1	Harnessing global fisheries to tackle micronutrient deficiencies
2	
3	
4	
5	Christina C. Hicks <sup>1, 2</sup> , Philippa J. Cohen <sup>2,3</sup> , Nicholas A. J. Graham <sup>1,2</sup> , Kirsty L. Nash <sup>4,5</sup> ,
6	Edward H. Allison <sup>3,6</sup> , Coralie D'Lima <sup>3,7</sup> , David J. Mills <sup>2,3</sup> , Matthew Roscher <sup>3</sup> Shakuntala H.
7	Thilsted <sup>3</sup> , Andrew L. Thorne-Lyman <sup>8</sup> , M. Aaron MacNeil <sup>9</sup>
8	
0	
9	
10	
11	<sup>1</sup> Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster LA1 4YQ, UK
12 13	<sup>2</sup> Australian Research Council, Centre of Excellence for Coral Reef Studies, James Cook University, Townsville, Australia
14	<sup>3</sup> WorldFish, Jalan Batu Maung, Batu Maung 11960 Bayan Lepas, Penang, Malaysia
15 16	<sup>4</sup> Institute for Marine and Antarctic Studies, University of Tasmania, Private Bag 129, Hobart, TAS 7001, Australia
17	<sup>5</sup> Centre for Marine Socio-ecology, University of Tasmania, Hobart, TAS 7000, Australia
18 19	<sup>6</sup> School of Marine and Environmental Affairs, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington 98102 USA
20	<sup>7</sup> WWF-India, Goa Science Centre Complex, Mirimar, Panjim, Goa, 403004, India
21 22	<sup>8</sup> Department of International Health, Center for Human Nutrition, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, USA
23 24	<sup>9</sup> Ocean Frontier Institute, Department of Biology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, Nova Scotia B3H 4R2 Canada
25	*email: christina.hicks@lancaster.ac.uk
26	
27	

28 Micronutrient deficiencies account for an estimated one million premature deaths 29 annually, and for some nations can reduce GDP by up to 11%<sup>1,2</sup>, highlighting the need 30 for food policies focused on improving nutrition rather than simply increasing volumes 31 of food produced<sup>3</sup>. People gain nutrients from a varied diet but fish, a rich source of bioavailable micronutrients essential to human health<sup>4</sup>, are often overlooked. A lack of 32 understanding of the nutritional composition of most fish<sup>5</sup> and how nutrient yields vary 33 34 among fisheries has hindered policy shifts needed to effectively harness the potential of fisheries for food and nutrition security<sup>6</sup>. Here, using the concentration of seven nutrients 35 36 in more than 350 species of marine fish, we estimate how environmental and ecological traits predict nutrient content among marine finfish species. We use this predictive model 37 38 to quantify spatial patterns of nutrient concentration from marine fisheries yields 39 globally and compare nutrient yields to the prevalence of micronutrient deficiencies in 40 human populations. We find that species from tropical thermal regimes contain higher 41 concentrations of calcium, iron, and zinc; smaller species contain higher concentrations 42 of calcium, iron, and omega-3; and, species from cold thermal regimes or those with a 43 pelagic feeding pathway contain higher concentrations of omega-3. There is no 44 relationship between nutrient concentrations and total fisheries yield, highlighting that 45 nutrient quality of a fishery is determined by species composition. For a number of 46 countries where nutrient intakes are inadequte, nutrients available in marine finfish 47 catches exceed the dietary requirements for coastal (within 100km) populations, and a 48 fraction of current landings could be particularly impactful for children under five years. 49 Our analyses show that fish-based food strategies have the potential to substantially 50 contribute to food and nutrition security globally.

51

53 Uneven progress in tackling malnutrition has kept food and nutrition security high on the development agenda globally<sup>1,3</sup>. Micronutrients, such as iron and zinc, are a particular focus; 54 it is estimated that nearly two billion people lack key micronutrients<sup>7</sup>, underlying nearly half 55 of all deaths in children under the age of five years<sup>1</sup>, and reducing GDP in Africa by estimates 56 of up to 11%<sup>2,3,7</sup>. Consequently, efforts to tackle malnutrition have shifted from a focus on 57 58 increasing energy and macronutrients (e.g. protein) towards ensuring sufficient consumption 59 of micronutrients<sup>3</sup>. People gain nutrients from a mix of locally produced and imported food 60 products. Fish, harvested widely and traded both domestically and internationally, are a rich 61 source of bioavailable micronutrients, which are often deficient in diets that rely heavily on plant-based sources<sup>6,8</sup>. Fish could therefore help address nutritional deficiencies if there are 62 63 sufficient quantities of fishery-derived nutrients accessible in places where deficiencies exist. 64 However, addressing this major food policy frontier has been elusive, in part because the nutrient composition of fish varies significantly among species, and data remain sparse for most 65 species<sup>5</sup>. 66

67

Here we determine the contribution marine fisheries can make to addressing micronutrient deficiencies. First, using strict inclusion protocols (methods), we developed a database of 2,267 measures of nutritional composition, from 367 fish species, spanning 43 countries, for seven nutrients essential to human health: calcium, iron, selenium, zinc, vitamin A, omega-3 (n-3 fatty acids), and protein. We then gathered species-level environmental and ecological traits that capture elements of diet, thermal regime, and energetic demand in fish<sup>9,10</sup> to develop a series of Bayesian hierarchical models that determine drivers of nutrient content (Methods).

76 Our models successfully predicted nutrient concentrations, with posterior predictive 77 distributions consistently capturing both the observed overall mean and individual values of each nutrient<sup>11</sup> (Extended Data Figs. 1 and 2; Methods). We found that calcium, iron, and zinc 78 - nutrients critical in preventing public health conditions such as stunting and anaemia $^{7,12}$  -79 80 were in higher concentrations in tropical fishes (Fig. 1). Tropical soils are often zinc and 81 calcium deficient because these nutrients are easily exported from land to sea during strong 82 pulse rainfall events common in the tropics; this process may elevate levels of these nutrients in marine food-webs<sup>13</sup>. Higher concentrations of calcium, zinc and omega-3 were found in 83 small fish species. Small fish consumption is promoted, particularly in Asia and Africa<sup>14,15,</sup> as 84 85 a rich source of micronutrients and, although these high concentrations are often linked to the practice of consuming fish whole<sup>15</sup>, we also detected elevated levels of these nutrients in 86 87 muscle tissue.

88

Greater concentrations of omega-3 – which supports neurological function and cardiovascular 89 health<sup>16</sup> – was found in species that are pelagic feeders, are from cold regions, and approach 90 91 their maximum size more slowly (Fig. 1). Pelagic feeders consume plankton, the main source of omega-3 in aquatic systems<sup>17</sup>, whereas species adapted to a colder thermal regime, have a 92 greater need for energy storage compounds and fat, including fatty acids<sup>18</sup>. Selenium 93 94 concentrations were higher for species found at greater depths and lower for species in tropical 95 waters, whereas lower concentrations of vitamin A were found in species from cold regions, 96 with high trophic levels and short, deep body shapes. Concentrations of protein were greater in 97 higher trophic level species, and those with a pelagic feeding pathway, and lower in species 98 found in cold regions, and with a flat or elongated body shape (Fig. 1).

100 Given the alignment between our posterior predictions and observed data (Extended Data Fig. 101 2), we used our trait-based models of nutrient concentration, and traits for species within the landed catch of the world's marine fisheries<sup>19</sup>, to produce the first global estimates for 102 nutritional concentration (Fig. 2) and nutritional yield (Extended Data Fig. 3) of marine 103 104 fisheries (Methods). These data reflect catches from within a country's Economic Exclusive 105 Zone (EEZ) that are landed and consumed domestically, landed outside the country by foreign 106 fleets, or traded internationally<sup>19</sup>. We include both officially recorded and reconstructed 107 unrecorded catches (see Methods for comparisons), but do not include discards. There was no 108 correlation between the concentration of nutrients per unit catch and either total nutrient yield 109 or total fishery yield (Extended Data Fig. 4), suggesting the nutrient quality of fishery landings 110 is influenced by species composition rather than the quantity landed; and thus, fish-based food policy guidelines <sup>e.g. 20</sup> should specify for what types of fish consumption is advised. 111

112

High concentrations of iron and zinc (>2.5mg  $100^{-1}$ g and >1.8 mg  $100^{-1}$ g respectively, of raw, 113 edible portion) are found in the species caught in a number of African and Asian countries (Fig. 114 2, Extended Data Table 1), the same regions at greatest risk of deficiencies in these nutrients $^{7,12}$ . 115 116 This suggests that, in areas of critical public health concern, a single portion (100g) of an 117 average fish provides approximately half the recommended dietary allowance (RDA) of iron and zinc for a child under the age of five years. Calcium concentrations are high (>200mg/100g 118 119 raw, edible portion) in the species caught in the Caribbean region, an area with a high 120 prevalence of deficiency risk<sup>7</sup>, again highlighting the potential contributions fish can make to 121 targeted health interventions in these areas. Concentrations of selenium and omega-3 are high (>25ug 100<sup>-1</sup>g, >0.5g 100<sup>-1</sup>g respectively, of raw, edible portion) in fish species caught from 122 high latitude regions including parts of Russia, Canada, Northern Europe, and Alaska (Fig. 2, 123 124 Extended Data Table 1). This is consistent with omega-3 observed as abundant in marine foods 125 consumed by Arctic indigenous populations such as the Inuit of Nunavik, Canada<sup>21</sup>.
126 Furthermore, these high selenium concentrations are found in some of the areas where selenium
127 deficiencies are common<sup>22</sup>, yet a single portion of an average fish (Methods) from these waters
128 contains enough selenium to meet the daily RDA for a child under the age of five years, and
129 nearly half that required by adults.

130

131 While recognising challenges of fisheries sustainability, and potential climate-driven declines in yields<sup>23</sup>, the availability of high concentrations of key nutrients in areas at risk of nutrient 132 133 deficiencies suggests that marine fisheries could be critical in helping close nutrient gaps. To 134 assess this, we calculated nutrient yields (per capita) using the estimated national nutrient yield in our models and the human population living within 100 km of the coast (which represents 135 39% of the global population<sup>24</sup>; Methods). We focus on calcium, iron, zinc, and vitamin A, 136 which constitute a major burden of malnutrition, particularly within low-income countries<sup>1,7,12</sup>. 137 For each nutrient and country, we compare this to published dietary deficiency risks<sup>12</sup>, seafood 138 consumption rates<sup>25</sup>, and RDA<sup>26</sup> (Methods). We specify RDA averaged for the population aged 139 140 five years and over, and children between six months and four years (Fig. 3). The latter category 141 represents a vulnerable proportion of the population, in which interventions have the greatest 142 potential long-term effects on growth, development, and health.

143

Fish-derived calcium, iron, zinc, and vitamin A yields of a large number of countries could contribute a significant proportion of the RDA for their coastal populations. For eight countries, these yields exceed requirements for at least one of these nutrients (Fig. 3a-d). Of those countries, only Iceland has mild dietary deficiency risks (<20%)<sup>12,27</sup> (Fig. 3a-d). Very high nutrient yields and prevalence of dietary deficiency risk coincide for at least two nutrients in 149 Namibia, Mauritania, and Kiribati (Fig. 3a-d). In these countries, a small fraction of available 150 fisheries production, has the potential to close nutrient gaps. For example, iron dietary 151 deficiency risk in Namibia is severe  $(47\%)^{12}$ , but just 9% of the fish caught in her EEZ is 152 equivalent to the dietary iron requirements for her entire coastal population.

153

154 Fisheries clearly have an important place in food and nutrition policy. This contribution could 155 be particularly significant if targeted towards the most vulnerable groups within society, such 156 as children under the age of five, capturing the period when most growth-faltering occurs. Over 50% of coastal countries have moderate to severe deficiency risks  $(>20\%)^{12,27}$  and nutritional 157 yields that exceed the RDA needed for all children under five in the coastal population (Fig. 158 3e-h). Most notably in Kiribati, calcium dietary deficiency risk is severe  $(82\%)^{12}$ , but just 1% 159 160 of fish caught in her EEZ equals the calcium requirements for all children under five years. For 161 a further 22 countries, predominantly in Asia and west Africa, the dietary requirements for all 162 children under five years is equivalent to 20% or less of current catches. That targeted 163 approaches could only require a fraction of current landings, suggests a nutrition-sensitive 164 fisheries approach could align with environmental efforts to reduce current harvest levels.

165

Nutrient surpluses of some coastal countries where nutritional needs are not being met highlights that large yields do not necessarily lead to food and nutrition security. International fishing fleets and trade deals<sup>19</sup>, physical, economic, or institutional access to the right food<sup>28</sup>, food preferences and cultures, waste, and reduction to fish oil for animal feed<sup>29</sup>, can all act as barriers or avenues to these resources meeting local nutritional needs. For example, trade and foreign fishing are dominant in countries with large nutrient yields, where high rates of dietary deficiency risk exist (Methods; Extended Data Table 2). Understanding why, when there is an adequate supply of nutrients, populations are still at risk of dietary deficiency, will require a
multiscale socio-economic research agenda, that situates fish in the broader food system,
accounting for patterns of production, distribution, preparation, and consumption.

176

177 Our results identify the current world distribution of nutrients from fisheries catch. In doing so, 178 we demonstrate that for a number of nutrients essential to human health current production has 179 the potential to significantly and positively impact the nutritional status of some of the most 180 nutrient-deficient countries globally, even at reduced catch levels. Given that fish are in many instances a more affordable animal-source food<sup>4</sup>, with a lower environmental impact<sup>20</sup>, and 181 nutrient supply from fisheries is comparable to that from other animal-source foods<sup>30</sup>, fisheries 182 183 should be a core component of food and nutrition policy. However, current fisheries policy 184 remains orientated towards maximising profit or yield. Reorienting fisheries policy towards a 185 more efficient distribution of consumption, aimed at meeting nutritional needs, could close 186 nutrient gaps in geographies of critical food and nutrition concern such as west and sub-Saharan 187 Africa. Achieving this will require concerted efforts to understand how existing policies can 188 be redirected towards desired food and nutrition outcomes. Ultimately, multiple approaches and actors must work in concert to tackle malnutrition <sup>20</sup>. Fisheries should thus form part of an 189 190 integrated approach that is informed from health, production, development, and environmental 191 sectors.

192

194 1. Global Nutrition Report 2017: *Nourishing the SDGs*. (Development Initiatives, 195 Bristol, 2017). 2. Horton, S. & Steckel, R. H. in How Much have Global Problems Cost the World? (ed. 196 197 Lomborg, B.) 247–272 (Cambridge University Press, 2013). 3. Haddad, L. et al. A new global research agenda for food. Nature 540, 30-32 (2016). 198 199 4. Kawarazuka, N. & Béné, C. The potential role of small fish species in improving 200 micronutrient deficiencies in developing countries: Building evidence. Public Health 201 Nutr. 14, 1927–1938 (2011). 202 5. Vaitla, B. et al. Predicting nutrient content of ray-finned fishes using phylogenetic 203 information. Nat. Commun. 9, 3742 (2018). 204 6. Thilsted, S. H. et al. Sustaining healthy diets: The role of capture fisheries and 205 aquaculture for improving nutrition in the post-2015 era. Food Policy 61, 126-131 206 (2016). 207 7. Kumssa, D. B. et al. Dietary calcium and zinc deficiency risks are decreasing but remain 208 prevalent. Sci. Rep. 5, 1-11 (2015). 209 8. Hotz, C. & Gibson, R. S. Traditional food-processing and preparation practices to enhance the bioavailability of micronutrients in plant-based diets. J. Nutr. 137, 1097-210 211 1100 (2007). 9. Hixson, S. M., Sharma, B., Kainz, M. J., Wacker, A. & Arts, M. T. Production, 212 213 distribution, and abundance of long-chain omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids: a 214 fundamental dichotomy between freshwater and terrestrial ecosystems. Environ. 215 *Rev.* 23, 414-424 (2015). 216 10. McGill, B. J., Enquist, B. J., Weiher, E. & Westoby, M. Rebuilding community ecology from functional traits. Trends Ecol. Evol. 21, 178–185 (2006). 217 218 11. Gelman, A., Meng, X-L. & Stern, H. Posterior predictive assessment of model fitness 219 via realized discrepancies. Statistica sinica 6, 733-760 (1996). 220 12. Beal, T., Massiot, E., Arsenault, J. E., Smith, M. R. & Hijmans, R. J. Global trends in 221 dietary micronutrient supplies and estimated prevalence of inadequate intakes. PLoS 222 One 12, e0175554 (2017). 223 13. Lal, R. Managing soils for a warming earth in a food-insecure and energy-starved 224 world. J. Plant Nutr. Soil Sci. 173, 4-15 (2010). 225 14. Marinda, P. A., Genschick, S., Khayeka-Wandabwa, C., Kiwanuka-Lubinda, R. & 226 Thilsted, S. H. Dietary diversity determinants and contribution of fish to maternal and 227 under-five nutritional status in Zambia. PLoS One 13, e0204009 (2018). 228 15. Thilsted, S. H., Roos, N. & Hassan, N. The role of small indigenous fish species in food 229 and nutrition security in Bangladesh. Naga 20, 82-84 (1997). 230 16. Calder, P. C. Marine omega-3 fatty acids and inflammatory processes: Effects, 231 mechanisms and clinical relevance. Mol. Cell Biol. Lipids 1851, 469-484 (2015). 232 17. Parrish, C. C. Lipids in Marine Ecosystems. ISRN Oceanogr. 2013, 604045 (2013). 233 18. Arts, M. T., Brett, M. T. & Kainz, M. J. Lipids in aquatic ecosystems. (Springer, 2009). 234 19. Pauly, D. & Zeller, D. Catch reconstructions reveal that global marine fisheries catches 235 are higher than reported and declining. Nat. Commun. 7, 10244 (2016). 236 20. Willett, W. et al. Food in the Anthropocene: the EAT-Lancet Commission on healthy 237 diets fomr sustainable food systems Lancet 393, 447-492 238 21. Achouba, A., Dumas, P., Ouellet, N., Lemire, M. & Ayotte, P. Plasma levels of 239 selenium-containing proteins in Inuit adults from Nunavik. Environ. Int. 96, 8-15 240 (2016).

- 241 22. Vedtofte, M. S., Jakobsen, M. U., Lauritzen, L. & Heitmann, B. L. Dietary α-linolenic
  242 acid, linoleic acid, and n–3 long-chain PUFA and risk of ischemic heart disease. *Am. J.*243 *Clin. Nutr.* 94, 1097–1103 (2011).
- 244 23. Golden, C. D. et al. Nutrition: Fall in fish catch threatens human health. *Nature* 534, 317–320 (2016).
- 246 24. Kummu, M. et al. Over the hills and further away from coast: global geospatial patterns
  247 of human and environment over the 20th–21st centuries. *Environ. Res. Lett.* 11, 034010
  248 (2016).
- 249 25. Micha, R., et. al. Global, regional and national consumption of major food groups in
  250 1990 and 2010: a systematic analysis including 266 country-specific nutrition surveys
  251 worldwide. *BMJ open.* 5, p.e008705 doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2015-008705 (2015).
- 252 26. National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. *Dietary Reference* 253 *Intakes Tables and Application*. 2017 Available at: national academies.
   254 org/HMD/Activities/Nutrition/SummaryDRIs/DRI-Tables. aspx.
- 255 27. Allen, L., de Benoist, B., Dary, O. & Hurrell R. *Guidelines on Food Fortification with* 256 *Micronutrients*. (World Health Organization, Geneva, 2006)
  - 28. Sen, A. *Poverty and Famines: an Essay on Entitlement and Deprivation*. (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1982).
- 259 29. Fréon, P., Avadí, A., Vinatea Chavez, R. A. & Iriarte Ahón, F. Life cycle assessment
  260 of the Peruvian industrial anchoveta fleet: boundary setting in life cycle inventory
  261 analyses of complex and plural means of production. *Int. J. Life Cycle Assess.* 19, 1068–
  262 1086 (2014).
- 30. Smith, M. R., Micha, R., Golden, C. D., Mozaffarian, D. & Myers, S. S. Global
  Expanded Nutrient Supply (GENuS) Model: A New Method for Estimating the Global
  Dietary Supply of Nutrients. *PLoS One* 11, e0146976 (2016).

257

#### 267 FIGURE LEGENDS





- 269 270
- 2,0
- 271
- 272

## Fig. 1 | Bayesian hierarchical predictive model of nutrient concentrations in fish.

274 Standardised effect sizes for environmental and ecological drivers of nutrient concentrations:

diet (green), thermal regime (dark blue), and energetic demand (light blue). Parameter

estimates are Bayesian posterior median values, 95% highest posterior density uncertainty

277 intervals (UI; thin lines), and 50% UI (thick lines). Black dots indicate that the 50% UI does

278 not overlap zero, indicating more than 75% of the posterior density was either positive or

279 negative; and open squares indicate baseline category in the statistical model. Underlying

280 sample sizes are calcium (n=170), iron (n=173), selenium (n=134), zinc (n=196), vitamin A

281 (n=69), omega-3 (n=176), and protein (n=627). Note effect sizes are not on a common x-axis
282 scale for clarity of presentation.

- 283
- 284
- 285
- 286
- 287
- 288
- 289
- 290
- 291







#### Fig. 3 | Potential contribution fisheries could make to closing dietary nutrient gaps.

Nutritional yield per, **a-d**) capita coastal resident **e-h**) capita under 5-year-old coastal

resident, by dietary deficiency risk<sup>12</sup> for all coastal countries based on, **a**), **e**) calcium; **b**), **f**) 

iron; c), g) zinc; d), h) vitamin A. Bubble size indicates national seafood consumption (g cap<sup>-</sup> 

<sup>1</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>25</sup>. Solid horizontal line denotes <5-year old RDA, dotted horizontal line denotes RDA 

- for the rest of the population $^{26}$ .

318 319

### **METHODS**

- 320 321 322 Finfish nutrient content database. We compiled a database of 4188 measures of nutritional 323 composition, from 419 finfish species, spanning 45 countries, based on: 324 1) Thomson Reuters Web of Science search of the scientific literature published between 325 the years 1980 and 2015, using the search terms 'content' or 'compos\*', and 'nutrition\* NEAR content NEAR fish\* AND Marine\*'. 326 2) <u>FAO/INFOODS</u> food composition for biodiversity database<sup>31-33</sup> produced by the Food 327 328 and Agriculture Organisation (FAO) of the United Nations. 329 3) Key informant grey literature sources of finfish nutrient composition databases 330 identified through snowballing of nutrition experts. 331 We extracted quantitative nutrient data from these sources on 14 nutrients essential to human health<sup>34</sup>; including, protein, minerals (iron, calcium, zinc, phosphorous, magnesium, 332 333 selenium), vitamins (Vitamin A and B12), and fatty acids (polyunsaturated fatty acid 334 (PUFA); the PUFA subsidiaries (omega-6, omega-3), and the omega-3 subsidiaries 335 (eicosapentaenoic acid (EPA) and docosahexaenoic acid (DHA)). We only included sources 336 in English, that were fully traceable and accessible, based on wild caught, marine finfish 337 species, where analyses were conducted on fresh samples, reported nutrient content as a 338 quantitative measure, and samples were taken from either the muscle, fillet, 'edible portion' 339 or whole body. 340
- 341 Where necessary, nutrient quantities were standardized into g/100g, mg/100g, or  $\mu g/100g$ .
- We followed the FAO-INFOODS guidelines<sup>35</sup> for fatty acid conversions from percentage of 342
- total fatty acids to g/100g. Differences in sampling (e.g., wet weight, dry weight, whole, 343
- 344 whole minus parts, muscle etc) were recorded and controlled for in our analyses (Methods
- 345 below, Extended Data Fig. 5.)

- 347 Of the14 nutrients of interest, seven had sufficient replication for our analyses: calcium, iron,
- 348 selenium, zinc, vitamin A, polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA), and protein. We focussed our
- 349 PUFA on n-3 fatty acids (i.e. omega-3) because fish are known to be the richest source of
- 350 these important long chain n-3 fatty acids, and few other sources exist<sup>36</sup>. The final database

for the seven nutrients used here was comprised of 2,267 individual samples, from 367
species of finfish, spanning 43 countries.

353

Traits database. Drawing on a body of theoretical, analytical, and empirical research in fish ecology<sup>9,10,37-39</sup> we identified a suite of characteristics related to diet, energetic demand, and thermal regime that are likely to influence nutritional quality of fish. We selected a traitbased approach to enable mechanisms of nutrient concentrations to be explored. However, we also allowed for inter-order variation among species in the structure of our hierarchical model to account for phylogeny<sup>5</sup>.

360

We used FishBase<sup>40</sup> to source trait data on the identified characteristics for fish species in our 361 nutrient database and the Sea Around Us Project landings data. An underlying assumption of 362 363 this approach is that trait values are fixed for a species and do not change in time or space. 364 Thus, spatial trends in nutrient concentrations are representative of shifts in the composition 365 of the catch. Where trait data were missing for a particular species, genus level averages were 366 calculated (mean for continuous traits and mode for categorical traits). Where genus level 367 averages were not available due to missing data, family level average values were calculated. 368 Traits were selected carefully to capture distinct elements of a species diet, energy demand, 369 and thermal regime.

370

371 Diet. Diet directly influences the nutritional content of organisms through the concentration of bioavailable nutrients in their food<sup>9,41</sup>. Two diet variables were sourced for each species: 372 373 feeding pathway, and trophic level. For feeding pathway, each species was first categorised 374 based on their food source, as listed under "ecology", "diet", and "food items" in FishBase<sup>40</sup>. These food sources were then classified as either from a predominantly pelagic pathway (e.g. 375 376 planktonic feeding) or benthic pathway (e.g. benthic algae, crustaceans). For carnivores, the 377 prey items needed to be assessed in the same way to see if they reflect pelagic or benthic 378 pathways. This represents the two dominant energy pathways for fish feeding in the marine environment, which are likely to influence the accumulation of nutrients<sup>42</sup>. Trophic level, 379 directly extracted from FishBase<sup>40</sup>, indicates how high in the foodweb a species is feeding, 380 which can be important for the bioaccumulation or bioreduction of some nutrients<sup>43</sup>. 381 382

383 *Thermal Regime*. The thermal regimes of water depth and the major geographic zones of the 384 world influence a range of processes that may determine the assimilation or availability of nutrients, for example metabolism of organisms<sup>44</sup>, and precipitation driven run-off of

- terrestrial nutrient sources<sup>45</sup>. We capture maximum depth and geographic zone for each
- 387 species. Because temperature declines with depth, the maximum depth trait is correlated with
- 388 temperature requirements<sup>46</sup>. Geographic zone was captured with four thermal regimes;
- 389 tropical, subtropical, temperate, and cold. The 'cold' category includes polar and deep-water
- 390 specialist species that are adapted to very cold water.
- 391

392 Energetic Demand. The allocation of energy and resources, including nutrients, to different 393 aspects of life history, for example growth, reproduction, or somatic storage, is fundamental 394 in animals<sup>47</sup>. Four variables were included to represent energetic demand: maximum length 395 which is allometric with a range of characteristics such as home range and metabolism; age at 396 maturity which captures the point at which resources are allocated to reproduction; K which 397 captures the rate at which maximum size is approached and thus how energy is dedicated to 398 body mass accumulation; and body shape which influences how a fish moves through its 399 environment. All variables were extracted from FishBase<sup>40</sup>. Four categories of body shape 400 were used; flat, elongate, short-deep, and fusiform. Eel-like shaped species (n=5 in our data) 401 were grouped with elongate. Natural mortality (M) and reproductive guild were not included 402 due to limited data on these life history traits across species.

403

404 Control variables. While fish trait covariates were of substantive interest, other covariates 405 related to sampling were not; however we included these 'nuisance parameters' because they 406 could have potentially biased our results due purely to sampling (Extended Data Fig. 5). 407 Therefore we controlled for variability in reported preparation (wet weight or dry weight) and 408 sampling (whole, whole minus parts, muscle), source (Web of Science, key informant grey 409 literature, FAO-INFOODS), by representing these conditions as covariates in our model. 410 Finally, while multiple habitat categories are recorded in FishBase, it was unclear how this 411 covariate would determine nutritional yield within a given ecosystem; we did however 412 believe it might affect sampling and therefore chose to include it as a nuisance parameter. 413

414 **Predictive model of nutrient concentrations.** We developed a series of Bayesian

415 hierarchical models to predict the nutritional quality of marine finfish species, based on their

416 environmental and ecological traits. None of the traits were sufficiently collinear to be

- 417 problematic for the model. Where nutrient data were recorded at the genus level, these data
- 418 were retained in the analysis if there were no species data for that genus within the dataset. If

419 species-level data were available from a given genus, any genus-level data was removed due to non-independence among data points. We ran two sets of models, one where covariates 420 421 were unstandardized and a second set where continuous explanatory variables were 422 standardised by subtracting their mean and dividing by two standard deviations. The 423 dependent variables, and maximum depth, maximum length, and growth rate were log-424 transformed to normalize the spread of these highly-skewed distributions. Our statistical 425 models were hierarchically-structured, allowing for inter-order differences that were 426 otherwise unaccounted for in our trait-focused models; this also provided posterior predictive 427 distributions for unobserved species that represented the full uncertainty underlying their 428 estimation. For each nutrient, our basic linear model structure was:

- 429
- 430

 $\mu = \beta_{0,ORD} + \beta_{1,HAB} + \beta_{2,TR} + \beta_3 MAD + \beta_4 TL + \beta_5 PEL + \beta_6 LMX + \beta_{7,BOD} + \beta_8 K + \beta_9 AM + \beta_{10,HAB} + \beta_{11,FOS} + \beta_{12,SPM} + \beta_{13,SEA}$ 

432

433 where the  $\beta_x$  values represent covariate parameters for taxonomic order (ORD), thermal 434 regime (TR), maximum depth (MAD), total length (TL), pelagic (PEL), maximum length 435 (LMX), body type (BOD), growth parameter (K), and age at maturity (AM). It also included 436 nuisance parameters for habitat category (HAB), the form of sample (FOS), sample 437 preparation method (SPM), and the database used to acquire the data (SEA). This linear 438 model was itself hierarchical, with the order-level intercepts ( $\beta_0$ ) allowing for phylogenetic 439 variation among groups.

440

441 Depending on assessed levels of fit to the model for each nutrient (see posterior checks

442 below), we used this linear model in combination with one of three data likelihoods, either

443 Normal  $(Y_i \sim N(\mu, \sigma))$  for calcium, omega-3 fatty acids, and selenium), non-central t

444  $(Y_i \sim T(\nu, \mu, \sigma) \text{ for protein and vitamin A}), \text{ or Gamma } (Y_i \sim \Gamma(\alpha, \alpha/e^{\mu}) \text{ for zinc and iron}).$  The 445 priors and hyperpriors for the various parameters were:

- 446
- 447  $\beta_0 \sim N(\gamma_0, \sigma_\gamma)$
- 448  $\gamma_0, \beta_{1...13} \sim N(0, 1000)$
- 449  $\sigma_{\gamma}, \sigma, \alpha \sim U(0, 1000)$
- 450  $\nu \sim U(0,4)$
- 451

452 Models were all run in PyMC3 (ref 48) for 5000 iterations of the automatically-assigned No-U-Turn sampler. We examined posterior traces and Gelman-Rubin statistics<sup>49</sup> for evidence of 453 454 model convergence and used posterior predictive distributions to check for model fit. 455 Beginning with an assumed Normal data likelihood, if we found evidence for lack of 456 convergence or poor model fit, we tried the alternative non-central t and Gamma likelihoods 457 instead. Final models all had stable traces and Gelman-Rubin statistics very near one, 458 supporting convergence, and posterior predictive distributions consistent with the observed 459 data, supporting accurate predictions under each model (Extended Data Figs. 1 and 2).

460

461 Mapping nutrient yields from global fisheries. Using the Sea Around Us (SAU) catch 462 reconstruction database<sup>19</sup>, we extracted catches from each country's exclusive economic zone (EEZ) in tonnes and by species group for the period 2010-2014. Reported and unreported 463 464 catches are generally available for consumption, but discards are not. We therefore extracted 465 data on reported and unreported catches from each country's EEZ, and excluded discards 466 from this data. Insufficient trait data exist for crustaceans<sup>50</sup>, and the majority of landed catch 467 are finfish. Therefore, all crustaceans, freshwater species, and cephalopods were removed 468 from the database. We used the top 20 remaining species in our SAU database, which 469 represent 100% of the catch of 31% of EEZs, over 90% of 74% of EEZs, and 75% of 95% of 470 EEZs, to calculate the nutrient concentration of the catch from each EEZ over the 5-year 471 period. The same procedure as used for the nutrient database, was used to assign the 472 environmental and ecological traits to the species in the landed catch. Where Sea Around Us 473 data were reported at family or genus level, we used the average trait value for that family or 474 genus. All higher-level groupings (e.g. order and mixed categories), representing 18% of the 475 finfish catch, were removed for the purpose of calculating EEZ nutrient concentrations. 476 Higher level groupings were then reintroduced to calculate the EEZ nutrient yields. Our 477 nutrient database included 17% of the species in the landed catch and we utilised the 478 predictive capability of the trait-based model (Extended Data Figs. 1 and 2) for the remaining 479 catch. Using the trait covariates from our predictive model, we calculated expected nutrient 480 concentrations (per 100g raw, edible portion) based on the top 20 caught taxon grouping in 481 the SAU database and the posterior distributions from our model. We then multiplied these 482 values by total catch to estimate total nutritional yield per EEZ, based on reported SAU 483 catches. There is some debate around the validity of the reconstructed unreported portion of 484 these data, we therefore repeated all the analysis using only the reported catch and used 485 correlation analyses to establish whether any bias was introduced. The spatial patterns in

- 486 nutrient yields and nutrient concentrations are extremely similar between the
- 487 reported+unreported and only reported data (Extended data Figs. 3 and 5). All nutrient yield
- 488 correlation coefficients are > 98; and nutrient concentration >0.89 (Extended data Fig. 4); and
- 489 reported+unreported nutrient yields are 19-29% greater than just reported nutrient yields.
- 490
- 491 There was no correlation between the concentration of nutrients per unit catch and either total
- 492 nutrient yield or total fishery yield (Extended Data Fig. 6). This suggests that: first, nutrient
- 493 concentrations are independent of total yield, and; second, the nutrient quality of fishery
- 494 landings is influenced by species composition rather than the quantity landed. Fish-based
- 495 food policy guidelines <sup>e.g. 20</sup> should thus specify for what types of fish consumption is
- 496 advised.
- 497
- 498 Code for Bayesian hierarchical model used to predict nutrient concentrations from499 standardized covariates:
- 500 https://gist.github.com/mamacneil/4358c6429a4dfa4a188e16bdce9c9376
- 501
- 502

503 Fishery contributions to meeting nutritional needs. Coastal population: We gathered data 504 on each country's coastal population within a 100km coastal band and each country's population age structure in 2015<sup>51</sup>. To calculate coastal proportion, we created a 100km 505 506 buffer along each country's coastline based on the Global Administrative Areas database 507 (GADM v.2.8) and used this to calculate total human population, and population under 5 years, within 100km coastal band for each country in 2015 based on the Socioeconomic Data 508 and Application Centre gridded population of the world database<sup>52</sup> and each country's 509 population age structure<sup>51</sup>. In 2010, 39% of the world's population lived within 100km of the 510 511  $coast^{24}$ , and within our study the coastal population captured on average 74% of each country's population (ranging from 2% to 100%), or 49% of the population of all countries 512 513 considered. 514 515 Nutrient yields and reference points: We focused on calcium, iron, zinc, and vitamin A, which are of great public health concern globally, and especially in low-income countries<sup>7,12</sup>. 516 517 We calculated each country's per capita nutrient yield for the entire coastal population and 518 separately for children under 5 years using the calculated fisheries-derived nutrient yields

- 519 (methods above) and respective populations within the 100km coastal band. We use
- 520 Recommended Dietary Allowance (RDA) for calcium, iron, zinc, and vitamin A as our

- 521 dietary reference intake values. RDA is the intake level at which the dietary needs of nearly
- all (97% to 98 %) of the population will be met. We calculated average RDA for children
- 523 under 5 years and for the rest of the population<sup>26</sup>. To calculate average RDA for children
- 524 under 5 years, we assumed infants between birth and six months were exclusively breastfed,
- and would thus not consume fishery derived nutrients directly. We then calculated the
- average RDA for children between 6 months and 4 years (i.e. children <5 years), assuming
- 527 each country's population was evenly distributed across the first 5 years of life<sup>26</sup>.
- 528
- 529 *Prevalence of inadequate intake*: We extracted data on the prevalence of inadequate intake of
- 530 calcium, iron, zinc, and vitamin A for each country in 2011 from Beal et  $al^{12}$ . Beal et  $al^{12}$
- 531 combined food balance sheets from the FAO, UN population data, and nutrient intakes and
- 532 requirements to calculate prevalence of inadequate intake based on the population weighted
- 533 estimated average requirement and the distribution of the availability of each micronutrient.
- 534
- 535 *Fish consumption rates:* We extracted data on seafood consumption rates<sup>25</sup> as an indicator of
- bow likely fish-based nutrition strategies were to be locally and culturally acceptable<sup>29</sup>.
- 537 Countries that do not consume seafood are likely to face social, cultural, or religious barriers
- 538 to the introduction of fish as a source of nutrients.
- 539

### 540 **Role of trade and foreign fishing**

- Fish trade could act as an engine of growth<sup>53</sup> enabling the import of large volumes of 541 nutritious foods. Alternatively, in the absence of fair returns<sup>54</sup>, fish trade could exacerbate 542 food and nutrition insecurity<sup>55</sup>. Recent global analyses demonstrate the volume of fish 543 544 exported from developing countries is equal to the volume imported, with developed countries importing high-priced seafood in exchange for low-priced seafood<sup>56</sup>. This work 545 546 thus suggests developing countries are compensated for the quantities of seafood that they 547 export with income; but, what remains unclear is whether the income from trade translates to 548 the consumption of nutrient-rich foods, and how this pattern plays out in different countries. 549 To address this gap, we analyse the role of trade and foreign fishing in the countries with 550 potential nutrient supply and high prevalence of deficiencies.
- 551
- 552 For the countries whose nutrient yields (from catches in their EEZ's) exceed the RDA for
- their coastal populations, and for the same 5-year period (2010-2014), we use the FAO
- 554 fishery statistical collections <sup>57</sup> (http://www.fao.org/fishery/statistics/global-commodities-

555 production/en) to extract data on marine finfish imports and exports to examine the patterns 556 of marine finfish trade; and the Sea Around Us catch reconstructions data to examine the 557 prevalence of foreign fishing in their waters, to together establish how trade may affect food 558 and nutrition security.

559

560 Domestic fleets account for the greatest volumes of finfish catches (>79%) in Iceland,

561 Maldives, and Namibia, whereas foreign fleets account for most of the fish caught in Kiribati

562 and Mauritania (>69%). Namibia and Kiribati subsequently exports most of their fish

563 landings (>90%), whereas the other nations export approximately half. For all countries, fish

imports amount to a small fraction (<5%) of fish exports. Taken together, Namibia, 564

565 Mauritania, and Kiribati, countries with high prevalence of nutritional deficiencies, have the

566 equivalent of <13% of the fish caught in their waters available for domestic markets, whereas

Iceland and Maldives, countries with low prevalence of nutritional deficiencies, have 68% 567

568 and 39% available (Extended Data Table 2). Any income gained from the large quantities of

569 fish trade and foreign fishing in Namibia, Mauritania, and Kiribati does not appear to

570 substitute for the nutrients lost. These countries could benefit from policies that seek to divert

571 a greater portion of fish for local consumption.

- 572
- 573 574

#### 575 REFERENCES

576

#### 577 31. Rittenschober, D., Stadlmayr, B., Nowak, V., Du, J. & Charrondiere, U.R. Report on the 578 development of the FAO/INFOODS user database for fish and shellfish (uFiSh) -579

Challenges and possible solutions. Food Chem. 193, 112-120 (2016).

- 32. Rittenschober, D., Nowak, V. & Charrondiere, U. R. Review of availability of food 580 581 composition data for fish and shellfish. Food Chem. 141, 4303–10 (2013).
- 582 33. FAO-INFOODS v4.0 http://www.fao.org/infoods/infoods/tables-anddatabases/faoinfoods-databases/en/ (2017) 583
- 34. Bogard, J. R., et. al. Nutrient composition of important fish species in Bangladesh and 584 585 potential contribution to recommended nutrient intakes. J. Food Compos. Anal. 42, 586 120-133 (2015).
- 587 35. Charrondiere, U.R., et. al., Improving food composition data quality: three new 588 FAO/INFOODS guidelines on conversions, data evaluation and food matching. Food 589 chemistry, 193, 75-81 (2016).
- 590 36. Sidhu, K.S. Health benefits and potential risks related to consumption of fish or fish oil. 591 Regul. Toxicol. Pharmacol. 38, 336–344 (2003).
- 592 37. Budge, S. M., Iverson, S. J., Bowen, W. D. & Ackman, R. G. Among- and within-species 593 variability in fatty acid signatures of marine fish and invertebrates on the Scotian 594 Shelf, Georges Bank, and southern Gulf of St. Lawrence. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 59, 886-898 (2002). 595
- 596 38. Balter, M., What made humans modern? Science, 295, 1219-1225 (2002).

- 39. Mouillot, D., Graham, N. A. J., Villéger, S., Mason, N. W. H. & Bellwood, D. R. A
  functional approach reveals community responses to disturbances. *Trends Ecol. Evol.*28, 167–177 (2013).
- 600 40. Froese, R. & Pauly, D. Ed. FishBase. www.fishbase.org, version (2018).
- 41. Willis, J.N. and Sunda, W.G. Relative contributions of food and water in the
  accumulation of zinc by two species of marine fish. *Marine Biology*, *80*, 273-279
  (1984).
- 42. Christensen, V. & Pauly, D. ECOPATH II a software for balancing steady-state
  ecosystem models and calculating network characteristics. *Ecol. Modell.* 61, 169–185
  (1992).
- 43. Van der Oost, R., Beyer, J. and Vermeulen, N.P. Fish bioaccumulation and biomarkers in
  environmental risk assessment: a review. *Environmental toxicology and pharmacology*, 13, 57-149 (2003).
- 44. Brown, J. H., Gillooly, J. F., Allen, A. P., Savage, V. M. & West, G. B. Toward a
  Metabolic theory of ecology. *Ecology* 85, 1771-1789 (2004).
- 45. Barlow, J. et. al. The future of hyperdiverse tropical ecosystems. *Nature*, 559, 517–526
  (2018).
- 614 46. Dee, L. E. et al. Functional diversity of catch mitigates negative effects of temperature
  615 variability on fisheries yields. *Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* 283, p.20161435 (2016).
- 47. Willmer, P., Stone, G. & Johnston, I. *Environmental Physiology of Animals*. (John Wiley & Sons, 2009).
- 48. Salvatier, J., Wiecki, T.V. & Fonnesbeck, C. Probabilistic programming in Python using
  PyMC3. *PeerJ Computer Science*, 2, p.e55 (2016).
- 620 49. Gelman, A. et al. *Bayesian Data Analysis* Vol. 2 (CRC, Boca Raton 2014).
- 50. Nash, K.L., Watson, R.A., Halpern, B.S., Fulton, E.A. & Blanchard, J.L. Improving
  understanding of the functional diversity of fisheries by exploring the influence of
  global catch reconstruction. *Scientific reports*, 7, p.10746 (2017).
- 624 51.United Nations DESA Population Division

https://population.un.org/wpp/Download/Standard/Population/ (2017)

- 626 52. Gridded Population of the World (GPW), v4 | SEDAC. Available at:
  627 http://sedac.ciesin.columbia.edu/data/collection/gpw-v4/sets/browse. (Accessed: 25th
  628 October 2018)
- 53. Cunningham, S. 2000. In A. Hatcher, & D. Tingley (Eds.), *International relations and the Common Fisheries Policy Proceedings of the fourth Concerted Action workshop on economics and the Common Fisheries Policy* pp. 255–272. Portsmouth: Center for the
  Economics and Management of Aquatic Resources.
- 54. J. Alder, U.R. Sumaila. Western Africa: A fish basket of Europe past and present. *Journal of Environment and Development*, 13, p. 156-178 (2004).
- 55. Ruddle, K. In K. Tsukamoto, T. Kawamura, T. Takeuchi, T.D. Beard, & M.J. Kaiser
  (Eds.), *Fisheries for global welfare and environment, 5th World Fisheries congress* pp. 399–411 (2008).
- 638 56. Asche, F., Bellemare, M.F., Roheim, C., Smith, M.D. and Tveteras, S. Fair enough? Food
  639 security and the international trade of seafood. *World Development*, 67, pp.151-160.
  640 (2015).
- 641 57. FAOSTAT 2019 <u>http://www.fao.org/fishery/statistics/global-commodities-production/en</u>
   642 (Accessed: 18th February 2019)
- 643644 Data availability statement
- 645

- 646 Data used for figures in this paper are available through the following GitHub 647 link:https://gist.github.com/mamacneil/7f8907e97eeb56022bdcabdb8854949e
- 648

## 649 **Code availability**

- 650
- Code used for figures in this paper are available through the following GitHub
   link:<u>https://gist.github.com/mamacneil/7f8907e97eeb56022bdcabdb8854949e</u>
- 654

655 Acknowledgments This research was supported by a European Research Council Starting 656 Grant awarded to C Hicks (ERC Grant number: 759457), Lancaster University, the ARC

- 657 Centre of Excellence for Coral Reef Studies, a Royal Society University Research Fellowship 658 to N Graham (UE140601), a Tier UNSERC Research Chair awarded to A MacNail the
- to N Graham (UF140691), a Tier II NSERC Research Chair awarded to A MacNeil, the
   Australian Centre for International Agricultural Research through projects FIS/2017/003 and
- 60 FIS/2015/031, and a USAID Feed the Future Innovation Lab for Nutrition Asia award to A
- 661 Thorne-Lyman (award number AIDOAA-1- 10-00005). This work was undertaken as part of
- the CGIAR Research Program on Fish Agri-Food Systems (FISH) led by WorldFish,
- 663 supported by contributors to the CGIAR Trust Fund. We are very grateful for the support
- provided by the FishBase and FAO INFOODs database teams, J. Robinson for help with Fig.
- 665 3, N. Swan, J. Silveira, and E. Maire for help sourcing data.
- 666

Author Contributions C.C.H. conceived of the study with P.J.C., N.A.J.G., K.L.N., A.T-L.,
C.D'L., E.H.A., S.H.T., and D.M.; C.C.H., P.J.C., N.A.J.G., K.L.N., C.D'L., and M.R.
collected the data; C.C.H., M.A.M., and K.L.N. developed and implemented the analyses;

- 670 C.C.H. led the manuscript with input from all authors.
- 671

# 672 Author Information

- 673 Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints. The authors
- 674 declare no competing financial or non-financial interests. Correspondence and request for
- 675 materials should be addressed to C.C.H. (<u>christina.hicks@lancaster.ac.uk</u>).