

# Petrology and geochemistry of annually laminated stalagmites from an Alpine cave (Obir, Austria): seasonal cave physiology

IAN J. FAIRCHILD<sup>1</sup> CHRISTOPH SPÖTL<sup>2</sup>, SILVIA FRISIA<sup>3</sup>, ANDREA BORSATO<sup>4</sup>, JEAN SUSINI<sup>5</sup>, PETER M. WYNN<sup>6</sup>, JEAN CAUZID<sup>5,7</sup> AND EIMF<sup>8</sup>

<sup>1</sup>*School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham, Edgbaston, Birmingham B15 2TT, UK (corresponding author, e-mail: i.j.fairchild@bham.ac.uk)*

<sup>2</sup>*Institut für Geologie und Paläontologie, Leopold-Franzens-Universität Innsbruck, Innrain 52, 6020 Innsbruck, Austria*

<sup>3</sup>*School of Environmental and Life Sciences, University of Newcastle, Callaghan, New South Wales, Australia*

<sup>4</sup>*Museo Tridentino di Scienze Naturali, Via Calepina 14, Trento 38100, Italy*

<sup>5</sup>*European Synchrotron Radiation Facility, F-38043 Grenoble Cedex, France*

<sup>6</sup>*Department of Geography, University of Lancaster, Lancaster, LA1 4YQ, UK*

<sup>7</sup>*G2R, Université Henri Poincaré, 54506 Vandœuvre-lès-Nancy, France*

<sup>8</sup>*Edinburgh Ion Microprobe Facility, Institute of Earth Science, School of Geosciences, University of Edinburgh EH9 3JW, UK*

Abbreviated title: Annually laminated stalagmites, Austria

**Abstract:** Calcite stalagmites from Obir, an Alpine (1100 m altitude), perennially wet cave, were studied using optical and electron backscatter diffraction petrology, bulk ICP-MS analysis, and microanalysis by ion microprobe and micro-X-ray fluorescence using synchrotron radiation. Drip water penetrates 70 m through Triassic limestones (with some Pb-Zn mineralization) to the chamber Säulenhalle where the stalagmites were collected and with which we compared drip water compositions. However, the cave is also characterized by strong seasonal ventilation, leading to low PCO<sub>2</sub> in winter. All samples display autumnal event lamination defined by a narrow, optically visible zone with trace element enrichments, within which synchrotron studies have resolved micron-scale enrichments of Pb and Zn. Crystallite-scale (10 µm) lateral trace element variations reflect alternate smooth faces and rough crystal edges, induced by high Zn content. Seasonal falls in sulphate S and increase in δ<sup>13</sup>C can be associated with the winter ventilation. The elemental covariations support the transport of Pb, Zn, P, F, Br and I by organic colloids, but final depositions from aerosols rather than dripwater should be considered. The chemical variations are powerful expressions of seasonal cave physiology, but the study points to important gaps in our understanding of colloidal element transport in ventilated caves.

(end of abstract)

The current surge of interest in speleothems as recorders of environmental change (McDermott 2004; Fairchild et al. 2006a) has mostly focused on multi-millennial stable isotope time series with typically scant description of speleothem petrology. Nevertheless, it is known that certain disequilibrium speleothem fabrics are associated with non-equilibrium geochemistry (Frisia et al. 2000) and more generally that there are wide variations in the trace element composition of speleothems (Roberts et al. 1998, Borsato et al. 2007). In this article, we focus on the distinctive petrography and geochemistry of stalagmites from Obir cave in Austria as an exemplar both of the wealth of information preserved in speleothems and also the issues arising in chemical palaeoenvironmental proxies. The cave system has a strongly developed circulation system, which together with its hydrology, can be referred to as its physiology. We examine how this physiology impacts on the formation of stalagmites.

Spötl et al. (2005) described the distinctive pattern of seasonal variation of air circulation at Obir based on three years monitoring. The result was the formulation of a new model for δ<sup>13</sup>C

52 variations in which: a) enhanced winter circulation leads to low  $\text{PCO}_2$ , b) dripwaters develop high  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
53 values by degassing isotopically light  $\text{CO}_2$  and c) supersaturations for calcite are increased. The  
54 expectation would be that, during the winter, stalagmites should grow faster and display high  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
55 values.

56 The first stalagmite publication on Obir is by Smith et al. (2009), who use  $^{14}\text{C}$  evidence to  
57 demonstrate that laminae in stalagmite Obi84 from the chamber Säulenhalle were annual, and that the  
58 laminae in this and two other similar stalagmites (Obi12 and Obi55) coincided with depletions in Sr  
59 and enrichments in several other trace elements. These patterns were used to test a new statistical  
60 model to determine speleothem growth rate from high-resolution chemical analyses. In this paper we  
61 show that annual chemical signals of ventilation ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and S) can be identified, but question the  
62 assumption of our previous study (Smith et al., 2009) that annual enrichments in trace elements such as  
63 Pb, Zn and P, can be attributed to drip water transport, as in the model set up at Grotta di Ernesto, NE  
64 Italy (Borsato et al. 2007). Although the Ernesto site has similarities in terms of altitude (1100 m),  
65 forested setting, presence of laminated stalagmites, and preservation of S pollution history (Frisia et al.  
66 2000, 2003, 2005; Fairchild et al. 2001; Huang et al. 2001; Borsato et al. 2007; Wynn et al. submitted),  
67 the deeper Obir site displays several differences. Specifically Obir displays neither the significant  
68 increases in dripwater flows during the autumn and nor the correlation between growth rate and  
69 temperature that are characteristic of Ernesto. The relationship between chemistry of Obir stalagmites  
70 and instrumental climate records generally are not simple and hence we do not discuss climatic  
71 inferences in detail in this paper. The focus instead is on demonstrating the remarkable annually-  
72 varying physicochemical properties of the stalagmites as shown by a series of state-of-the-art analytical  
73 techniques.

74

## 75 **Methods**

76

77 Thin sections for petrography and ion microprobe analysis for stalagmite samples Obi12, 55 and 84  
78 were polished and c. 150  $\mu\text{m}$  thick. Lamina thickness measurement was carried out on a polarizing  
79 microscope using a graticule in which the smallest division was 5  $\mu\text{m}$ , making frequent use of  
80 photomosaics, and varying the optical conditions to optimize lamina visibility. In Obi84, the thickness  
81 of the last 140 laminae was measured in at least three traverses and the mean value determined.

82 A representative piece of the top cm of sample Obi84 sample was ground into a powder in a  
83 pestle and mortar and analysed using a Siemens D5000 diffractometer in transmission geometry. Data  
84 were collected in  $0.02^\circ$  steps with a counting time of 11 s/step over the range  $2\theta$   $10^\circ$  to  $80^\circ$ . A Rietveld  
85 refinement was carried out in GSAS (Larson and Von Dreele 2000).

86 The EBSD analyses were acquired using the HKL Channel5 EBSD analysis system on the  
87 Philips XL30CP SEM in the School of GeoSciences, University of Edinburgh. The SEM was operated  
88 at an accelerating voltage of 20kV and a  $\sim 2\text{nA}$  beam at a working distance of 20 mm and a tilt angle of  
89  $\sim 70^\circ$ . The sample was given a final colloidal silica polish to remove surface crystal damage after  
90 mechanical polishing and the sample was used uncoated with the SEM operating at a controlled  
91 pressure of 0.1 mBar to minimise any charging effects. For each point the diffraction pattern was  
92 collected and solved by the software for the calcite crystal structure to within  $<1^\circ$ . Maps for the  
93 orientation of the crystal structure of the sample were generated from point analyses collected every  
94  $1\mu\text{m}$  over a  $2\times 2$  grid of maps each approximately 500  $\mu\text{m}$  wide and which were subsequently tiled  
95 together to form the final map. The whole map was then processed to highlight any variation in  
96 orientation of the crystal structure within the sample.

97 Samples for stable oxygen and carbon isotope analysis were micromilled at 100  $\mu\text{m}$  intervals  
98 for all three stalagmites (using methods as in Spötl & Matthey 2006). Measurements were performed  
99 using an on-line, automated carbonate preparation system linked to a triple collector gas source isotope  
100 ratio mass spectrometer at Innsbruck University. Values are reported relative to VPDB standard. Long-  
101 term precision of the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values, estimated as the  $1\sigma$ -standard deviation, is 0.06 and 0.08%,  
102 respectively (Spötl & Vennemann, 2003). Methods for water analyses are given in Spötl et al. (2005).

103 ICP-MS analysis was conducted at the NERC ICP-MS facility at Kingston University UK, on  
104 drilled sub-samples from stalagmites and as a re-analysis, following acidification, of some drip waters  
105 up to three years after collection. An Agilent single-collector instrument was used, supplemented by a  
106 high mass-resolution Axiom instrument for S and P analysis of dissolved speleothem powders, as  
107 reported in Frisia et al. (2005). Both solutions from speleothem powders (50 mg in 100 mls solution)  
108 and acidified waters were analyzed in a matrix of 2% Aristar-grade HNO<sub>3</sub>. Standardization procedures  
109 are as reported in Borsato et al. (2007) and all reported results are well above calculated detection  
110 limits with analytical precision of ≤5%.

111 Ion microprobe analysis at the Edinburgh Ion Microprobe Facility (EIMF) was carried out under  
112 a variety of experimental conditions using polished gold-coated samples. One sub-set of analytical  
113 work was summarized by Smith et al. (2009), with more examples being given here. This used similar  
114 methods to those of Fairchild et al. (2001) and Borsato et al. (2007), using a Cameca ims-4f instrument,  
115 with a primary 20 nA beam of diameter c. 30 μm. Each of the three stalagmite samples was bombarded  
116 with a primary O<sup>-</sup> beam leading to sputtering of secondary ions of <sup>1</sup>H<sup>+</sup>, <sup>23</sup>Na<sup>+</sup>, <sup>26</sup>Mg<sup>+</sup>, <sup>31</sup>P<sup>+</sup>, <sup>44</sup>Ca<sup>+</sup>, <sup>88</sup>Sr<sup>+</sup>  
117 and <sup>138</sup>Ba<sup>+</sup> which were measured. The step scan mode was used to analyse the sample at approximate 5  
118 μm intervals, with ions being drawn from an area with an approximate diameter of 8 μm.  
119 Measurements were taken along linear traverses at 5 or 10 μm intervals. Precision of results for most  
120 elements is typically 1-5% (but worse for H and Na whose analyses are regarded as semi-quantitative  
121 because of variable surface effects); Mg, Sr and Ba were referred to a carbonate standard (Oka) and  
122 other elements to an apatite standard (Durango) with agreement within 10% of mean bulk analyses as  
123 determined by Borsato et al. (2007).

124 Sample Obi84 was also analysed on the Cameca ims-1270 instrument at the EIMF under three  
125 different experimental conditions using a primary Cs<sup>+</sup> beam to generate negative secondary ions.  
126 Precise analysis of <sup>13</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C ratios was carried out in two sessions in February and May 2005. The  
127 primary beam current was 30 nA (February) or 40-45 nA (May), and a 50-60 μm image field, to yield  
128 an elliptical analytical spot. The area of gold removed is typically 35 by 30 μm, but SEM analysis of  
129 February pits showed a pit 13-20 by 20 μm with a narrow core about 6 by 6 μm. Secondary carbon  
130 ions of masses 13 and 12 were simultaneously collected using two Faraday cups. High transmission  
131 and a high beam current was necessary to obtain sufficient counts (≥1.5\*10<sup>6</sup> cps on <sup>13</sup>C). Charge  
132 neutralization was achieved using a normal incidence electron gun. Each analysis consisted of 20  
133 blocks of 5 seconds measurement time following a period of pre-sputtering. Analysis of a group of 20-  
134 50 sample points alternated with blocks of 10 analyses of standard UWC (University of Wisconsin  
135 calcite, which has a composition of -2.14 ‰<sub>VSMOW</sub> determined by multiple bulk analyses by J.W.  
136 Valley). Analytical points were spaced at 30-60 μm to avoid surface charging effects and their X-Y  
137 coordinates were recorded automatically. The 1-sigma precision on 10 successive spots on the UWC  
138 standard was normally <0.6 per mil. For S and P analysis in May 2005, a primary beam current of 4.5  
139 nA were used with Köhler illumination to generate an analytical spot around 20-25 μm in size. The  
140 instrument was used in line scan mode (10 or 15 μm step) with a pre-sputter reduced to 10 seconds.  
141 Ratios of the secondary ions of <sup>31</sup>P and <sup>32</sup>S (at a mass resolution of 2500 to distinguish from O<sub>2</sub>) to <sup>13</sup>C  
142 were counted using an electron multiplier. Results have a precision of better than 2% from counting  
143 statistics, but were not standardized. Analysis of <sup>31</sup>P<sup>-</sup> and halogen elements (<sup>19</sup>F<sup>-</sup>, <sup>35</sup>Cl<sup>-</sup>, <sup>37</sup>Cl<sup>-</sup>, <sup>79</sup>Br<sup>-</sup>,  
144 <sup>81</sup>Br<sup>-</sup> and <sup>127</sup>I<sup>-</sup>) was undertaken in November 2008 with a 1 nA primary beam focused to a diameter of  
145 c. 10 μm. Analysis was in line scan mode, stepping at 5 μm between analyses, which also had the  
146 effect of cleaning the sample by pre-ablation. Analytical precision is limited by counting statistics and  
147 is <1% for Cl, 2-3% for P and 3-4% for Br and I. Halogen concentrations were standardized by direct  
148 comparison with a lead-silicate glass K1053. The absolute ion yields for the halogens were confirmed  
149 as being very high, varying from 5.0 (for F<sup>-</sup>) to 0.86 (for I<sup>-</sup>) times that of O<sup>-</sup>. The effects of sample  
150 matrix on ion yields on the silicate glass compared with carbonate are currently unknown.

151 Sample Obi84 was analyzed at the European Synchrotron Research Facility using soft X-rays at  
152 beamline ID21 in May 2005 and using hard X-rays at beamline ID22 in December 2006. For beamline  
153 ID21, experimental details are similar to those given in detail in Frisia et al. (2005). Samples were  
154 prepared as thin (<1 mm thick) slabs up to around 22 by 19 mm, with polished upper surfaces and were

155 mounted with double-sided tape to a circular 3 cm-diameter holder. The samples were excited with  
156 monochromatic synchrotron radiation of 2.9 keV in order to stimulate  $K\alpha$  radiation from light elements  
157 (up to Cl). Ca was not analysed, but the consistent beam conditions permit the assumption that  
158 excitation conditions were consistent; minor reductions in beam intensity of up to 10% were corrected  
159 for. Specific energy levels within the resultant X-ray fluorescence spectrum characteristic of particular  
160 elements were then studied in scans and maps. The X-rays were predominantly generated at depths of  
161 just a few microns in the sample and maximum penetration of the exciting radiation was 20-30  $\mu\text{m}$ .  
162 The beam was focused to either 5  $\mu\text{m}$  (scans and maps) or, for a high-resolution map using 1  $\mu\text{m}$  pixels  
163 the beam was focused to 0.6 by 0.3  $\mu\text{m}$ , but resolution is limited by the slightly larger excitation  
164 volume.

165 At beamline ID22, the conditions are mostly similar to those described in detail by Borsato et al.  
166 (2007), but some differences are noted here. The sample was prepared as a doubly-polished wafer of  
167 thickness around 150  $\mu\text{m}$ , mounted over a hole in the sample holder. Excitation energy used was 23  
168 keV, enabling in principle the detection of the K-lines of all the elements up to atomic number 47 and  
169 of the L-lines of other elements. The spectrum was deconvoluted by using PyMCA software (Solé et  
170 al. 2007) and detection limits were found to be sub-ppm level for Ca, Sr, Zn and Pb, but analysis of  
171 other elements was limited by elemental interferences. Elemental mapping was carried out with a 2  $\mu\text{m}$   
172 resolution over a length of 1.1 mm and 5  $\mu\text{m}$  resolution over a width of 0.1 mm. The fluorescence  
173 signal was integrated for 2 seconds in each pixel. The information depth is defined at the depth to  
174 which 63% of the characteristic X-ray line intensity of an element is being collected and depends on the  
175 X-ray energy. It varies from around 17  $\mu\text{m}$  for Ca to 110  $\mu\text{m}$  for Sr. The generation of X-rays over a  
176 range of depths for heavier elements results in a more complex pattern than in a strictly two-  
177 dimensional image, but unlike tomographic images it is not possible to distinguish which are shallower  
178 and which are deeper sites of X-ray generation.

179

## 180 **Study site and dripwater characteristics**

181

182 The local context of Obir is only briefly described here, being summarized from Spötl et al.  
183 (2005). The cave is on the eastern flank of the Hochobir massif (46.51 °N, 14.54 °E), 22 km SE of  
184 Klagenfurt, Austria. One distinct group of cave passages within the cave system is accessible only  
185 through an adit from an abandoned Pb-Zn mine at an altitude of 1090 m. Here several chambers  
186 around 200 m into the hillside have been monitored, displaying a remarkably congruent pattern of  
187 variation in  $\text{PCO}_2$  through the year. Of these, Säulenhalle lies at a depth of ca. 70 m from the surface  
188 and is accessible via a narrow horizontal passage opening to a chamber several metres in size in each  
189 dimension. The overlying vegetation is a spruce-dominated forest underlain by a brown forest soil.  
190 Annual precipitation lies within the range 1100-1600 mm, mostly in the second half of the year and the  
191 water-excess peaks in October and November. The temperature is below freezing normally between  
192 November and March and the ground is snow-covered for most of this period. The air temperature in  
193 Säulenhalle, which should be close to the annual mean, is  $5.8\pm 0.1$  °C throughout the year and  
194 dripwaters in the same chamber are  $5.8\pm 0.2$  °C.

195 Spötl et al. (2005) presented several years of hydrochemical data from three representative drips  
196 in the cave system which varied from near-invariant in drip rate to displaying modest seasonal changes  
197 through to more extreme and inter-annual variability. Despite differences in hydrological behaviour  
198 they showed a consistent pattern of seasonal changes in the carbonate system, but no seasonal  
199 variations in other chemical parameters. In the winter: 1) pH rises, in equilibrium with changing  $\text{PCO}_2$   
200 of cave air and calcite saturation rises similarly, 2)  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  of dissolved inorganic carbon rises from a base  
201 of -11.2 to -11.9 ‰ by 2 to 7 ‰ as isotopically light  $\text{CO}_2$  is degassed, 3) in some drips, there is a  
202 modest decrease in Ca and alkalinity (most precisely monitored by changes in the electroconductivity  
203 of the solution) indicative of some  $\text{CaCO}_3$  precipitation; winter precipitation is also seen on the surface  
204 of a pool (Silbersee) in Säulenhalle.

205 The three studied stalagmites from Säulenhalle (Obi12, Obi55 and Obi84) are all approximately  
206 cylindrical structures 3-4 cm in diameter fed by stalactites a few cm to dm above. The elemental

207 composition of four drip water sites, including the three feeding the three stalagmites, is summarized in  
208 Table 1. The drips feeding the studied stalagmites are very similar in: 1) major and minor element  
209 compositions, 2) the consistent Ca concentrations of 51-53±5 mg.l<sup>-1</sup> and 3) calcite saturation indices  
210 (around 0.44-0.58±0.1) controlled by seasonally changing ventilation.

211 Generally, no relationship between instantaneous measurements of drip rate and EC (electrical  
212 conductivity, a proxy for total ion content) was found. SH2, which feeds a stalagmite that has not been  
213 collected, was an exception in that at the slowest drip rates of down to 0.36 mlhr<sup>-1</sup>, EC was low and  
214 correlated with low Ca and hence high Mg/Ca; δ<sup>13</sup>C was also high. This is indicative of prior calcite  
215 precipitation stimulated by degassing (Fairchild et al. 2000; Fairchild and McMillan 2007).

216 Data on drip rates (from a tipping bucket drip logger), water and air temperature is illustrated in  
217 Figure 1. None display a simple seasonal pattern of variation; in particular there is no sign of an  
218 increased drip rate during peak infiltration during the autumn season. Drip SH4, feeding Obi84, was  
219 not continuously logged, but over a period of two years maintained a relatively high drip rate that  
220 would have ensured steady growth. Drips SH1 to SH3 all displayed inter-annual growth variations; the  
221 most pronounced relative change was SH1 (Obi12) which displayed a pronounced decline from 2000 to  
222 2003 (confirming instantaneous drip rates presented in Spötl et al. 2005) when monthly volume  
223 collections indicated drip rates as low as 0.36 mlhr<sup>-1</sup>.

224 Figure 1 illustrates a more regular pattern of variation of temperature of drip water (using SH3 -  
225 Obi55 as a typical example), displaying an upward deviation compared with summer values of around  
226 0.1°C in the first part of winter followed by a larger drop and gradual recovery later in the winter. Air  
227 temperature in Säulenhalle displays a similar pattern, although the upward displacement is more  
228 typically 0.2-0.3°C. Since the air circulation is so extensive (Spötl et al. 2005), we argue that the  
229 deviations in the water temperature are controlled by the seasonal air circulation. Some spot  
230 measurements of air velocity have been made at the narrow squeeze at the entrance to Säulenhalle as  
231 well at the next one which leads to subsequent chambers: maximum air velocities of ca. 0.5 msec<sup>-1</sup> are  
232 reached during winter.

233

## 234 **Petrology**

235

### 236 *Crystal fabrics*

237 The successive growth layers of the stalagmite are made visible by the presence of internal laminae  
238 which are parallel to the external surface of each stalagmite (Fig. 2a). A slight depression toward the  
239 centre of the stalagmites likely reflects the impact point of the feeding droplets. Fig. 2b highlights the  
240 characteristics of the columnar fabrics which compose Obir stalagmites. These, as for other  
241 speleothems, are aggregates of crystals that precipitated synchronously from the same medium to form  
242 single growth layers. The “synchronous” crystals precipitated in each growth layer (where the unit of  
243 “synchronous” time could be a year or a season) are commonly referred to as “crystallites”, following  
244 Kendall & Broughton (1978), to distinguish them from the composite columnar individuals which are  
245 typically recognized by their systematic extinction.

246 The fabrics in the best-studied example (Obi 84) are transitional from columnar to  
247 microcrystalline types as defined by Frisia et al. (2000). Columnar fabric is commonly characterized  
248 by the parallel arrangement of prismatic crystals (Onac, 1997), where the equal orientation of the  
249 crystals is related to a common direction of most rapid growth. In microcrystalline fabric, some  
250 individuals within the aggregate are not parallel or sub-parallel to the adjacent individuals and their  
251 direction of most rapid growth is not the same as that of the majority of the individuals within the  
252 aggregate. In the centre of Obi84 (Fig. 2b), extinction sweeps regularly as a wave through the crystals  
253 (with a total variation of up to 20°), similar to the variation in orientation of growth layers) but crystal  
254 boundaries are typical of columnar calcite. However, the extinction sweeps counter to the crystal  
255 elongation (see crystal S in Fig. 2b) in the manner of radiaxial calcite, which has recently been  
256 recognized in a Mg-bearing calcitic speleothem sample by Neuser & Richter (2007). In speleothems,  
257 radiaxial fibrous calcite aggregates have been interpreted as being the product of crystal splitting, i.e.  
258 where individual crystals split through various mechanisms, among which because ions with a

259 “poisoning” effect on growth sites are present in the parent solution or because ions with a larger ionic  
260 radius substitute for ions in the mineral structure. The final form of crystal splitting is a spherulite  
261 (Onac, 1997). Further from the growth axis, the composite crystal aggregates are closer to the  
262 microcrystalline fabrics described by Frisia et al. (2000), the latter representing a type of columnar  
263 fabric forming when growth inhibitors or drip rate variability characterize the system (Frisia et al.,  
264 2000). High-resolution analysis of this microcrystalline calcite has been achieved using electron  
265 backscatter diffraction in an area about 8 mm below the top of sample Obi84 (Fig. 2b) and is illustrated  
266 in Fig. 2c. Fig. 2c shows a mosaic of small crystallites, with grain boundaries which range from well  
267 defined to more “diffuse”, typically around 20 by 10  $\mu\text{m}$ . There is a clear preferred orientation of the  
268 individuals roughly from the left bottom corner to the right upper corner of Fig 2c. This direction  
269 coincides with the overall orientation of the aggregate crystal which has been analysed (see the area of  
270 the map in Fig. 2b). The relative crystallographic orientation of each small crystal (or crystallite)  
271 within the aggregate is indicated by the false colours of Fig. 2c and correspond to the orientations  
272 shown in the stereographic projections of Fig.2d. The crystallites show a range in orientation by up to  
273 around  $15^\circ$  within each crystal, but adjacent crystallites are often mismatched by only  $1\text{-}2^\circ$ . The pole  
274 to  $\{0001\}$  in Figure 1d (left), which also corresponds to the  $\langle 0001 \rangle$  zone axis cluster near the centre of  
275 the projection, indicating that the z crystallographic axes are near-vertical with respect to the surface of  
276 the sample section shown in Fig. 1c and sub-parallel to the growth surface at the top of the speleothem.

277 SEM analysis at the sample top (Fig. 3b) reveals that the morphology of the calcite crystals is  
278 characterized by sub-micrometre-scale macrosteps. Some flat faces also developed which are  
279 apparently all parallel to each other. This contrasts with the more usual situation in stalagmites (Frisia  
280 et al. 2000), where SEM observations reveal that speleothem surfaces are characterized by the  
281 emergence of rhombohedral tips. The scaling indicates that each flat face may correspond to a single  
282 crystallite on the EBSD image. If the orientation analysed by EBSD on a portion of the stalagmite  
283 holds true for the rest of the specimen, as is supported by the extinction patterns as seen by optical  
284 microscopy, possible candidates for the flat faces which developed at the top of the Obir stalagmites are  
285 those that lie in the equatorial plane of the stereographic projection and pointing towards the top of the  
286 sample as in Fig. 1d. Plots for various prismatic, rhombohedral and scalenohedral forms are shown and  
287 the most likely example is a face in the  $\{10\text{-}11\}$  rhombohedral form (Fig. 1d) and not the usual  
288 (cleavage-parallel) rhombohedral faces  $\{10\text{-}14\}$ . Later in the paper, we interpret the presence of  
289 macrosteps and the overall morphology of the calcite crystals of Obir stalagmites as being controlled by  
290 the presence of impurities in the parent solution.

291

### 292 *Visible annual lamination*

293 The top few centimetres of stalagmite Obi84 display a consistent structure in which narrow visible  
294 laminae, shown to be annual by Smith et al. (2009), are spaced at ca. 100-200  $\mu\text{m}$  intervals. Similar  
295 laminae are also developed in the other two samples, but their development is less consistent. The  
296 stalactite feeding Obi55 was collected and also displays such laminae, but very close-spaced. Where  
297 most distinctly developed in stalagmites, the laminae are a few microns wide and may be nearly flat in  
298 geometry, but more commonly display a zig-zag shape. Usually the zig-zags have a relief of a few  
299 micrometres, but this can exceptionally be up to 200  $\mu\text{m}$  where it is followed by the development of a  
300 large air inclusion (Fig. 3a). Some years show a more complex structure in which two or three such  
301 laminae are found close together, although the optical imaging of these is complicated by internal  
302 reflections (Fig. 4a). The zig-zag shapes have dimensions consistent with those of the crystallites in  
303 Figs. 2c and Fig. 3b. Laterally, some laminae may become diffuse and apparently are composed of a  
304 zone of fluid inclusions, locally inclusions forming vertical trains at crystallite margins. These areas  
305 are interpreted as representing places where crystallites coalesced just below the growth surface (as in  
306 Kendall & Broughton 1978).

307 In Obi84, which was collected in December 2002, the latest visible lamina lies very close to the  
308 top surface (Fig. 3a), implying that it formed in the autumn. In the review of Fairchild et al. (2007), we  
309 presented a similar figure to Fig. 3a and identified these features as *infiltration laminae*, implying a

310 formation by infiltration of water excess (Fairchild et al. 2006a), but we now regard this interpretation  
311 as suspect, and here use the term *event laminae* instead.

312 Re-nucleation horizons are present in each of the three samples and are sufficiently prominent  
313 as to suggest they each represent a hiatus in growth. However, it is notable that the hiatuses do not  
314 contain enrichments in insoluble residues or signs of corrosion, and so are distinct from those that  
315 represent significant time gaps in speleothems (Tan et al. 2006). Indeed, close study of the prominent  
316 event shown in Fig. 4c reveals that locally growth continues through the event and that it is no more  
317 than two or three years in duration (Fig. 4d). The prominent hiatus in Obi84 occurs at the level of the  
318 1834-1835 A.D. laminae around 23 mm below the top, whereas in Obi55 there is one just 9 mm from  
319 the top and in Obi12 at 12 mm from the top. However, the statistical analyses of Smith et al. (2009)  
320 show that the growth rate of each stalagmite is similar.

321 An example of an incipient hiatus, representing probably of the order of a month's gap in  
322 growth, is shown between the 1999 and 2000 annual layers in Fig. 3a. Essentially it represents a re-  
323 nucleation horizon where some new crystallites of diverse optical orientation are found and which can  
324 persist upwards (e.g. the upwards-expanding crystallite under the word "top" in Fig. 3a). Such an intra-  
325 year hiatus can be seen to pass laterally into a more profound pause in growth in Fig. 4b and this is  
326 typically of the lamina geometry as they are traced into the flanks of the stalagmites.

327 In summary, it is notable that hiatuses are developed at different times in the three specimens  
328 and that they do not represent significant time gaps. The presence of inter-annual slowdowns in drip  
329 rate mentioned earlier in the paper (and found elsewhere, e.g. by Baldini et al. 2006) provides a  
330 possible mechanism for hiatus development, growth being limited by lack of ion supply through  
331 dripwater. Where the monitored drip rates go well below  $0.36 \text{ mlhr}^{-1} = 1 \mu\text{l sec}^{-1}$ , significantly slower  
332 growth would be expected from the quantitative model of Dreybrodt (1988) and Baker et al. (1998).  
333 However, since the different drips in Säulenhalle do not vary in discharge synchronously, this  
334 phenomenon is not of climatic significance.

335 The lamina chronology for Obi84 for the past 140 years is shown in Fig 5b. The mean annual  
336 growth thickness is  $141 \pm 25 \mu\text{m}$  and the robustness of the series is shown by the low relative standard  
337 deviation of measurement of any individual year, which is 19%. Note that there is an overall reduction  
338 in annual growth thickness with time. This contrasts with the record in Grotta di Ernesto stalagmites  
339 where there is a strong increase, correlated with Northern Hemisphere temperature trends (Frisia et al.  
340 2003; Smith et al. 2006).

## 341 **Trends in chemical composition and comparison with dripwaters**

### 342 *Trace elements*

343 Figure 5 summarizes the variations in chemistry found in stalagmites Obi84 (Fig. 5a, c) and Obi12  
344 (Fig. 5d) over the past 200 years. Trace elements, including some additional elements not showing  
345 temporal variation, are also summarized in Table 2. The most unusual feature about both samples is  
346 their extremely high content of Zn (typically around 5000 ppm) and Pb (400-1400 ppm). These  
347 contents tend to reduce over time, albeit somewhat irregularly from the early 19<sup>th</sup> century to the late  
348 20<sup>th</sup> century. Cu shows a similar trend in Obi84, but concentrations are low. Other trace elements (Mg,  
349 P, Mn, Y, Sr and Ba) show steady compositions, but S (present in the calcite in the form of sulphate)  
350 increases strongly with time. This parallels the impact of late 20<sup>th</sup> century pollution recorded in  
351 speleothem ER78 from Ernesto cave (Frisia et al. 2005). In work to be presented elsewhere, we  
352 confirm this using the first in-situ micro-measurements of  $\delta^{34}\text{S}$  in carbonate-associated sulphate.

353 The trace element content explains X-ray diffraction data which demonstrate that there is a  
354 small reduction in (hexagonal) unit cell size ( $a = 4.985 \text{ \AA}$ ,  $c = 17.042 \text{ \AA}$ ) compared with pure calcite ( $a$   
355  $= 4.9896 \text{ \AA}$ ,  $c = 17.06 \text{ \AA}$ , Reeder 1983). The mean composition of the top cm of the sample in molar  
356 terms is  $\text{Ca}_{0.989} \text{Zn}_{0.0070} \text{Mg}_{0.0042} \text{Pb}_{0.0003} \text{CO}_3$ . For ions that form isomorphous carbonates with calcite,  
357 there is a linear change in unit cell size with substitution of trace species and both Mg and Zn have the  
358 effect of decreasing cell size. From data in Reeder (1983) and Mackenzie (1983), and assuming an  
359 additive effect of the two ions, the observed Mg and Zn concentrations predict parameters of  $a = 4.986$   
360  
361

362 Å and 17.038 Å, very close to the observed values. Therefore, it is interpreted that these ions are  
 363 dominantly substituted for Ca.

364 For Mg and Sr, it is appropriate to calculate a distribution coefficient to express the  
 365 fractionation in the ratio of the ion to calcium where:

$$366 (1) (Tr/Ca)_{CaCO_3} = K_{Tr} * (Tr/Ca)_{solution}$$

367 where Tr is the trace ion and  $K_{Tr}$  is the distribution coefficient, which may vary to a greater or lesser  
 368 extent with temperature, precipitation rate, crystal morphology, or other aspects of solution (Fairchild  
 369 and Treble 2009). The resulting values in Table 3 are reasonably consistent with those observed by  
 370 slow-growth, low ionic-strength experiments and in Ernesto cave speleothems (Huang and Fairchild  
 371 2001), but kinetic and competition factors are known to be important for Sr (Borsato et al. 2007).

372 The behaviour of sulphate is being studied in much more detail and will be presented elsewhere,  
 373 but it should be noted that the concentrations in drip water and in the speleothems are similar to the  
 374 Ernesto stalagmite ER78 (Frisia et al. 2005). In both cases sulphate partitions into calcite to a lesser  
 375 extent than would be expected from the experiments of Busenberg and Plummer (1985), which were  
 376 conducted at relatively fast growth rates using high ionic strength solutions.

377 For other solutes, the partition coefficient concept is not so applicable and it is also more  
 378 difficult to obtain water analyses for many species. Borsato et al. (2007) found that at Ernesto metals  
 379 such as Pb and Zn, as well as P, strongly adsorbed to collection vessels because of being transported in  
 380 the form of unstable colloids. Obir water samples are normally collected monthly, or less frequently  
 381 from cumulative collection vessels, although some direct samples were taken from drip SH4 from 2002  
 382 to early 2004. On realizing the importance of colloiddally transported elements, in November 2005, we  
 383 re-analyzed remaining previously collected samples from drips SH3 and SH4, acidifying those  
 384 samples where that had not previously been done (to release adsorbed elements) and carried out ICP-  
 385 MS analysis on additional elements. Data from SH3 (feeding Obi55) and SH4 (feeding Obi84) are  
 386 presented in Table 4 and results are generally consistent between the two. The Fe, Al and Si probably  
 387 represent colloidal particles, but organic colloids could be even more important (Fairchild and Treble,  
 388 2009). Pb, Zn and Y (all elements inferred to be colloiddally transported at Ernesto Cave) have, as  
 389 expected, high variations in abundance in contrast with Sr and Ba which are expected to be very largely  
 390 present as free ions. There were no obvious seasonal variations in abundance.

391 Empirical distribution coefficients, as in equation (1), between the dripwater data of Tables 1  
 392 and 4 and the composition of the top 10 mm of the stalagmite are shown in Table 5. The calculated  
 393 values for Zn and Pb ( $\gg 1$ ) are consistent with experimental and theoretical data summarized by  
 394 Rimstidt et al. (1998) and Curti (1999) and with the evidence of strong sorption of these elements to  
 395 calcite surfaces (Zahara et al., 1991; Godelitsas et al. 2003, Chada et al. 2005). The values of  $\ll 1$  for  
 396 Cu and Y are quite inconsistent with data in Rimstidt et al. (1998) and Curti (1999) where values  $\gg 1$   
 397 can be predicted, using rare earth elements as a model for Y. This discrepancy can be accounted for if  
 398 these elements are more tightly bound to colloids than are Zn and Pb, such that Y and Cu are not so  
 399 readily available for incorporation into calcite.

#### 400 *Stable isotopes*

402 The mean stable isotope composition of the top 2 mm (approximately 20 years) of growth of  
 403 sample Obi84 is  $-6.27 \pm 0.36$  and  $-7.83 \pm 0.23$  ‰ for  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{18}O$ , respectively. In the case of  $\delta^{13}C$   
 404 there is a direct comparison with the aqueous  $\delta^{13}C$  composition since the fractionation between  $CaCO_3$   
 405 and dissolved inorganic carbon at the pH values of interest is very small (Mühlinghaus et al. 2007).  
 406 The mean value for drip SH4 (which is very close to those from SH3) is  $-10.25 \pm 0.74$  ‰ (n = 19) Table  
 407 1. However, the pattern of seasonal variation of aqueous  $\delta^{13}C$  (with a maximum of  $-8.36$  ‰  
 408 representing as one of only two points higher than  $-9$  ‰) is less strongly developed than for the more  
 409 slowly dripping points SH1 and SH2, which display increases of around 3 and 8 ‰ from the low  
 410 summer levels of  $-11$  ‰ (Spötl et al. 2005). Hence the mean difference of 4 ‰ between SH4 drip  
 411 water and the stalagmite is likely to reflect continued degassing perhaps with some kinetic effects  
 412 during precipitation.



413 The  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  composition of dripwater feeding SH4 is  $-10.23 \pm 0.10$  ‰ (n = 18). Using the  
414 experimentally determined fractionation factors of Kim and O'Neil (1997), such water should  
415 precipitate calcite at equilibrium at a temperature of  $5.5^\circ\text{C}$  with a composition of  $-8.4$  ‰. The  
416 difference with the observed composition of  $0.6$  ‰ might indicate a small kinetic effect, but such a  
417 discrepancy is very commonly observed in natural speleothems (McDermott et al. 2005).

418 No detailed treatment of the variation in stable isotopes with depth is attempted here. However,  
419 we can note that over time the isotopes show rapid shifts from covariations to antipathetic variation and  
420 there are no strong correlations with mean temperature, winter temperature or rainfall in the  
421 instrumental period.

422

## 423 **Seasonal variations in chemical composition**

424

### 425 *Carbon isotopes*

426 The monitoring data show that enhanced ventilation during the winter season is a key process at Obir.  
427 The winter season is associated with low  $\text{PCO}_2$  which is found to control the pH of dripwater by  
428 enhancing the degassing towards equilibrium (Spötl et al. 2005). The high  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values found in  
429 dripwater should be expected to be seen in winter speleothem growth. In faster-growing stalagmites, it  
430 has recently proved possible to micromill sub-samples and demonstrate seasonal variations in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
431 (Frappier et al. 2002, Johnson et al. 2006, Matthey et al. 2008), but the Obir laminae are too thin for this  
432 to be done. Hence, we made the first attempt to determine such variations in terrestrial samples by ion  
433 microprobe.

434 The work was focused primarily around a group of relatively thick annual laminae which  
435 formed between 1958 and 1966. Interlaced forward-and-back trains of ablation pits were created during  
436 the analysis which was repeated in some parallel traverses (Fig. 6b). The work was technically  
437 extremely demanding because of the high beam current that was required leading to frequent electrical  
438 discharges that terminated the analysis. Enough data was collected however to demonstrate that  
439 considerable intra-annual variability is present with an amplitude of up to  $6$  ‰ and always at least  $2$   
440 ‰, although the magnitude could not be reproduced between analytical tracks. The bulk of the  
441 heavier analyses were in the first half of the growth following the position of the visible infiltration  
442 lamina (Fig. 6b) which is consistent with the expectations from the cave monitoring.

443

### 444 *Sulphate*

445 Sulphate can be expected to vary in abundance with seasonal ventilation because of the  
446 influence of pH on its incorporation into calcite. Frisia et al. (2005) noted a significant annual variation  
447 in sulphate in stalagmite ER78 from Ernesto Cave which was attributed to pH changes, based on the  
448 model of Busenberg and Plummer (1985). These authors proposed that sulphate incorporation could be  
449 modelled by a distribution coefficient approach where the ratio of interest (cf. equation (1)) was  $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$   
450  $/\text{CO}_3^{2-}$ . Since aqueous sulphate does not vary through the year, and the abundance of  $\text{CO}_3^{2-}$  is primarily  
451 controlled by pH in terms of its over-riding control on the ratio of  $\text{HCO}_3^-$  (the more abundant species)  
452 to  $\text{CO}_3^{2-}$ , a low value for sulphate in the speleothem each winter would be expected.

453 As was done by Frisia et al. (2005), synchrotron radiation was used to confirm that S in Obi84  
454 was present as sulphate using the position of the dominant X-ray absorption peak. However,  
455 *quantitative* analysis of S content was impossible by this method because the  $\text{K}\alpha$  emission line was  
456 swamped by Pb. Instead, the ion microprobe was used to analyze S, utilizing negative secondary ions,  
457 which permitted the simultaneous determination of P. A relatively large spot size of  $20\text{-}25$   $\mu\text{m}$  was  
458 used, so laminae were crossed obliquely to compensate for this. No S standard was available at the  
459 time the analyses were done, so results are presented as ratios to  $^{13}\text{C}$ . Results for the 1958-1966  
460 laminae illustrate that P peaks lie close to or precisely on the visible event lamina. In comparison with  
461 this, S also shows annual-scale variability, but it is offset from P. Figure 6a illustrates that in most  
462 cases the low values also occur predominantly from around the time of deposition of the visible lamina  
463 through to the first half of the next year's growth. A similar approach was taken to analyzing the last  
464 few years of growth at the top of the sample (Fig. 7). Here laminae were not visible in the precise area

465 analyzed, but their thicknesses on a lateral part of the section are in agreement with the lamina  
466 positions that can be deduced from the P peaks (although it should be noted that the 1997 P peak is  
467 very small and the 2000 P peak is double). Again the low-S analyses are found to be overlapping with  
468 and following the P peaks, consistent with their formation during the winter period. An additional  
469 feature of Fig. 7 is that an overall decline in mean S/C is found which is consistent with the fall in  
470 aqueous sulphate observed from dripwater monitoring data from 2002- to 2004 (Spötl et al., 2005) as  
471 the catchment recovers from the effects of acid deposition in the late 20<sup>th</sup> century.

472

473 *Event laminae*

474 Smith et al. (2009) reported ion probe analyses of positive secondary ions from the Obir stalagmites  
475 which demonstrated a strong annual covariation of H, P, Na and Mg with enrichments centred around  
476 the event laminae, where Sr decreases. The Sr pattern was found to be most reliable for using trace  
477 element layers to determine the rate of stalagmite growth. For Obi84, a principal component analysis  
478 found that this explained 55% of the variation in elemental chemistry, with a further 23% being  
479 explained by an independent mode of Sr and Ba variability (these results were obtained on data from  
480 which long-term trends had been removed). This pattern of variability is illustrated for the years 1958-  
481 1966 in Figure 8a. A discrepancy with Grotta di Ernesto stalagmites is that Mg increases in event  
482 laminae, whereas it does not usually do so in Ernesto stalagmites. It also varies annually in the Obir  
483 stalagmites typically by a factor of 2, much more than observed from the equivalent dripwater  
484 chemistry. These observations either imply that there are growth factor influences on Mg incorporation  
485 (Fairchild & Treble 2009), or that there was an independent mode of enrichment of Mg.

486 Further ion probe analyses of negative secondary ions were later undertaken in order to study  
487 the pattern of halogen elements. The iodine analyses are the first such data from a speleothem. Figure  
488 8b shows a strong pattern of enrichment in F, Br and I coinciding with P. Cl, some of which may be a  
489 surface contamination, displays little variability. These elements, like the positive ions, show more  
490 than one peak per year in the period 1962-1965; such noise in some years was noted in Smith et al.  
491 (2009), but the annual pattern dominates overall.

492 A more specific imaging of elemental variations in event laminae proved to be possible using  
493 synchrotron radiation. The soft X-ray studies showed a particularly strong response from the M-shell  
494 of Pb. Lead was seen to be periodically strongly enriched with a spatial pattern matching the  
495 distribution of event laminae (Fig. 9).

496 Mapping of elemental distribution across event laminae was carried out within a zone in the  
497 sample that was also subsequently used for the EBSD analysis of Fig. 2. Figure 10a illustrates a map of  
498 several annual layers with Pb enrichments, and the boxed area was analyzed at ultra-high resolution  
499 (Fig. 10b). The results obtained require some knowledge of the physics of X-ray generation for their  
500 interpretation. The spectrum (Fig. 10c) reflects the excitation of various elements by radiation with  
501 energy of 2.9 keV. The sensitivity of excitation decreases rapidly at lower energies and is not high  
502 enough to excite Ca, so the consistent total ion flux is used to justify an assumption that the element  
503 records are concentrations. Normally, only K-shell excitation is expected, but if the concentration of an  
504 element is high, L- and even M-shell excitation can occur. Since the Pb is abundant in the sample and  
505 the M-shell signal lies fairly close to the excitation energy, this technique proved especially sensitive  
506 for Pb. Zn L-shell excitation also proved much stronger than Na K-shell excitation (Fig. 10c), but was  
507 much less responsive than the Pb peak. P and Mg K $\alpha$  radiation could also be detected. A key point is  
508 that the use of soft X-rays causes excitation very close to the sample surface and so generates a sharply  
509 defined truly 2-dimensional map, so the sample offers exceptional clarity of the distribution of Pb.

510 Figure 10b illustrates two features. Running horizontally across the maps is the position of the  
511 infiltration lamina. Within a broad zone in the centre of the map enrichment in Pb, Zn and P can be  
512 seen. It is hard to discern a similar enrichment in Mg, but this peak is weaker and Mg in any case does  
513 not normally show the annual pattern quite as distinctly as P (Fig. 8a). This broad zone is 15-20  $\mu$ m  
514 high compared with the 80-150  $\mu$ m thickness of the entire annual layers in Fig. 10a and therefore only  
515 forms during a subordinate part of the year (perhaps 1 to 3 months). Within the enriched zone, two  
516 continuous peaks in Pb (and less distinctly in Zn and P) are visible 1-2 pixels (i.e. 1-2  $\mu$ m) across.

517 Based on the annual growth rate, the narrow metal peaks must represent individual events of at most a  
518 few days duration when Pb and other elements were flushed onto the stalagmite. Also visible in Fig.  
519 10b are structural features running NE-SW across the maps. These have the same dimensions as the  
520 crystallites of Fig. 2c and Fig. 3b and so demonstrate a different chemical composition associated with  
521 the flat crystal faces of Fig. 3b compared with the rough surfaces that surround them (corresponding  
522 also to the zigs and the zags of laminae in Fig. 3a and 4a).

523 Obi84 was also studied using hard X-ray synchrotron excitation, with energy of 23 keV, on a  
524 portion of the sample just below the very top surface and representing up to eight years of growth (Fig.  
525 11). This yields a spectrum with a much higher continuum background (Fig. 11a) and in which there  
526 are many peak overlaps. The strongest peaks are for Zn (L), Ca (K), Pb (L) and Sr (L). Y may be just  
527 quantifiable from its  $K\beta$  peak, but its  $K\alpha$  peak overlaps with a Pb peak. The broad annual patterns of  
528 enrichment in Zn and Pb are matched by small reductions in Sr, whilst Ca variation is limited which  
529 confirms that the other elements can be interpreted as concentrations. Under these high-energy  
530 conditions, excitation takes place at much greater depths and over a larger range of depths than under  
531 the conditions of imaging of Fig. 10, hence providing images integrated over a larger thickness. Thus it  
532 would normally be expected that a less sharp image would be obtained unless chemical zones were  
533 precisely perpendicular to the excitation path which is  $45^\circ$  from the surface. This explains the details in  
534 the Pb and Zn maps which reveal fine bands of enrichment within individual crystallites in slightly  
535 different positions. Hence one time-band forms a series of sweeping curves in the image and it is  
536 difficult to reconstruct just how many are present in one annual layer.

537

## 538 Discussion

539

### 540 *Chemical control of crystal fabrics*

541 The Obir stalagmites, and specifically Obi84 which has been studied in most detail, display a series of  
542 striking fabric characteristics, some of which have not been previously recorded. However, their  
543 preferred optical orientation is a common characteristic of speleothems. In freely growing columnar  
544 crystals this preferred orientation arises through geometrical selection, whereby crystals oriented  
545 perpendicular to the growth surface grow fastest and become predominant “taking over” the individuals  
546 that are not favourably oriented (Dickson, 1993, Onac, 1997). The resulting aggregates can be  
547 optically length-fast or length-slow dependent on crystal morphology (Dickson 1993). However  
548 speleothem growth is confined within a mm-scale solution film (Dreybrodt 1988) which limits  
549 competition to periods whilst crystals are still small, at the beginning of growth, or following a hiatus  
550 when heterogeneous renucleation is often observed. Hence, the similar optical orientation of adjacent  
551 composite crystals at the top of Fig. 2b implies that competition has occurred.

552 Speleothems often are formed of composite (rarely of single) crystals with uniform extinction  
553 (Frisia et al. 2000). Commonly, the columnar crystals will be characterized by an overall orientation of  
554 the z axis (the  $\langle 0001 \rangle$  direction) roughly perpendicular to the speleothem surface. If the system is not  
555 disturbed by the presence of growth inhibitors, such as organic compounds or trace metals, or by  
556 changes in flow at the top of the speleothem, the crystallites covering the top of the stalagmites will be  
557 characterized by rhombohedral faces with very few defects. In the case of columnar crystals (*sensu*  
558 Frisia et al. 2000), the crystallites would be expected to be strictly parallel in lattice orientation,  
559 whereas in microcrystalline calcite (*sensu* Frisia et al. 2000), some mismatches in orientation of  
560 crystallites are found. Microcrystalline calcite is typically associated with perturbations of the system  
561 with selective adsorption of species from solution on particular surfaces. The result is a change in the  
562 morphology of calcite crystals, with the formation of macrosteps which indicate the presence of crystal  
563 defects (Frisia et al., 2000; Jimenez-Lopez et al., 2003; Fernandez-Diaz et al., 2006). In Obi84, XRD  
564 data demonstrates that there is a distortion of the lattice induced by substitution for Ca of the smaller  
565 ions Mg and Zn and the presence of non-divalent ions such as phosphate and halides implies significant  
566 substitution in defect sites. These impurities may cause the development of sweeping extinction  
567 patterns, even in the quasi-columnar composite crystals near the growth axis of the stalagmite. In the  
568 off-axis area studied by EBSD, adjacent crystallites are seen to differ in lattice orientation.

569 The SEM image of the top of Obi84 shows the predominance of unstable surfaces, that is, those  
570 characterized by macrosteps, with only subordinate flat, defect-free faces. Also, we did not observe  
571 calcite rhombohedra tips typically found at the surface of speleothems. Cave precipitation experiments  
572 carried out in other caves, and in particular at Grotta di Ernesto, highlighted the development of  
573 stepped crystals with forms deviating from the equilibrium form (i.e. {10-14} rhombohedron) when  
574 supersaturation or presence of impurities perturbed the system (Frisia et al. 2000). In Obi84 each  
575 crystallite displays a single, poorly developed flat face possibly pertaining to {10-11}. The appearance  
576 of macrosteps and the deviation from the equilibrium rhombohedra morphology have been documented  
577 by Braybrook et al. (2002) who grew calcite crystals doped with cobalt. By increasing the  
578 concentration of this trace metal in the growth medium, the morphology of calcite crystals became  
579 progressively anisotropic, probably because of the preferential localization of the dopant at the crystal  
580 surface (Reeder 1996) and the preferential development of a face in the {10-11} form was found. Zn  
581 has a very similar ion size to Co, and similarly adsorbs strongly to calcite surfaces, forming distinct  
582 phases at higher concentrations (Zachara et al. 1991). Zn prefers the opposite surface site to Co (Reeder  
583 1996) and yet despite this, Reeder et al. (1999) showed from X-ray absorption fine-structure studies  
584 that Co, Pb, Zn and Ba in calcites all adopted octahedrally-coordinated Ca-substituted lattice positions  
585 with varying degrees of local distortion around the ions. Many trace species are present in Obi84, of  
586 which Zn and Mg are the most abundant, but the peculiar morphology is not typical of Mg-calcite.  
587 Given that the ionic radii of zinc and cobalt are nearly identical a homology with the morphologies  
588 identified by Braybrook et al. (2002) seems plausible. The presence of trace metal ions with diverse  
589 ionic radii with respect to Ca may explain also the observed radial fibrous fabric in some aggregates  
590 in Obi 84. Finally, Fig. 10b illustrates differences in composition between alternating zones across  
591 crystallites; arguably these could be sector zones, reflecting differential trace metal incorporation in  
592 different crystallographic forms (e.g. Reeder and Grams 1987).

593 It is of interest that despite the strong disequilibrium effects noted above, there is a consistency  
594 of mean Mg data with published literature (Huang et al. 2001) implying that deposition on multi-annual  
595 timescales was not strongly out of chemical equilibrium, consistent also with the  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  data. Also  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
596 data in the speleothem can be regarded as equilibrium values, assuming some further degassing occurs  
597 in the field beyond that typical of the dripwaters sampled.

598  
599 *Phenomena responsible for trace element patterns in event laminae*

600 The coincidence of narrow optically visible laminae with trace element anomalies is striking in the Obir  
601 stalagmites. In Smith et al. (2009) we had interpreted these event laminae as forming in the same way  
602 as the infiltration laminae from Grotta di Ernesto (Borsato et al. 2007). Our understanding of the  
603 Ernesto laminae has progressed through the work of Huang et al. (2001), Fairchild et al. (2001) and  
604 Treble et al. (2003) who established a link between P enrichments in stalagmites and patterns of  
605 seasonal infiltration. Borsato et al. (2007) went much further in demonstrating a very specific hierarchy  
606 of association of trace element enrichments with infiltration laminae which they related to the relative  
607 importance of colloidal transport. The most specifically associated element with fluorescent laminae  
608 was Y (a proxy also for behaviour of the heavy rare earths), followed by Cu, Pb and Zn, whereas P and  
609 Br were found to display a rather broader enrichment centred around the infiltration lamina. Sr was  
610 depressed, which was interpreted as due to being out-competed for lattice defect sites. Ion microprobe  
611 analysis confirmed the role of Y and also showed that F, H and Na were focused around these laminae,  
612 although the latter two might reflect the presence of fluid inclusions (Borsato et al. 2007). In the  
613 infiltration lamina hypothesis, multiple pulses of trace elements associated with infiltration laminae  
614 (Figs. 10 and 11) could be consistent with early work on fluorescence in which multiple laminae were  
615 recognized (Shopov et al. 1994) and with monitoring work in modern caves, such as the Shihua Cave  
616 near Beijing where a series of pulses of organic carbon are found during a wet season (Tan et al. 2006,  
617 Ban et al. 2008). However, a review of all the evidence concerning the Obir laminae indicates that we  
618 need to consider two alternative origins: as infiltration laminae, or as aerosol laminae.

619 The first line of evidence concerns the patterns of chemical change associated with the laminae.  
620 Of the colloiddally-associated species identified from Ernesto, interferences with more abundant species

621 prevented microanalysis of Y in Obi84, but all the other species are found enriched together in event  
622 laminae together with iodine, which has been analyzed for the first time. Our unpublished UV-  
623 fluorescence and Fourier-Transform Infra-Red analyses indicated that the infiltration laminae at  
624 Ernesto host organic compounds (previously observed by fluorescence) in addition to trace metals, and  
625 literature documents that most trace metals detected could be complexed, especially by humic  
626 substances. This fits readily with our identification of iodine enrichments since there is also a large  
627 body of evidence, summarized by Steinberg et al. (2008), that a large fraction of soluble iodine is  
628 associated with colloidal humic substances in terrestrial environments. It is significant also that Cl,  
629 which shows minimal complexing effects, shows no variation in the stalagmite. Hence, this pattern of  
630 element enrichments clearly supports a similar mechanism of formation of trace element laminae at  
631 both cave sites. However, it should be pointed out that fluorescence is not readily detectable from the  
632 Obir samples. Although this is consistent with the much deeper (70 m versus 10-15 m) position of  
633 Säulenhalle relative to the ground surface compared with Ernesto, it also makes it surprising that the  
634 trace element enrichments are so clearly developed at these depths.

635 Secondly, we need to consider the delivery of the elements to the speleothem. A mass balance  
636 can be calculated for Obi84 given the mean discharge of dripwater at this site (which varies less than  
637 the other drips studied, Table 1, the mean composition of dripwaters (Tables 1 and 4), and the mean  
638 composition of the top 10 mm of the stalagmite (Table 2). The annual discharge is 287 litres and the  
639 annual volume of calcite precipitated on the top surface of the stalagmite is approximately 0.23 g  
640 (given a thickness of 0.12 mm and diameter of the top surface of 30 mm). The results, in terms of %  
641 removal of the species from the solution, are shown in Table 5 along with the distribution coefficients  
642 previously discussed. It can be seen that only a small fraction (0.63%) of Ca is removed from the  
643 dripwater and much smaller percentages of Mg, Cu and Y. However the calculated figures for Zn  
644 (5.7%) and Pb (14%) are high, but still well below 100%. Hence, on an annual basis, dripwaters could  
645 supply sufficient trace elements. However, as has been shown, the event laminae display  
646 concentrations 3-10 times higher than outside these zones, but there is no indication of a seasonal  
647 variability in concentration, even though three samples were collected in November when infiltration  
648 might be expected to be at a maximum. It appears that much higher rates of delivery of ions is required in  
649 the autumn season and yet the dripwater data do not clearly indicate higher rates of discharge at this  
650 time. Using the plumbing model concepts in Tooth and Fairchild (2003) and Fairchild et al. (2006b), it  
651 is conceivable that a small proportion of water from a fracture-fed source could have had more  
652 influence in the autumn if it entered a reservoir with an overflow such that the outflow to the drip had  
653 an approximately constant pressure head, but in the absence of evidence for enhanced trace element  
654 concentrations in autumn dripwater, this could be regarded as special pleading.

655 Given the uncertainty as to whether dripwater could supply sufficient elements for the event  
656 laminae, we now consider an alternative explanation is that the trace element enrichments represent  
657 deposition from aerosol in the cave system. This hypothesis only emerged after our analyses and  
658 specifically after the period of more intense cave monitoring at this logistically difficult site. As a  
659 result, we currently lack specific observations that could be used to support this hypothesis, so we will  
660 argue in more general terms. One point that emerged from the  $^{14}\text{C}$  study in Smith et al. (2009) was the  
661 result that the  $^{14}\text{C}$  concentration of the speleothems increased in parallel with that of the external  
662 atmosphere during the era of atmospheric bomb testing: hence there must be isotopic exchange of  
663 carbon between air and solution, despite the net degassing of the latter. This result was unexpected, but  
664 draws attention to the air as a potential source of chemical species for speleothem deposition.

665 Aerosols (liquid droplets and fine particles) are generated within the cave system or brought  
666 from the outer atmosphere within the cave by air currents (Cigna and Hill, 1997). Deposition from  
667 aerosols contributes to the accretion of speleothem deposits at certain sites. However, the main issue in  
668 the literature, has been whether speleothems could be entirely explained from aerosol deposition (Cigna  
669 and Hill (1997). At Obir, it is accepted that the main crystal growth originates from solution: the only  
670 question is whether aerosols might add to the solutes supplied from dripwater during the formation of  
671 event laminae in particular.

672 In an extensive study on the physics of cave passages, Badino (1995) suggested that aerosols  
673 deposit onto speleothems in zones where air currents are feeble to stagnant through the phenomenon of  
674 “evaporation”, i.e. when the dimensions of the aerosol particles decrease below a critical size (the  
675 pressure within the aerosol droplet drops and the surrounding cave air equilibrates with a pressure  
676 which is similar to that of the disappearing aerosol droplet). If these aerosol carry trace metals as  
677 particulate they may deposit their load onto the growing speleothem surface.

678 An instructive case study is provided by the work of Jeong et al. (2003) and Chang et al. (2008)  
679 on pervasive black carbon deposits on speleothems from touristic caves in Korea. Microscopic and  $^{14}\text{C}$   
680 studies were used to identify the sources of carbon as being both from vehicle exhausts and biomass  
681 burning (the latter potentially being both external and internal to the cave). Elevated levels of Mn, N, S  
682 and Pb were attributed to airborne anthropogenic sources. The organic carbon was of colloidal  
683 dimensions (20-50 nm) and so clearly would be much more mobile than pollen grains which are known  
684 to be aerielly transported only close to the entrance of cave systems (McGarry and Caseldine 2004).

685 We must stress that although the circulation at Obir is efficient, strong draughts are not felt in  
686 the cave interior (flows of up to  $0.5 \text{ msec}^{-1}$  at constrictions were mentioned earlier) and flows within  
687 chambers could even be laminar. Hence we do not anticipate that micron-scale particulates (e.g. rock  
688 flour) are transported, but smaller colloidal (organic-hosted) entities should be. A suggestive piece of  
689 evidence is the observed and irregular increase in air temperature at the beginning of the winter  
690 circulation regime (Fig. 1). This may imply a more vigorous circulation regime at the time, which  
691 could be equated with the event laminae that overlap with and are partly followed by the low-S winter  
692 growth. For example in autumn 2003, four distinct pulses of higher temperature can be recognized  
693 (Fig. 1), which are likely to reflect changes in the intensity of air circulation. Such pulses would be  
694 responsible for the distinct micron-scale enrichments in metal content observed in Figs. 10 and 11.

695 The chemical properties of the elements found enriched in the event laminae are distinctive and  
696 are precisely those expected from binding to organic matter, supporting their interpretation as originally  
697 bound to soil humic substances. Therefore an overall two-stage hypothesis for the development of the  
698 event laminae can be tentatively proposed as:

- 699 1. Delivery of elements bound to colloidal humic substances in solutions percolating through  
700 fracture-fed components of the karstic aquifer into the cave system and
- 701 2. Suspension of part of the colloidal material as aerosol and redistribution within the cave  
702 system.

703 These and other models will be tested in future observations at the study site.

704

#### 705 *Expressions of seasonality and proxies for climate*

706 This study has been based on samples that show strongly developed seasonality. The most obvious  
707 effect observed during monitoring is the development of a stronger winter circulation, once the external  
708 temperature falls below that of the interior, associated with reduced  $\text{PCO}_2$  in cave air. The most  
709 obvious annual phenomenon in the speleothems are the event laminae (of the order of  $10^{-1}$  years), many  
710 of which are composite of individual events representing only a few days growth. The enrichment in  
711 trace elements expected to be associated with organic colloids could be interpreted as reflected a  
712 seasonal hydrological flushing as in the model set up for Grotta di Ernesto (Smith et al. 2009). Borsato  
713 et al. (2007) found the most convincing relationship between abundance of such elements and surface  
714 conditions for the Ernesto cave stalagmite arose when a period of deforestation around World War I led  
715 to enhanced metal contents. However, in sample Obi84, although year-to-year variability in element  
716 abundances is strong, it is not related to the interannual variability in the intensity of autumnal rainfall  
717 (Fig. 9). Neither has cave monitoring has not detected changes in the flux of elements in dripwater,  
718 whereas there is evidence for unusually high and fluctuating airflows at the start of the winter season.  
719 For this reason, an aerosol origin for event laminae is proposed as an alternative model for testing in  
720 future work.

721 The reduction in  $\text{CO}_2$  content of cave air in the winter, as observed by monitoring, in itself  
722 leaves no physical trace in the speleothem unlike the changes in saturation state in caves in seasonally  
723 dry climates where clear and cloudy calcites alternate seasonally (Genty and Quinif 1996, Baker et al.

724 2008). However, we have demonstrated from  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and sulphate evidence that the effects of low  $\text{PCO}_2$   
725 in winter do have a distinct chemical expression which accords with theory and previous experimental  
726 evidence.

727 Unlike the Ernesto cave, the rate of speleothem growth is not proportional to temperature, but  
728 instead has decreased since the mid 19<sup>th</sup> century. It is plausible that this may relate to a reduction in the  
729 severity of winters, leading to less influence of winter ventilation, associated with high supersaturations  
730 apply. We do not present here our work on statistical comparison with climatic indices, but suffice to  
731 say that any correlations are weak. Obir speleothems, like the physiological variation of the cave  
732 system through the year, are remarkable, and should yet yield more specific information that can be  
733 interpreted in terms of seasonality under past conditions. We are currently working on the premise that  
734 it is the length of the winter season during which strong ventilation applies (currently around 4 months)  
735 which is the key factor and have recently obtained more high-resolution S profiles to try to test S  
736 variation as a proxy for the duration of the winter season.

737  
738 This work was initiated during a Royal Society joint project grant between IJF and CS with assistance from Anna Tooth,  
739 and funding continued under the UK Natural Environment Research Council grants NER/T/S/2002/00448 and  
740 NE/C511805/1 (IJF principal investigator) and funding from the European Synchrotron Facility (allocations ME1103 and  
741 EC104, SF principal investigator). CS acknowledges laboratory assistance by Manuela Wimmer and partial support from  
742 FWF grant Y122-GEO. EIMF staff associated with this work are Nicola Cayzer, John Craven and Richard Hinton. We  
743 thank staff at the former NERC ICP-MS facility at Kingston University for their assistance and Dr. Louise Male (University  
744 of Birmingham) for the X-ray diffraction data.  
745

746

747

748

**References**

749

750

751

752

753

754

755

756

757

758

759

760

761

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

772

773

774

775

776

777

778

779

780

781

782

783

784

785

786

787

788

789

790

791

792

793

794

795

796

797

798

799

800

801

802

803

804

805

806

807

- Badino, G., 1995. Fisica del clima sotterraneo. Memorie dell'Istituto Italiano di Speleologia 7, Serie II, Bologna, 137 pp. (in Italian)
- Baker, A., Genty, D., Dreybrodt, W., Barnes, W. L., Mockler, N. J. & Grapes, J. 1998. Testing theoretically predicted stalagmite growth rate with recent annually laminated samples: Implications for past stalagmite deposition. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **62**, 393-404.
- Baker, A., Smith, C.L., Jex, C., Fairchild, I.J., Genty, D. & Fuller, L. 2008. Annually laminated speleothems: a review. *International Journal of Speleology*, **37**, 193-206.
- Baldini, J.U.L., McDermott, F. & Fairchild, I.J. 2006 Spatial variability in cave drip water hydrochemistry: Implications for stalagmite paleoclimate records. *Chemical Geology*, **235**, 290-304
- Ban, F., Pan, G., Zhu, J., Cai, B. & Tan, M. 2008. Temporal and spatial variations in the discharge and dissolved organic carbon of drip waters in Beijing Shihua Cave, China. *Hydrological Processes*, **22**, 3749-3758.
- Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Fairchild, I.J., Somogyi, A. & Susini, J. 2007. Trace element distribution patterns in annual stalagmite laminae mapped by micrometer-resolution X-ray fluorescence: incorporation of colloiddally-transported species. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **71**, 1494-1512.
- Braybrook, A.L., Heywood, B.R., Jackson, R.A. & Pitt, K. 2002. Parallel computational and experimental studies of the morphological modification of calcium carbonate by cobalt. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, **243**, 336-344.
- Busenberg, E. & Plummer, L.N. 1985. Kinetic and thermodynamic factors controlling the distribution of  $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$  and  $\text{Na}^+$  in calcites and selected aragonites. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **49**, 713-725.
- Chada, V.G.R., Hausner, D.B., Strongin, D.R., Rouff, A.A. & Reeder, R.J. 2005. Divalent Cd and Pb uptake on calcite {10bar14} cleavage faces: An XPS and AFM study. *Journal of Colloid and Interface Science*, **288**, 350-360.
- Chang, S.J., Jeong, G.Y. & Kim, S.J. 2008. The origin of black carbon on speleothems in tourist caves in South Korea: Chemical characterization and source discrimination by radiocarbon measurement. *Atmospheric Environment*, **42**, 1790-1800.
- Cigna, A.A. & Hill, C.A. 1997. Aerosols: are they a mechanism of speleothem growth? In: Hill, C. & Forti, P. (eds) *Cave Minerals of the World*, National Speleological Association, Huntsville, Alabama, 255-258.
- Curti, E. 1999. Coprecipitation of radionuclides with calcite: estimation of partition coefficients based on a review of laboratory investigations and geochemical data. *Applied Geochemistry*, **14**, 433-445.
- Dickson, J.A.D. 1993. Crystal-growth diagrams as an aid to interpreting the fabrics of calcite aggregates. *Journal of Sedimentary Petrology*, **63**, 1-17.
- Dreybrodt, W. 1988. *Processes in Karst Systems*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Fairchild, I.J. & McMillan, E.A. 2007. Speleothems as indicators of wet and dry periods. *International Journal of Speleology*, **36**, 79-84.
- Fairchild, I.J. & Treble, P.C. 2009. Trace elements in speleothems as recorders of environmental change. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **xx**, xxx-xxx.
- Fairchild, I. J., Borsato, A., Tooth, A. F., Frisia, S., Hawkesworth, C. J., Huang, Y. M., McDermott, F. & Spiro, B. 2000. Controls on trace element (Sr-Mg) compositions of carbonate cave waters: implications for speleothem climatic records. *Chemical Geology*, **166**, 255-269.
- Fairchild, I. J., Baker, A., Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Hinton, R. W., McDermott, F. & Tooth, A. F. 2001. Annual to sub-annual resolution of multiple trace-element trends in speleothems. *Journal of the Geological Society, London*, **158**, 831-841.
- Fairchild, I. J., Smith, C. L., Baker, A., Fuller, L., Spötl, C., Matthey, D., McDermott, F. & E.I.M.F. 2006a. Modification and preservation of environmental signals in speleothems. *Earth-Science Reviews*, **75**, 105-153.
- Fairchild, I.J., Tuckwell, G.W., Baker, A. & Tooth, A.F. 2006b. Modelling of dripwater hydrology and hydrogeochemistry in a weakly karstified aquifer (Bath, UK): implications for climate change studies. *Journal of Hydrology*, **321**, 213-231.
- Fairchild, I.J., Frisia, S., Borsato, A. & Tooth, A.F. 2007. Speleothems. In: *Geochemical Sediments and Landscapes* (ed. Nash, D.J. and McLaren, S.J.), Blackwell, Oxford, p. 200-245.
- Fernández-Díaz, L., Astilleros, J.M. & Pina, C.M. 2006. The morphology of calcite crystals grown in a porous medium doped with divalent cations. *Chemical Geology*, **225**, 314-321.
- Frappier, A., Sahagian, D., Gonzalez, L.A. & Carpenter, S.J. 2002. El Niño events recorded by stalagmite carbon isotopes. *Science*, **298**, 565.
- Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Fairchild, I.J. & McDermott, F. I.J. 2000. Calcite fabrics, growth mechanisms and environments of formation in speleothems (Italian Alps and SW Ireland). *Journal of Sedimentary Research*, **70**, 1183-1196.
- Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Preto, N. & McDermott, F. 2003. Late Holocene annual growth in three Alpine stalagmites records the influence of solar activity and the North Atlantic Oscillation on winter climate. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, **216**, 411-424.
- Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Fairchild, I.J. & Susini, J. 2005. Variations in atmospheric sulphate recorded in stalagmites Variations in atmospheric sulphate recorded in stalagmites by synchrotron micro-XRF and XANES analyses. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, **235**, 729-740.
- Genty, D. & Quinif, Y. 1996. Annually laminated sequences in the internal structure of some Belgian stalagmites – importance for paleoclimatology. *Journal of Sedimentary Research*, **66**, 275-288.



- 808 Godelitsas, A., Astilleros, J.M., Hallam, K., Harissopoulos, S. & Putnis, A. 2003. Interaction of calcium carbonates with  
809 lead in aqueous solutions. *Environmental Science and Technology*, **37**, 3351-3360.
- 810 Huang, Y. & Fairchild, I.J. 2001. Partitioning of Sr<sup>2+</sup> and Mg<sup>2+</sup> into calcite under karst-analogue experimental conditions.  
811 *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **65**, 47-62.
- 812 Huang, H. M., Fairchild, I. J., Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Cassidy, N. J., McDermott, F. & Hawkesworth, C. J. 2001. Seasonal  
813 variations in Sr, Mg and P in modern speleothems (Grotta di Ernesto, Italy). *Chemical Geology*, **175**, 429-448.
- 814 Jeong, G.Y., Kim, S.J. & Chang, S.J. 2003. Black carbon pollution of speleothems by fine urban aerosols in tourist caves.  
815 *American Mineralogist*, **88**, 1872-1878.
- 816 Jimenez-Lopez, C., Rodriguez-Navarro, A., Dominguez-Vera, J.M. & Garcia-Ruiz, J.M. 2003. Influence of lysozym on the  
817 precipitation of calcium carbonate: A kinetic and morphologic study. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **67**, 1667-1676.
- 818 Johnson, K. R., Hu, C., Belshaw, N.S. & Henderson, G.M. 2006. Seasonal trace-element and stable isotope variations in a  
819 Chinese speleothem: the potential for high resolution paleomonsoon reconstruction. *Earth and Planetary Science  
820 Letters*, **244**, 394-407.
- 821 Kendall, A.C. & Broughton, P.L. 1978. Origin of fabric in speleothems of columnar calcite crystals. *Journal of  
822 Sedimentary Petrology*, **48**, 550-552.
- 823 Kim S.T. & O'Neil, J.R. 1997. Equilibrium and nonequilibrium oxygen isotope effects in synthetic carbonates. *Geochimica  
824 et Cosmochimica Acta*, **61**, 3461-3475.
- 825 Larson, A.C. & Von Dreele, R.B. 2000. General Structure Analysis System (GSAS), *Los Alamos National Laboratory  
826 Report*, **LAUR 86-748**.
- 827 Mackenzie, F.T., Bischoff, W.D., Bishop, F.C., Loijens, M., Schoonmaker, J. & Wollast, R. 1983. Magnesian calcites: low-  
828 temperature occurrence, solubility and solid-solution behavior. In: Reeder, R.J. (ed) *Carbonates: Mineralogy and  
829 Geochemistry, Reviews in Mineralogy*, **11**, 97-144.
- 830 Mathey, D., Lowry, D., Duffet, J., Fisher, R., Hodge, E. & Frisia, S. 2008. A 53 year seasonally resolved oxygen and carbon  
831 isotope record from a modern Gibraltar speleothem: Reconstructed drip water and relationship to local precipitation.  
832 *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, **269**, 80-95.
- 833 McDermott, F. 2004. Palaeo-climate reconstruction from stable isotope variations in speleothems: a review. *Quaternary  
834 Science Reviews*, **23**, 901-918.
- 835 McDermott F., Schwarcz H.P. & Rowe, P.J. 2005. 6. Isotopes in speleothems. In: Leng, M.J. (ed) *Isotopes in  
836 Palaeoenvironmental Research*, Springer, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 185-225.
- 837 McGarry, S.F. & Caseldine, C. 2004. Speleothem palynology: an undervalued tool in Quaternary studies. *Quaternary  
838 Science Reviews*, **23**, 2389-2404.
- 839 Mühlingaus, C., Scholz, D. & Mangini, A. 2007. Modelling stalagmite growth and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  as a function of drip interval and  
840 temperature. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **71**, 2780-2790.
- 841 Neuser, R.D. & Richter, D.K. 2007. Non-marine radiaxial fibrous calcites – examples of speleothems proved by electron  
842 backscatter diffraction. *Sedimentary Geology*, **194**, 149-154.
- 843 Onac, B. P., 1997. Crystallography of Speleothems In: Hill, C. & Forti, P. (eds) *Cave Minerals of the World*, National  
844 Speleological Association, Huntsville, Alabama, 230-235.
- 845 Reeder, R.J. 1983. Crystal chemistry of the rhombohedral carbonates. In: Reeder, R.J. (ed) *Carbonates: Mineralogy and  
846 Geochemistry, Reviews in Mineralogy*, **11**, 1-47.
- 847 Reeder, R.J. 1996. Interaction of divalent cobalt, zinc, cadmium, and barium with the calcite surface during layer growth.  
848 *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **60**, 1543-1552.
- 849 Reeder, R.J. & Grams, J.C. 1987. Sector zoning in calcite cement crystals: Implications for trace element distributions in  
850 carbonates. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **51**, 187-194.
- 851 Reeder, R.J., Lamble, G.M. & Northrup, P.A. 1999. XAFS study of the coordination and local relaxation around Co<sup>2+</sup>,  
852 Zn<sup>2+</sup>, Pb<sup>2+</sup>, and Ba<sup>2+</sup> trace elements in calcite. *American Mineralogist*, **84**, 1049-1060.
- 853 Rimstidt, J.D., Balog, A. & Webb, J. 1998. Distribution of trace elements between carbonate minerals and aqueous  
854 solutions. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **62**, 1851-1863.
- 855 Roberts, M. S., Smart, P. & Baker, A., 1998. Annual trace element variations in a Holocene speleothem. *Earth and  
856 Planetary Science Letters*, **154**, 237-246.
- 857 Shopov, Y.Y., Ford, D.C. & Schwarcz, H.P. 1994. Luminescent microbanding in speleothems: High-resolution chronology  
858 and palaeoclimate. *Geology*, **22**, 407-410.
- 859 Smith, C.L., Baker, A., Fairchild, I.J., Frisia, S. & Borsato, A. 2006. Reconstructing hemispheric-scale climates from  
860 multiple stalagmite records. *International Journal of Climatology*, **26**, 1417-1424.
- 861 Smith, C.L., Fairchild, I.J., Spötl, C., Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Moreton, S.G. & Wynn, P.M. 2009. Chronology-building  
862 using objective identification of annual signals in trace element profiles of stalagmites. *Quaternary Geochronology*, **4**,  
863 11-21.
- 864 Solé, V.A. Papillon, E., Cotte, M., Walter, P. & Susini, J., 2007. PyMCA: A multiplatform code for the analysis of energy-  
865 dispersive X-ray fluorescence spectra. *Spectrochimica Acta B*, **62**, 63-68.
- 866 Spötl, C. & Mathey, D.P., 2006. Stable isotope microsampling of speleothems: a comparison of manual drill, micromill and  
867 laser ablation techniques. *Chemical Geology*, **235**, 48-58.
- 868 Spötl, C. & Vennemann, T.W., 2003. Continuous-flow isotope ratio mass spectrometric analysis of carbonate minerals.  
869 *Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry*, **17**, 1004-1006.

- 870 Spötl, C., Fairchild, I. J. & Tooth, A. F. 2005. Cave air control on dripwater geochemistry, Obir caves (Austria):  
 871 implications for speleothem deposition in dynamically ventilated caves. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, **69**, 2451-  
 872 2468.
- 873 Steinberg, S.M., Kimble, G.M., Schmett, G.T., Emerson, D.W., Turner, M.F. & Rudin, M. 2008. Abiotic reaction of iodate  
 874 with sphagnum peat and other natural organic matter. *Journal of Radioanalytical and Nuclear Chemistry*, **277**, 185-191.
- 875 Tan, M., Baker, A., Genty, D., Smith, C., Esper, J. & Cai, B., 2006. Applications of stalagmite laminae to paleoclimate  
 876 reconstructions: comparison with dendrochronology/climatology. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **25**, 2103-2117.
- 877 Tooth, A.F. & Fairchild, I.J. 2003 Soil and karst aquifer hydrological controls on the geochemical evolution of speleothem-  
 878 forming drip waters, Crag Cave, southwest Ireland. *Journal of Hydrology*, **273**, 51-68.
- 879 Treble, P., Shelley, J.M.G. & Chappell, J. 2003. Comparison of high resolution sub-annual records of trace elements in a  
 880 modern (1911-1992) speleothem with instrumental climate data from southwest Australia. *Earth and Planetary Science  
 881 Letters*, **216**, 141-153.
- 882 Wynn, P.M., Fairchild, I.J., Spötl, C. & EIMF 2009. High resolution sulphur isotope analysis of speleothem carbonate by  
 883 ion microprobe. *Chemical Geology* (submitted)
- 884 Zachara, J.M., Cowan, C.E. & Resch, C.T. 1991. Sorption of divalent metals on calcite. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*,  
 885 **55**, 1549-1562.

886  
 887

### 888 Figure captions

889 **Fig. 1.** Characteristics of Saulenhalle drips, mostly using continuously logged data. Features of all  
 890 four drips, including the three feeding the studied stalagmites is a lack of clear seasonality and large  
 891 inter-annual variations in mean drip rate. Water temperature is given for dripSH3 (Obi55) as an  
 892 example for comparison with air temperature. The two follow a similar pattern of a rise followed by a  
 893 fall during the winter season; this is attributed to the forcing effects of winter air ventilation.

894

895 **Fig. 2.** Petrology of stalagmite sample Obi84. **a.** image of ion microprobe section with calendar ages  
 896 of annual laminae superimposed. In the central part of the speleothem the laminae are approximately  
 897 tabular and horizontal, but curve and merge on the lateral flanks. **b.** Photomicrograph under crossed  
 898 polars of thin section made from synchrotron sample (viewed to a similar sample depth as in  
 899 photograph **a.**) illustrating quasi-columnar crystal morphology approximately normal to growth  
 900 surface. "S" indicates example of crystal with undulose (specifically, radial) extinction (see text).  
 901 Small red rectangle indicates area of electron backscatter diffraction (EBSD) map. **c.** EBSD map of a  
 902 grid of 931 by 701 points at 1  $\mu\text{m}$  resolution. The map has been false-coloured to highlight the relative  
 903 crystallographic orientations of the calcite across the map. The colour range blue to red indicates a 0°-  
 904 15° deviation in orientation with respect to the crystallographic orientation of the calcite at the  
 905 reference point indicated by the red cross near the centre. The large crystals to the right of the map are  
 906 grey and have no colour as the orientation of these crystals differ by more than 15° from that of the  
 907 reference point (see also Figure 1d). Scattered grey pixels in the upper and left areas of the map were  
 908 the results of systematic mis-indexing of the calcite diffraction patterns while others (mostly in the  
 909 central areas of the map) represent locations where the quality of the diffraction pattern was too poor to  
 910 give a solution for the crystallographic orientation of the calcite and were assigned a zero solution. The  
 911 map shows that the large crystals are divided into crystallites around 10  $\mu\text{m}$  wide. **d.** Upper-hemisphere  
 912 stereographic projections of the poles to potential indicated crystal forms for the crystals illustrated in  
 913 the EBSD map in Figure 1c. The XY plane of the projections is that of the surface of the sample  
 914 section. The colours shown correspond to those in Figure 1c. The reference point (red cross) shown in  
 915 Figure 1c was chosen as having a crystallographic orientation close to the centre of the brightly  
 916 coloured clusters. The grey clusters indicate the orientation of the large (grey) crystals to the right of  
 917 Figure 1c. The {0001} diagram also corresponds to the zone axis and orientation of the z  
 918 crystallographic axis which can be seen to be sub-vertical in the diagram, corresponding to sub-  
 919 perpendicular to the elongation and growth directions of crystals at the top of the stalagmite, i.e. the  
 920 crystals are optically length-slow. The {10-11} diagram displays a pole to one face approximately in  
 921 the equatorial plane: this is thought to be equivalent to the flat face seen on crystallite tops in Fig. 3b.

922

923 **Fig. 3.** Petrology of sample Obi84. **a.** ion probe thin section, transmitted light illustrating a series of  
 924 annual event laminae with the last one being close to the top of the sample prior to collection in

925 December 2002. Zig-zag crystallite shapes are visible, and are of much higher relief in the 1998 layer,  
 926 apparently corresponding to a pit on the crystal surface which subsequently evolves into a (black) air  
 927 inclusion. A within-year hiatus prior to the 2000 infiltration lamina is marked by a re-nucleation  
 928 horizon (hi). **b.** SEM of top surface of sample illustrating crystallites which display a mixture of flat  
 929 smooth surfaces and rough surfaces representing stacked edges.

930  
 931 **Fig 4.** Stalagmite petrology. **a.** Sample Obi 84, transmitted light, illustrating two annual infiltration  
 932 laminae. The lower one illustrates three (arrowed) sub-laminae plus internal reflections, whereas the  
 933 upper one is a single lamina. The fibrous sub-vertical structure of crystallites is seen to correspond to  
 934 the zig-zag lamina structure. **b.** Sample Obi84. Arrow illustrates hiatus between infiltration laminae for  
 935 the years 1889 and 1890. To the left of the arrow the hiatus disappears. To the right (the stalagmite  
 936 flank) various laminae converge to give more prominent hiatus (i.e. renucleation) surface. **c.** and **d.**  
 937 Sample Obi12. **c.** Prominent hiatus surface with box (0.9 mm long) showing location of photo **d.** **d.**  
 938 enlargement of hiatus, illustrating local area where growth continued throughout (arrows indicate  
 939 individual annual infiltration laminae). The hiatus itself, although very prominent in photo **c**, is only of  
 940 three or four years duration.

941  
 942 **Fig. 5.** Depth trends in stalagmite Obi84 (**a** to **c**) and Obi12 (**d**). **a.** stable isotope data derived by  
 943 micromilling at 0.1 mm intervals; thick lines are 5-point moving averages. **b.** Variations in lamina  
 944 thickness; calendar years are shown at 20-year intervals. **c** and **d.** Trends in composition with depth  
 945 from ICP analyses of samples drilled at approximately 1.5 mm intervals. Data for 10 elements is  
 946 summarized in Table 1. S increases during the 20<sup>th</sup> century whereas the base metals tend to decrease,  
 947 especially in Obi84.

948  
 949 **Fig. 6.** Chemical trends in sample Obi84 across an interval of wide laminae corresponding to the years  
 950 1958 to 1966 (year marker indicates position of visible infiltration lamina for that year). Compare with  
 951 Fig 8. **a.** ion microprobe traverse of negative secondary ions (15  $\mu\text{m}$  step interval) illustrating the  
 952 offset of S variability from P. Horizontal bars are low S intervals which tend to overlap with or follow  
 953 P peaks. **b.** Ion microprobe traverse of  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ ; analytical spots are around 25  $\mu\text{m}$  in diameter and spaced  
 954 at 50  $\mu\text{m}$  intervals. Inset photograph illustrates that the points are arranged in interwoven forward-and-  
 955 back arrays which can be identified on dataplot by numbered points. Significant within-year variation  
 956 in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  is demonstrated.

957  
 958 **Fig. 7.** Trends in S and P in the last few years of growth of sample Obi84. The horizontal scale is  
 959 distance rather than time since infiltration laminae were not clearly visible in this section, but the P  
 960 peaks match the lamina widths in a laterally adjacent profile (but note poor P peak in 1996 and double  
 961 peak in 2000). S displays low intervals partly overlapping and partly following P peaks, and also  
 962 displays a distinct downward inter-annual trend; likewise dripwater sulphate declined by 25% between  
 963 1999 and 2003 in Säulenhalle (Spötl et al. 2005).

964  
 965 **Fig. 8.** Chemical trends in sample Obi84 for the years 1958 to 1966 (compare with Fig. 6). **a.** ion  
 966 microprobe analyses of positive secondary ions (5-point moving average of 5  $\mu\text{m}$  steps); note Sr is on  
 967 right-hand axis and its scale is linear and reversed. H, Mg, Na and P tend to peak at visible laminae,  
 968 inverse to Sr. **b.** ion microprobe analysis of negative secondary ions (5  $\mu\text{m}$  steps). P, F, Br and I  
 969 enrichments coincide with visible laminae, but Cl does not display distinctive variation.

970  
 971 **Fig. 9.** Line scan of Pb (three-point moving average of analyses at 5  $\mu\text{m}$  intervals in sample Obi84)  
 972 using X-ray fluorescence induced by relatively low-energy synchrotron radiation. The concentrations  
 973 have been normalized to ppm using the mean composition from ICP-MS analysis in the same interval.  
 974 The depth beneath the top surface of visible annual laminae in a similar, but different slice of the  
 975 sample is shown as is the magnitude of autumn (September to December) rainfall since the year 1922.

976 The highest Pb peak is closest to 1946 in the chronology of the other slice, but there is a registration  
977 uncertainty of  $\pm 3$  years because of the curvature of the laminae.  
978

979 **Fig. 10.** Obir84, level within the area of the EBSD map of Fig. 2. X-ray elemental mapping at ultra-  
980 high resolution, sample Obi 84, induced by relatively low-energy synchrotron radiation. **a.** a low-  
981 resolution map (400 by 100  $\mu\text{m}$ ), showing the development of four annual laminae rich in Pb. **b.** high-  
982 resolution maps, 30 by 30  $\mu\text{m}$  with 1  $\mu\text{m}$  pixels of Pb, Zn, P and Mg. The Pb map displays a 15  $\mu\text{m}$ -  
983 wide zone of enrichment with two 1-2  $\mu\text{m}$  high-Pb zones within it. The enrichment zone is also  
984 displayed, but less prominently in the Zn and P maps. All maps show an oblique structure running  
985 from upper right to lower left, seen to correspond to crystallite development by the zig-zag pattern of  
986 the Pb zones. The grey shade linear scale-bar below the image has the following upper and lower limits  
987 in counts: Pb (0-154), Zn (0-12), P (0-31) and Mg (0-22). **c.** X-ray emission energy spectrum showing  
988 the location of peaks used to produce the maps. Elements in small type are too insignificant to quantify.  
989 The excitation energy was 2.9 keV and the peak at around this energy is due to scattering.  
990

991 **Fig. 11.** X-ray fluorescence mapping using high-energy synchrotron radiation very close to the top of  
992 the Obi 84 sample. **a.** Energy spectrum resulting from excitation with 23 keV radiation. Only Zn, Pb,  
993 Ca and Sr can be reliably quantified using a deconvolution procedure. **b.** scale bars in maps in counts  
994 (logarithmic for Zn and Pb and linear for Ca and Sr). **c.** Elemental maps of an area 1.1 mm by 0.04 mm  
995 at 2  $\mu\text{m}$  resolution (top of section at left side). Probably eight annual layers are shown by Zn and Pb  
996 with a complex pattern of enriched micro-laminae because of excitation of crystallites at different  
997 depths below the surface: hence this is a pseudo-3D image. Levels of Zn and Pb are more uniformly  
998 high in two annual cycles on the far right.  
999

1000

1001

Drip site	Collection date of stalagmite	Start date of observations		Discharge, $\mu\text{l}/\text{sec}$	minimum drip rate, $\mu\text{l}/\text{sec}$	EC $\mu\text{S}/\text{cm}$	pH	HCO <sub>3</sub>	SO <sub>4</sub>	NO <sub>3</sub>	Cl	Na	K	Mg/Ca	Ca	Mg	Sr	SiO <sub>2</sub>	Calcite saturation index	pCO <sub>2</sub>	$\delta^{18}\text{O}$	$\delta\text{D}$	$\delta^{13}\text{C}$
SH1	August 1998 Obi12	September 1998	mean	2.06	0.11	292	8.19	186	5.29	4.01	0.49	0.32	0.23	0.15	51.51	7.74	0.03	1.52	0.44	-3.05	-10.25	-69.37	-9.91
			stdev	1.82		11	0.15	10	0.44	1.25	0.12	0.03	0.03	0.02	3.47	0.62	0.01	0.25	0.15	0.15	0.15	1.09	1.15
			n	44		45	44	45	45	44	44	44	44	45	45	45	45	45	29	40	44	44	45
SH2	not collected	November 2000	mean	0.42	0.08	252	8.19	158	5.11	2.61	0.50	0.36	0.25	0.17	42.89	7.19	0.03	1.50	0.29	-3.11	-10.11	-67.59	-8.43
			stdev	0.39		38	0.12	24	0.28	0.55	0.13	0.08	0.04	0.03	8.78	0.42	0.01	0.12	0.16	0.15	0.18	1.64	2.45
			n	31		29	31	32	32	31	32	32	31	32	32	32	18	30	31	31	31	32	27
SH3	May 2001 Obi55	May 2001	mean	4.42	2.20	296	8.23	191	4.76	2.38	0.45	0.32	0.23	0.13	52.97	7.07	0.04	1.53	0.51	-3.07	-10.23	-68.82	-10.27
			stdev	1.02		17	0.13	9	0.21	0.29	0.10	0.06	0.03	0.02	5.26	0.43	0.01	0.20	0.13	0.14	0.10	0.79	0.92
			n	27		26	25	26	26	26	26	26	26	26	26	26	13	26	25	25	25	26	22
SH4	December 2002 Obi84	February 2002	mean	9.08	2.70	299	8.24	190	4.44	2.64	0.40	0.33	0.23	0.14	51.17	7.03	0.03	1.64	0.58	-3.15	-10.25	-69.12	-10.26
			stdev	3.82		13	0.10	12	0.11	0.80	0.20	0.03	0.02	0.02	4.65	0.23	0.01	0.15	0.07	0.09	0.10	0.76	0.75
			n	17	10	14	13	16	7	7	7	10	10	9	9	9	4	5	7	7	16	13	17

1002

1003

1004

1005

1006

**Table 1.** Summary of drip hydrochemistry including samples collected to the end of 2003.

mm below top	Mg	P	S	Mn	Cu	Zn	Sr	Y	Ba	Pb	number of analyses
<b>Obi 84</b>											
0-10	903	66	42.4	0.99	2.2	3410	32.4	0.020	174	500	8
11-20	976	52	6.7	1.01	2.7	4590	35.3	0.040	196	770	6
>20	1040	67	10.5	0.87	3.4	6420	30.9	0.039	191	1360	7
<b>Obi 12</b>											
0-10	1160	56	30.6	1.02	4.5	4010	32.6	0.015	244	370	8
11-20	1280	67	12.8	0.67	3.8	5970	29.2	0.014	234	630	6
>20	1250	93	17.3	1.3	5.4	5690	30.9	0.020	237	510	5

1007

1008

1009

1010

**Table 2.** Bulk compositions of stalagmite samples (ppm in calcite).

	Dripwater Mg/Ca	Stalagmite Mg/Ca (top 0.5 mm)	$K_{\text{Mg}}$	Drip water Sr/Ca	Stalagmite Sr/Ca (top mm)	$K_{\text{Sr}}$
<b>Obi 12</b>	0.15 (0.13 - 0.21)	0.003 (0.0025-0.004)	0.020	$6.9 \cdot 10^{-4}$ ( $5.1 - 9.0 \cdot 10^{-4}$ )	$9.2 \cdot 10^{-5}$ ( $8.3 - 9.8 \cdot 10^{-4}$ )	0.13
<b>Obi 55</b>	0.13 (0.12 - 0.20)	0.0024 0.0011-0.0031	0.018	$7.4 \cdot 10^{-4}$ ( $4.7 - 8.8 \cdot 10^{-4}$ )	$8.6 \cdot 10^{-5}$ ( $8.0 - 9.4 \cdot 10^{-4}$ )	0.12
<b>Obi 84</b>	0.14 (0.13 - 0.17)	0.0021 (0.001 - -0.0032)	0.015	$7.0 \cdot 10^{-4}$ ( $5.3 - 9.0 \cdot 10^{-4}$ )	$5.5 \cdot 10^{-5}$ ( $3.9 - 7.9 \cdot 10^{-4}$ )	0.079

1011

1012

1013

1014

**Table 3.** Mean values (and range in parentheses) of dripwater and stalagmite Mg and Sr compositions with the calculated value of the distribution coefficient  $K$ .

		Al	Si	P	Fe	Cu	Zn	Sr	Y	Ba	Pb
<b>SH3 (n=12)</b>	mean	31	781	48	287	6.7	48	38	0.020	128	3.0
	stdev	31	295	76	36	5.5	24	2	0.023	4	2.3
<b>SH4 (n=6)</b>	mean	33	707	38	270	4.8	48	34	0.021	115	2.9
	stdev	29	240	14	38	0.8	25	2	0.021	8	2.1

1015

1016

1017

1018

**Table 4.** Indicative ICP-MS analyses (in ppb) of drip water trace element compositions for SH3 (Obi55, month-long collection) and SH4 (Obi84, instantaneous collection).

1019

	<b>Ca</b>	<b>Mg</b>	<b>Cu</b>	<b>Zn</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>Pb</b>
<b>Distribution coefficient, calculated</b>	-	0.017	0.059	9.1	0.122	22
<b>% efficiency of removal</b>	0.63	0.010	0.04	5.7	0.076	14

1020

1021

1022

1023

**Table 5.** Summary of water-calcite partitioning calculations for the top 10 mm of Obi84 (SH4) from data in Tables 1 and 4.