific aggression is likely to change on future coral reefs  
95 given predicted changes in coral community composition and associated declines in structural  
96 complexity and live-coral cover.

97         In this study, coral composition was manipulated on patch reefs in a coral-reef lagoon  
98 to mimic climate-change impacts, and differences in abundance and diversity, and aggressive  
99 behaviour, of juvenile coral-reef fishes were monitored. Juveniles of three reef-fish 'focal'  
100 species were investigated (*Pomacentrus moluccensis*, *P. amboinensis* and *Dischistodus*  
101 *perspicillatus*, representing species with decreasing order of reliance on live coral).  
102 Specifically, we assessed if differences in coral composition lead to (1) a decrease in total fish  
103 abundance and diversity (pooled across all species and life-history stages), and a decrease in

104 focal juvenile fish abundance, and (2) an increase in the intensity, and changes in the nature  
105 of, aggressive interactions instigated by juvenile coral-reef fish. These results provide insight  
106 into how habitat degradation is likely to affect fish abundance and behaviour.

107

## 108 **Materials and methods**

### 109 **Experimental design and study site**

110 To examine how changes in coral composition under climate change affected  
111 abundance and diversity of coral-reef fishes, and the incidence of aggressive behaviour within  
112 and between juvenile reef-fish species, patch reefs were constructed in October 2013 at Lizard  
113 Island, northern Great Barrier Reef (GBR), Australia (14°41'S, 145°27'E). Sixteen patches  
114 were constructed with two distinct treatments: (1) 'climate-vulnerable' patch reefs (n=8),  
115 which consisted of six coral species that are currently abundant and relatively sensitive to  
116 coral bleaching, and (2) 'climate-robust' patch reefs (n=8), which consisted of six coral species  
117 that have moderate or low susceptibility to coral bleaching, simulating what coral  
118 assemblages may consist of in the future (Table 1). The coral species for these assemblages  
119 were chosen based on their bleaching vulnerability according to recent studies that have  
120 recorded the response of coral taxa and coral community-composition after large-scale natural  
121 bleaching events (Marshall and Baird 2000; Loya et al. 2001; McClanahan et al. 2007). For  
122 the present study, all chosen coral species were also naturally abundant at the study location.

123 Patch reefs were constructed using live corals on a rubble base, on a shallow sand flat  
124 in the lagoon at Lizard Island, in water between 2.5 and 5 m deep. The percentage cover of  
125 live coral was measured using line-intercept transects, in which a transect line was placed  
126 over each patch reef, and subsequent coral cover calculated as the ratio between the length of  
127 the transect covering live coral, compared to the total length of the transect. Structural

128 complexity was defined as the physical three-dimensional structure of the patch reef, and was  
129 expressed as a rugosity index, displaying the ratio between the linear distance covered when  
130 the chain was pulled taught, compared to the distance when the chain was draped over the  
131 contours of the reefs (Graham and Nash 2013), meaning a higher rugosity ratio indicated  
132 higher structural complexity. Because coral composition, coral cover, and structural  
133 complexity co-vary in nature, we did not attempt to separate these three variables in our study.  
134 Hence, manipulating coral composition meant that coral cover and structural complexity were  
135 significantly higher on climate-vulnerable than on climate-robust patch reefs (coral cover,  
136  $\log_{10}(x+1)$ -transformed data: t-Test,  $t_{2,14}=-6.08$ ,  $p<0.0001$ ; structural complexity,  $\log_{10}(x+1)$ -  
137 transformed data: Welch Modified two-sample t-Test,  $t_{2,12.31}=-3.33$ ,  $p<0.01$ ). On average,  
138 coral cover was 53.5% (SE  $\pm 1.46$ ) on climate-vulnerable reefs, compared to 31.3% (SE  $\pm 3.4$ )  
139 on climate-robust reefs. All patch reefs showed moderate structural complexity, but this was  
140 higher (mean 2.04 SE  $\pm 0.05$ ) on climate-vulnerable reefs compared with climate-robust reefs  
141 (mean 1.73 SE  $\pm 0.08$ ). This difference meant there was a substantially lower availability of  
142 refuges for fishes on climate-robust reefs. Treatment was randomly allocated to the patch  
143 reefs. Patch reefs were on average 1.5 m in diameter, and separated by at least 15 m of sand  
144 from other patches and natural reefs. Patches were constructed immediately before the main  
145 part of the fish recruitment season, which takes place on the GBR between November and  
146 January (e.g., Kerrigan 1996). Data for the present study were collected at the end of the main  
147 recruitment season, in January - February 2014. Juveniles living on the patch reefs were  
148 assumed to have naturally recruited during previous months, as juvenile movement between  
149 separated patches of reef tends to be minimal (Doherty 1982; Almany and Webster 2006).

151 **Focal species**

152 Preliminary surveys conducted in early December 2013 indicated that 18-40 fish  
153 species were present on the patch reefs, with a total abundance of 46-213 fish per patch reef.  
154 Focal species for the present study were selected based on their abundance on these reefs, and  
155 also on whether they interacted aggressively, and differed in their dependence on live-coral  
156 habitat. This project focused on aggressive interactions instigated by juveniles, because  
157 aggressive behaviour is common between juveniles (e.g., McCormick 2012), and juveniles  
158 have a critical role in replenishing adult populations. Three focal species were selected: (1)  
159 *Pomacentrus moluccensis*, (2) *Pomacentrus amboinensis* and (3) *Dischistodus perspicillatus*.  
160 *P. moluccensis* is an obligate coral-dweller, *P. amboinensis* is a coral associate and *D.*  
161 *perspicillatus* is a non-coral associate (Randall et al. 1997; Coker et al. 2014). *P. moluccensis*  
162 and *P. amboinensis* are both planktivores that feed in the water column, preferentially settle  
163 onto live, healthy coral (McCormick et al. 2010) and compete for shelter at settlement  
164 (McCormick and Weaver 2012). Within two months after settlement, these two species  
165 occupy distinct microhabitats: *P. moluccensis* occupies live coral at the top of the reef, while  
166 *P. amboinensis* occupies the base of the reef (McCormick and Weaver 2012). *D.*  
167 *perspicillatus* is associated with sand and rubble, feeds on algae and detritus (Randall et al.  
168 1997) and aggressively defends its territory from adult conspecifics and heterospecifics  
169 (Randall et al. 1997; Bay et al. 2001). *P. moluccensis* reaches a maximum adult length of 7.5  
170 cm, *P. amboinensis* 11 cm, and *D. perspicillatus* 20 cm (Randall et al. 1997). Juveniles of *P.*  
171 *amboinensis* on the patch reefs were found to be between 1.5 - 6 cm, *P. moluccensis* 1.5 - 6.5  
172 cm, and *D. perspicillatus* 1.5 - 7 cm (see Electronic Supplementary Material). The few  
173 individuals larger than these size thresholds were assumed to have migrated to the reef  
174 patches from nearby reefs, and were excluded from analysis. Preliminary surveys indicated  
175 that adults of the focal species used the habitat distinctly different from juveniles (see



176 Electronic Supplementary Material), and that aggressive interactions between adults and  
177 juvenile conspecifics were rare.

178

179

### 180 **Initial fish abundance and diversity and focal juvenile abundance through time**

181 To examine how changes in coral composition affected total fish diversity and  
182 abundance, the abundance and size of all fish (all species and life-history stages) was sampled  
183 by visual census on SCUBA on all patches on 28/29 January 2014. Differences in total fish  
184 abundance and diversity between patch reef treatments were analysed using t-tests on  
185  $\log_{10}(x+1)$ -transformed data. To examine changes in abundance through time of focal  
186 juveniles, and whether these changes were consistent between treatments, the abundance and  
187 size of focal species were sampled on each patch reef every 4-5 days for 20 days (at  $t=0$ ,  $t=4$ ,  
188  $t=10$ ,  $t=15$ ,  $t=20$  days). Variation in initial abundance through time for juveniles of the focal  
189 species was tested using a linear mixed effects model, with dependent variable  
190  $\log_{10}(\text{abundance}+1)$ , with reef included as a random factor to account for repeated measures  
191 of reefs, and independent variables time, treatment and species.

192

### 193 **Intensity and nature of aggressive interactions**

194 Video observations were used to examine how changes in coral composition affected  
195 the intensity and nature of aggressive interactions. Go Pro Hero 3 cameras were mounted on a  
196 small concrete block that was positioned approximately 20 cm above the sand and 50 cm  
197 away from patch reefs. The cameras were deployed on the side of the patch where most  
198 juvenile focal species were present. Video observations were made in the morning while fish  
199 were actively feeding. At the beginning of each video, a measuring stick of one meter was

200 placed at several positions on the reefs to serve as a scale bar to enable later estimation of fish  
201 size from the videos, enabling juveniles to be distinguished from adults. Video recording was  
202 continuous for at least 50 minutes per patch and was replicated two times per patch reef, on 7-  
203 8 February 2014, and again on 17-18 February 2014, with video recordings of four reef  
204 patches per treatment per day.

205         During subsequent video analysis, the number and characteristics of aggressive chases  
206 were analysed. Aggressive chases were characterised as rapid movement in the direction of  
207 another fish accompanied by flaring of the fins, and could be easily distinguished from  
208 general swimming activities on the videos. For each video, a random ten minute fragment was  
209 viewed, at least ten minutes into the recording period and 20 minutes from the end, to  
210 minimize effects of diver presence. From each video segment the following variables were  
211 recorded for each aggressive chase: fish species of the chaser and chased fish, and if the  
212 chased fish used the substratum (coral or rubble) to find refuge from or divert the chaser.  
213 Refuges were used by both the chaser and the chased fish during aggressive interactions, but  
214 could also be used to hide from nearby predators. However, because predator-associated  
215 refuge use was rare in our data (it was only observed once), and this was not the direct focus  
216 of this paper, this specific behaviour was excluded from analysis. The nature and intensity of  
217 aggressive interactions of juvenile focal fish on reefs with differing coral composition was  
218 characterised with the following variables: (1) total number of chases instigated by a juvenile  
219 focal species (regardless of species identity of the chased fish), (2) total number of chases  
220 instigated by a juvenile focal species, standardised for total fish abundance (across all species  
221 and life-history stages), (3) intraspecific:interspecific ratio of aggressive chases, (4) use of  
222 substratum (coral or rubble) by a chased juvenile focal species to find refuge from or divert  
223 the chaser.

224 The number of chases was used as a proxy for the intensity of aggression. Where fish  
225 go when they are chasing or being chased has potential implications for mortality, because  
226 fish that do not use the substratum during aggressive chases are potentially more vulnerable to  
227 predation, especially when they are less vigilant while chasing or being chased (Carr et al.  
228 2002). In addition, predation rates tend to be higher on bleached and dead coral (rubble)  
229 compared to live coral, as fish are generally more visible against the pale/white background of  
230 dead coral (Coker et al. 2009). Hence, a loss of live-coral cover, structural complexity and  
231 refuges may indirectly increase predation rates. Reefs where abundance of a focal species was  
232 zero were excluded from analysis of aggressive interactions instigated by that particular  
233 species. Differences between treatments in the total number of chases, and number of chases  
234 standardised by total fish abundance were analysed using two linear mixed effects models,  
235 with dependent variables respectively  $\log_{10}(x+1)$  number of chases and standardised number  
236 of chases, independent variables treatment and species, and reef included as a random effect.  
237 There was quite high variation in the amount of aggressive chases between replicate samples  
238 of each reef. In addition, the intensity of intraspecific compared with interspecific aggression  
239 was expressed as a ratio (intraspecific:interspecific). This ratio and the use of substratum  
240 during aggression on climate-vulnerable and climate-robust reefs were expressed as relative  
241 frequencies and analysed using Pearson's Chi-squared tests on untransformed data.

242

## 243 **Results**

### 244 **Effect of coral composition on fish abundance and richness**

245 Total fish abundance (across all species and life-history stages) was not significantly  
246 different between climate-vulnerable and climate-robust reefs (Fig. 1a) ( $t_{2,14}=-2.07$ ,  $p=0.057$ ).  
247 Similar overall abundances of fishes on the climate-robust versus climate-vulnerable reefs

248 were also related to the fact that some species were equally abundant on both reef types (e.g.,  
249 *P. amboinensis*), some species decreased in abundance on climate-robust reefs (e.g., *Apogon*  
250 *doederleini*) and other species increased in abundance (e.g., *Apogon cyanosoma*). Residual  
251 variation in fish abundance was not correlated with the variation in structural complexity or  
252 coral cover between reefs within treatments. Total fish species richness (across all species and  
253 life-history stages) was significantly higher on climate-vulnerable reefs ( $t_{2,14}=-3.31$ ,  $p<0.01$ ),  
254 which had, on average, 1.6 times more species than climate-robust reefs (Fig. 1b). These  
255 results indicate that reefs with climate-vulnerable coral species, and therefore high coral cover  
256 and high topographic complexity, support more fish species per unit area, but approximately  
257 equivalent (and variable) fish abundances.

258 The abundance of juveniles of all focal species was largely consistent across the  
259 sampling period, regardless of coral composition (i.e., no 'time' effect, Table 2). However,  
260 coral composition had species-specific effects on juvenile fish abundance: *P. moluccensis* was  
261 7.5 times more abundant on climate-vulnerable reefs, while the abundance of *P. amboinensis*  
262 and *D. perspicillatus* were approximately equal between treatments (species\*treatment  
263 interaction, Table 2; Fig. 2).

264

### 265 **Effect of coral composition on aggressive interactions**

266 On climate-vulnerable reefs, the total number of chases instigated by juveniles of the  
267 three focal species was not statistically significant different between climate-vulnerable and  
268 climate-robust reefs (Table 3).. *P. amboinensis* instigated a significantly higher number of  
269 total chases than *P. moluccensis* and *D. perspicillatus* (Fig. 3a; Table 3). When the number of  
270 aggressive chases was standardised for total fish abundance on each patch reef, differences  
271 between treatments were reduced and remained non-significant (Fig. 3b; Table 4).

272 The ratio between intra- and interspecific aggressive chases ('who chases who')  
273 significantly differed among the focal species and coral-composition (Fig. 4). Chases  
274 instigated by juvenile *P. moluccensis* were mainly interspecific, and the proportion of  
275 interspecific chases compared to intraspecific chases was significantly higher on climate-  
276 robust compared with climate-vulnerable reefs ( $\chi^2=5.22$ ,  $df=1$ ,  $p<0.05$ ) (Fig. 4). However, the  
277 intraspecific:interspecific ratio was approximately equal across treatments for *P. amboinensis*  
278 ( $\chi^2=1.56$ ,  $df=1$ ,  $p=0.21$ ) and *D. perspicillatus* ( $\chi^2=0.36$ ,  $df=1$ ,  $p=0.55$ ) (Fig. 4).

279 On climate-robust and climate-vulnerable reefs, there were differences in substratum  
280 use to find refuge from chasers for all three focus species, and the focal species also showed  
281 differential use of the substratum among each other (*P. moluccensis*:  $\chi^2=12.84$ ,  $df=2$ ,  $p<0.01$ ; *P.*  
282 *amboinensis*:  $\chi^2=152.89$ ,  $df=2$ ,  $p<0.0001$ ; *D. perspicillatus*:  $\chi^2=7.97$ ,  $df=2$ ,  $p<0.05$ ) (Fig. 5). The  
283 proportion of chases in which the chased fish sought refuge from aggression in live coral was ~2  
284 – 3 fold higher on climate-vulnerable reefs for all species (Fig. 5). The proportion in which  
285 rubble was used in aggressive chases was higher on climate-robust than on climate-vulnerable  
286 reefs for *P. amboinensis* (Fig. 5), whereas the opposite trend was observed for *D. perspicillatus*.  
287 In contrast, chased *P. moluccensis* were not observed to use rubble on climate-vulnerable reefs,  
288 and only in a very small proportion of the cases on climate-robust reefs (Fig. 5).

289

## 290 Discussion

291 The coral species compositions of climate-vulnerable and climate-robust patch reefs  
292 used in this study reflect a plausible future composition of coral species under ocean warming  
293 scenarios. This is the first study actively manipulating coral composition to mimic climate-  
294 impacts that examines the abundance of, and interactions between, juvenile coral-reef fishes.  
295 Results showed that climate-robust reefs support a lower total species richness of reef fishes

296 compared to climate-vulnerable reefs, but have similar overall abundances, likely because  
297 responses to coral-composition are species-specific. Between coral compositions, there were  
298 differences in the nature of aggressive interactions, in terms of who chases who and where  
299 fish go when they are being chased: the intra:interspecific ratio of aggression was lower for  
300 the obligate coral-dwelling fish (*P. moluccensis*), and juvenile fish used the substratum less  
301 often to avoid aggression from competitors on climate-robust reefs. However, the overall  
302 intensity of aggression did not differ between climate-vulnerable and climate-robust reefs,  
303 congruent with the consistent total fish abundance across both coral compositions.

304 Coral composition expected under climate-change supported lower total species  
305 richness than on present-day reefs. This finding is congruent with other studies that have  
306 found negative effects of habitat degradation on species richness, both in coral-reef fishes (as  
307 reviewed by Pratchett et al. 2011), and in other taxa, including invertebrates (Dean and  
308 Connell 1987), birds (MacArthur and MacArthur 1961; Karr and Roth 1971) and insects  
309 (Lawton 1983). However, total abundance of coral-reef fishes (across all species and life-  
310 history stages) was consistent across coral compositions. Loss of live-coral cover seems to  
311 have selective effects on coral-reef fishes, based on their dependence on live coral for food  
312 and refuges (as reviewed by Wilson et al. 2006; Pratchett et al. 2008; Pratchett et al. 2011).  
313 Hence, the absence of an effect of coral composition (and related lower coral cover and  
314 structural complexity) on total fish abundance may be because some species can increase in  
315 abundance following coral loss while others decrease. However, to resolve the effects of  
316 changing coral composition on the relative abundances of reef fishes in general, future studies  
317 are required that manipulate coral composition and monitor the community composition of  
318 coral-reef fish over a longer time period.

319 Coral composition affected the ratio of intraspecific to interspecific aggression ('who  
320 chases who'). On climate-robust reefs, the relative importance of interspecific interactions was

321 higher than on climate-vulnerable reefs for juveniles of the obligate coral-dweller *P.*  
322 *moluccensis*, while overall aggression was independent of reef type. The high interspecific  
323 aggression on climate-robust reefs instigated by *P. moluccensis* may have been an effect of  
324 the lower abundance of this species on these reefs compared to the climate-vulnerable reefs.  
325 Although it was beyond the scope of this study, the ratio of intraspecific to interspecific  
326 aggression may ultimately have important implications for fish community composition,  
327 because it indicates whether the negative effects of aggressive interactions will tend to  
328 exclude conspecifics or heterospecifics from reef patches. To understand the relative impacts  
329 of intra- versus interspecific aggression on individuals and populations, longer term studies  
330 are required, monitoring recruitment, growth and survival of tagged individuals. Also, future  
331 studies are required to determine whether and how local abundances of particular species and  
332 their competitors mediate the levels of intraspecific and interspecific competition, and how  
333 such patterns depend on resource availability.

334         This is the first study to demonstrate that coral-reef fish use the substratum differently,  
335 in terms of where they go to avoid aggressive interactions under different coral compositions.  
336 On climate-robust reefs, juvenile reef fish seem to partly compensate for a lower availability  
337 of coral by using rubble more frequently than on climate-vulnerable reefs. However, the  
338 number of 'unsheltered' chases was also higher on climate-robust reefs, likely as a result of the  
339 lower structural complexity on these reefs. On future reefs, this lower frequency of shelter-use  
340 could lead to higher predation-related mortality rates. Small-bodied fishes, like the juveniles  
341 examined in this study, are highly susceptible to predation, and often depend on specific  
342 microhabitats to evade predators (Hixon and Beets 1993; Beukers and Jones 1997), making  
343 them especially vulnerable to habitat degradation and changes in coral composition. Although  
344 no changes in fish abundance were observed over time during the course of this study, the  
345 limited availability of refuges on climate-robust reefs may result in higher predation mortality

346 in the longer term compared to reefs with present-day coral composition (Beukers and Jones  
347 1997; Almany 2004b; Graham et al. 2007), in particular, if fish are less vigilant to predators  
348 while chasing or being chased (Carr et al. 2002).

349         Contrary to expectations, the overall intensity of aggressive interactions was  
350 approximately equal on climate-vulnerable and climate-robust reefs.. This indicates that  
351 aggression may be more strongly related to fish abundance compared with coral composition  
352 and other habitat limitations. To date, no studies have examined the effect of coral  
353 composition on aggression dynamics in fishes, but some studies have been conducted on the  
354 effect of declining habitat complexity (Basquill and Grant 1998; Baird et al. 2006; Barley and  
355 Coleman 2010) and coral health (McCormick 2012) on aggression. In contrast to our results,  
356 declining habitat complexity has been associated with an increase in the rate of aggression  
357 (Basquill and Grant 1998; Baird et al. 2006), the total time spent interacting with competitors  
358 and chasing competitors (Baird et al. 2006; Barley and Coleman 2010), number of bites  
359 directed at subordinate fish (Barley and Coleman 2010) and monopolization of food (Basquill  
360 and Grant 1998) for temperate reef fish and freshwater fish. Also, as coral health declined, the  
361 intensity of aggression of a coral-reef fish toward a competing species increased (McCormick  
362 2012). The abundance of fish on the patch reefs used in this study was much higher than  
363 observed in previous studies on (artificial) temperate reefs (Basquill and Grant 1998), on  
364 small patch coral-reefs (McCormick 2012) and in freshwater systems (Baird et al. 2006;  
365 Barley and Coleman 2010), where sometimes only two individuals per trial were used. As the  
366 costs of aggression are known to outweigh the benefits when abundance of competitors is  
367 high (Grant 1993), the absence of an effect of coral composition and subsequent differences in  
368 habitat complexity on the intensity of aggression in the present study might be driven by the  
369 relatively high abundance of fish across treatments.



370           While this study increases our understanding of behavioural interactions between  
371 individuals in coral-reef fishes under climate-induced changes in coral composition, the study  
372 also has several limitations. First, unambiguously assigning causality in this study is  
373 complicated: coral composition, coral cover and habitat complexity all varied between  
374 climate-vulnerable and climate-robust reefs. This was a deliberate choice of the study design,  
375 as these variables are confounded in nature. Quantifying the relative importance of  
376 complexity versus coral composition on reef fish competition would require further studies  
377 using an experimental set up of coral reefs with the same complexity but different coral  
378 species composition. Second, there was quite high variation (error bars 12-48% of the mean  
379 number of chases) in the total number of aggressive interactions between reefs within  
380 treatments. Video analysis was used in this study because aggressive interactions are  
381 numerous on these reefs and occur too quickly to be observed accurately on SCUBA. More  
382 frequent sampling would help to resolve the drivers of changes in fish behaviour as coral  
383 community composition changes. Third, aggressive interactions among individuals can have  
384 important effects on outcomes other than abundance, as has for example been shown for  
385 feeding rates, growth rates, weight and body condition (Jones 1987; Höjesjö et al. 2004;  
386 McCormick and Lönnstedt 2013). As body size and fecundity are closely related in most  
387 coral-reef fishes (Kuwamura et al. 1994; Hobbs and Munday 2004), longer term studies  
388 monitoring growth and adult fecundity will be useful to determine longer-term effects of  
389 aggressive behaviour on vulnerable and robust reefs on community composition of reef fishes.  
390 Fourth, the presence and abundance of adult fishes can have major effects on the recruitment,  
391 behaviour and abundance of fishes (Almany 2004a,b; Lecchini et al. 2005). Hence, future  
392 studies examining the effect of coral composition under climate-change on recruitment,  
393 priority effects and post-recruitment survival and behaviour will give a more comprehensive  
394 understanding of how habitat change affects coral-reef fishes.

395 This study highlights the importance of coral composition for coral-reef fishes in terms  
396 of species richness and interactions between fishes. This is the first study to show that  
397 specific differences in coral composition that are independent of coral health, and are  
398 mimicking present-day coral composition and coral composition predicted under climate  
399 change, are linked to species-specific differences in the ratio of intra:interspecific aggression,  
400 and where fishes go in the substratum when they are being chased. Predictions of how  
401 community composition of reef fishes will change as a result of climate change depends on  
402 understanding what mechanisms are driving the effects of climate-induced changes in coral  
403 composition on reef fish communities. To contribute to addressing this knowledge gap, the  
404 present study has shown that changes in coral composition affected the nature and intensity of  
405 aggression in juvenile reef fishes.

406

407 **Acknowledgements:** We thank Tessa Hempson, Aaron MacNeil, and Karen Chong-Seng for assistance with  
408 building the patch reefs, and for census data of fish on the patch reefs collected in early December 2013 and late  
409 January 2014. The authors also thank Grace Frank, Alex Vail, Kirsty Nash and staff of Lizard Island Research  
410 Station for assistance during fieldwork, and two anonymous reviewers whose comments helped to clarify the  
411 interpretation of our results. Funding for this project was provided by the Australian Research Council and James  
412 Cook University.

## 413 **References**

- 414 Almany GR (2004a) Differential effects of habitat complexity, predators and competitors on abundance of  
415 juvenile and adult coral reef fishes. *Oecologia* 141:105-113
- 416 Almany GR (2004b) Does increased habitat complexity reduce predation and competition in coral reef fish  
417 assemblages? *Oikos* 106:275-284
- 418 Almany GR, Webster MS (2006) The predation gauntlet: early post-settlement mortality in reef fishes. *Coral*  
419 *Reefs* 25:19-22
- 420 Alvarez-Filip L, Dulvy NK, Gill JA, Côté IM, Watkinson AR (2009) Flattening of Caribbean coral reefs: region-  
421 wide declines in architectural complexity. *Proc R Soc Lond B Biol Sci* 276:3019-3025
- 422 Baird HP, Patullo BW, Macmillan DL (2006) Reducing aggression between freshwater crayfish (*Cherax*  
423  *destructor* Clark: Decapoda, Parastacidae) by increasing habitat complexity. *Aquac Res* 37:1419-1428
- 424 Barley AJ, Coleman RM (2010) Habitat structure directly affects aggression in convict cichlids *Archocentrus*  
425 *nigrofasciatus*. *Zool* 56:52-56
- 426 Basquill SP, Grant JWA (1998) An increase in habitat complexity reduces aggression and monopolization of  
427 food by zebra fish (*Danio rerio*). *Can J Zool* 76:770-772

428 Bay L, Jones GP, McCormick MI (2001) Habitat selection and aggression as determinants of spatial segregation  
429 among damselfish on a coral reef. *Coral Reefs* 20:289-298

430 Bellwood DR, Hughes TP, Folke C, Nyström M (2004) Confronting the coral reef crisis. *Nature* 429:827-833

431 Beukers JS, Jones GP (1997) Habitat complexity modifies the impact of piscivores on a coral reef fish  
432 population. *Oecologia* 114:50-59

433 Brooks TM, Mittermeier RA, Mittermeier CG, Da Fonseca GAB, Rylands AB, Konstant WR, Flick P, Pilgrim J,  
434 Oldfield S, Magin G (2002) Habitat loss and extinction in the hotspots of biodiversity. *Conserv Biol*  
435 16:909-923

436 Carr MH, Anderson TW, Hixon MA (2002) Biodiversity, population regulation, and the stability of coral-reef  
437 fish communities. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 99:11241-11245

438 Coates D (1980) Prey-size intake in humbug damselfish, *Dascyllus aruanus* (Pisces, Pomacentridae) living  
439 within social groups. *J Anim Ecol* 49:335-340

440 Coker DJ, Pratchett MS, Munday PL (2009) Does body colouration influence predation risk of coral dwelling  
441 reef fish in bleached landscapes? *Proc 11th ICRS*

442 Coker DJ, Graham NAJ, Pratchett MS (2012a) Interactive effects of live coral and structural complexity on the  
443 recruitment of reef fishes. *Coral Reefs* 31:919-927

444 Coker DJ, Pratchett MS, Munday PL (2012b) Influence of coral bleaching, coral mortality and conspecific  
445 aggression on movement and distribution of coral-dwelling fish. *J Exp Mar Biol Ecol* 414:62-68

446 Coker DJ, Wilson SK, Pratchett MS (2014) Importance of live coral habitat for reef fishes. *Rev Fish Biol Fish*  
447 24:89-126

448 De'ath G, Fabricius KE, Sweatman H, Puotinen M (2012) The 27-year decline of coral cover on the Great  
449 Barrier Reef and its causes. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 109:17995-17999

450 Dean RL, Connell JH (1987) Marine invertebrates in an algal succession. III. Mechanisms linking habitat  
451 complexity with diversity. *J Exp Mar Biol Ecol* 109:249-273

452 Doherty PJ (1982) Some effects of density on the juveniles of two species of tropical, territorial damselfish. *J*  
453 *Exp Mar Biol Ecol* 65:249-261

454 Dornelas M, Gotelli NJ, McGill B, Shimadzu H, Moyes F, Sievers C, Magurran AE (2014) Assemblage time  
455 series reveal biodiversity change but not systematic loss. *Science* 344:296-299

456 Fahrig L (2003) Effects of habitat fragmentation on biodiversity. *Ann Rev Ecol Evol Syst* 34:487-515

457 Feary DA, Almany GR, McCormick MI, Jones GP (2007) Habitat choice, recruitment and the response of coral  
458 reef fishes to coral degradation. *Oecologia* 153:727-737

459 Fischer J, Lindenmayer DB (2007) Landscape modification and habitat fragmentation: a synthesis. *Global Ecol*  
460 *Biogeogr* 16:265-280

461 Gardner TA, Côté IM, Gill JA, Grant A, Watkinson AR (2003) Long-term region-wide declines in Caribbean  
462 corals. *Science* 301:958-960

463 Grabowski JH (2004) Habitat complexity disrupts predator-prey interactions but not the trophic cascade on  
464 oyster reefs. *Ecology* 85:995-1004

465 Graham NAJ, Nash KL (2013) The importance of structural complexity in coral reef ecosystems. *Coral Reefs*  
466 32:315-326

467 Graham NAJ, Cinner JE, Norström AV, Nyström M (2014) Coral reefs as novel ecosystems: embracing new  
468 futures. *Curr Opin Env Sustainability* 7:9-14

469 Graham NAJ, Jennings S, MacNeil MA, Mouillot D, Wilson SK (2015) Predicting climate-driven regime shifts  
470 versus rebound potential in coral reefs. *Nature* 518:94-97

471 Graham NAJ, Wilson SK, Jennings S, Polunin NVC, Robinson J, Bijoux JP, Daw TM (2007) Lag effects in the  
472 impacts of mass coral bleaching on coral reef fish, fisheries, and ecosystems. *Conserv Biol* 21:1291-  
473 1300

474 Grant JWA (1993) Whether or not to defend? The influence of resource distribution. *Mar Freshw Behav Physiol*  
475 23:137-153

476 Hixon MA, Beets JP (1993) Predation, prey refuges, and the structure of coral-reef fish assemblages. *Ecol*  
477 *Monogr* 63:77-101

478 Hobbs J-PA, Munday PL (2004) Intraspecific competition controls spatial distribution and social organisation of  
479 the coral-dwelling goby *Gobiodon histrio*. *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 278:253-259

480 Hoegh-Guldberg O (1999) Climate change, coral bleaching and the future of the world's coral reefs. *Mar Freshw*  
481 *Res* 50:839-866

482 Hoegh-Guldberg O (2004) Coral reefs in a century of rapid environmental change. *Symbiosis* 37:1-31

483 Höjesjö J, Johnsson J, Bohlin T (2004) Habitat complexity reduces the growth of aggressive and dominant  
484 brown trout (*Salmo trutta*) relative to subordinates. *Beh Ecol Sociobiol* 56:286-289

485 Hughes TP, Connell JH (1999) Multiple stressors on coral reefs: A long-term perspective. *Limnol Oceanogr*  
486 44:932-940

487 Hughes TP, Baird AH, Bellwood DR, Card M, Connolly SR, Folke C, Grosberg R, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Jackson  
488 J, Kleypas J (2003) Climate change, human impacts, and the resilience of coral reefs. *Science* 301:929-  
489 933

490 Jones GP (1986) Food availability affects growth in a coral reef fish. *Oecologia* 70:136-139

491 Jones GP (1987) Competitive interactions among adults and juveniles in a coral reef fish. *Ecology* 68:1534-1547

492 Karr JR, Roth RR (1971) Vegetation structure and avian diversity in several New World areas. *Am Nat* 105:423-  
493 435

494 Kerrigan BA (1996) Temporal patterns in the size and condition of settlement in two tropical reef fishes  
495 (Pomacentridae: *Pomacentrus amboinensis* and *P. nagasakiensis*). *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 135:27-41

496 Kuwamura T, Yogo Y, Nakashima Y (1994) Population-dynamics of goby *Paragobiodon Echinocephalus* and  
497 host coral *Stylophora pistillata*. *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 103:17-23

498 Lawton JH (1983) Plant architecture and the diversity of phytophagous insects. *Ann Rev Entomology* 28:23-39

499 Lecchini D, Shima J, Banaigs B, Galzin R (2005) Larval sensory abilities and mechanisms of habitat selection of  
500 a coral reef fish during settlement. *Oecologia* 143:326-334

501 Loya Y, Sakai K, Yamazato K, Nakano Y, Sambali H, van Woesik R (2001) Coral bleaching: the winners and  
502 the losers. *Ecol Lett* 4:122-131

503 MacArthur RH, MacArthur JW (1961) On bird species diversity. *Ecology* 42:594-598

504 Madin JS, Baird AH, Dornelas M, Connolly SR (2014) Mechanical vulnerability explains size-dependent  
505 mortality of reef corals. *Ecol Lett*

506 Marshall PA, Baird AH (2000) Bleaching of corals on the Great Barrier Reef: differential susceptibilities among  
507 taxa. *Coral Reefs* 19:155-163

508 McClanahan TR, Ateweberhan M, Graham NAJ, Wilson SK, Sebastián CR, Guillaume MMM, Bruggemann JH  
509 (2007) Western Indian Ocean coral communities: bleaching responses and susceptibility to extinction.  
510 *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 337:1-13

511 McCormick MI (2009) Behaviourally mediated phenotypic selection in a disturbed coral reef environment. *PLoS*  
512 *One* 4:e7096

513 McCormick MI (2012) Lethal effects of habitat degradation on fishes through changing competitive advantage.  
514 *Proc R Soc Lond B Biol Sci* 279:3899-3904

515 McCormick MI, Weaver CJ (2012) It pays to be pushy: intracohort interference competition between two reef  
516 fishes. *PloS One* 7:e42590

517 McCormick MI, Lönnstedt OM (2013) Degrading habitats and the effect of topographic complexity on risk  
518 assessment. *Ecol Evol* 3:4221-4229

519 McCormick MI, Moore JAY, Munday PL (2010) Influence of habitat degradation on fish replenishment. *Coral*  
520 *Reefs* 29:537-546

521 Myrberg AA, Thresher RE (1974) Interspecific aggression and its relevance to the concept of territoriality in reef  
522 fishes. *American Zoologist* 14:81-96

523 Peiman KS, Robinson BW (2010) Ecology and evolution of resource-related heterospecific aggression. *The Q*  
524 *Rev Biol* 85:133-158

525 Pratchett MS, Hoey AS, Wilson SK, Messmer V, Graham NAJ (2011) Changes in biodiversity and functioning  
526 of reef fish assemblages following coral bleaching and coral loss. *Diversity* 3:424-452

527 Pratchett MS, Munday P, Wilson SK, Graham NAJ, Cinner JE, Bellwood DR, Jones GP, Polunin NVC,  
528 McClanahan TR (2008) Effects of climate-induced coral bleaching on coral-reef fishes. *Oceanogr Mar*  
529 *Biol Annu Rev* 46:251-296

530 Randall JE, Allen GR, Steene RC (1997) *Fishes of the Great Barrier Reef and Coral Sea*. University of Hawaii  
531 Press, Bathurst

532 Robinson SK, Thompson III FR, Donovan TM, Whitehead DR, Faaborg J (1995) Regional forest fragmentation  
533 and the nesting success of migratory birds. *Science* 267:1987-1990

534 Schoener TW (1987) Time budgets and territory size: some simultaneous optimization models for energy  
535 maximizers. *Am Zool* 27:259-291

536 Shulman MJ (1984) Resource limitation and recruitment patterns in a coral reef fish assemblage. *J Exp Mar Biol*  
537 *Ecol* 74:85-109

538 Veron JEN, Stafford-Smith M (2000) *Corals of the World*. Volumes 1-3. Australian Institute of Marine Science,  
539 Townsville

540 Webster MS, Hixon MA (2000) Mechanisms and individual consequences of intraspecific competition in a  
541 coral-reef fish. *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 196:187-194

542 Wilson SK, Graham NAJ, Pratchett MS, Jones GP, Polunin NVC (2006) Multiple disturbances and the global  
543 degradation of coral reefs: are reef fishes at risk or resilient? *Glob Change Biol* 12:2220-2234

544

## 545 **Figure legends**

546 **Fig. 1 (a)** Total fish abundance, across all species and life-history stages, expressed as average number of fish  
547 per patch reef, and **(b)** species richness, pooled across all fish species and life-history stages, expressed as  
548 average number of fish species per patch reef, both including all species of reef-fish and life-history stages, on  
549 climate-vulnerable and climate-robust reef patches. \* indicates a significant difference between treatments at  
550  $p=0.05$  or lower; error bars indicate standard errors.

551 **Fig. 2** Average abundance of juvenile *Pomacentrus moluccensis*, *P. amboinensis* and *Dischistodus perspicillatus*  
552 on climate-robust and climate-vulnerable reefs. Values are the number of juvenile focal species per patch reef. \*  
553 indicates a significant difference between treatments at  $p=0.05$  or lower.

554 **Fig. 3 (a)** Average total number of chases, and **(b)** average number of chases standardised for total fish  
555 abundance, instigated by a juvenile focal species, on climate-robust and climate-vulnerable reefs. Values indicate  
556 number of aggressive chases per ten minute video fragment per patch reef.

557 **Fig. 4** Relative frequency of intraspecific and interspecific aggressive chases instigated by juveniles of the three  
558 focal species, on climate-robust and climate-vulnerable reefs. \* indicates a significant difference between  
559 treatments for that particular species at  $p=0.05$ .

560 **Fig. 5** Relative frequency with which chased individuals of the focal species use the substratum to seek refuge  
561 from, or divert juvenile focal chasers on climate-robust and climate-vulnerable reefs. \* indicates a significant  
562 difference between treatments for that particular species at  $p=0.05$  or lower.