

# Origins of dissociations in the English past tense:

## A synthetic brain imaging model

1 Gert Westermann<sup>1\*</sup>, Samuel Jones<sup>1</sup>

2 <sup>1</sup>Department of Psychology, Lancaster University, Lancaster, UK

3

4 \* Correspondence:

5 Gert Westermann

6 g.westermann@lancaster.ac.uk

7 **Keywords:** English past tense, connectionist modeling, synthetic brain imaging, experience-  
8 dependent brain development, verb inflection, verb morphology, neuroconstructivism

9 **Abstract**

10 Brain imaging studies of English past tense inflection have found dissociations between regular and  
11 irregular verbs, but no coherent picture has emerged to explain how these dissociations arise. Here  
12 we use synthetic brain imaging on a neural network model to provide a mechanistic account of the  
13 origins of such dissociations. The model suggests that dissociations between regional activation  
14 patterns in verb inflection emerge in an adult processing system that has been shaped through  
15 experience-dependent structural brain development. Although these dissociations appear to be  
16 between regular and irregular verbs, they arise in the model from a combination of statistical  
17 properties including frequency, relationships to other verbs, and phonological complexity, without a  
18 causal role for regularity or semantics. These results are consistent with the notion that all inflections  
19 are produced in a single associative mechanism. The model generates predictions about the  
20 patterning of active brain regions for different verbs that can be tested in future imaging studies.

21

22 **1 Introduction**

23 The English past tense has, over the past 35 years, taken center stage in debate on the nature of  
24 language and cognitive processing. This is because the past tense is a prototypical ‘rules-and-  
25 exceptions’ system, with regular verbs that form their past tense by adding *-ed* to the stem (e.g.,  
26 *look-looked*), and irregular verbs with past tense forms that range from no change (*hit-hit*) and vowel  
27 changes with or without suffixation (*sleep-slept*, *sing-sang*) to completely idiosyncratic forms (*go-*  
28 *went*). The main question around which this debate has revolved is whether there are separate  
29 processing mechanisms for regular and irregular verbs, or if they can be accounted for in a system  
30 that produces both regular and irregular forms through a single associative mechanism. This question  
31 is important because it has wider implications, for example, for the rule-like nature of grammar (*is*  
32 *rule-like behavior evidence for an underlying mental rule or can it be explained through associative*  
33 *processes?*) and for the question of whether behavioral dissociations imply that the language system  
34 has a modular architecture. These questions touch on the very nature of language and cognitive

35 processing, and the English past tense has therefore been called the ‘drosophila of language  
36 processing’ ([Pinker, 1994](#)); a model system in which such questions can be studied in detail.

37 Two dominant theories of the nature of inflection processing have emerged. One view, the dual-  
38 mechanism or words-and-rules theory (e.g., [Clahsen, 1999](#); [Marcus, Brinkmann, Clahsen, Wiese, &](#)  
39 [Pinker, 1995](#); [Pinker, 1991, 1997, 1999](#); [Pinker & Ullman, 2002](#); [Ullman, 2004](#); [Ullman et al., 1997](#))  
40 holds that the processing differences between regular and irregular forms that have been observed in  
41 many studies are caused by distinct, qualitatively different underlying mechanisms: A mental  
42 symbolic rule for regular forms, and associative storage in the mental lexicon for irregular forms.  
43 According to this view grammatical differences are psychologically real in that the mental grammar  
44 is used directly in language processing ([Clahsen, 1999](#)), so that language processing separates into an  
45 associative mental lexicon and a rule-based system (i.e., words-and-rules).

46 An alternative view argues that all past tense forms are processed in a single associative system in  
47 which overlapping representations for regular and irregular forms compete for processing resources  
48 (e.g., [Bybee & Slobin, 1982](#); [Joanisse & Seidenberg, 1999](#); [MacWhinney & Leinbach, 1991](#);  
49 [Marchman, 1993](#); [McClelland & Patterson, 2002](#); [Plunkett & Juola, 1999](#); [Plunkett & Marchman,](#)  
50 [1991, 1993](#); [Rumelhart & McClelland, 1986](#); [Westermann & Plunkett, 2007](#); [Westermann & Ruh,](#)  
51 [2012](#), [Engelmann et al., 2019](#)). This view is closely tied to implemented connectionist neural network  
52 models that have simulated how graded dissociations between different verbs can arise without  
53 recourse to modularity and qualitatively different processes. In these systems, apparent dissociations  
54 between regular and irregular forms emerge on the basis of the different statistical properties of  
55 verbs, such as frequency, phonological complexity, similar sounding verbs with a similar sounding  
56 past tense form (i.e., ‘friends’; e.g., *sing* and *ring*), similar sounding verbs with a different sounding  
57 past tense form (i.e., ‘enemies’; e.g., *sing* and *bring*), or due to reliance on semantic versus  
58 phonological factors.

59 A large amount of empirical and computational work has aimed to provide evidence for each view  
60 (for an overview, see [McClelland & Patterson, 2002](#); [Pinker & Ullman, 2002](#); [Westermann & Ruh,](#)  
61 [2012](#)). While much of this research has focused on behavioral data from language acquisition and  
62 studies involving adults with and without brain damage, a number of brain imaging studies have also  
63 revealed brain regions involved in processing different verb inflections. These studies have found  
64 differences in neural activation patterns when participants inflected regular and irregular verbs,  
65 evidence cited by some researchers as support for a dual mechanism system in which the rule  
66 component and the associative mental lexicon are located in different brain regions (e.g., [Bakker, I.,](#)  
67 [MacGregor, L. J., Pulvermüller, F., & Shtyrov, 2013](#); [Dhond, Marinkovic, Dale, Witzel, & Halgren,](#)  
68 [2003](#); [Jaeger et al., 1996](#); [Lavric, Pizzagalli, Forstmeier, & Rippon, 2001](#); [Sahin, Pinker, & Halgren,](#)  
69 [2006](#); [Oh et al., 2011](#); for an overview see [Leminen, Smolka, Duñabeitia & Pliatsikas, 2019](#)). For  
70 example, in a seminal study by [Jaeger et al. \(1996\)](#) using positron-emission tomography (PET),  
71 participants were asked to generate past tense forms of visually presented monosyllabic verb stems.  
72 [Jaeger et al. \(1996\)](#) predicted that the left frontal lobe should be involved in regular processing due to  
73 its role in grammatical processing. Likewise, inflection of irregulars was predicted to involve  
74 posterior temporal or parietal activity as an index of memory retrieval. Results showed that although  
75 many brain regions were activated equally by all verbs, production of regulars selectively activated  
76 left dorsolateral prefrontal cortex and left anterior cingulate cortex. Irregulars, meanwhile, prompted  
77 higher overall activation and involved occipital visual processing areas. These systematic differences  
78 between both verb types were interpreted by the authors as strong evidence for the dual-mechanism  
79 account of inflection. Similar claims were made by [Lavric et al. \(2001\)](#) in an ERP study of covert  
80 past tense production. These authors found differences between regular and irregular past tense forms

81 in a time window from 288-321 ms after visual presentation of the verb stem, and source localization  
82 indicated higher activation during this time window for regulars in right prefrontal and temporal  
83 areas and higher activation for irregulars in the left temporal area and the anterior cingulate cortex.

84 In another study using magnetoencephalography (MEG), Dhond et al. (2003) asked participants to  
85 covertly generate past tense forms of visually presented verb stems. Dhond et al. also found that  
86 generation of regulars and irregulars activated many brain areas in common, but that processing of  
87 regulars led to greater activation in left inferior prefrontal areas (Broca's area), and processing of  
88 irregulars preferentially activated left occipitotemporal cortex as well as right dorsolateral prefrontal  
89 cortex. These results were interpreted as indicating that regulars activated rule-based grammar  
90 regions and irregulars activated areas involved in the associative retrieval of forms, corresponding  
91 directly to the dual-mechanism theory. Different results were found in an fMRI study of covert past  
92 tense and plural production (Sahin et al., 2006) in which Broca's area was activated equally by  
93 regular and irregular verbs. Irregulars activated the anterior cingulate and supplementary motor area  
94 more than regulars, whereas regulars led to greater activation in some subcortical structures. Overall  
95 there was greater activation for irregulars. These results were interpreted within the dual-mechanism  
96 framework by suggesting that activation differences between regulars and irregulars were evidence  
97 for separate mechanisms and, therefore, against a single mechanism of inflection. Specifically, it was  
98 argued that Broca's area was involved in inflection processing, and that greater activation associated  
99 with irregulars indicated blocking of the application of the rule by a retrieved irregular form.

100 However, the results of these and other studies have been controversial. One problem is that specific  
101 methodological choices can strongly affect results. For example, because of the low temporal  
102 resolution of PET, Jaeger et al. (1996) used a block design in which all regular verbs and all irregular  
103 verbs were presented together. However, this design introduces the confound that participants could  
104 develop response strategies for regular but not for irregular verbs, suggesting that differences  
105 between both verb types should be found independently of the nature of the underlying processing  
106 mechanisms (Seidenberg & Hoeffner, 1998). Furthermore there have been inconsistencies between  
107 studies in the brain areas that were activated by different verbs (see also Table 1 in Desai, Conant,  
108 Waldron, & Binder, 2006). For example, Broca's area was activated selectively by regulars in one  
109 study (Dhond et al., 2003) which led the authors to argue that it is responsible for rule-based  
110 processing, but it was active equally for regular and irregular verbs in another (Sahin et al., 2006).  
111 Likewise, greater activation of the anterior cingulate cortex was found for regulars in one study  
112 (Jaeger et al., 1996) and for irregulars in others (Lavric et al., 2001; Sahin et al., 2006).

113 Several other imaging studies have investigated the possibility that the observed activation  
114 differences between regular and irregular verbs are due to the different statistical properties of verbs  
115 and not to separate underlying mechanisms. For example, an fMRI study in which participants  
116 covertly produced the past tense of auditorily presented stems (Joanisse & Seidenberg, 2005) found  
117 that regulars and irregulars activated common areas in both hemispheres, but that regulars, as well as  
118 irregulars that were phonologically similar to regulars (e.g., *burnt*, *slept*), additionally activated the  
119 inferior frontal gyrus bilaterally. In this study, irregulars did not activate any area more than regulars.  
120 Dissociations between verbs were thus argued to arise from the phonological properties of verbs  
121 instead of their regularity. In a similar fMRI study, Desai, Conant, Waldron, & Binder (2006) also  
122 found widespread overlapping activation, including in Broca's area, for all verbs, and greater  
123 activation for regulars in the left dorsal superior temporal gyrus, involving the primary auditory areas  
124 and the planum temporale. This study also found regions of greater activation for irregulars compared  
125 with regulars (inferior frontal, precentral cortex and parietal cortex bilaterally). When the authors  
126 matched a subset of their verb set for phonological complexity of the past tense form, they found that

127 no regions were activated more for regulars than for irregulars. Desai et al. (2006) explained the  
128 widespread activation of brain regions for irregular verbs in terms of higher demands on attention,  
129 working memory, and response selection for generating the past tense forms of these verbs. The fact  
130 that both regular and irregular production activated Broca's area was seen as contradicting the dual-  
131 mechanism account which assumes that regular, but not irregular forms are generated through a  
132 mental grammar instantiated in Broca's area ([Ullman et al., 1997](#)). Greater activation in auditory  
133 areas for regulars was explained with regular forms being phonologically more complex than  
134 irregular forms (Burzio, 2002; Bird et al, 2003). Therefore, despite double dissociations between  
135 regular and irregular verbs these results were interpreted as evidence for a single-mechanism view of  
136 inflection processing.

137 In summary, previous imaging studies, despite each reporting single or double dissociations between  
138 regular and irregular verbs, have not provided a coherent picture of the brain areas involved in  
139 processing the English past tense: First, the activated regions for specific verb types differed  
140 considerably between studies; and second, the nature of the dissociations differed between studies.  
141 One study ([Joanisse & Seidenberg, 2005](#)) reported activation of distinct brain regions for regulars but  
142 not irregulars, another ([Desai et al., 2006](#)) reported the opposite pattern with distinct regions active  
143 for irregulars but not for regulars when verbs were matched phonologically, and other studies ([Dhond](#)  
144 [et al., 2003](#); [Jaeger et al., 1996](#); Oh et al., 2011; [Sahin et al., 2006](#)) reported a double dissociation  
145 with some regions more active for regulars and others more active for irregulars (although these  
146 regions differed in each case). These inconsistent patterns of activation have made it difficult to  
147 sufficiently constrain the theories of inflection for (or against) which they were meant to provide  
148 evidence. For example, involvement of Broca's area in the inflection of both regular and irregular  
149 verbs has been claimed to provide evidence both for ([Sahin et al., 2006](#)) and against ([Desai et al.,](#)  
150 [2006](#)) dual-mechanism views of inflection.

151 One possible explanation for the inconsistency in observed activation patterns in the discussed  
152 neuroimaging studies is that statistical factors and not grammatical class determine how a verb is  
153 processed, and that these factors differed between the specific verb stimuli used in existing studies. In  
154 each study, regular and irregular verbs were matched on certain factors, but the choice of factors had  
155 little theoretical foundation and differed greatly between studies. Jaeger et al. ([1996](#)) matched stem  
156 and past tense frequencies (albeit based on a word list that did not distinguish between nouns and  
157 verbs and therefore overestimated regular stem frequencies), Lavric et al. ([2001](#)) and Dhond et al.  
158 ([2003](#)) matched word frequency and letter length, Sahin et al. ([2006](#)) matched past and stem cluster  
159 frequency and syllable length and aimed for phonological similarity, Oh et al. (2011) matched  
160 phonological complexity and past tense frequency, and Joanisse & Seidenberg ([2005](#)) matched past  
161 tense frequency, imageability, and concreteness. The most careful matching was done by Desai et  
162 al.'s ([2006](#)), with past tense frequency, friend-enemy ratio, stem letter length, and stem and past tense  
163 syllable length all taken into account, in addition to a sub-group of verbs being further matched on  
164 number of phonemes and past tense syllable structure. However, which of these factors affect  
165 processing, and in what way, remains an open question. It is therefore also unclear whether a  
166 processing system that is sensitive to the statistical properties of verbs would give rise to the  
167 observed dissociations in active brain regions.

168 One approach to answering these questions is to consider how the adult language processing system  
169 is shaped through development. Adult psycholinguistics traditionally pays little heed to the  
170 mechanisms of language development although a better understanding of developmental trajectories  
171 could inform the nature of the adult processing system. Taking this perspective, in this paper we train  
172 an artificial neural network model on English past tense inflection (Westermann & Ruh, 2012),

173 adopting a neuroconstructivist developmental process in which the architecture of the adult inflection  
174 processing system emerges through an interaction between experience-dependent structural  
175 development and experiences with verbs that have specific statistical properties. We then use what  
176 has been called ‘synthetic brain imaging’ (e.g., [Arbib, Billard, Iacoboni, & Oztop, 2000](#); [Arbib,](#)  
177 [Bischoff, Fagg, & Grafton, 1994](#); [Horwitz, Tagamets, & McIntosh, 1999](#); [Tagamets & Horwitz,](#)  
178 [1998](#), Cangelosi & Parisi, 2004, Thomas, Purser, Tomlinson & Mareschal, 2012) to analyze  
179 activation patterns across different parts of the model and show that such a system displays visible  
180 processing differences between regular and irregular verbs without relying on built-in dissociable  
181 processing modules. Finally, we investigate which statistical properties account for the observed  
182 dissociations, generating predictions for behavioral and imaging studies.

183 The computational model used in the current paper was developed by Westermann and Ruh (2012)  
184 for modeling behavioral aspects of the acquisition and adult processing of the English past tense.  
185 This model displayed a realistic acquisition profile, adult-like non-word generalization, and selective  
186 breakdown after damage to parts of the network. The model is based on the neuroconstructivist  
187 framework ([Mareschal et al., 2007](#); [Quartz & Sejnowski, 1997](#); [Westermann et al., 2007](#)), which  
188 stresses the importance of experience-dependent structural brain development in shaping an adult  
189 processing system that is specifically adapted to the learning task. There is overwhelming evidence  
190 that experience shapes the brain during cognitive development (e.g., Bick & Nelson, 2017; [Casey,](#)  
191 [Giedd, & Thomas, 2000](#); [Casey, Tottenham, Liston, & Durston, 2005](#); [Johnson, 2001](#); [Johnson &](#)  
192 [Munakata, 2005](#); [Mareschal et al., 2007](#); [Nelson, Moulson, & Richmond, 2006](#); [Quartz, 1999](#); [Quartz](#)  
193 [& Sejnowski, 1997](#); [Stiles, 2009](#); [Westermann et al., 2007](#)), and that differences in adult brain  
194 structures can at least partly be explained by a developmental process by which the brain adapts to  
195 the specific aspects of the tasks being learned. For example, one study involving Chinese-speaking  
196 adults and English-speaking adults living in the United States reported specific differences in the size  
197 of frontal, temporal and parietal cortical substrates between these groups ([Kochunov et al., 2003](#)).  
198 This structural difference was interpreted by the authors as an outcome of the different orthographic,  
199 phonetic and semantic characteristics of Chinese and English, which impacted experience-dependent  
200 brain development. Likewise, structural brain changes have been observed when learning a second  
201 language (see Li, Legault & Litcofsky, 2014, for a review) and for bilinguals (see Bialystok, 2017,  
202 for review). For example, native Japanese speakers trained on learning English words for 16 weeks  
203 showed an increased density of gray and white matter in the right IFG, but a control group did not  
204 show these changes (Hosoda, Tanaka, Nariai, Honda & Hanakawa, 2013). Anatomical change in this  
205 study correlated positively with the participants’ knowledge of English vocabulary. Other studies  
206 have begun to address systematic cross-linguistic variation in the neural structures supporting  
207 language processing ([Chen et al., 2009](#); Mei et al, 2015) and more broadly have asked how specific  
208 experiences affect brain organization in members of different cultures ([Park & Huang, 2010](#)). Here,  
209 along similar lines, we argue that the specific processing demands of the English inflection system  
210 will lead to brain structures that are adapted to these demands through experience-dependent  
211 development. From this perspective, the specific dissociations between brain activation patterns  
212 observed in the adult language system are the outcome of experience-dependent structural  
213 development under the task demands of learning verb inflections with their characteristic distribution  
214 and statistical properties. This view is in contrast to a modular view of language processing according  
215 to which functionally specialized modules implement qualitatively different mental processes (e.g.,  
216 [Pinker, 1994](#)).

217 Translating these ideas into a computational model, the artificial neural network described here  
218 integrates structural changes that mimic, on an abstract level, the experience-dependent development  
219 of cortical regions through childhood, allowing for the adaptation of its neural circuits to the specific

220 demands of learning to inflect a large set of English verbs. It should be noted, however, that our  
221 relatively simple model, despite integrating aspects of neural development, is not a computational  
222 neuroscience model that aims to account for the formation of biological synapses or the internal  
223 processes of biological neurons, or to mimic the specific aspects of experience-dependent brain  
224 development. Connectionist models are usually conceptualized as higher-level models that are based  
225 on an abstract and simplified view of neural processing in the brain (e.g., Rumelhart, 1989):  
226 Interactions between simple processing units to generate complex behavior; learning of associations  
227 by adapting the efficacy of transmission between processing units; and the ability to extract statistical  
228 structures from the environment. As high-level models, units ('neurons') in connectionist models are  
229 not assumed to correspond to biological neurons on a one-to-one basis but instead to large ensembles  
230 of biological neurons (e.g., O'Reilly & Munakata, 2000). Nevertheless, the model is grounded in the  
231 assumptions that first, task-driven structural adaptation during learning qualitatively changes the  
232 learning process compared with learning in a fixed structure (Quartz, 1993; Quartz & Sejnowski,  
233 1997; Westermann & Ruh, 2012; Westermann, 2016), and second, that it shapes the functional  
234 structure of the final system (Mareschal et al., 2007; Shultz et al, 2007) so that the adult system can  
235 best be understood as an outcome of such a structural developmental process. In building the model,  
236 therefore, we were interested in a principled mechanistic account of how a processing system that is  
237 sensitive to the statistical properties of verbs to which it is exposed while undergoing a structural  
238 developmental process gives rise to the dissociations between activation patterns for different verbs  
239 that are observed in adult neuroimaging studies.

240 Synthetic brain imaging ([Arbib, Billard, Jacoboni, & Oztop, 2000](#); [Arbib, Bischoff, Fagg, & Grafton,](#)  
241 [1994](#); [Horwitz, Tagamets, & McIntosh, 1999](#); [Tagamets & Horwitz, 1998](#)) applies the idea of brain  
242 imaging – comparing brain region activation profiles between different test conditions to gain  
243 insights into underlying processing mechanisms – to artificial neural networks. In a structured neural  
244 network, different stimuli will generate specific activation patterns in different network components  
245 and, like in brain imaging, these patterns can be compared between conditions. Although synthetic  
246 brain imaging is still in initial stages of exploration, several results have been reported in modeling  
247 language processing. For example, one study showed how differential activation patterns for nouns  
248 and verbs arose in evolved agent-based networks (Cangelosi & Parisi, 2004). Whereas nouns  
249 activated preferentially sensory processing areas of the networks, verbs activated multisensory  
250 integration areas more broadly. These activation patterns were compared with brain imaging data  
251 showing that nouns activate more posterior brain areas whereas verbs also activate anterior motor  
252 areas. In another study, synthetic brain imaging was used in a model of sentence comprehension  
253 (Just, Carpenter, & Varma, 1999) and accounted for fMRI data on brain regions involved in  
254 processing sentences of different complexities. A third study used synthetic brain imaging and  
255 lesioning to investigate whether impairment after brain damage and neuroimaging predict the same  
256 patterns of functional specialization ([Thomas, Purser, Tomlinson, & Mareschal, 2012](#)).

257 In deciding how to measure the synthetic analogue to the fMRI BOLD signal it is important to  
258 consider which aspect of neural processing is reflected by BOLD. Current understanding is that the  
259 BOLD signal in fMRI does not measure neural activity (i.e., spike potentials) but rather the local  
260 field potential (LFP), which reflects the summation of post-synaptic potentials ([Logothetis, Pauls,](#)  
261 [Augath, Trinath, & Oeltermann, 2001](#); [Norris, 2006](#)). This view would indicate that the closest  
262 correlate in a connectionist model to the BOLD signal is the incoming activation into a group of  
263 units, that is, the activation flowing through a pathway to this set of units. While it is beyond the  
264 scope of this report to explain in detail the many different activation patterns that have been observed  
265 in neuroimaging studies of the past tense, we aim to show how differential activation patterns can be  
266 generated in a single-mechanism system that is shaped through interactions between the statistical

267 structure of the environment and experience-dependent brain development. In doing so we will  
268 account for some empirical results in detail and generate predictions for future neuroimaging studies.

269 There are a number of reasons why synthetic brain imaging using neural networks can inform theory  
270 building and help generate predictions for assessment in studies using real brain imaging. First, in  
271 neural networks, the experimenter has full control over the studied process. In imaging studies of  
272 inflection processing, the large number of active brain areas suggests that it is difficult to find a  
273 baseline condition that differs from the experimental condition only in the inflection process. For  
274 example, Desai et al. (2006) reported that the baseline task of reading verbs activated some brain  
275 regions that were not active when the verbs were inflected. In a model of verb inflection that takes a  
276 verb stem as input and produces its past tense as output, the inflection process can be isolated  
277 effectively. It is therefore not necessary to establish a baseline condition (such as reading a verb  
278 without inflecting it) and subtracting this baseline activation from the observed activation patterns in  
279 the inflection task. Second, a computational model allows for the precise analysis of what factors  
280 affect differential activation of network components in a much larger set of verbs than those typically  
281 used in neuroimaging studies, where small sets of verbs have to be matched for statistical factors.  
282 Third, the language experience that has shaped the computational model towards its final structure is  
283 precisely known and is under the control of the modeler. This allows for a better characterization of  
284 the statistical factors that underpin emerging dissociations.

## 285 **2 Materials and Method**

### 286 **2.1 The model**

287 The neuroconstructivist neural network model (NCM, Westermann & Ruh, 2012) (Figure 1) starts  
288 out with a minimal architecture in which the input and output layers are fully connected. In a process  
289 of experience-dependent structural development, the hidden layer gradually expands to enable the  
290 past tense inflection task to be learned. The ‘adult’ architecture of the model is therefore an outcome  
291 of, and optimally adapted to, the specific learning task.

292 **==== Figure 1 here =====**

293 In (Westermann and Ruh, 2012), the NCM was presented with phonological representations of verb  
294 stems and had the task of producing the corresponding past tense forms. Hidden layer units had a  
295 Gaussian (i.e., bell-shaped) activation function. Units of this type become active for a subset of  
296 similar-sounding verbs, forming a receptive field for a region of the phonological input space.  
297 Gaussian units are activated when an input (i.e., a verb stem) falls within their receptive field, and the  
298 closer the input is to the center of the receptive field the higher is the activation of the unit. In the  
299 NCM, lateral inhibition in the hidden layer was simulated by suppressing activation of all but the  
300 most active hidden unit. The position of the receptive field of this unit was adjusted at each  
301 presentation to move a small step towards the position of the current input. Receptive field sizes were  
302 also adapted to increase for fields that responded to a range of different verbs. Each hidden unit kept  
303 a local error counter to which the network’s output error was added when the hidden unit was active.

304 The model attempted to learn the inflection task in the initial minimal architecture, and structural  
305 change occurred when the current structure no longer allowed for improvement in performance:  
306 When the average error over 10,000 verbs was no lower than for the previous 30,000 verbs, three  
307 new hidden unit receptive fields were inserted at the position of the existing hidden unit which had  
308 the highest local error, and their weights to the output layer were initialized randomly. In this  
309 process, a hidden unit whose activation leads to a high output error will become the preferred

310 location for the insertion of new units. Because a high local error is usually caused by one hidden  
 311 unit being responsible for too many input patterns with conflicting input-output transformations (e.g.,  
 312 *sink-sank* and *blink-blinked*), the insertion of additional resources led to a more fine-grained covering  
 313 of the input space in those areas where similar sounding verbs have different past tense forms. As a  
 314 consequence, the hidden units were ‘quasi-localist’ (see Westermann & Ruh, 2012): different units  
 315 became responsive to between 1 and 136 verbs, with the degree of granularity an outcome of the task  
 316 demands of the past tense inflection task. Note that this is different from purely localist ‘lexical entry  
 317 units’ (e.g., Joanisse and Seidenberg, 1999) where each unit is activated by exactly one verb.

318 Regressive events in the model were implemented by pruning hidden units that were not activated for  
 319 30,000 verb presentations. (For further details of the implementation see Westermann & Ruh, 2012).  
 320 Together, these mechanisms led to a process in which the structure of the model – number, size and  
 321 location of hidden unit receptive fields as well as the weight patterns in both the direct and indirect  
 322 pathways – was a direct outcome of the experience with the environment of the English past tense,  
 323 with its different verbs with specific inflections, phonological properties, similarity clusters, and  
 324 frequencies. This way of developing the model is in contrast both to the more common static models  
 325 in which only the weights but not the model structure are adapted, and to models in which change  
 326 proceeds along a maturational timetable independent from environmental input (e.g., Elman, 1993).  
 327 Indeed, whereas the developing model was shown to account for a wide range of data on acquisition,  
 328 adult generalization, and selective impairment after brain damage, an equivalent static model did not  
 329 account for many of these data (Westermann & Ruh, 2012).

330 This ‘neuroconstructivist’ type of model also corresponds most closely to current views of  
 331 experience dependent brain development in which new abilities become manifest in developing brain  
 332 structures that are adapted to the demands of a specific ability (see also Shultz et al., 2007). In the  
 333 past tense model, more structure (i.e., hidden units and their connections) was allocated for forms  
 334 that were ‘harder’ to learn because of the statistical properties of the verb set.

335

## 336 2.2. Corpus

337 The NCM was trained on a set of 1,271 mono- and bisyllabic English verbs extracted from the  
 338 CELEX database (Baayen, Piepenbrock, & van Rijn, 1993; full training details are provided in  
 339 Westermann & Ruh, 2012). Of these verbs, 111 (i.e., 8.73% of types, 46.00% of tokens) were  
 340 irregular. During training, verbs were drawn from this corpus on the basis of their past tense  
 341 frequencies. The phonemes of each verb were inserted into a consonant-vowel template of the form  
 342 xCCCVCC for each syllable (where x indicates if the syllable was stressed [1] or not [0]). Individual  
 343 phonemes were encoded by phonetic feature vectors, following the binary version of the PatPho  
 344 coding scheme (Li & MacWhinney, 2002) which requires 6 features per vowel and 7 features per  
 345 consonant. The presence or absence of a feature was encoded by a value of 1 or -1, respectively, and  
 346 all features for an empty phoneme slot were set to 0. The stem of a verb was encoded by 84 bits and  
 347 the past tense form had an additional VC suffix (13 bits).

348

## 349 2.3. Training

350 Five networks were trained on 20m verb tokens each. Verbs were presented randomly according to  
 351 their past tense frequencies. Weights were updated after the presentation of each verb (online



352 learning) using the perceptron learning rule (Rosenblatt, 1958). For earlier work on this model see  
 353 Westermann & Ruh, 2009).

354

## 355 **2.4 Synthetic Brain Imaging Analysis**

356 Synthetic brain imaging (SBI) in the models was performed by measuring the activation flowing  
 357 through the direct (input-output) and indirect (hidden-output) pathways for each verb. Activation in  
 358 the direct pathway was computed as the summed absolute activation flowing through the input-  
 359 output connections:

$$360 \quad \sum_o \sum_i |w_{oi} a_i|$$

361 where  $o$  are output units,  $i$  input units,  $w_{oi}$  the weight of the connection between input unit  $i$  and  
 362 output unit  $o$ , and  $a_i$  the activation of input unit  $i$ . Likewise, activation in the indirect pathway was  
 363 computed as the absolute activation flowing through the hidden-output connections as:

364

$$365 \quad \sum_o |w_{oh} a_h|$$

366 where  $w_{oh}$  is the connection weight from the active hidden unit  $h$  to output unit  $o$  and  $a_h$  the activation  
 367 of hidden unit  $h$ . Total activation was computed as the sum of the activation in the two pathways.

368

## 369 **3. Results**

370 All models reached 100% accuracy on average after exposure to 16.8 million verbs, with an average  
 371 number of 361 hidden units (range = 355-370). Since performance across networks was highly  
 372 comparable, detailed results from a randomly sampled network will be reported unless otherwise  
 373 specified.

374

==== **Figure 2 here** ====

375

### 376 **3.1. Emerging double dissociation between regulars and irregulars**

377 Figure 2 shows a longitudinal developmental SBI activation profile of the two network pathways.  
 378 Early in development each pathway was activated equally strongly by regular and irregular verbs.  
 379 With development, activation in the direct pathway increased and separated between regular and  
 380 irregular verbs, with regulars producing on average higher activation in this pathway than irregulars  
 381 (mean activation at the end of training by regulars:  $M = 864.3$ ,  $SD = 111.9$ ; by irregulars:  $M = 844.1$ ,  
 382  $SD = 91.5$ ; Mann-Whitney U test,  $z = -2.19$ ,  $p = .029$ , mean rank for regulars = 642.97; and for  
 383 irregulars = 563.21). Overall activation in the indirect pathway initially decreased because activation  
 384 in this pathway interfered with learning the task due to the insufficient number of hidden units.  
 385 Throughout the rest of development, mean activation differences between regular and irregular verbs

386 then continued to increase (mean activation at the end of training by irregulars:  $M = 75.5$ ,  $SD = 59.1$ ;  
 387 by regulars:  $M = 21.4$ ,  $SD = 13.8$ ; Mann-Whitney U test,  $z = -14.534$ ,  $p < .001$ , mean rank for  
 388 regulars = 589.7, and for irregulars = 1119.7). This double dissociation between regular and irregular  
 389 verbs emerged in the model without any functional pre-specification of either pathway and without  
 390 explicit encoding of regularity, solely on the basis of the different task demands of producing the past  
 391 tenses of different verbs.

392 Although to our knowledge there have not yet been developmental brain imaging studies of verb  
 393 inflection, a developmental fMRI study of word production ([Brown et al., 2005](#)) found an increase in  
 394 activation in some cortical areas and a decrease in others across age, with significant differences  
 395 between age groups even when overt task performance was equal. The network for which results are  
 396 displayed in Figure 2 reached 100% correct performance in the inflection task after 16.0 million verb  
 397 tokens, and it is interesting to observe that activation in the direct pathway likewise continued to  
 398 increase after this point without a change in overt performance.

399 The fact that a double dissociation in regional activation patterns between regular and irregular verbs  
 400 emerges in the NCM contradicts the argument that differential activation of brain regions for each  
 401 verb type necessarily indicates an underlying qualitative processing difference between regular and  
 402 irregular forms (e.g., [Beretta et al., 2003](#); [Jaeger et al., 1996](#); [Sahin et al., 2006](#)). In the ‘adult’ NCM  
 403 all past tense forms are generated through a single associative mechanism, but dissociations arise on  
 404 the basis of statistical and distributional differences between verbs that have become manifest in the  
 405 network’s architecture during development. The developing hidden layer enables the model to  
 406 allocate additional processing resources for verbs whose inflections are hard to learn in the direct  
 407 pathway alone, as structure is added to this layer when learning no longer improves. The fact that the  
 408 indirect pathway is activated more by irregular verbs is compatible with the ‘ease-of-processing’  
 409 account of functional specialization in past tense processing (Westermann & Ruh, 2012). This  
 410 account states that on average, irregular forms are harder to learn and process than regulars. An  
 411 irregular is harder to process than a regular, however, not by virtue of its irregularity, which is a  
 412 grammatical property of an individual verb, but instead as the result of a combination of statistical  
 413 and distributional factors such as relative frequency and numbers of friends and enemies, which are  
 414 statistical properties that arise from the verb corpus as a whole (Westermann & Ruh, 2012). The  
 415 origin of the emergent dissociations is, therefore, the differential ease of processing of verbs and not  
 416 their grammatical class.

417

### 418 **3.2. Double dissociations between mean activation values mask distributional differences**

419 More detailed analysis of the NCM further revealed that, despite the observed double dissociation  
 420 between regular and irregular verbs, each verb activated both pathways, albeit to different degrees.  
 421 Figure 3 shows the distribution of regular and irregular verbs activating each pathway. In the direct  
 422 pathway (Figure 3A) the spread of activations is similar for regular and irregular verbs, with the  
 423 highest activations resulting from regulars. In contrast, in the indirect pathway a higher proportion of  
 424 irregulars than regulars were strongly activated, and most regulars only led to weak activation in this  
 425 pathway (Figure 3B). Figure 3C shows the *activation ratio* which was computed as:

$$426 \frac{\text{direct pathway activation}}{\text{direct pathway activation} + \text{indirect pathway activation}}$$

427 where activations in both pathways were scaled to a maximum value of 1. A ratio of greater than 0.5  
 428 indicates that a specific verb activates the direct pathway relatively more than the indirect pathway.  
 429 The figure shows that regulars as well as irregulars activated the direct pathway more than the  
 430 indirect pathway, but regulars tended to have a higher activation ratio than irregulars. Nevertheless,  
 431 some irregulars as well were produced almost solely through the direct pathway, with activation ratio  
 432 near 1.0. These results indicate that although there is an apparent global specialization of the direct  
 433 pathway for regular verbs and of the indirect pathway for irregulars as revealed by the observed  
 434 double dissociation, this is an outcome of complex overlapping activation patterns for individual  
 435 regular and irregular forms throughout the network.

436

437

==== Figure 3 here ====

438

### 439 3.3. Greater regular activation is due to greater phonological complexity of regulars

440 We further modeled more specific results from Desai et al.'s (2006) fMRI study. Desai et al. (2006)  
 441 argued that a higher activation for regular verbs in some cortical regions was the consequence of the  
 442 higher phonological complexity of the regular verbs used in their experiment. To test this claim they  
 443 analyzed a subset of their verbs in which regulars and irregulars were matched for phonological  
 444 complexity. As predicted, they found that for this matched set there was no brain region more active  
 445 for regular verbs. We simulated this result by comparing the activation profiles in the model for all  
 446 verbs with those for the matched subset of Desai et al. (2006). Of the 80 verbs in the subset, two  
 447 irregulars were not in the network's training corpus (*break, cost*). These word's matched regular  
 448 partners (*stay, guess*) were also removed from the test set, and the NCM was tested on the remaining  
 449 76 matched verbs. For this matched subset, as in Desai et al.'s (2006) study, no area was now more  
 450 active for regulars. Whereas with the full verb set the average direct pathway activation was higher  
 451 for regulars than for irregulars (see section 3.1.), the matched subset showed the opposite pattern,  
 452 with irregulars ( $M = 853.2, SD = 99.1$ ) now on average activating the direct pathway more than  
 453 regulars ( $M = 798.8, SD = 92.8$ ; Mann-Whitney U test,  $z = -2.68, p = .007$ , mean rank for regulars =  
 454 31.71; and for irregulars = 45.29). As in the full set of verbs, indirect pathway activation was higher  
 455 for irregulars in the matched subset (irregular activation  $M = 58.9, SD = 31.3$ ; regular activation  $M =$   
 456 31.0,  $SD = 20.0$ ; Mann-Whitney U test,  $z = -4.21, p < .001$ , mean rank for regulars: 27.84, and for  
 457 irregulars: 49.16).

458 Although Desai et al. (2006) found that with the phonologically matched subset some areas were  
 459 activated more for irregulars than had been for the non-matched set (i.e., the precentral gyrus and left  
 460 anterior cingulate gyrus), the region previously more active for regulars later showed no difference  
 461 between regulars and irregulars. While in the NCM this area (i.e., the direct pathway) was now more  
 462 active for irregulars than for regulars, the model accounted for Desai et al.'s (2006) main result of the  
 463 disappearance of higher activation for regulars within the processing system when phonological  
 464 complexity was controlled.

465 The NCM further provided a more general evaluation of the role of phonological complexity in  
 466 observed regular-irregular dissociations. Whereas in experimental neuroimaging the effect of  
 467 phonological complexity can only be controlled for by using matched subsets of verbs, in the NCM  
 468 the same can be achieved by dividing the total activation in the direct pathway by the number of  
 469 active input units. This is because in the distributed phonological representation of verbs, higher

470 phonological complexity, here defined as number of phonemes or number of syllables, corresponds  
 471 to more input units being active. Dividing the direct pathway activation by the number of active input  
 472 units therefore normalizes this activation. (Note that this is not necessary for the indirect pathway  
 473 because only one hidden unit is active for each verb.) Whereas non-normalized activation in the  
 474 direct pathway was higher for regulars than for irregulars, activation normalized for complexity was  
 475 conversely smaller for regulars ( $M = 30.6$ ,  $SD = 8.4$ ) than for irregulars ( $M = 36.0$ ,  $SD = 7.3$ ; Mann-  
 476 Whitney U test,  $z = -6.82$ ,  $p < .001$ , mean rank for regulars = 614.28, and for irregulars = 862.95),  
 477 providing further evidence that systematic differences in phonological complexity can lead to  
 478 regular-irregular dissociations.

479

### 480 3.4. Origins of dissociations

481 What, then, are the origins of the dissociations found in neuroimaging studies? The ‘easiness’ view  
 482 of past tense processing suggests that different statistical characteristics of verbs affect their ease of  
 483 processing, and hence their activation profile, irrespective of whether they are regular or irregular. By  
 484 using synthetic brain imaging we are able to investigate precisely which statistical factors are  
 485 involved, as the model is tested on a large set of verbs in which these factors vary considerably. To  
 486 do this, we characterized each verb along a range of factors that were accessible to the model during  
 487 training: Past tense frequency, presence of a stem final alveolar consonant, phonological complexity,  
 488 and number of friends and enemies within the training corpus. (Note that a ‘friend’ was defined as a  
 489 verb with the same stem rime and the same past tense rime, e.g., *sing-sang* and *ring-rang*, and an  
 490 ‘enemy’ was defined as a verb with the same stem rime but with different past tense rime, e.g., *sing-*  
 491 *sang* and *bring-brought*.)

492 Table 1 shows that frequency, friend/enemy measures, and complexity correlate significantly with  
 493 activation ratio (i.e., direct activation divided by total activation; see Formula 3). These correlations  
 494 indicate that phonologically complex, low-frequency verbs with an advantageous neighborhood (i.e.,  
 495 many friends, few enemies) tend to activate the direct pathway relatively more strongly (i.e., lead to a  
 496 higher activation ratio), while the indirect pathway is activated relatively more for frequent verbs  
 497 with an unfavorable neighborhood.

498

499 ===== Table 1 here =====

500

501 To examine which statistical factors contributed to activation differences in each pathway, we  
 502 entered these factors as independent variables into multi-level regression models across all networks,  
 503 with pathway activation as the dependent variable and verb and network as random effects. All  
 504 predictors were zero centered and scaled to  $SD = 1$ . Indirect pathway activation was most strongly  
 505 predicted by past tense frequency ( $\beta = 16.77$ ), enemies ( $\beta = 5.64$ ), phonological complexity ( $\beta = -$   
 506  $3.64$ ), and friends ( $\beta = -2.86$ ; all  $p < .001$ ), with this model explaining 50% of the variance in  
 507 pathway activation ( $R^2 = .498$ ). For direct pathway activation, the only significant contributing  
 508 factors were phonological complexity ( $\beta = 38.78$ ) and friends ( $\beta = 26.43$ ; both  $p < .001$ ), with this  
 509 model accounting for only 19% of the variance in pathway activation ( $R^2 = .189$ ).

510 The picture emerging from these results is, therefore, slightly more complex than directly linking  
 511 activation in the indirect pathway with low ease of processing. Although indirect pathway activation  
 512 is predicted by a high number of enemies and low number of friends – both factors that would be  
 513 expected to make processing harder – it is also predicted by high frequency, which would be  
 514 expected to make processing easier. The reason for this counterintuitive result is that verbs that are  
 515 frequently encountered by the model will lead to the accumulation of many small errors on hidden  
 516 units (instead of fewer but larger errors for harder verbs) so that in the experience-dependent  
 517 development of the network’s structure new units will also be inserted in those regions of the input  
 518 space. Importantly, the neuroconstructivist view of past tense processing therefore predicts that the  
 519 same brain regions should be shared by the processing of frequent and hard verbs.

520

### 521 **3.5. Typical and non-typical regulars and irregulars**

522 Given these results we used the activation ratio to establish ‘typical’ and ‘non-typical’ regular and  
 523 irregular verbs from the imaging perspective. Typical regulars were regulars with a high activation  
 524 ratio. The ten most typical monosyllabic regulars according to this measure, given the specific  
 525 training set of our model, were *naïl, nurse, roar, hail, hiss, slice, frost, dawn, roast, and rate*. Note  
 526 that these are not the most frequent regulars because frequent verbs also highly activated the indirect  
 527 pathway, leading to a lower activation ratio. The ten least typical monosyllabic regulars, that is, those  
 528 regulars with the lowest activation ratio, were *ask, look, roam, mask, add, try, soil, dry, hum, and use*.  
 529 Interestingly, several of these verbs would normally be regarded as prototypical regulars because of  
 530 their high frequencies. The synthetic imaging results presented here, however, predict that in brain  
 531 imaging studies they might actually activate similar regions to irregulars.

532 The ten irregular verbs with the most typical irregular activation pattern, that is, a low activation  
 533 ratio, were *say, see, think, stand, bring, do, go, make, get, and speak*. The ten least typical irregulars  
 534 according to this measure were *shrink, spin, sweep, flee, deal, creep, thrust, kneel, ride, and quit*.  
 535 Five of these ten verbs (*sweep, flee, deal, creep, kneel*) are pseudo-regulars which add [t] or [d] to  
 536 their past tense and, according to Joanisse & Seidenberg (2005), should be expected to cluster with  
 537 regular verbs in their activation profile. In line with this claim, these verbs showed ‘regular-like’  
 538 activation patterns in the NCM.

539

### 540 **3.6. Analysis from a dual-mechanism perspective**

541 Although the NCM shows that regional double dissociations between regular and irregular verbs can  
 542 emerge solely on the basis of the statistical properties of different verbs in a single processing  
 543 mechanism that is shaped by experience-developmental structural development, and that the  
 544 grammatical property of regularity plays no role in causing these dissociations, in brain imaging  
 545 studies the underlying mechanisms remain unknown and are hypothesized on the basis of observed  
 546 data. Thus, when dissociations between regular and irregular verbs are observed in an empirical  
 547 study, researchers adopting a dual-mechanism framework explain these data in terms of separate  
 548 processing mechanisms (Beretta et al., 2003; Dhond et al., 2003; Jaeger et al., 1996; Lavric et al.,  
 549 2001; Oh et al, 2011; Sahin et al., 2006), with regions more active for regulars hypothesized to be  
 550 responsible for the application of grammatical rules, such as regular inflection, and regions more  
 551 active for irregulars indicating the retrieval of full forms from the mental lexicon located in this

552 region. At the core of such dual-mechanism interpretations lies the assumption that grammatical class  
553 (i.e., regularity) forms the basis of observed dissociations.

554 To mimic this inferential process from data to hypothesized mechanism, we analyzed the activation  
555 differences in the model from a dual-mechanism perspective, which would assume that regularity  
556 itself is a predictor of the observed dissociations. We performed further multi-level regression  
557 analyses for pathway activation, with verb and network as random effects, and with regularity added  
558 to the inventory of independent variables first modelled in section 3.4. (each zero centered and  
559 scaled,  $SD = 1$ ). Results were again highly significant, with past tense frequency ( $\beta = 15.35$ ),  
560 regularity ( $\beta = -36.28$ ), complexity ( $\beta = -4.65$ ), and friends ( $\beta = -1.68$ ; all  $p < .001$ ) predicting  
561 indirect pathway activation ( $R^2 = .557$ ). This model accounted for approximately 6% more variance  
562 than the model without regularity as a factor, and this increase was significant ( $p < .001$ ). Including  
563 regularity as a predictor in the regression model of direct pathway activation did not lead to a  
564 statistically significant improvement in model fit, and regularity did not predict activation ( $p = .638$ ).

565 Although the NCM is a single-mechanism model, the results for indirect pathway activation  
566 correspond to the predictions made by the revised version of the dual-mechanism theory for lexical  
567 retrieval (Pinker & Ullman, 2002). This revised theory predicts lexical retrieval not only for  
568 irregulars but also for high frequency regulars because high frequency forms are more likely to be  
569 memorized than low frequency ones, and for regulars with low friend-enemy ratios because they are  
570 more likely to be attracted to irregular enemies. From a dual-mechanism perspective, activation  
571 patterns like those observed in the model would therefore be taken as backing for this theory, despite  
572 being caused by a very different underlying mechanism. This result highlights the benefit of  
573 computational modeling: when we collect empirical data we do not know the mechanism that  
574 generates them but we infer from the data to a potential underlying mechanism. When we construct a  
575 model we know the mechanism and we see how this mechanisms generates empirical data. In the  
576 past tense debate, empirically observed dissociations between regulars and irregulars have often been  
577 hypothesized as arising from two separate underlying mechanisms. The NCM shows that such  
578 dissociations, down to a level of detail that has previously served as refinement of the dual-  
579 mechanisms theory, arise in a single-mechanism system on the basis of statistical properties of verbs  
580 together with experience-dependent structural development. By designing the model we know that  
581 whether a verb is regular or not is not encoded in the training data and is therefore not accessible to  
582 the network. The fact that regularity nevertheless emerges as a significant predictor for indirect  
583 pathway activation is a consequence of two factors: on the one hand regularity correlates highly with  
584 several of the measures that lead to specialization of the network pathways (Table 2). Regular verbs  
585 tend to be less frequent, have more friends and fewer enemies than irregulars, and are phonologically  
586 less complex. As discussed above, learning high frequency verbs with few friends and many enemies  
587 leads to the allocation of hidden units in the indirect pathway, and thus to higher indirect pathway  
588 activation in the adult model. Therefore, regular verbs, which show the opposite profile, will on  
589 average have fewer dedicated hidden units and thus a lower activation of the indirect pathway, with  
590 these forms activating the direct pathway more.

591 **==== Table 2 here ====**

592 Nevertheless, this cannot be the sole explanation of the significant effect for regularity, because if  
593 regularity was entirely predictable from these factors the hierarchical regression should not show a  
594 significant improvement when regularity is added. Instead, the explanation lies in the fact that  
595 associative learning mechanisms make use of all cues that facilitate learning of a mapping. In the  
596 case of the English past tense, these cues do not only lie in the distributional characteristics of verbs

597 available to the model indirectly through the training schedule, but also in the phonological  
598 characteristics of verbs, which are available directly as inputs. The second factor explaining why  
599 regularity emerges as a significant predictor of activation in the indirect pathway is that the mapping  
600 between stem and past tense for regulars is easy to learn in the direct pathway because regular verbs  
601 have the highest relative and absolute type frequency. To form their past tense, in English more verbs  
602 preserve their stem and add *-ed* than undergo any other transformation. Therefore, additional  
603 structure in the hidden pathway is not necessary for learning this transformation. As such, regularity-  
604 specific activation patterns in the model arise out of a combination between structural and  
605 distributional environmental cues together with the model's experience-dependent developmental  
606 process.

607

### 608 3.7 Mapping the model to the brain

609 A question that can be addressed in SBI studies is which brain areas give rise to specific behaviors.  
610 Indeed, one way in which SBI has been applied is in modeling the internal functioning of, and the  
611 interactions between, specific brain areas that are known to be involved in a task. For example, the  
612 model developed by Cangelosi and Parisi (2004) contained a sensory layer and a  
613 sensory/proprioceptive layer, and results from processing nouns and verbs were linked to previous  
614 fMRI results showing that nouns activate more sensory areas and verbs activated motor areas.  
615 Similarly, Horwitz et al. (1999) presented a biologically plausible large scale neural model of the  
616 interactions between specific brain areas, and used this model to account for cerebral blood flow data  
617 from PET studies. Nevertheless, of course, even 'biologically plausible' models are far away from  
618 the biological substrate of the brain in terms of detail and number of interacting regions. Any link  
619 between activated regions in a higher-level model and the brain can therefore only serve as a  
620 suggestion that should be verified in subsequent neuroimaging studies. As such, speculating on such  
621 links can be beneficial for generating predictions about which stimuli might activate which brain  
622 areas preferentially.

623 Can a mapping between model and brain areas also be done on the basis of the present past tense  
624 model? One difficulty is that by necessity, the model is simple and the brain is complex, making any  
625 such attempted link seem tenuous. On the other hand, though, as the model clearly develops  
626 specialized processing pathways, it might seem a missed opportunity not to at least speculate how the  
627 model's pathways might map onto brain structures. A second difficulty in attempting such a mapping  
628 is that, unlike in the models described above, the data from past tense imaging experiments are  
629 anything but clear. As discussed above, studies have differed greatly in the areas that were found to  
630 be involved in regular and irregular processing. Furthermore, most imaging studies were not  
631 principally concerned with testing whether specific brain areas were involved in inflection  
632 processing, but instead investigated whether regular and irregular verbs activated different brain areas  
633 in principle (to provide evidence for dual-mechanism accounts of inflection) or whether regions for  
634 regulars and irregulars overlapped and dissociations were based on phonological and semantic factors  
635 (as evidence for single-mechanism accounts). When differences were found they were typically  
636 explained in a post-hoc manner. In one study favoring a dual-mechanism interpretation, for example,  
637 Dhond (2006) noted that the left fusiform area, which was activated more by irregulars, has been  
638 implicated in lexico-iconic or word-form encoding and early lexical access, whereas Broca's area,  
639 which was in this study activated more by regular verbs, plays a role in rule-based past-tense  
640 formation, grammar, and syntactic parsing. Likewise adopting a dual-mechanism interpretation Sahin  
641 et al. (2006) and Jaeger et al. (1996) found equal activation of Broca's area for regulars and

642 irregulars, and therefore attributed a general role in inflection processing to this region. Stronger  
643 activation for irregulars in the anterior cingulate and supplementary motor areas was in Sahin et al.'s  
644 (2006) study attributed to irregular verbs blocking the application of regular inflection, which is a  
645 central feature of dual mechanism accounts. Few studies include predictions about the specific areas  
646 involved in past tense processing. For example, [Joanisse and Seidenberg \(2005\)](#) hypothesized that,  
647 overall, activation should be distributed over areas responsible for phonological processing such as  
648 the inferior frontal gyrus (IFG), including Broca's area, and areas involved in semantic processing,  
649 particularly the posterior temporal lobe. These areas have also been shown in brain-damaged patients  
650 to lead to dissociations between verb types ([Bird, Lambon-Ralph, Seidenberg, McClelland, &](#)  
651 [Patterson, 2003](#); [Patterson, Lambon Ralph, Hodges, & McClelland, 2001](#)).

652 The IFG and posterior temporal lobe are also a subset of the areas involved in inflection processing  
653 in Desai et al.'s (2006) study, which had the most carefully matched verb set. Given that studies with  
654 brain damaged patients also point towards these areas as being involved in inflection, we can  
655 hypothesize that the pathways in our model map to these areas. Specifically, the direct pathway in  
656 our model might reflect the functioning of the IFG, and the indirect pathway might reflect the  
657 functioning of the posterior temporal lobe. However, our model does not suggest that these are  
658 phonological and semantic areas respectively, as suggested by Joanisse and Seidenberg (2005).  
659 Instead, both reflect phonological processes, with the IFG processing direct mappings based on  
660 distributed phonological information, and posterior temporal areas providing more localist word  
661 representations that complement these distributed representations in the IFG. There has been a  
662 controversy on whether semantic representations are causal in enabling the formation of irregular  
663 past tense forms or whether semantic and irregular past tense representations are merely collocated in  
664 the IFG.

665 Deficits in irregular inflection are often associated with semantic impairments in Alzheimer's  
666 disease, semantic dementia and herpes simplex encephalitis (HSE) (Patterson et al, 2001; Tyler et al,  
667 2002, Ullman et al, 1997) as a consequence to damage to the temporal lobes. Nevertheless, the  
668 association does not seem to be absolute, as would be expected if semantic representations formed  
669 the basis for irregular inflection. Several studies have reported cases in which patients with semantic  
670 deficits did not show disproportionate problems with semantic inflection (Tyler et al, 2004; Miozzo  
671 & Gordon, 2005) and others found patients with no semantic deficits but problems with irregular  
672 inflection (Miozzo, 2003). A longitudinal study of two semantic dementia patients (Bright, Moss,  
673 Stamatakis & Tyler, 2008) reported that the early stages of dementia were associated with semantic  
674 deficits, but that language deficits occurred later when brain atrophy was more widespread. We  
675 believe that these results raise the intriguing possibility that semantic and irregular verb  
676 representations are closely but not causally associated, because both constitute idiosyncratic  
677 representations. There is nothing in the sound of a word that signifies its meaning, and there is also  
678 nothing in the sound of a verb that predicts its irregular past tense. Both have to be learned, and it is  
679 possible that idiosyncratic information connected with words is stored in the posterior temporal areas  
680 of the brain. Computational modeling work supports this view. A well-known model of past tense  
681 impairment after brain damage (Joanisse & Seidenberg, 1999) included a set of localist units for each  
682 verb, and damage to these localist units led to greater irregular impairment. However, while these  
683 units were labeled as 'semantic' in the model, there was nothing to connect them to the meaning of  
684 words; their main role was to encode idiosyncratic information. Likewise, in our neuroconstructivist  
685 model we did not include 'semantic' representations (in the sense that the meaning of verbs was not  
686 encoded) because we found that a model without semantics (albeit with the ability to encode  
687 idiosyncratic information without recourse to semantics) accounted for a wide range of behavioral



688 data in past tense tasks, spanning acquisition, adult processing and impairment after brain damage,  
689 and that assuming a causal role for semantics was therefore not necessary.

690 The proposed mapping of the pathways in our model to brain areas is corroborated by results from  
691 selectively damaging the model's pathways ([Westermann & Ruh, 2012](#)), where damage to the  
692 indirect pathway selectively affected irregular verbs and damage to the directed pathway affected all  
693 verbs, albeit regulars to a greater degree. These results correspond to patients with brain damage to  
694 left temporal areas and the IFG, respectively. Further evidence linking the direct pathway to the IFG  
695 comes from the fact that in Jonaisse and Seidenberg's (2005) fMRI study, 'pseudo-regulars' (such as  
696 *burnt*) clustered with regulars in the IFG, and the same was true in the model where several pseudo-  
697 regulars had activation ratios comparable with regular verbs. Finally, locating the direct pathway in  
698 the left IFG can provide insight into why some studies found equal activation for all verbs in Broca's  
699 area (Desai et al., 2005; Sahin et al., 2006), while others found greater activation for regular verbs in  
700 this region (Dhond, 2003). In our model, the direct pathway is strongly activated by all verbs, but  
701 slightly more by regulars. Whether activation differences in this path are found therefore depends on  
702 the precise choice of verbs. In accord with Joannis and Seidenberg (2005), the model predicts that  
703 activation in the IFG is associated with phonological processing rather than with regularity: In our  
704 regression analysis of direct pathway activation, phonological complexity was the strongest  
705 predictor, but regularity was not a predictor.

706

#### 707 4. Discussion

708 The simulations described in this paper show how dissociations between brain activation patterns in  
709 inflection tasks can arise from a single associative mechanism together with experience-dependent  
710 structural development. The argument that dissociations between verbs reflect ease of processing has  
711 been made previously with respect to imaging studies (Seidenberg & Arnoldussen, 2003), but the  
712 present model provides a mechanistic account of how these dissociations can arise and a precise  
713 characterization of their underlying factors. Importantly, the model predicts that frequency acts in the  
714 opposite direction to ease of processing, and that hard-to-process verbs should generate similar  
715 activation patterns to high frequency verbs because dedicated structure in the developing system is  
716 allocated to both.

717 Together these results raise a number of important points. First, dissociations in activation patterns  
718 like those observed in the model have often been described as being between regular and irregular  
719 verbs, and have been taken as evidence for the existence of qualitatively distinct mechanisms (i.e.,  
720 rule application and lexical retrieval) in the inflection of these verbs ([Bergida, O'Craven, Savoy, &  
721 Ullman, 1998](#); [Dhond et al., 2003](#); [Jaeger et al., 1996](#); [Lavric et al., 2001](#); [Sahin et al., 2006](#)). The fact  
722 that the same dissociations emerge in the model on the basis of a single processing mechanism  
723 considerably weakens this argument. Whereas separate processing mechanisms would result in  
724 observable dissociations, the reverse implication is not true: Separate mechanisms are not *necessary*  
725 to obtain dissociations ([see also Plaut, 1995](#)). Second, although superficially the emerging  
726 dissociations appear to be between regular and irregular verbs, their true nature is better described as  
727 a grading between low-frequency, phonologically complex verbs with many phonological friends and  
728 few enemies on the one hand, and high-frequency verbs with many enemies and few friends on the  
729 other. Although these statistical factors correlate with regularity, characterizing the dissociations  
730 observed as being between regulars and irregulars is a post-hoc abstraction of the actual underlying  
731 mechanisms. When this abstraction is used as an explanation of the underlying processes, as in dual

732 mechanism approaches, a lot of the empirical data, such as the gradation of dissociations and the  
733 effects of phonology, friends, and enemies, cannot be captured. Third, regional activation patterns in  
734 imaging studies are likely to be a complex function of the statistical and phonological properties of  
735 the verbs used in a specific study. All imaging studies have taken this possibility into account and  
736 controlled for various properties. However, the selection of properties controlled for has generally not  
737 been systematic or based on evident theoretical considerations. The results presented here suggest  
738 that interactions between verb frequency, phonological complexity, and numbers of friends and  
739 enemies are the main factors affecting regional activation differences. Fourth, these results indicate  
740 that typical (i.e., high frequency) regulars and irregulars might not in fact activate different brain  
741 regions. Instead, according to the model, all frequent verbs share activated regions, and dissociations  
742 between regulars and irregulars will primarily be found among low frequency verbs. Finally, some  
743 previous approaches have also based explanations for dissociations on a differential involvement of  
744 semantics in the generation of regular and irregular forms (e.g., Joanisse & Seidenberg, 1999;  
745 Patterson et al., 2001). In this view, regular inflections rely on phonological representations, whereas  
746 irregular inflections are based on the semantic representations of verbs. Without precluding the  
747 possibility that semantic and irregular processing might be linked and correlated, the present model,  
748 which does not contain semantic representations, suggest that semantic and irregular impairments  
749 might correlate because they both refer to idiosyncratic information about verbs that cannot be  
750 directly retrieved from their phonological form.

751 In line with our argument that experience-dependent brain development shapes the adult cognitive  
752 architecture, the performance of the NCM model is an outcome of its experience with the learning  
753 environment. While we have made specific predictions about what are typical and atypical regular  
754 and irregular verbs in terms of brain activation patterns, as well as about the statistical factors  
755 predicting activation patterns in the model pathways, this point must serve as a caveat because it is  
756 not clear how closely the statistics of our verb set reflect those of real-world language learners. For  
757 example, the frequency statistics in our corpus are extracted from the CELEX database ([Baayen,  
758 Piepenbrock, & van Rijn, 1995](#)) and are not derived from parental input to a child. Likewise, with  
759 respect to modelling, we made decisions about what statistical factors to consider in the first place.  
760 These choices were guided by two considerations. First, the factors must be available to the model.  
761 Therefore we did not include, for example, imageability as a factor because the model does not  
762 contain semantic representations. Second, a factor must be available for the majority of verbs. This  
763 precluded our use of age of acquisition norms, which are only available for a relatively small subset  
764 of verbs. Given these caveats, a worthwhile avenue for future research will be to investigate how  
765 variation in the input comes to be reflected in variation in the model's architecture and performance,  
766 and in how far model performance is robust to input variation.

767 In a similar vein, our model effectively isolates the past tense inflection process from the rest of  
768 cognitive processing. On the one hand this is a valuable abstraction because it allows for a precise  
769 investigation into the factors affecting activation patterns in this task alone. On the other hand, it is  
770 possible that different inflectional paradigms such as noun plurals or even inflections across  
771 languages known to multilinguals affect each other. While computational models exist that have  
772 simultaneously learned multiple inflections in a single system ([Plunkett & Juola, 1999](#)) there has  
773 been no systematic investigation of how these paradigms affect each other. Likewise, although we  
774 argued that the semantics of verbs are not causally linked to irregular inflection (Westermann & Ruh  
775 2012), omitting semantic representations from the model does not allow it to distinguish between  
776 homophones (e.g., *ring* and *wring*) and consequently these were excluded from the training data.

777 Although the model provides a precise account of the origins of different activation patterns in  
778 synthetic brain imaging, it is nevertheless possible that verbs might dissociate differently depending  
779 on the experimental paradigm, because representations in different areas for the same verb might be  
780 redundant. As discussed, the model predicts that in imaging studies inflecting frequent and hard verbs  
781 activate the same brain regions. It is, however, possible that in behavioral paradigms such as lexical  
782 decision tasks, frequent and hard verbs might dissociate as interactions between processing regions  
783 can differ with specific task demands even when the same regions are involved in processing both.  
784 This is because in a neuroconstructivist system that structurally develops on the basis of experience  
785 with the environment, a brain area that is activated by a certain process need not be necessary for this  
786 process because such a system would involve a degree of redundancy. For example, although high  
787 frequency verbs in the model activated the indirect pathway more than low frequency verbs, this does  
788 not mean that the indirect pathway is *necessary* for the production of high frequency past tense  
789 forms. Instead, their production might be possible based on the direct pathway alone, with indirect  
790 pathway representations being redundant. This would also indicate that one could expect differences  
791 between results from brain imaging and from behavioral studies with brain damaged patients ([Price  
& Friston, 2002](#); [Thomas et al., 2012](#)). Damage to a certain brain area would therefore affect forms  
793 that activate this area in different ways, depending on whether the area is redundant for the  
794 processing of a specific form or not. For example, as described above, in lesioning the NCM to  
795 simulate selective impairment after brain damage ([Westermann & Ruh, 2012](#)), even when the indirect  
796 pathway was completely lesioned performance on regulars remained virtually unimpaired, indicating  
797 that the direct pathway is sufficient for producing all regular forms, despite, as reported here, regulars  
798 also activating the indirect pathway in synthetic brain imaging.

799 As a more general contribution, the model presented here highlights the importance of computational  
800 modeling in understanding the mechanisms of cognitive processing. As shown in the regression  
801 analyses, depending on the adopted theoretical perspective different explanations can be derived from  
802 the same observed dissociations. Under the assumption that the grammatical class (i.e., regular or  
803 irregular) of a verb is accessible to the model and analyzing the observed activation patterns from this  
804 perspective, the results would be taken as evidence for a dual-mechanism view of inflection  
805 processing. In studying the brain, this top-down approach from observed data to potential underlying  
806 mechanisms is the only possible approach. In a computational model, however, the mechanisms of  
807 processing are known and we can observe what data is generated through these known mechanisms.  
808 Using this bottom-up approach we know that regularity is not one of the factors accessible to the  
809 model, and that all inflections are based on a single mechanism that operates in a structured  
810 processing system. Likewise, the model has no access to semantic representations, with all inflections  
811 based on phonological information alone. Finding that dissociations between regular and irregular  
812 verbs nevertheless emerge under these constraints disconfirms the claim that such dissociations are  
813 evidence against a single-mechanism explanation and necessitate a dual-process system. However,  
814 these results also weaken the argument of prior single-mechanism accounts that semantic  
815 representations play a causal role in the inflection of irregular verbs. Computational modeling  
816 provides a detailed alternative explanation to these views by quantifying the interactions between  
817 statistical verb properties that give rise to the observed dissociations, and by providing a mechanism  
818 by which the structure of the environment comes to be reflected in the structure of the processing  
819 system through neuroconstructivist development. Computational modeling is therefore an important  
820 approach in the gathering of converging evidence for theories of inflection processing, and for  
821 theories of cognitive processing in general.

822 Finally, together with previous work incorporating the NCM ([Westermann & Ruh, 2012](#)), which  
823 accounted for empirical data from past tense acquisition, adult generalization, and impaired

824 processing after brain damage, we believe that our modeling of brain imaging data in the current  
825 paper illustrates how neuroconstructivist computational modeling can overcome one point of  
826 criticism sometimes levied against models in this domain – that each individual model is tailored  
827 specifically to account for a single phenomenon ([Pinker & Ullman, 2003](#)) – in providing a principled  
828 account of past tense processing by explaining existing data as well as generating predictions for  
829 future research.

### 830 **3 Conflict of Interest**

831 The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial  
832 relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

### 833 **4 Author Contributions**

834 GW developed the study hypothesis, ran the simulations and drafted the paper. GW and SJ  
835 performed the data analysis, discussed the results and finalized the manuscript for submission.

836

### 837 **5 Acknowledgement**

838 We thank Nicolas Ruh for help with the analysis scripts. An earlier version of part of this work was  
839 presented in (Westermann & Ruh, 2009).

### 840 **6 Funding**

841 This work was supported by Economic and Social Research Council International Centre for  
842 Language and Communicative Development (LuCiD) [ES/S007113/1 and ES/L008955/1].

### 843 **7 Data Availability Statement**

844 The datasets analyzed for this study can be found in the Open Science Framework  
845 <https://osf.io/ejs4m/>

846

### 847 **References**

848 Arbib, M. A., Billard, A., Iacoboni, M., & Oztop, E. (2000). Synthetic brain imaging: grasping,  
849 mirror neurons and imitation. *Neural Networks*, 13, 975-997. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0893-6080\(00\)00070-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0893-6080(00)00070-8)

851 Arbib, M. A., Bischoff, A., Fagg, A. H., & Grafton, S. T. (1994). Synthetic PET: analyzing large-  
852 scale properties of neural networks. *Human Brain Mapping*, 2(4), 225-233.  
853 <https://doi.org/10.1002/hbm.460020404>

854 Baayen, H., Piepenbrock, R., & van Rijn, H. (1995). The CELEX Lexical Database (CD-ROM):  
855 Linguistic Data Consortium, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA.  
856 <https://doi.org/10.35111/gso6s-gm48>

- 857 Bakker, I., MacGregor, L. J., Pulvermüller, F., & Shtyrov, Y. (2013). Past tense in the brain's time:  
858 Neurophysiological evidence for dual-route processing of past-tense verbs. *NeuroImage*, *71*, 187–  
859 195. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2012.12.065>
- 860 Beretta, A., Campbell, C., Carr, T. H., Huang, J., Schmitt, L. M., Christianson, K., & Cao, Y. (2003).  
861 An ER-fMRI investigation of morphological inflection in German reveals that the brain makes a  
862 distinction between regular and irregular forms. *Brain and Language*, *85*, 67-92.  
863 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0093-934X\(02\)00560-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0093-934X(02)00560-6)
- 864 Bergida, R., O'Craven, K., Savoy, R. L., & Ullman, M. T. (1998) fMRI double dissociations in  
865 frontal and temporal regions between regular and irregular past tense production. Paper presented at  
866 the *5th Annual Meeting of the Cognitive Neuroscience Society*, San Francisco, California.
- 867 Bialystok, E. (2017). The bilingual adaptation: How minds accommodate experience. *Psychological*  
868 *Bulletin*, *143*(3), 233–262. <https://doi.org/10.1037/bul0000099>
- 869 Bick, J., & Nelson, C. A. (2017). Early experience and brain development. *WIREs Cognitive Science*,  
870 *8*(1–2), e1387. <https://doi.org/10.1002/wcs.1387>
- 871 Bird, H., Lambon-Ralph, M. A., Seidenberg, M. S., McClelland, J. L., & Patterson, K. (2003).  
872 Deficits in phonology and past-tense morphology: What's the connection? *Journal of Memory and*  
873 *Language*, *48*(3), 502-526. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0749-596X\(02\)00538-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0749-596X(02)00538-7)
- 874 Brown, T. T., Lugar, H. M., Coalson, R. S., Miezin, F. M., Petersen, S. E., & Schlaggar, B. L.  
875 (2005). Developmental changes in human cerebral functional organization for word generation.  
876 *Cerebral Cortex*, *15*(3), 275-290. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/bhh129>
- 877 Burzio, L. (2002). Missing players: Phonology and the past-tense debate. *Lingua*, *112*(3), 157–199.  
878 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0024-3841\(01\)00041-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0024-3841(01)00041-9)
- 879 Bybee, J. L., & Slobin, D. I. (1982). Rules and schemas in the development and use of the English  
880 past tense. *Language*, *58*(2), 265–289. <https://doi.org/10.1353/lan.1982.0021>
- 881 Cangelosi, A., & Parisi, D. (2004). The processing of verbs and nouns in neural networks: Insights  
882 from synthetic brain imaging. *Brain and Language*, *89*(2), 401-408. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0093-934x\(03\)00353-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0093-934x(03)00353-5)
- 884 Casey, B. J., Giedd, J. N., & Thomas, K. M. (2000). Structural and functional brain development and  
885 its relation to cognitive development. *Biological Psychology*, *54*(1-3), 241-257.  
886 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0301-0511\(00\)00058-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0301-0511(00)00058-2)
- 887 Casey, B. J., Tottenham, N., Liston, C., & Durston, S. (2005). Imaging the developing brain: what  
888 have we learned about cognitive development? *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, *9*(3), 104-110.  
889 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2005.01.011>
- 890 Chen, C., Xue, G., Mei, L., Chen, C., Dong, Q., & Joan, Y. C. (2009). Cultural neurolinguistics.  
891 *Progress in Brain Research*, *178*, 159-171. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0079-6123\(09\)17811-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0079-6123(09)17811-1)

- 892 Clahsen, H. (1999). Lexical entries and rules of language: a multidisciplinary study of German  
893 inflection. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 22, 991-1013.  
894 <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0140525x99002228>
- 895 Desai, R., Conant, L. L., Waldron, E., & Binder, J. R. (2006). fMRI of past tense processing: The  
896 effects of phonological complexity and task difficulty. *Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience*, 18(2),  
897 278-297. <https://doi.org/10.1162/089892906775783633>
- 898 Dhond, R. P., Marinkovic, K., Dale, A. M., Witzel, T., & Halgren, E. (2003). Spatiotemporal maps of  
899 past-tense verb inflection. *Neuroimage*, 19(1), 91-100. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s1053-8119\(03\)00047-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/s1053-8119(03)00047-8)  
900 8
- 901 Elman, J. L. (1993). Learning and development in neural networks: The importance of starting small.  
902 *Cognition*, 48, 71-99. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277\(93\)90058-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277(93)90058-4)
- 903 Horwitz, B., Tagamets, M. A., & McIntosh, A. R. (1999). Neural modeling, functional brain  
904 imaging, and cognition. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, 3(3), 91-98. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0893-  
905 6080\(00\)00062-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0893-6080(00)00062-9)
- 906 Jaeger, J. J., Lockwood, A. H., Kemmerer, D. L., VanValin, R. D., Murphy, B. W., & Khalak, H. G.  
907 (1996). A positron emission tomographic study of regular and irregular verb morphology in English.  
908 *Language*, 72, 451-497. <https://doi.org/10.2307/416276>
- 909 Joanisse, M. F., & Seidenberg, M. S. (1999). Impairments in verb morphology after brain injury: A  
910 connectionist model. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of  
911 America*, 96(13), 7592-7597. <https://dx.doi.org/10.1073%2Fpnas.96.13.7592>
- 912 Joanisse, M. F., & Seidenberg, M. S. (2005). Imaging the past: Neural activation in frontal and  
913 temporal regions during regular and irregular past-tense processing. *Cognitive Affective & Behavioral  
914 Neuroscience*, 5(3), 282-296. <https://doi.org/10.3758/cabn.5.3.282>
- 915 Johnson, M. H. (2001). Functional brain development in humans. *Nature Reviews Neuroscience*,  
916 2(7), 475-483. <https://doi.org/10.1038/35081509>
- 917 Johnson, M. H., & Munakata, Y. (2005). Processes of change in brain and cognitive development.  
918 *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, 9(3), 152-158. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2005.01.009>
- 919 Kochunov, P., Fox, P., Lancaster, J., Tan, L. H., Amunts, K., Zilles, K., Mazziotta, J., & Gao, J. H.  
920 (2003). Localized morphological brain differences between English-speaking Caucasians and  
921 Chinese-speaking Asians: New evidence of anatomical plasticity. *NeuroReport*, 14(7), 961-964.  
922 <https://doi.org/10.1097/01.wnr.0000075417.59944.00>
- 923 Leminen, A., Smolka, E., Duñabeitia, J. A., & Pliatsikas, C. (2019). Morphological processing in the  
924 brain: The good (inflection), the bad (derivation) and the ugly (compounding). *Cortex*, 116, 4-44.  
925 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cortex.2018.08.016>
- 926 Lavric, A., Pizzagalli, D., Forstmeier, S., & Rippon, G. (2001). A double-dissociation of English  
927 past-tense production revealed by event-related potentials and low-resolution electromagnetic  
928 tomography (LORETA). *Clinical Neurophysiology*, 112(10), 1833-1849.  
929 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1388-2457\(01\)00615-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1388-2457(01)00615-0)

- 930 Li, P., & MacWhinney, B. (2002). PatPho: A phonological pattern generator for neural networks.  
931 *Behavior Research Methods, Instruments, & Computers*, *34*, 408-415.  
932 <https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03195469>
- 933 Logothetis, N. K., Pauls, J., Augath, M., Trinath, T., & Oeltermann, A. (2001). Neurophysiological  
934 investigation of the basis of the fMRI signal. *Nature*, *412*, 150-157. <https://doi.org/10.1038/35084005>
- 935 MacWhinney, B., & Leinbach, J. (1991). Implementations are not conceptualizations: revising the  
936 verb learning model. *Cognition*, *40*, 121-157. [https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1016/0010-0277\(91\)90048-9](https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1016/0010-0277(91)90048-9)
- 938 Marchman, V. A. (1993). Constraints on plasticity in a connectionist model of the English past tense.  
939 *Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience*, *5*(2), 215-234.  
940 <https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1162/jocn.1993.5.2.215>
- 941 Marcus, G. F., Brinkmann, U., Clahsen, H., Wiese, R., & Pinker, S. (1995). German inflection: The  
942 exception that proves the rule. *Cognitive Psychology*, *29*, 189-256.  
943 <https://doi.org/10.1006/cogp.1995.1015>
- 944 Mareschal, D., Johnson, M. H., Sirois, S., Spratling, M. W., Thomas, M., & Westermann, G. (2007).  
945 *Neuroconstructivism: How the Brain Constructs Cognition*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.  
946 <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0140525x0800407x>
- 947 McClelland, J. L., & Patterson, K. (2002). Rules or connections in past-tense inflections: what does  
948 the evidence rule out? *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, *6*(11), 465-472. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613\(02\)01993-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613(02)01993-9)
- 950 Mei, L., Xue, G., Lu, Z.-L., He, Q., Wei, M., Zhang, M., Dong, Q., & Chen, C. (2015). Native  
951 language experience shapes neural basis of addressed and assembled phonologies. *NeuroImage*, *114*,  
952 38-48. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2015.03.075>
- 953 Nelson, C. A., Moulson, M. C., & Richmond, J. (2006). How does neuroscience inform the study of  
954 cognitive development? *Human Development*, *49*(5), 260-272. <https://doi.org/10.1159/000095579>
- 955 Norris, D. G. (2006). Principles of magnetic resonance assessment of brain function. *Journal of*  
956 *Magnetic Resonance Imaging*, *23*(6), 794-807. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jmri.20587>
- 957 Oh, T. M., Tan, K. L., Ng, P., Berne, Y. I., & Graham, S. (2011). The past tense debate: Is  
958 phonological complexity the key to the puzzle? *NeuroImage*, *57*(1), 271-280.  
959 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2011.04.008>
- 960 O'Reilly, R. C., & Munakata, Y. (2000). Computational explorations in cognitive neuroscience:  
961 Understanding the mind by simulating the brain. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- 962 Park, D. C., & Huang, C.-M. (2010). Culture wires the brain. *Perspectives on Psychological Science*,  
963 *5*(4), 391-400. <https://dx.doi.org/10.1177/2F1745691610374591>
- 964 Patterson, K., Lambon Ralph, M. A., Hodges, J. R., & McClelland, J. L. (2001). Deficits in irregular  
965 past-tense verb morphology associated with degraded semantic knowledge. *Neuropsychologia*, *39*,  
966 709-724. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0028-3932\(01\)00008-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0028-3932(01)00008-2)

- 967 Pinker, S. (1991). Rules of language. *Science*, 253, 530-535. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1857983>  
968
- 969 Pinker, S. (1994). *The Language Instinct*. New York: Morrow.
- 970 Pinker, S. (1997). Words and rules in the human brain. *Nature*, 387, 547-548.  
971 <https://doi.org/10.1038/42347> <https://doi.org/10.1038/42347>
- 972 Pinker, S. (1999). *Words and Rules: The Ingredients of Language*. New York: Basic Books.
- 973 Pinker, S., & Ullman, M. T. (2002). The past and future of the past tense. *Trends in Cognitive  
974 Sciences*, 6(11), 456-463. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613\(02\)01990-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613(02)01990-3)
- 975 Pinker, S., & Ullman, M. T. (2003). Beyond one model per phenomenon. *Trends in Cognitive  
976 Sciences*, 7(3), 108-109. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613\(03\)00021-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613(03)00021-4)
- 977 Plaut, D. C. (1995). Double dissociation without modularity - evidence from connectionist  
978 neuropsychology. *Journal of Clinical and Experimental Neuropsychology*, 17(2), 291-321.  
979 <https://doi.org/10.1080/01688639508405124>
- 980 Plunkett, K., & Juola, P. (1999). A connectionist model of English past tense and plural morphology.  
981 *Cognitive Science*, 23(4), 463-490. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0364-0213\(99\)00012-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0364-0213(99)00012-9)
- 982 Plunkett, K., & Marchman, V. A. (1991). U-shaped learning and frequency-effects in a multilayered  
983 perceptron - implications for child language-acquisition. *Cognition*, 38(1), 43-102.  
984 [https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277\(91\)90022-V](https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277(91)90022-V)
- 985 Plunkett, K., & Marchman, V. A. (1993). From rote learning to system building - acquiring verb  
986 morphology in children and connectionist nets. *Cognition*, 48(1), 21-69.  
987 [https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277\(93\)90057-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277(93)90057-3)
- 988 Price, C. J., & Friston, K. J. (2002). Degeneracy and cognitive anatomy. *Trends in Cognitive  
989 Sciences*, 6(10), 416-421. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613\(02\)01976-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613(02)01976-9)
- 990 Quartz, S. R. (1993). Neural networks, nativism, and the plausibility of constructivism. *Cognition*,  
991 48(3), 223-242. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277\(93\)90041-S](https://doi.org/10.1016/0010-0277(93)90041-S)
- 992 Quartz, S. R. (1999). The constructivist brain. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, 3(2), 48-57.  
993 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613\(98\)01270-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613(98)01270-4)
- 994 Quartz, S. R., & Sejnowski, T. J. (1997). The neural basis of cognitive development: A constructivist  
995 manifesto. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 20(4), 537-596.  
996 <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0140525x97001581>
- 997 Rosenblatt, F. (1958). The perceptron: A probabilistic model for information storage and  
998 organization in the brain. *Psychological Review*, 65(6), 386-408. <https://doi.org/10.1037/h0042519>
- 999 Rumelhart, D. E. (1989). The architecture of mind: A connectionist approach. In M. I. Posner (Ed.),  
1000 *Foundations of cognitive science* (pp. 133-159). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press



- 1001 Rumelhart, D., & McClelland, J. L. (1986). On learning the past tense of English verbs: implicit rules  
1002 or parallel distributed processing? In J. L. McClelland & D. Rumelhart & the PDP Research Group  
1003 (Eds.), *Parallel Distributed Processing: Explorations in the Microstructure of Cognition*. Cambridge,  
1004 MA: MIT Press.
- 1005 Sahin, N. T., Pinker, S., & Halgren, E. (2006). Abstract Grammatical Processing of Nouns and Verbs  
1006 in Broca's Area: Evidence from fMRI. *Cortex*, 42(4), 540-562. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0010-](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0010-9452(08)70394-0)  
1007 9452(08)70394-0
- 1008 Seidenberg, M. S., & Hoeffner, J. H. (1998). Evaluating behavioral and neuroimaging data on past  
1009 tense processing. *Language*, 74, 104-122. <https://doi.org/10.2307/417567>
- 1010 Shultz, T. R., Mysore, S. P., & Quartz, S. P. (2007). Why let networks grow? In D. Mareschal & G.  
1011 Westermann & S. Sirois & M. H. Johnson (Eds.), *Neuroconstructivism: Perspectives and prospects*  
1012 (pp. 65-98). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 1013 Stiles, J. (2009). On genes, brains, and behavior: why should developmental psychologists care about  
1014 brain development? *Child Development Perspectives*, 3(3), 196-202. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-8606.2009.00106.x)  
1015 8606.2009.00106.x
- 1016 Tagamets, M. A., & Horwitz, B. (1998). Integrating electrophysiological and anatomical  
1017 experimental data to create a large-scale model that simulates a delayed match-to-sample human  
1018 brain imaging study. *Cerebral Cortex*, 8(4), 310-320. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/8.4.310>
- 1019 Thomas, M. S. C., Purser, H. R. M., Tomlinson, S., & Mareschal, D. (2012). Are imaging and  
1020 lesioning convergent methods for assessing functional specialisation? Investigations using an  
1021 artificial neural network. *Brain and Cognition*, 78(1), 38-49.  
1022 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bandc.2011.10.003>
- 1023 Tyler, L. K., deMornay-Davies, P., Anokhina, R., Longworth, C., Randall, B., & Marslen-Wilson,  
1024 W. D. (2002). Dissociations in Processing Past Tense Morphology: Neuropathology and Behavioral  
1025 Studies. *Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience*, 14(1), 79-94.  
1026 <https://doi.org/10.1162/089892902317205348>
- 1027 Ullman, M. T. (2004). Contributions of memory circuits to language: the declarative/procedural  
1028 model. *Cognition*, 92(1-2), 231-270. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cognition.2003.10.008>
- 1029 Ullman, M. T., Corkin, S., Coppola, M., Hickok, G., Growdon, J. H., Koroshetz, W. J., & Pinker, S.  
1030 (1997). A neural dissociation within language: Evidence that the mental dictionary is part of  
1031 declarative memory, and that grammatical rules are processed by the procedural system. *Journal of*  
1032 *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 9(2), 266-276. <https://doi.org/10.1162/jocn.1997.9.2.266>
- 1033 Westermann, G. (2016). Experience-dependent brain development as a key to understanding the  
1034 language system. *Topics in Cognitive Science*, 8(2), 446-458. <https://doi.org/10.1111/tops.12194>
- 1035 Westermann, G., Mareschal, D., Johnson, M. H., Sirois, S., Spratling, M., & Thomas, M. (2007).  
1036 Neuroconstructivism. *Developmental Science*, 10(1), 75-83. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-7687.2007.00567.x)  
1037 7687.2007.00567.x

- 1038 Westermann, G., & Plunkett, K. (2007). Connectionist models of inflection processing *Lingue e*  
1039 *Linguaggio*, 1(2), 291-311. <https://doi.org/10.1418/25655>
- 1040 Westermann, G., & Ruh, N. (2009). Synthetic brain imaging of English past tense inflection. In N.  
1041 A. Taatgen & H. van Rijn (eds.), *Proceedings of the 31st Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science*  
1042 *Society*, pp. 1364-1369. Austin, TX: Cognitive Science Society.
- 1043 Westermann, G., & Ruh, N. (2012). A neuroconstructivist model of past tense development and  
1044 processing. *Psychological Review*, 119, 649-667. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0028258>
- 1045
- 1046
- 1047

1048 **Figure captions**

1049 Figure 1: The architecture of the neuroconstructivist past tense model

1050 Figure 2: Development of the activation profiles of regular and irregular verbs in both network  
1051 pathways

1052 Figure 3: Distribution of path activations by regular and irregular verbs

1053

1054

1055 **Tables**

1056 Table 1: Correlations between the statistical properties of verbs and their activation ratio

Correlation with activation ratio	Past tense frequency	Friends	Enemies	Phonological complexity
<i>r</i>	-.696	.226	-.434	.245

1057 *Note.* All correlations  $p < .001$ .

1058

1059 Table 2: Correlations between regularity and the statistical properties of verbs in the training data

Correlation with regularity	Past tense frequency	Friends	Enemies	Phonological complexity
<i>r</i>	-.363	.176	-.7	-.122

1060 *Note.* All correlations  $p < .001$ .

1061