Substorm onset latitude and the steadiness of 2 magnetospheric convection

S. E. Milan^{1,2}, M.-T. Walach³, J. A. Carter¹, H. Sangha¹, and B. J.

 $\operatorname{Anderson}^4$

Corresponding author: S. E. Milan, Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Leicester, Leicester LE1 7RH, UK. (steve.milan@le.ac.uk)

¹Department of Physics and Astronomy,

University of Leicester, Leicester, UK.

²Birkeland Centre for Space Science,

University of Bergen, Bergen, Norway.

³Physics Department, Lancaster

University, Lancaster, UK.

⁴Johns Hopkins University Applied

Physics Laboratory, Laurel, Maryland,

USA.

³ Abstract.

X - 2

We study the role of substorms and steady magnetospheric convection (SMC) in magnetic flux transport in the magnetosphere, using observations of field-5 aligned currents (FACs) by the Active Magnetosphere and Planetary Elec-6 trodynamics Response Experiment (AMPERE). We identify two classes of 7 ubstorm, with onsets above and below 65° magnetic latitude, which display 8 different nightside FAC morphologies. We show that the low-latitude onsets 9 develop a poleward-expanding auroral bulge, and identify these as substorms 10 that manifest ionospheric convection-braking in the auroral bulge region [Gro-11 *cott et al.*, 2009]. We show that the high-latitude substorms, which do not 12 experience braking, can evolve into SMC events if the interplanetary mag-13 netic field (IMF) remains southwards for a prolonged period following on-14 set. We conclude that during periods of ongoing driving, the magnetosphere 15 displays repeated substorm activity or SMC depending on the rate of driv-16 ing and the open magnetic flux content of the magnetosphere prior to on-17 set. We speculate that sawtooth events are an extreme case of repeated on-18 sets, and that substorms triggered by northward-turnings of the IMF mark 19 the cessation of periods of SMC. Our results provide a new explanation for 20 the differing modes of response of the terrestrial system to solar wind-magnetosphere-21 ionosphere coupling by invoking friction between the ionosphere and atmo-22 sphere. 23

²⁴ Key points

• AMPERE observations reveal two classes of substorm: high- and low-latitude onsets which are weak and intense, respectively

• Intense substorms experience convection-braking in the auroral bulge; weak onsets 28 can develop into SMC

• These results suggest a framework within which different magnetospheric modes, including sawtooth events, can be understood

1. Introduction

The dynamics of the magnetosphere are driven primarily by the interaction of the 31 solar wind and embedded interplanetary magnetic field (IMF) with the terrestrial field 32 through the process of magnetic reconnection. During periods of southward-directed IMF 33 this excites the Dungey cycle of circulation - or convection - of the field and plasma 34 within the magnetosphere, in which reconnection at the subsolar magnetopause creates 35 open magnetic flux and reconnection in the magnetotail closes flux again, with a general 36 antisunwards transport of open flux and sunwards return flow of closed flux [Dungey, 37 1961. This transport is communicated to the polar ionosphere by an electrical current 38 system linking the magnetopause, ionosphere, and ring current [e.g., *Iijima and Potemra*, 30 1976; Cowley, 2000, resulting in an ionospheric twin-cell convection pattern [e.g., Heppner 40 and Maynard, 1987, and references therein, which comprises antisunwards plasma drift 41 in the footprint of open field lines (known as the polar cap) and sunwards plasma drift at 42 lower latitudes. 43

X - 3

X - 4

The rate of magnetopause (or dayside) reconnection is controlled by conditions in the 44 solar wind [e.g., Milan et al., 2012, and references therein], most importantly the orientation of the IMF. The factors controlling the occurrence and rate of magnetotail (or 46 nightside) reconnection are less well understood, but are thought to be determined by the 47 conditions in the plasmasheet and pressure exerted on the magnetotail by the solar wind 48 e.g., Boudouridis et al., 2003: Milan et al., 2004, 2007; Hubert et al., 2006b]. Davside 49 and nightside reconnection can occur independently of one another, leading to changes 50 in the open magnetic flux content of the magnetosphere, with attendant changes in the 51 size of the ionospheric polar caps; the flux transport and convection associated with these 52 changes is described by the expanding/contracting polar cap (ECPC) model [e.g., Siscoe 53 and Huang, 1985; Cowley and Lockwood, 1992; Hubert et al., 2006a; Milan, 2015]. 54

Often, changes in open flux content can be linked with the substorm cycle [e.g., Lockwood 55 and Cowley, 1992; Milan et al., 2003, 2007; Lockwood et al., 2009]. Substorm growth phase 56 is the accumulation of open flux in the magnetotail lobes by dayside reconnection. The 57 near-Earth neutral line (NENL) model of substorm onset [e.g., Hones, 1984; Baker et 58 al., 1996] asserts that substorm expansion phase (often referred to as "substorm onset") 59 corresponds to the formation of a reconnection X-line within the closed flux of the plasma 60 sheet, and that this closed flux must first be pinched off (forming a plasmoid) before 61 reconnection proceeds to close the open flux of the tail lobes. Subsequently, the recovery 62 phase marks the antisunwards motion of the NENL to form a distant neutral line (DNL). 63 The tailward motion of the NENL is thought to be associated with the pile-up of newly 64 closed flux in the near-Earth tail, but what provokes this is unclear. The present study 65 addresses this question. 66

MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION

Milan et al. [2009a] and Grocott et al. [2009] studied the auroral intensity and the 67 convection response of substorms with different onset latitudes, that is substorms that 68 accumulated different amounts of open magnetic flux prior to onset. They found that 69 high-latitude substorms (onset above 65° magnetic latitude) tend to have a weak auroral 70 response but lead to enhanced convection in the nightside auroral zone. On the other 71 hand, low-latitude substorms (onset below 65° magnetic latitude) have a more intense 72 auroral response, but counterintuitively lead to a braking of the convection flow. It was 73 suggested by Grocott et al. [2009] that this convection-braking was produced by enhanced 74 conductance in the more intense auroral bulge, a mechanism earlier discussed by *Morelli* 75 *et al.* [1995]. 76

At other times the magnetosphere can achieve similar dayside and nightside reconnec-77 tion rates, leading to steady magnetospheric convection (SMC) or balanced reconnection 78 intervals (BRI) in which the open magnetic flux content remains uniform for an extended 79 period [e.g., Sergeev et al., 1996; DeJong et al., 2008, 2018; McWilliams et al., 2008; 80 Kissinger et al., 2012, and references therein]. Sergeev et al. [1996], DeJong et al. [2008], 81 and Kissinger et al. [2012] noted that periods of SMC are often bracketed by substorm 82 activity, so Walach and Milan [2015] and Walach et al. [2017] examined the relationship 83 between substorms and SMC events (SMCs) in more detail. They concluded that some 84 SMCs are substorms that have their expansion phase prolonged by continued southwards 85 IMF, so-called "driven"-substorms, whereas "classic" or "isolated" substorms are those 86 during which the IMF turns northwards shortly after onset. There is also debate as to 87 whether northward-turnings of the IMF can trigger substorm onset (see discussion in 88 Wild et al. [2009]). It is the purpose of the current study to reexamine the link between 89

X - 5

changes in the IMF, substorms and SMCs, and the onset latitude dependence of substorm
 intensity.

To monitor solar wind-magnetosphere coupling, convection, and substorms, we em-92 ploy measurements of the magnetosphere-ionosphere coupling currents, also known as 93 field-aligned currents (FACs) or Birkeland currents, made by the Active Magnetosphere 94 and Planetary Electrodynamics Response Experiment (AMPERE) [Anderson et al., 95 2000, 2002; Waters et al., 2001; Coxon et al., 2018]. The magnitude of the FACs measured 96 by AMPERE, of which the region 1 and region 2 (R1/R2) currents identified by *Iijima* 97 and Potemra [1976] are the main component, are a measure of convection strength and 98 ionospheric conductance [Coxon et al., 2016; Milan et al., 2017], whereas the location of 99 the R1/R2 currents is related to the open magnetic flux content of the magnetosphere 100 [*Iijima and Potemra*, 1978; *Clausen et al.*, 2012]. AMPERE measurements have been 101 used to study the large-scale magnetospheric response to solar wind driving [e.g., Coxon 102 et al., 2014a; Anderson et al., 2014, 2018; Milan et al., 2017] and substorms [e.g., Clausen 103 et al., 2013a, b; Coxon et al., 2014b; Murphy et al., 2013; Forsyth et al., 2018]. 104

¹⁰⁵*Milan et al.* [2015] applied principal component analysis (PCA) to AMPERE current ¹⁰⁶maps to determine the dominant modes of response of FACs to solar wind driving. Subse-¹⁰⁷quently, *Milan et al.* [2018] applied PCA separately to the dayside and nightside portions ¹⁰⁸of the polar FAC pattern, allowing the temporal response of currents to magnetopause ¹⁰⁹and magnetotail drivers to be examined. The same technique is employed in the current ¹¹⁰study.

2. Methodology

The Active Magnetosphere and Planetary Electrodynamics Response Experiment (AM-PERE) [Anderson et al., 2000, 2002; Waters et al., 2001; Coxon et al., 2018] measures the FAC density in both northern and southern hemispheres, at geomagnetic latitudes above 40° with a latitudinal resolution of 1°, in 24 magnetic local time (MLT) sectors, at a cadence of 2 min. The data used in this study cover the period 2010 to 2016.

The application of principal component analysis to AMPERE observations has been 116 described by Milan et al. [2015, 2017, 2018]. An automated algorithm fits a circle to 117 the boundary between the region 1 and 2 current ovals and the current density maps 118 are transformed to be the same size and centred on the geomagnetic pole. The radius 119 of the fitted circle, Λ° , measured in degrees of colatitude, is later used as a proxy for 120 the size of the polar cap. Each current map is then described by two vectors \mathbf{J}^{D} and 121 \mathbf{J}^N , being the dayside and nightside portions respectively, each of M = 440 elements 122 (40 colatitudinal bins and 11 MLT sectors centred on noon and midnight). PCA is then 123 performed separately on the dayside and nightside currents, producing two sets of basis 124 vectors \mathbf{D}_i and \mathbf{N}_i , i = 1, 2, 3, ..., M, which are the eigenvectors of the covariance matrices 125 of \mathbf{J}^D and \mathbf{J}^N , respectively. These basis vectors, which we term eigenFACs, are those that 126 most efficiently describe variations in the observations. There are as many dayside and 127 nightside eigenFACs as there are elements in the original vectors, but only the first few 128 are significant. The first dayside and the seven most important nightside eigenFACs are 129 presented in Figure 1. For the time being, we note that \mathbf{D}_1 and \mathbf{N}_1 resemble the dayside 130 and nightside portions of the R1 and R2 current systems. 131

Each of the original vectors \mathbf{J}^D or \mathbf{J}^N can be reconstructed as a linear combination of the eigenFACs:

$$\mathbf{J}^{D} = \sum_{i=1}^{m} \alpha_{i} \mathbf{D}_{i}, \qquad \mathbf{J}^{N} = \sum_{i=1}^{m} \beta_{i} \mathbf{N}_{i}, \tag{1}$$

where α_i and β_i are coefficients which can be determined by finding the projection of \mathbf{D}_i and \mathbf{N}_i on \mathbf{J}^D and \mathbf{J}^N :

$$\alpha_i = \mathbf{J}^D \cdot \mathbf{D}_i, \qquad \beta_i = \mathbf{J}^N \cdot \mathbf{N}_i. \tag{2}$$

For the reconstruction to be exact, all eigenFACs must be included in the summations, 132 that is m = M, though in practice reasonable fidelity can be achieved with $m \ll M$. 133 The coefficients α_i and β_i then provide a means of quantifying a complex dataset using 134 a handful of numbers, a technique known as dimensionality reduction. In this study we 135 use m = 1 on the dayside and m = 7 on the night side. The significance of each eigenFAC 136 (the amount of variance in the original data that it represents) is given by the ratio of 137 its corresponding eigenvalue to the sum of the eigenvalues of all the eigenFACs, indicated 138 in Figure 1 of Milan et al. [2018]. As shown in that figure, eigenFACs N_1 to N_7 capture 139 $\sim 80\%$ of the variance in the night FAC patterns, with the contribution of the first 140 10 eigenFACs to the variance being 45.8, 9.2, 6.3, 5.2, 4.1, 3.3, 3.0, 2.7, 2.5, and 2.2%. 141 There is no clear change in significance between N_7 and N_8 , and the choice of this cut-142 off in our analysis is somewhat arbitrary; however, we find that no new information for 143 the present study is contributed by including N_8 and beyond. We expect α_1 and β_1 to 144 quantify the strengths of the dayside and nightside portions of the R1/R2 current system 145 in each AMPERE FAC map. As we will demonstrate, β_3 to β_7 are related to substorm 146 phenomena. 147

February 1, 2019, 10:17am

¹⁴⁸ Supporting data are provided by the 1-min OMNI dataset [*King and Papitashvili*, 2005], ¹⁴⁹ the SuperMAG geomagnetic index dataset, including SML, SMU, and SMR, equivalent to ¹⁵⁰ AL, AU, and SYM-H [*Newell and Gjerloev*, 2011, 2012; *Gjerloev*, 2012], and the substorm ¹⁵¹ onset list derived from SuperMAG observations [*Newell and Gjerloev*, 2011].

3. Observations and Discussion

This paper focusses on three aspects of solar wind-magnetosphere coupling, substorms, and substorm-related FACs: how does the FAC response vary with substorm onset latitude?; what is the relationship between substorms and steady magnetospheric convection?; and what do the FAC systems tell us about magnetosphere-ionosphere coupling during substorms? We investigate these three themes in turn.

Figure 2 presents a superposed epoch analysis of substorms, from 2 hours before to 6 157 hours after substorm onset. Panels (a) to (c) show IMF B_Z , the electrojet indices SML 158 and SMU, and the radius of the boundary between the R1/R2 current ovals, Λ° , a proxy 159 for polar cap size. Panels (d) to (j) show the coefficients α_1 and β_1 to β_7 , neglecting β_2 . 160 As described by Milan et al. [2018], β_2 quantifies IMF B_Y asymmetries in the nightside 161 FACs and is not of interest to the present study. The substorms are categorised by the 162 value of Λ at the time of onset, $\Lambda(t=0)$ or Λ_0 , and the corresponding traces colour-coded 163 from $\Lambda_0 = 18^{\circ}$ (black) to $\Lambda_0 = 26^{\circ}$ (red) in steps of 1°. In total, 8896 substorms are 164 included in the analysis. For clarity, the traces do not show the standard error on the 165 mean, though these are in general low due to the relatively large number of substorms in 166 each category. 167

On average, IMF B_Z is close to zero or negative throughout the period of analysis. This is because substorms tend to occur during periods of southwards IMF which lead

to magnetopause reconnection, and substorm growth phase. More negative values of 170 B_Z are associated with lower-latitude (higher- Λ_0) onsets. That is, substorms tend to 171 occur on an expanded auroral oval, corresponding to high polar cap flux, when B_Z is 172 strongly southwards. B_Z becomes more negative as onset is approached, associated with 173 substorm growth phase, and less negative afterwards, as there is no longer a requirement 174 for continued creation of open flux after the substorm has commenced. The SMU and 175 SML indices (the SuperMAG equivalents of the AU and AL electrojet indices) show 176 substorm growth, expansion, and recovery phase signatures, as expected, though the 177 magnitude of the variations are larger for high- Λ_0 onsets. In all categories except the 178 lowest- Λ_0 substorms, Λ increases prior to onset, a signature of growth phase, and decreases 179 thereafter. The beginning of the contraction of the polar cap can be delayed by almost 180 an hour after onset for the low- Λ_0 substorms. Panels (d) and (e) show the strength of 181 the dayside and nightside R1/R2 currents, as quantified by α_1 and β_1 , which quantify the 182 rate of convection on the dayside and nightside [e.g., Milan, 2013; Clausen et al., 2013a]. 183 The magnitude of the R1/R2 FACs is well-ordered by Λ_0 , indicating that magnetospheric 184 convection is enhanced for low-latitude onsets. The dayside R1/R2 tends to grow during 185 the growth phase, and then steps up following onset, before decaying after a few 10s of 186 minutes. The night R1/R2 FACs remain roughly constant during the growth phase 187 but again increase around the time of onset. These results are broadly consistent with 188 previous studies of the latitude dependence of substorms [e.g., Milan et al., 2009a; Clausen 189 et al., 2013b; Coxon et al., 2014b]. 190

¹⁹¹ Panels (f) to (j) show the nightside response of the FACs as quantified by β_3 to β_7 . ¹⁹² We defer a discussion of what the eigenFACs \mathbf{N}_3 to \mathbf{N}_7 actually signify until later in

the paper. For the time-being we note that all five parameters show substorm-related 193 variations, i.e. their behaviour shows marked changes before, during, and after onset. 194 Their variations are also ordered by Λ_0 : specifically, there appear to be two classes of 195 behaviour displayed by low- and high- Λ_0 substorms. For instance, for $\Lambda_0 < 21^\circ$ (black to 196 cyan traces) β_4 decreases from 0 in the 30 mins before onset and increases back to 0 in 197 the 30 mins after onset; for $\Lambda_0 > 21^\circ$ (green to red traces) β_4 shows little variation prior 198 to onset, but increases for an hour or so after onset. Similar, clear differences between 199 these two latitudinal classes can be seen in the variations of β_6 and β_7 . 200

Grocott et al. [2009] also identified two classes of substorm: those that experience 201 convection-braking (onsets below 65° magnetic latitude) and those that don't (onsets 202 above 65°). Our value of Λ_0 of 21° is consistent with 65° at midnight, as the auroral 203 oval is on average displaced antisunwards from the geomagnetic pole by 4°. Their inter-204 pretation was that enhanced conductance, associated with enhanced auroral luminosity 205 for low-latitude onsets [Milan et al., 2009a], leads to frictional coupling between the iono-206 sphere and atmosphere such that the convection is arrested. Following on from the results 207 of Grocott et al. [2009], in the remainder of this study we assume that our low-latitude 208 category of onsets experience convection-braking, whereas our high-latitude onsets do 209 not. We will go on to demonstrate that high-latitude onsets can evolve into periods of 210 SMC, but that low-latitude onsets cannot. (We note that *DeJong et al.* [2018] presented 211 a counter-example to this hypothesis, in which a case study of the conductance during an 212 isolated substorm and an SMC event indicated higher conductance during the latter.) 213 We next investigate the nature of convection associated with substorms during which 214

IMF B_Z remains southwards for different lengths of time following onset. In general

X - 12 MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION

 $B_Z < 0$ nT during the growth phase – it is generally accepted that ongoing loading of 216 open flux into the magnetosphere is a prerequisite for substorm onset, unless an external 217 perturbation such as a solar wind pressure pulse triggers onset [e.g., Boudouridis et al., 218 2003; Milan et al., 2004; Hubert et al., 2006b] – but once onset has commenced, the IMF 219 orientation can change. Figure 3 presents a superposed epoch analysis of substorms in 220 the same format as Fig. 2 (though note that the vertical scales differ between the two 221 figures). In this analysis, substorms are categorised by the length of time that IMF B_Z 222 remains negative after onset. In each category, we require that $B_Z < -2$ nT for 90% 223 of data points from 20 mins before onset to 30, 60, 90, ..., 360 mins after onset, with 224 traces colour-coded from black to red. Substorms which do not match these criteria are 225 indicated by a dashed line. 226

The resulting B_Z traces show the expected variation, becoming increasingly negative 227 prior to onset, and then remaining negative for a different length of time post-onset before 228 turning positive. The corresponding SMU and SML traces show the expected substorm 229 growth, expansion, and recovery phases, except that the duration of the substorm bay 230 in SML is prolonged by the length of time that B_Z remains southwards. The radius of 231 the current ovals, Λ , increases during the growth phase prior to onset and begins to fall 232 about 20 mins after onset, but remains elevated for the duration of the B_Z -southwards 233 phase. Similar behaviours are seen for the dayside and nightside R1/R2 FAC magnitudes 234 as quantified by α_1 and β_1 : increasing before onset and remaining elevated during the 235 period of southwards IMF before falling to pre-growth phase levels, that is, convection 236 strength increases during the growth phase and is maintained while the magnetosphere 237

²³⁸ continues to be driven. At this point, with regards to the variations of β_3 to β_7 , we note ²³⁹ that these are similar to each other for all categories of B_Z -southwards duration.

On the face of it, these results would seem to support the conclusions of Walach and 240 Milan [2015], that continuing southwards IMF after substorm onset can lead to a period of 241 steady magnetospheric convection, which only subsides once the IMF turns northwards. 242 However, we have not considered the possibility that with continued southwards IMF 243 a series of substorms could be triggered, and that averaging over many such substorms 244 could lead to the results presented in Fig. 3. To investigate further, we repeat the 245 superposed epoch analysis, but now limit the events to those substorms for which there is 246 no subsequent substorm in the following 6 hours. This significantly reduces the number 247 of events in the analysis, so we relax our B_Z criterion to be that $B_Z < -1$ nT (rather 248 than $B_Z < -2$ nT) for 90% of data points from 20 mins before onset to 30, 60, 90, ..., 249 360 mins after onset. The results are presented in Figure 4. 250

The B_Z traces are similar to Fig. 3, though B_Z is not as negative as before. The SML 251 traces for each category are similar to each other, indicating a substorm bay that lasts 90 252 mins in each case – a single expansion phase lasting approximately 1 hour irrespective of 253 the duration of the B_Z -southwards phase. However, after the expansion and contraction 254 of the polar cap associated with the onset, Λ remains elevated for the duration of the 255 B_Z -southward phase. Similarly, the dayside and nightside R1/R2 current magnitudes are 256 also elevated for the duration of the B_Z -southwards phase. These results do appear to 257 confirm the conclusions of Walach and Milan [2015], that nightside reconnection can be 258 maintained at the end of the expansion phase of a substorm, and steady convection can 259 ensue, if the IMF remains southwards. 260

X - 14 MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION

We now compare other differences between the substorms of Figs. 3 and 4. Firstly, 261 Fig. 3 has an average value of $\Lambda_0 > 21^\circ$ while for Fig. 4, on average $\Lambda_0 < 21^\circ$. The 262 difference in the two average values is marginal, but does place the two sets of substorms 263 in the high- and low- Λ_0 categories discussed in relation to Fig. 2. Moreover, in Fig. 4 264 both β_4 and β_6 become negative at the time of onset and shortly afterwards, respectively, 265 whereas this negative excursion is not so significant in Fig. 3. This reinforces the link 266 between the high- and low- Λ_0 categories and Figs. 3 and 4, respectively, that is the dip 267 in β_4 and β_6 distinguishes those substorms that do not experience convection-braking at 268 onset from those that do. 269

Figure 5 presents a schematic of the two scenarios we envisage for substorms occurring 270 during prolonged periods of solar wind-magnetosphere coupling, with high-latitude sub-271 storm onsets on the left, panels (a)-(c), and low-latitude onsets on the right. The figure 272 has a format similar to Fig. 3 of Cowley and Lockwood [1992]. Panels (a) and (d) show 273 substorm growth phase for the two cases, followed by the expansion phase in panels (b) 274 and (e). We suggest that substorms that can transition to periods of SMC (panel (c)) 275 are those that do not experience convection-braking, whereas substorms that do experi-276 ence braking cannot lead to a laminar convection state, but must result in a sequence of 277 onsets if the IMF remains southwards (panel (f)). An expected consequence of convection-278 braking is the formation of a pronounced substorm auroral bulge following onset, with a 279 significant poleward motion of the nightside open/closed field line boundary (OCB), as 280 magnetotail reconnection erodes the open flux of the polar cap (panel (e)). As the bulge 281 begins to dim and the brake is released, the substorm enters a recovery phase in which 282 the polar cap returns to a circular shape through the redistribution of open and closed 283

flux in the ionosphere (panel (f)), before the cycle begins again (panel (d)). Conversely, 284 we expect that substorms with no convection-braking can maintain a roughly circular 285 polar cap through continuous redistribution of flux, such that the substorm appears as 286 a brightening of the nightside auroral oval rather than a poleward-growing bulge (panel 287 (b)). There is evidence in the wideband imaging camera (WIC) observations of Fig. 5 of 288 Milan et al. [2009a] to support this suggestion that low-latitude onsets have a much more 289 significant poleward progression of the substorm auroras than high-latitude onsets, and 290 this is also consistent with the nightside auroral observations of an isolated substorm and 291 an SMC event presented by *DeJong et al.* [2018]. 292

Convection-braking is also expected to have ramifications for the dynamics in the mag-293 netotail. The substorm onset marks the formation of a near-Earth neutral line (NENL) 294 in the closed plasma sheet [e.g., Hones, 1984; Baker et al., 1996]. Once the NENL has 295 pinched off the closed flux, open flux is closed and the polar cap contracts. If the redis-296 tribution of magnetic flux in the ionosphere required by the ECPC is unimpeded, then 297 the NENL reconnection rate can adjust to match the dayside reconnection rate and a 298 period of SMC, that is a balanced reconnection interval (BRI), can ensue. On the other 299 hand, if convection-braking occurs, ongoing tail reconnection will lead to the formation 300 of a poleward-progressing auroral bulge. This will be associated with flux pileup in the 301 near-tail, as newly-closed flux cannot convect sunwards, and this pileup will push the 302 NENL down-tail until reconnection ceases. Reconnection can only recommence by the 303 formation of a new NENL within the region of newly-closed field lines, signalled by a new 304 substorm AL bay. In this manner, a sequence of onsets is required if the IMF remains 305 directed southwards. In both substorm and SMC cases, once the IMF turns northwards 306

³⁰⁷ dayside reconnection ceases but nightside reconnection continues until the tail reaches a
 ³⁰⁸ relaxed configuration.

So far we have discussed statistical results. We now present some case examples. To aid with event selection, we developed an algorithm to identify potential periods of SMC from the SMU and SML indices, using criteria similar to *McWilliams et al.* [2008] and *Kissinger et al.* [2012]. We then discarded events during which the IMF was variable or the FAC ovals showed large changes in radius (see also *Walach and Milan* [2015]). Many events were found, of which some typical examples are shown in Figures 6 to 8. We first discuss the 18-hour period beginning 04 UT, 6 October 2010, presented in Fig. 6.

Panels (a) and (b) show AMPERE FAC densities along the dawn-dusk meridians of 316 the northern and southern hemispheres, in which the upward/downward FAC pairs (the 317 R1/R2 FACs) can be seen at dawn and dusk. The radii of the FAC ovals, A, are shown 318 in panel (c), followed by IMF B_Y and B_Z and solar wind speed and density in panels 319 (d) and (e). Panel (f) shows the dayside reconnection rate, Φ_D , estimated from the solar 320 wind observations using eq. (15) of Milan et al. [2012], and the time integral of Φ_D . This 321 integral shows the amount of open flux that would accumulate in the polar caps if no 322 nightside reconnection took place. Typically the polar caps contain 0.5 GWb of open 323 flux, rising to ~ 1 GWb during extreme conditions [Milan et al., 2007]. Below this are: 324 panel (g) the SML and SMU indices, panel (h) the SMR ring current index, and panel 325 (i) the PC index which measures convection strength in the polar regions. Vertical green 326 lines indicate substorm onset identified by SuperMAG. Vertical red lines, labelled i, ii, 327 etc., indicate times which will be discussed below; if a red line corresponds to a substorm 328 onset, it has been displaced slightly for clarity. 329

Two events occurred during this time period. Between i and viii, the IMF was predom-330 inantly directed southwards (panel (d)), the R1/R2 FACs were enhanced (panels (a) and 331 (b)), and the PC index was elevated (panel (i)). Following the southwards turning at i, 332 dayside reconnection was elevated leading to expansions of the polar caps (panel (c)). At 333 *ii*, SuperMAG identified a substorm onset. Thereafter the IMF remained southwards until 334 iv, and between *iii* and *iv* SMC ensued, indicated by the horizontal orange bar, during 335 which SMU and SML were approximately constant (panel (g)), the FAC radius remained 336 uniform, and PC indicated steady convection. By v the IMF had turned southwards 337 again, growth phase signatures were seen in SMU/SML and Λ , followed by a substorm 338 onset at vi. Associated with the substorm bay, the polar caps initially contracted, but 339 by vii they stabilised and varied only gradually during a second period of SMC, again 340 accompanied by steady PC. At *viii* the IMF rotated so that it was no longer southward, 341 and the SMC petered out. We consider both these periods of SMC to be examples of the 342 driven-substorm SMC described by Walach and Milan [2015]. We note that Λ remained 343 below 21° throughout almost the entire period. 344

To summarize these two events, we identify the following intervals as: (i - ii) growth phase, (ii - iii) expansion phase, (iii - iv) SMC, (iv - v) recovery phase, (v - vi) growth phase, (vi - vii) expansion phase, (vii - viii) SMC, (viii-) recovery phase. In both of these cases, $\int \Phi_D dt \sim 0.1$ GWb of open flux accumulated during the growth phase of the substorm and ~ 0.1 GWb during the expansion phase. During the two periods of SMC, ~ 0.15 and ~ 0.5 GWb of open flux were open and closed, that is, transported through the system, in the latter case equivalent to refreshing a typical polar cap.

DRAFT

February 1, 2019, 10:17am

X - 18

Fig. 7 presents the 28-hour period beginning 19 UT, 28 May 2010. At i the IMF 352 turned southwards and remained so for almost 23 hours. Following i the polar caps 353 expanded (Λ), before a substorm onset was detected at *ii*, which by *iii* developed into a 354 period of SMC. IMF B_Z became increasingly negative such that the dayside reconnection 355 rate increased and exceeded the night rate resulting in gradually expanding polar caps 356 A) and stronger convection (SML/SMU and PC). Around iv, A grew beyond 21° and 357 thereafter multiple substorm onset or substorm intensification signatures were identified 358 by SuperMAG. By v, the IMF was no longer so strongly southwards, the polar caps 359 had contracted, and SMC resumed, until the IMF turned northwards at vi. A substorm 360 occurred at this time and the polar caps rapidly contracted. This event shows that SMC 361 can occur when the polar caps are contracted, but if the radii grow too large, repeated 362 substorm activity results. We also note that this period of elevated polar cap size is 363 associated with an enhanced ring current (SMR, similar to SYM-H), as suggested by 364 Milan et al. [2009b]. $\int \Phi_D dt \sim 0.2$ GWb during both the growth and expansion phases of 365 the initial substorm, and ~ 0.8 and ~ 0.4 GWb during the two phases of SMC. Between 366 iv and $v, \int \Phi_D dt \sim 4.5$ GWb, or approximately 0.2 GWb for each intensification. It is 367 debatable if each substorm onset identified by SuperMAG in the interval iv to v is a true 368 substorm or rather a substorm intensification; however, this clearly is not a period of 369 SMC, and SML indicates intense fluctuations in nightside precipitation which would be 370 expected to give rise to convection-braking. 371

Finally, Fig. 8 presents two similar events: the 9-hour period after 10 UT, 4 September 372 2011, and the 13-hour period after 00:30 UT, 21 January 2012. In both examples, during 373 ongoing southward IMF growth phase signatures were observed between i and ii, followed 374

by substorm onset at *ii*, transitioning into SMC at *iii*, and then ending as the IMF 375 turned northwards at iv. In both cases a substorm onset was observed at iv, which lead 376 to rapid contractions of the polar caps. Several studies have indicated that periods of 377 SMC often end with a substorm [e.g., Sergeev et al., 1996], and these examples (and 378 arguably that in Fig. 7) conform to this. In none of these cases is there a clear solar wind 379 cause for the triggering of a substorm, except a reduction in the dayside reconnection 380 rate. We suggest that if the tail is in a stressed state at the end of a period of SMC. 381 a substorm can be triggered to return it to a relaxed state. In all three cases the solar 382 wind density is relatively high, exceeding 10 cm^{-3} , which may exacerbate this stressed 383 state. Interestingly, such cases may inform the debate regarding the existence of substorms 384 triggered by northward turnings of the IMF [e.g., Wild et al., 2009, and references therein]. 385 In both these cases, $\int \Phi_D dt \sim 0.1$ GWb during the growth and expansion phases of the 386 initial substorms (that is, ~ 0.2 GWb associated with each substorm), and ~ 0.3 and 387 ~ 0.7 GWb during the two phases of SMC. 388

We now turn to our final question, regarding the nature of the FAC patterns associated with substorm onset, and especially the difference between the high- and low- Λ_0 onsets. Remembering that a general FAC pattern can be reproduced as a linear combination of the eigenFACs, we briefly describe the FAC morphology associated with \mathbf{N}_i , i = 1, ..., 7, and their contribution to the summation in eq. (1).

 $\beta_1 \mathbf{N}_1$: The nightside portion of the large-scale R1/R2 current system. β_1 is always found to be positive, as this corresponds to the expected polarity of the R1/R2 FACs. This eigenFAC is roughly symmetric about the midnight meridian, but we note that ³⁹⁷ the upward FACs link up across midnight, the average configuration associated with the ³⁹⁸ Harang discontinuity [e.g., *Iijima and Potemra*, 1978].

 $\beta_2 N_2$: As discussed by *Milan et al.* [2018], this eigenFAC controls the local time at which the polarities of the R1/R2 currents reverse, which we can identify with the location of the nightside convection throat. For $\beta_2 > 0$ and $\beta_2 < 0$ the convection throat moves preand post-midnight, respectively. *Milan et al.* [2018] showed that the value of β_2 is related to the B_Y component of the IMF.

 $\beta_{3}N_{3}$: This eigenFAC controls how the pre- and post-midnight portions of the R1/R2 FACs link up across midnight. If $\beta_{3} < 0$ then the strength of the upwards current in the Harang discontinuity region is enhanced. If $\beta_{3} > 0$ then upwards current is diminished or downwards current intrudes into this region. We observe that β_{3} tends to be positive for high- Λ_{0} substorms, which is consistent with Fig. 15 of *Iijima and Potemra* [1978].

 $\beta_4 N_4$: When $\beta_4 > 0$ this eigenFAC leads to a strengthening and poleward motion of the R1/R2 FACs, especially at midnight and in the post-midnight sector; $\beta_4 < 0$ leads to a thinning of these currents. That $\beta_4 > 0$ and $\beta_4 < 0$ for high- and low- Λ_0 substorms (e.g., Fig. 2) is consistent with our assertion that the auroral bulge is enhanced and protrudes polewards during high- Λ_0 substorms.

 $\beta_5 N_5$: In the midnight sector this eigenFAC is morphologically similar to N_3 (though of opposite polarity), so we expect it to play a role in modulating the Harang discontinuity currents.

 $\beta_{6}\mathbf{N}_{6}$: When $\beta_{6} > 0$ this eigenFAC contributes upwards FAC at high latitudes, especially in the midnight and post-midnight regions, and in this respect is similar to \mathbf{N}_{4} . ⁴¹⁹ $\beta_7 \mathbf{N}_7$: When $\beta_7 > 0$ this eigenFAC contributes upwards FAC at high latitudes, across ⁴²⁰ both pre- and post-midnight regions.

In summary, those eigenFACs which tend to be enhanced during high- Λ_0 substorms contribute FAC at high latitudes in the pre-, post-, and midnight regions, consistent with our expectations that these substorms have an enhanced auroral bulge that will lead to convection-braking; indeed, the polewards-growth of the bulge is a consequence of this convection-braking, requiring a poleward motion of the ionospheric projection of the nightside reconnection X-line as open magnetic flux is eroded.

4. Conclusions

We have examined the field-aligned current strength and morphology during substorms, 427 using observations from AMPERE, focussing on two main questions: what influence does 428 onset latitude have on the FAC response?; and what is the relationship between substorm 429 onset, prolonged IMF B_Z -southward conditions, and steady magnetospheric convection? 430 Milan et al. [2009a] demonstrated that substorms occurring at low latitudes (high- Λ_0 431 substorms in the terminology of this paper) are more intense than high-latitude sub-432 storms, and *Grocott et al.* [2009] demonstrated that these experience convection-braking, 433 possibly associated with the high conductance of the bright auroral bulge [e.g., Morelli 434 et al., 1995]. Walach and Milan [2015] showed that a significant number of steady mag-435 netospheric convection events are initially substorms, but substorms for which the IMF 436 remains southwards for a prolonged period after onset. Our results support both of these 437 conclusions, but we go further to suggest that those substorms which can evolve into 438 SMC are those that occur at high latitudes and do not experience convection-braking, as 439 illustrated in Fig. 5(a)-(c). In this case, once a substorm commences, associated with the 440

X - 22 MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION

onset of magnetic reconnection in the tail at a near-Earth neutral line (NENL), that re-441 connection can persist if new open flux continues to be supplied by dayside reconnection. 442 Typical substorm signatures, such as the SML bay and substorm-associated FAC mor-443 phologies, last 60 to 90 mins after onset, but these die away even if NENL reconnection 444 continues thereafter. We suggest that substorms which experience braking and associated 445 flux pile-up in the near-tail pushing the NENL down-tail, cannot segue into a laminar 446 convection state, and instead a staccato sequence of substorm onsets results, each with 447 a recovery phase that represents the release of the brake, as illustrated in Fig. 5(d)-(f). 448 Substorms that experience braking will be those that develop poleward-growing auroral 449 bulges, whereas high-latitude, non-braking substorms will have less-pronounced bulges. 450 maintaining a circular polar cap through frictionless redistribution of magnetic flux. 451

In the examples presented, between 0.2 and 0.4 GWb of open flux transport were 452 associated with the growth and expansion phases of each precursor substorm, with between 453 0.15 and 0.8 GWb during the following period of SMC. This latter value depends on how 454 long the IMF remains southwards following the initial onset, that is, the duration of 455 the SMC. When the polar caps grew sufficiently large that a sequence of substorms or 456 intensifications was triggered, each effected 0.2 GWb of flux transport. We note that 457 periods of SMC can lead to a complete refreshment of the open flux of the polar caps, 458 that is straight through-put of open flux from the dayside to the nightside X-lines and 459 convection from the dayside OCB to the nightside OCB. 460

In the example presented in Fig. 7, repeating substorms occurred with a repetition rate of ~ 30 min. Indeed, these may not be true substorms, but substorm intensifications caused by convection-braking. We speculate that sawtooth events, ~ 3 hr quasi-periodic

intense substorms [Belian et al., 1995], may be an extreme case of braking substorms 464 occurring during strongly-driven intervals associated with geomagnetic storms [Walach 465 and Milan, 2015; Walach et al., 2017]. In this case, we would place SMCs, repeating 466 substorms, and sawtooth events as a spectrum of responses to periods of prolonged low to 467 high solar wind-magnetosphere coupling; we note that this spectrum of behaviour agrees 468 with the ordering of Hubert et al. [2017]. On the other hand, isolated substorms are 469 associated with periods when the IMF is sporadically turning northwards and southwards. 470 We have not addressed the question of why some substorms commence at high latitudes 471 and others at low latitudes, though *Milan et al.* [2009b] suggested that this was associated 472 with the magnetic perturbation produced by the ring current dipolarizing the near-Earth 473 tail. This will be investigated further in a subsequent study. 474

Acknowledgments. SEM and JAC were supported by the Science and Technology Fa-475 cilities Council (STFC), UK, grant no. ST/N000749/1; HS was supported by an STFC stu-476 dentship. MTW was supported by the Natural Environment Research Council (NERC), 477 UK, grant no. NE/P001556/1. The work at the Birkeland Centre for Space Centre, Uni-478 versity of Bergen, Norway, was supported by the Research Council of Norway/CoE un-479 der contract 223252/F50. We thank the AMPERE team and the AMPERE Science 480 Center for providing the Iridium-derived data products; AMPERE products are avail-481 able at http://ampere.jhuapl.edu. The OMNI data, including solar wind parameters 482 and geomagnetic indices, were obtained from the GSFC/SPDF OMNIWeb interface at 483 http://omniweb.gsfc.nasa.gov. The SuperMAG indices and substorm list was downloaded 484 from http://supermag.jhuapl.edu. For the ground magnetometer data from which these 485 were derived, we gratefully acknowledge: Intermagnet; USGS, Jeffrey J. Love; CARISMA, 486

X - 24 MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION

PI Ian Mann; CANMOS; The S-RAMP Database, PI K. Yumoto and Dr. K. Shiokawa; 487 The SPIDR database; AARI, PI Oleg Troshichev; The MACCS program, PI M. Engebret-488 son, Geomagnetism Unit of the Geological Survey of Canada; GIMA; MEASURE, UCLA 489 IGPP and Florida Institute of Technology; SAMBA, PI Eftyhia Zesta; 210 Chain, PI K. 490 Yumoto; SAMNET, PI Farideh Honary; The institutes who maintain the IMAGE mag-491 netometer array, PI Eija Tanskanen; PENGUIN; AUTUMN, PI Martin Connors; DTU 492 Space, PI Dr. Juergen Matzka; South Pole and McMurdo Magnetometer, PI's Louis J. 493 Lanzarotti and Alan T. Weatherwax; ICESTAR; RAPIDMAG; PENGUIn; British Artarc-494 tic Survey; McMac, PI Dr. Peter Chi; BGS, PI Dr. Susan Macmillan; Pushkov Institute 495 of Terrestrial Magnetism, Ionosphere and Radio Wave Propagation (IZMIRAN); GFZ, PI 496 Dr. Juergen Matzka; MFGI, PI B. Heilig; IGFPAS, PI J. Reda; University of L'Aquila, 497 PI M. Vellante; SuperMAG, PI Jesper W. Gjerloev. 498

References

- Anderson, B. J., Takahashi, K., & Toth, B. A. (2000). Sensing global Birkeland currents
 with Iridium engineering magnetometer data. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 27, 4045–
 4048. doi: 10.1029/2000GL000094
- Anderson, B. J., Takahashi, K., Kamei, T., Waters, C. L., & Toth, B. A. (2002).
 Birkeland current system key parameters derived from Iridium observations: Method
 and initial validation results. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 107, 1079. doi:
 10.1029/2001JA000080
- Anderson, B. J., Korth, H., Waters, C. L., Green, D. L., Merkin, V. G., Barnes, R. J.,
 & Dyrud, L. P. (2014). Development of large-scale Birkeland currents determined from

- the Active Magnetosphere and Planetary Electrodynamics Response Experiment. Geo-508 physical Research Letters, 41. doi: 10.1002/2014GL059941 509
- Anderson, B. J., Olson, C. N., Korth, H., Barnes, R. J., Waters, C. L., & Vines, S. K. 510
- (2018). Temporal and spatial development of global Birkeland currents. Journal of Geo-511 physical Research: Space Physics, 123. doi: 10.1029/2018JA025254 512
- Baker, D. N., Pulkkinen, T. I., Angelopoulos, V., Baumjohann, W., & McPherron, R. L. 513
- (1996). Neutral line model of substorms: Past results and present view. Journal of 514 Geophysical Research, 101, 12975–13010. 515
- Belian, R. D., Cayton, T. E., & Reeves, G. D. (1995). Quasi-periodic global substorm 516
- generated flux variations observed at geosynchronous orbit. In Space Plasma: Coupling 517
- Between Small and Medium Scale Processes, Geophys. Monogr. Ser., vol. 86, eds. M. 518
- Ashour-Abdalla, T. Chang, and P. Dusenbery, pp. 143–148, AGU, Washington, D. C. 519 doi:10.1029/GM086p0143 520
- Boudouridis, A., Zesta, E., Lyons, R., Anderson, P. C., & Lummerzheim, D. (2003). Effect 521 of solar wind pressure pulses on the size and strength of the auroral oval. Journal of 522 Geophysical Research, 108, 8012. doi: 10.1029/2002JA009373 523
- Clausen, L. B. N., Baker, J. B. H., Ruohoniemi, J. M., Milan, S. E., & Anderson, B. J. 524 (2012). Dynamics of the region 1 Birkeland current oval derived from the Active Mag-525 netosphere and Planetary Electrodynamics Response Experiment (AMPERE). Journal
- of Geophysical Research, 117, A06233. doi:10.1029/2012JA017666 527
- Clausen, L. B. N., Baker, J. B. H., Ruohoniemi, J. M., Milan, S. E., Coxon, J. C., Wing, 528 S., Ohtani, S., & Anderson, B. J. (2013a). Temporal and spatial dynamics of the region
- 1 and 2 Birkeland currents during substorms. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space 530

526

X - 26 MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION

⁵³¹ *Physics*, *118*. doi: 10.1002/jgra.50288

- ⁵³² Clausen, L. B. N., Milan, S. E., Baker, J. B. H., Ruohoniemi, J. M., Glassmeier, K.-
- H., Coxon, J. C., & Anderson, B. J. (2013b). On the influence of open magnetic flux on substorm intensity: ground- and space-based observations. *Journal of Geophysical*
- ⁵³⁵ Research: Space Physics, 118. doi: 10.1002/jgra.50308
- ⁵³⁶ Cowley, S. W. H. (2000). Magnetosphere-ionosphere interactions: A tutorial review. In
- ⁵³⁷ Magnetospheric Current Systems, Geophys. Monogr. Ser., vol. 118, eds. S. Ohtani et

al., pp. 91–106, AGU, Washington, D.C. doi: 10.1029/GM118p0091

- ⁵³⁹ Cowley, S. W. H., & Lockwood, M. (1992). Excitation and decay of solar wind-driven flows in the magnetosphere-ionosphere system. *Annales Geophysicae*, *10*, 103–115.
- 541 Coxon, J. C., Milan, S. E., Clausen, L. B. N., Anderson, B. J., & Korth, H. (2014a).
- 542 The magnitudes of the Birkeland currents observed by AMPERE and their role in
- ⁵⁴³ solar wind-magnetosphere-ionosphere coupling. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space

⁵⁴⁴ *Physics*, *119*. doi: 10.1002/2014JA020138

- ⁵⁴⁵ Coxon, J. C., Milan, S. E., Clausen, L. B. N., Anderson, B. J., & Korth, H. (2014b). A

superposed epoch analysis of the Region 1 and Region 2 Birkeland currents observed

- ⁵⁴⁷ by AMPERE during substorms. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 119.
 ⁵⁴⁸ doi: 10.1002/2014JA020500
- Coxon, J. C., Milan, S. E., Carter, J. A., Clausen, L. B. N., Anderson, B. J., & Korth,
- H. (2016). Seasonal and diurnal variations in AMPERE observations of the Birkeland
 currents compared to modelled results. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics*,
- ⁵⁵² *121*. doi: 10.1002/2015JA022050

- ⁵⁵³ Coxon, J. C., Milan, S. E., Korth, H., & Anderson, B. J. (2018). Ampère's Law: a review
- of Birkeland current research using the Iridium constellation. In *Electric Currents in*
- GeoSpace and Beyond, AGU Geophysical Monograph 235, eds. A. Keiling et al., Wiley and Sons.
- ⁵⁵⁷ DeJong, A. D., Ridley, A. J., & Clauer, C. R. (2008). Balanced reconnection intervals: ⁵⁵⁸ Four case studies. *Annales Geophysicae*, *26*, 3897–3912.
- ⁵⁵⁹ DeJong, A. D., Bell, J. M., & Ridley, A. J. (2018). Comparison of the ionosphere during ⁵⁶⁰ an SMC initiating substorm and an isolated substorm. *Journal of Geophysical Research:*
- ⁵⁶¹ Space Physics, 123, 4939–4951. https://doi.org/10.1029/2017JA025055
- ⁵⁶² Dungey, J. W. (1961). Interplanetary magnetic fields and the auroral zones. *Physical* ⁵⁶³ *Review Letters*, 6, 47–48.
- Forsyth, C., Shortt, M., Coxon, J. C., Rae, I. J., Freeman, M. P., Kalmoni, N.
 M. E., Jackson, C. M., Anderson, B. J., Milan, S. E., & Burrell, A. G. (2018).
 Seasonal and temporal variations of field-aligned currents and ground magnetic deflections during substorms. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics*, 123.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/2017JA025136
- ⁵⁶⁹ Gjerloev, J. W. (2012). The SuperMAG data processing technique. Journal of Geophysical
 ⁵⁷⁰ Research, 117, A09213. doi: 10.1029/2012JA017683.
- Grocott, A., Wild, J. A., Milan, S. E., & Yeoman, T. K. (2009). Superposed epoch analysis
- of the ionospheric convection evolution during substorms: onset latitude dependence.
 Annales Geophysicae, 27, 591–600.
- ⁵⁷⁴ Heppner, J. P., & Maynard, N. (1987). Empirical high-latitude electric field models. *Jour-*
- ⁵⁷⁵ nal of Geophysical Research, 92, 4467–4489. doi: 10.1029/JA092iA05p04467

- X 28 MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION
- Hones, E. W., Jr. (1984). Plasma sheet behavior during substorms, in *Magnetic Recon*-576
- nection in Space and Laboratory Plasmas, Geophys. Monogr. Ser., vol. 30, edited by E. 577
- W. Hones Jr., pp. 178-184, AGU, Washington, D.C. 578
- Hubert, B., Milan, S. E., Grocott, A., Blockx, C., Cowley, S. W. H., & Gérard, J.-C. 579
- (2006a). Dayside and nightside reconnection rates inferred from IMAGE FUV and Super 580
- Dual Auroral Radar Network data. Journal of Geophysical Research, 111, A03217. doi: 581 10.1029/2005JA011140 582
- Hubert, B., Palmroth, M., Laitinen, T. V., Janhunen, P., Milan, S. E., Grocott, A., 583
- Cowley, S. W. H., Pulkkinen, T., & Gérard, J.-C. (2006b). Compression of the Earth's 584
- magnetotail by interplanetary shocks drives magnetic flux closure. Geophysical Research 585 Letters, 33, L10105. doi: 10.1029/2006GL026008 586
- Hubert, B., Gérard, J.-C., Milan, S. E., & Cowley, S. W. H. (2017). Magnetic recon-587 nection during steady magnetospheric convection and magnetospheric modes. Annales 588 Geophysica, 35, 505–524. doi: 10.5194/angeo-35-505-2017 589
- Iijima, T., & Potemra, T. A. (1976). The amplitude distribution of field-aligned currents 590 at northern high latitudes observed by Triad. Journal of Geophysical Research, 81, 591 2165–2174. doi: 10.1029/JA081i013p02165
- Iijima, T., & Potemra, T. A. (1978). Large-scale characteristics of field-aligned cur-593 rents associated with substorms. Journal of Geophysical Research, 83, 599–615. doi: 594 10.1029/JA083iA02p00599 595
- King, J. H., & Papitashvili, N. E. (2005). Solar wind spatial scales in and comparisons of 596 hourly Wind and ACE plasma and magnetic field data. Journal of Geophysical Research, 597
- 110, A02209. doi: 10.1029/2004JA010804 598

- ⁵⁹⁹ Kissinger, J. E., McPherron, R. L., Hsu, T.-S., Angelopoulos, V., & Chu, X. (2012).
- ⁶⁰⁰ Necessity of substorm expansions in the initiation of steady magnetospheric convection,
- ⁶⁰¹ Geophysical Research Letters, 39, L15105. doi: 10.1029/2012GL052599
- Lockwood, M., & Cowley, S. W. H. (1992). Ionospheric convection and the substorm cycle. In *Proceedings of the International Conference on Substorms (ICS-1)*, 99–109.
- Lockwood, M., Hairston, M., Finch, I., & Rouillard, A. (2009). Transpolar voltage and
- ⁶⁰⁵ polar cap flux during the substorm cycle and steady convection events. Journal of
- ⁶⁰⁶ Geophysical Resaerch, 114, A01210. doi: 10.1029/2008JA013697
- McWilliams, K. A., Pfeifer, J. B., & McPherron, R. L. (2008). Steady magnetospheric con-
- vection selection criteria: Implications of global SuperDARN convection measurements,
- ⁶⁰⁹ Geophysical Research Letters, 35, L09102 doi: 10.1029/2008GL033671
- Milan, S. E., Lester, M., Cowley, S. W. H., Oksavik, K., Brittnacher, M., Greenwald, R. A.,
- ⁶¹¹ Sofko, G., & Villain, J.-P. (2003). Variations in polar cap area during two substorm ⁶¹² cycles. *Annales Geophysicae*, *21*, 1121–1140.
- Milan, S. E., Cowley, S. W. H., Lester, M., Wright, D. M., Slavin, J. A., Fillingim, M.,
- ⁶¹⁴ Carlson, C. W., and Singer, H. J. (2004). Response of the magnetotail to changes in
 ⁶¹⁵ open flux content of the magnetosphere. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 109, A04220.
- doi: 10.1029/2003JA010350
- Milan, S. E., Provan, G., & Hubert, B. (2007). Magnetic flux transport in the Dungey
- cycle: A survey of dayside and nightside reconnection rates. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, *112*, A01209. doi: 10.1029/2006JA011642
- ⁶²⁰ Milan, S. E., Grocott, A., Forsyth, C., Imber, S. M., Boakes, P. D., & Hubert, B. (2009a).
- ⁶²¹ A superposed epoch analysis of auroral evolution during substorm growth, onset and

X - 30

recovery: open magnetic flux control of substorm intensity. Annales Geophysicae, 27, 659–668.

- Milan, S. E., Hutchinson, J., Boakes, P. D., & Hubert, B. (2009b). Influences on the radius
 of the auroral oval. Annales Geophysicae, 27, 2913–2924.
- Milan, S. E., Gosling, J. S., & Hubert, B. (2012). Relationship between interplan etary parameters and the magnetopause reconnection rate quantified from observa tions of the expanding polar cap. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 117, A03226. doi:
 10.1029/2011JA017082
- Milan, S. E. (2013), Modelling Birkeland currents in the expanding/contracting polar cap
 paradigm. Journal of Geophysical Research, 118. doi:10.1002/jgra.50393
- Milan, S. E. (2015). Sun et Lumière: solar wind-magnetosphere coupling as deduced
 from ionospheric flows and polar auroras. In *Magnetospheric Plasma Physics: The Impact of Jim Dungey's Research, Astrophysics and Space Science Proceedings 41*, eds.
- ⁶³⁵ D. Southwood et al., Springer. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-18359-6_2
- ⁶³⁶ Milan, S. E., Carter, J. A., Korth, H., & Anderson, B. J. (2015). Principal Component
- Analysis of Birkeland currents determined by the Active Magnetosphere and Plane tary Electrodynamics Response Experiment. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space
 Physics, 120. doi: 10.1002/2015JA021680
- Milan, S. E., Clausen, L. B. N., Coxon, J. C., Carter, J. A., Walach, M.-T., Laun-
- dal, K., Østgaard, N., Tenfjord, P., Reistad, J., Snekvik, K., Korth, H., & Anderson, B. J. (2017). Overview of solar wind-magnetosphere-ionosphere-atmosphere coupling and the generation of magnetospheric currents. *Space Science Reviews*, 206. doi:
 10.1007/s11214-017-0333-0

- Milan, S. E., Carter, J. A., Sangha, H., Laundal, K., Østgaard, N., Tenfjord, P., Reistad, 645
- J., Snekvik, K., Coxon, J. C., Korth, H., & Anderson, B. J. (2018). Timescales of day-646
- side and nightside field-aligned current response to changes in solar wind-magnetosphere 647
- coupling. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, Journal of Geophysical Re-648
- search: Space Physics, 123. https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JA025645. 649
- Morelli, J. P., Bunting, R. J., Cowley, S. W. H., Farrugia, C. J., Freeman, M. P., Friis-650
- Christensen, E., Jones, G. O. L., Lester, M., Lewis, R. V., Lühr, H., Orr, D., Pinnock, 651
- M., Reeves, G. D., Williams, P. J. S., & Yeoman, T. K. (1995). Radar observations of 652
- auroral zone flows during a multiple-onset substorm. Annales Geophysicae, 13, 1144. 653
- https://doi.org/10.1007/s00585-995-1144-2 654
- Murphy, K. R., Mann, I. R., Rae, I. J., Waters, C. L., Frey, H. U., Kale, A., Singer, H. J., 655
- Anderson, B. J., & Korth, H. (2013). The detailed spatial structure of field-aligned cur-656
- rents comprising the substorm current wedge. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space 657
- *Physics*, 118, 7714–7727. doi: 10.1002/2013JA018979 658
- Newell, P. T., & Gjerloev, J. W. (2011). Evaluation of SuperMAG auroral electrojet 659
- indices as indicators of substorms and auroral power. Journal of Geophysical Research, 660
- 116, A12211. doi: 10.1029/2011JA016779 661
- Newell, P. T. & Gjerloev, J. W. (2012). SuperMAG-Based Partial Ring Current Indices 662 Journal of Geophysical Research, 117, A12211. doi:10.1029/2012JA017586 663
- Sergeev, V. A., Pellinen, R. J., & Pulkkinen, T. I. (1996). Steady magnetospheric convec-664 tion: A review of recent results. Space Science Reviews, 75, 551–604.
- Siscoe, G. L., & Huang, T. S. (1985). Polar cap inflation and deflation. Journal of Geo-666
- physical Research, 90, 543–547. 667

- X 32 MILAN ET AL.: SUBSTORM ONSET LATITUDE AND CONVECTION
- Walach, M.-T., & Milan, S. E. (2015). Are steady magnetospheric convection events
 prolonged substorms? Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 120. doi:
 10.1002/2014JA020631
- ⁶⁷¹ Walach, M.-T., Milan, S. E., Murphy, K. R., Carter, J. A., Hubert, B. A, & Grocott, A.
- (2017). Comparative study of large-scale auroral signatures of substorms, steady magnetospheric convection events, and sawtooth events. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics*, 122. doi: 10.1002/2017JA023991.
- ⁶⁷⁵ Waters, C. L., Anderson, B. J., & Liou, K. (2001). Estimation of global field aligned
 ⁶⁷⁶ currents using the Iridium® system magnetometer data. *Geophysical Research Letters*,
 ⁶⁷⁷ 28, 2165–2168.
- ⁶⁷⁸ Wild, J. A., Woodfield, E. E., & Morley, S. K. (2009). On the triggering of auroral sub-⁶⁷⁹ storms by northward turnings of the interplanetary magnetic field. *Annales Geophysicae*,
- ⁶⁰⁰ 27, 3559–3570. www.ann-geophys.net/27/3559/2009/

X - 33



Figure 1. The first dayside (\mathbf{D}_1) and first seven nightside (\mathbf{N}_i , i = 1, ..., 7) eigenFACs derived from AMPERE field-aligned current distributions. Each panel is presented in a magnetic local time and magnetic latitude frame, where magnetic latitudes are scaled such that the boundary between R1 and R2 FACs occurs at 70° (green semicircle). Blue and red colours correspond to positive and negative values.



Figure 2. Superposed epoch analysis of substorms from 2 hours prior to 6 hours after onset. (a) IMF B_Z , (b) SMU and SML electrojet indices, (c) radius of the AMPERE current pattern, Λ , and (d) to (j) coefficients associated with the eigenFACs presented in Fig. 1 (except N₂). The substorms are categorised by the value of Λ at onset (t = 0) or Λ_0 , in 1° steps from 18° (black trace) to 26° (red trace); the number of substorms in each category is 976, 510, 1282, 1681, 1527, 1108, 789, 501, and 522, respectively.



Figure 3. Superposed epoch analysis of substorms in the same format as Fig. 2. Substorms are categorised by the length of time that the IMF remains southwards after onset: over 30, 60, 90, ..., 360 mins (blue to red traces). The number of substorms in each category is 699, 495, 472, 344, 337, 290, 253, 229, 234, 184, 222, 151, 189, and 2786, respectively. Substorms which do not fit the selection criteria (2409) are shown as a dashed line.

February 1, 2019, 10:17am



Figure 4. Superposed epoch analysis of substorms in the same format as Fig. 2, and selected in the same way, though restricted to those substorms which are not followed by a subsequent substorm for at least 6 hours. The number of substorms in each category is 59, 180, 128, 85, 97, 58, 48, 65, 37, 35, 27, 26, 31, 306, respectively. Substorms which do not fit the selection criteria (847) are shown as a dashed line.



Figure 5. A schematic of the development of high- and low-latitude substorms, panels (a) to (c) and (d) to (f), respectively, in response to prolonged solar wind-magnetosphere coupling. Each panel has noon at the top. Black arrowed lines show convection streamlines, the purple circle is the open/closed field line boundary enclosing the polar cap. Red dashed lines show portions of the OCB mapping to active reconnection X-lines at the magnetopause or in the magnetotail. Blue regions indicate the location of the auroral bulge and whether it is of high (dark blue) or low (light blue) ionospheric conductance; along these portions of the OCB the ionospheric flow crosses the boundary, along other portions the flow is adiaroic. Green arrows indicate expansion or contraction of the auroral zone and polar cap, or motions of the OCB.

February 1, 2019, 10:17am



Figure 6. Solar wind and magnetospheric dynamics for the period 04 to 22 UT, 6 October 2010. (a) and (b) Field-aligned current density along the dawn-dusk meridian in the northern and southern hemispheres, with red and blue indicating upwards and downwards FAC, with the colour scale saturating at 0.5 μ A m⁻². (c) Radius, Λ , of the northern and southern FAC ovals, with the southern hemisphere being displaced by 5° for clarity; the horizontal dashed lines indicate $\Lambda = 21^{\circ}$. (d) IMF B_Y and B_Z . (e) Solar wind speed and density. (f) Dayside reconnection rate, Φ_D , and the time integral of Φ_D . (g) The electrojet indices SML and SMU, with periods of steady magnetospheric convection indicated by orange bars. (h) The ring current index SMR. (i) The PC index. Vertical green lines show SuperMAG substorm onsets, and vertical red lines $\tilde{p}^{r} R discussed in the text.$ February 1, 2019, 10:17am D R A F T



Figure 7. Solar wind and magnetospheric dynamics for the period 19 UT, 28 May 2010, to 23 UT on the following day, in the same format as Fig. 6.



Figure 8. Solar wind and magnetospheric dynamics or the period 10 to 19 UT, 4 September 2011, and 00:30 to 13:30 UT, 21 January 2012, in the same format as Fig. 6.

Figure 1.



Figure 2.



Figure 3.



Figure 4.



Figure 5.



Figure6.



Figure 7.



Figure 8.

