Integrated geochemical identification of natural hydrogen sources

Quanyou Liu^{a,b,↑}, Xiaoqi Wu^c, Xiaowei Huang^a, Di Zhu^d, Qingqiang Meng^c, Dongya Zhu^c, Huiyuan Xu^c,

Jiayi Liu^c, Pengpeng Li^a, Zheng Zhou^e, Kaiqiang Zhang^a, Zhijun Jin^{a,c,↑}

^a Institute of Energy, Peking University, Beijing 100871, China

^cLancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster LA1 4YQ, UK

Owing to heightened environmental and energy concerns, countries worldwide are setting carbon peak and carbon neutrality goals. Natural hydrogen gas (H_2) is considered a clean energy source and is often referred to as "gold" or "white" hydrogen. Discovering natural hydrogen reserves could be critical for meeting the demand for hydrogen energy.

Hydrogen has been discovered in various geological settings [1,2]. However, the active chemical properties of hydrogen pose considerable challenges in identifying H₂ sources [3,4]. Multiple sources of natural hydrogen have been identified using gas geochemistry, including mantle volatiles, serpentinization, radiolytic decomposition of water (H₂O), and organic matter reactions (see Supplementary Materials online for a detailed discussion). However, there are no integrated geochemical criteria for identifying natural hydrogen, and such criteria are necessary for accumulation and resource evaluation. We analyzed the gas compositions, carbon and hydrogen isotopes, and ³He/⁴He of natural gases and hot springs to acquire representative H₂ data (Fig. S1, Table S1 online) in order to elucidate the genetic source of natural hydrogen. These insights not only mitigate the risks to economic challenges in hydrogen exploration in geological bodies but also support the effective and efficient development and utilization of hydrogen.

Sources of methane (CH₄) and helium (He) can be correlated with H₂ sources, given their common association. Typical mantlederived gas has R/Ra ;:: 8.0, whereas gases from hot springs and hydrothermal systems in the East Pacific mid-ocean ridge have R/Ra > 1.0 [5,6]. A value of R/Ra > 4.0 is typical of a mantle origin. Although typical crust-derived helium has R/Ra = 0.02, crustderived gases from cratonic basins such as the Ordos, Sichuan, and Kansas basins have R/Ra < 0.32 [7-9]. Consequently, R/Ra< 0.32 is consistent with a crustal origin. Gases in the Daniudi (DND) gas field in the Ordos Basin, the Canadian Shield, and the American Kansas Basin are typical crust-derived gases, with R/Ra < 0.32and H₂ concentrations of 0.1%–27.9% (Fig. 1a). Gas in the Zambales Ophiolite in the Philippines has R/Ra > 4.0 (Fig. 1a), indicative of typical mantle-derived H₂, with concentrations rang- ing from 35.1% to 58.5%. Samples from the Qingshen (QS) gas field in the Songliao Basin, the Huagou (HG) gas field in the Bohai Bay Basin, Oman peridotite complexes, New Caledonia ophiolites, and the Jimo (JM) hot springs of China yield R/Ra of 0.32-4.0 (Fig. 1a), indicating mixing of crust- and mantle-derived H₂, with H₂ concentrations ranging from 0.0014% to 99%. Similarly, gas sam- ples from the Tengchong (TC) hot springs yield R/Ra of 0.32-4.0, consistent with H₂ derived from both mantle and crustal sources, although some samples have R/Ra > 4.0 and H₂ concentrations of 0.015% - 5.15%, consistent with mantle-derived gas (Fig. 1a).

Methane in geological bodies is commonly categorized as biogenic or abiogenic. Abiogenic CH₄ typically exhibits heavier carbon isotopes, with d¹³C₁ values greater than -20‰ [10], whereas biogenic CH₄ originating from organic matter typically yields d¹³C₁ values of less than -55‰ for bacterial gas and -55‰ to -30‰ for thermogenic gas [11] (see Supplementary Materials online for a detailed discussion). Gas in the Sebei (SB) No.1 gas field in the Qaidam Basin is typically bacterial, with d¹³C₁ < -55‰ and H₂ concentrations of 47.7 %–95.4 % (Fig. 1b). Abiogenic gas can be derived from both the deep mantle and inorganic chemical reactions (ICRs) in the crust; as a result, crust-mantle mixing (CMM) gas can also be abiogenic. It is extremely difficult to determine the type of abio-

^b Northwest Institute of Eco-Environment and Resource, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Lanzhou 730000, China

^c Petroleum Exploration & Production Research Institute, SINOPEC, Beijing 102206, China

^d Key Laboratory for Biomass Gasification Technology of Shandong Province, Energy Research Institute, Qilu University of Technology (Shandong Academy of Sciences), Jinan 250014, China



Fig. 1. Diagrams of (a) H_2 (%) versus R/Ra, (b) H_2 (%) versus $d^{13}C_1$ (‰), (c) $d^{13}C_1$ (‰) versus $\ln(CH_4/H_2)$, (d) d^2H – C_1 versus $\ln(CH_4/H_2)$, and (e) d^2H – H_2 versus d^2H – C_1 of natural gas in various geological settings. Abbreviations: TCG, thermally cracked gas; FTS, Fischer-Tropsch synthesis; CMM, crust-mantle mixing; ICR, inorganic chemical reaction; RDW, radiolytic decomposition of water.

genic gas using only carbon and hydrogen isotope compositions and gas compositions. Mantle-derived abiogenic gas generally has d¹³C₁ values above -20‰ and can be more easily identified if *R*/*Ra* data are available. Gases in the Zambales Ophiolite, Oman peridotite complexes, and the Chimaera ophiolites in Turkey have d¹³C₁ values above -20‰ and are typically abiogenic, with H₂ concentrations ranging from 7.46% to 87.3% (Fig. 1b). However, gases in the Oman peridotite complexes and Chimaera ophiolites have *R*/*Ra* < 4.0, suggesting that the abiogenic CH₄ and H₂ are not derived solely from a mantle source.

Abiogenic H₂ can also be formed by serpentinization. Gas from the Kansas Basin, New Caledonia ophiolites, TC hot springs, and part of the QS gas field have $d^{13}C_1$ values ranging from -30‰ to -20‰ (Fig. 1b), which likely represent a mixture of thermogenic and abiogenic CH₄. This suggests that the H₂ in these regions could also be a mixture of biogenic and abiogenic, with concentrations ranging from 0.03% to 36.07%. The $d^{13}C_1$ values of gases in the HG and DND gas fields, the Taoudenni Megan Basin in Mali, the Canadian Shield, and the JM hot springs range from -55% to -30% (Fig. 1b), suggesting that the hydrogen gas in these regions could be derived via thermal cracking of organic matter. However, the alkane gases of the Canadian Shield are abiogenic [12], so the H₂ may also be abiogenic, with H₂ concentrations of 0.01%–26%.

The $ln(CH_4/H_2)$ values of natural gas derived via thermal cracking and Fischer-Tropsch synthesis (FTS) decrease with increasing d¹³C₁ values (Fig. 1c). In the SB No.1 gas field, headspace gas samples collected from two wells had high concentrations of H₂ (Fig. 1b), in contrast to the CH₄-dominated gas collected from the wellheads. The minimal variations in the H₂ concentrations (Fig. 1b) and ln(CH₄/H₂) values (Fig. 1c) of natural gas indicate that

H₂ may be preferentially derived from organic matter owing to certain types of microorganisms. In the HG, DND, and QS gas fields, a negative correlation is observed between $ln(CH_4/H_2)$ and $d^{13}C_1$ values (Fig. 1c). As the thermal maturity increases from the HG to QS gas fields, ln(CH₄/H₂) values decrease from 11.53 to 3.86, indicating a relative increase in H2 concentrations. In the QS field, despite the presence of mantle- and FTS-derived CH4, thermal cracking is dominant [13]. A weak positive correlation is observed between the ln(CH₄/H₂) and d¹³C₁ values of gases from the Zambales Ophiolite, Oman peridotite complexes, Chimaera ophiolites, and New Caledonia ophiolites (Fig. 1c), with ln(CH₄/H₂) values of -6.75 to 4.0 and $d^{13}C_1$ values above -20‰, indicating that the CH₄ and H₂ are both abiogenic. Hydrogen in these areas is formed by inorganic chemical reactions, resulting in a wide range of ln(CH₄/H₂) values. A negative correlation is observed between the ln(CH₄/H₂) and $d^{13}C_1$ values of gases from the New Caledonia ophiolites and the TC and JM hot springs (Fig. 1c), with $ln(CH_4/H_2)$ values of -3.83to 4.96 and $d^{13}C_1$ values of -55‰ to -20‰, indicating a mixture of crust- and mantle-derived gas.

Gases in the Kansas Basin have similar $\ln(CH_4/H_2)$ and $d^{13}C_1$ values to gases from the TC and JM hot springs; however, the low *R/Ra* values are consistent with a crustal origin with a limited mantle contribution (Fig. 1a), which suggests that the gases were mainly derived from inorganic chemical reactions (Fig. 1c). In addition, the presence of abiogenic CH₄ with $\ln(CH_4/H_2) < 4.0$ in the Zambales Ophiolite, Oman peridotite complexes, Chimaera ophiolites, and New Caledonia ophiolites further supports an abiogenic origin for both CH₄ and H₂ in these locations.

Hydrogen is converted to CH_4 through FTS, and $d^{13}C_1$ values become increasingly negative with ongoing conversion. Gas in the Canadian Shield is crustal in origin and rich in He (1.51%– 19.1%), and it was most likely produced by radioactive **a**-decay of U- and Th-bearing minerals; the variations in H₂ concentration suggest consumption through FTS, leading to the formation of abiogenic CH₄ [14].

Gases in the HG, DND, and QS gas fields have ln(CH₄/H₂) values ranging from 3.76 to 11.68 and d^2H-C_1 values of -277‰ to -179‰ (Fig. 1d). As the source rocks in these gas fields were deposited in fresh water, the negative correlation between $ln(CH_4/H_2)$ and d^2H -C1 values indicates that H2 and CH4 concentrations and d²H-C1 values were controlled by thermal maturity. With the gradual increase in thermal maturity through the HG, DND, and QS gas fields, ln(CH₄/H₂) values gradually decrease while d²H-C₁ values increase, indicating that the formation of CH4 and H2 was mainly controlled by their generation processes. The narrower range of d²H-C₁ values in the QS gas field indicates a higher proportion of mantle-derived fluids, emphasizing the impact of mantle-derived fluids on hydrogen isotopic compositions. The ln(CH₄/H₂) and d²H-C₁ values of gases from the Zambales Ophiolite, Chimaera ophiolites, and TC hot springs are positively correlated (Fig. 1d). Mantle-derived abiogenic gas from the Zambales Ophiolite has In (CH_4/H_2) values between -0.74 and 0.27 and d²H-C₁ values from -175‰ to -118‰. Given the narrow ranges of $d^{13}C_1$ and d^2H-C_1 values for the mantle-derived abiogenic gases of the Zambales Ophiolite, it is inferred that the abiogenic gases of the Oman peridotite complexes were also formed mainly by inorganic chemical reactions. During this process, H₂ is progressively converted to CH₄ via FTS, leading to decreasing H₂ and increasing CH₄ concentrations and d²H-C₁ values. The Chimaera ophiolites and the TC hot springs host a mixture of mantle- and FTS-derived gases. The $ln(CH_4/H_2)$ and d^2H-C_1 values of the gases from the Taoudenni Megan Basin, Kansas Basin, New Caledonia ophiolites, TC hot springs, and JM hot springs are similar to those of the Oman peridotite complexes, which have ln(CH₄/H₂) and d²H-C₁ values of -4.58 to 0.47 and -428‰ to -206‰, respectively (Fig. 1d). Gases in the Kansas Basin, New Caledonia ophiolites, TC hot springs, and

JM hot springs, which formed through inorganic chemical reactions such as FTS, have R/Ra values between 0.32 and 4.0. Consequently, initial CH₄ is isotopically enriched in ¹H but becomes gradually more enriched in ²H with ongoing FTS. In contrast, the gas in the Canadian Shield with R/Ra < 0.32 is crust-derived, and the H₂ was probably formed through radiolytic decomposition of water. The ln(CH₄/H₂) values of gas from the Canadian Shield exhibit a positive correlation with d²H–C₁ values, with values ranging from 0.74 to 8.63 and -417‰ to -184‰, respectively.

The relationship between d^2H-C_1 and d^2H-H_2 values in the SB No.1 gas field reveals a narrow range of hydrogen isotope values for CH₄ and H₂ in bacterial gas (Fig. 1e). The d^2H-C_1 and d^2H-H_2 values range from -237% to -201% and -831% to -758%, respectively. Bacterial H₂ typically has relatively stable d^2H-H_2 values ranging from -800% to -700%. In the HG, DND, and QS gas fields, a relatively narrow range of d^2H-C_1 values from -277% to -179% is observed, whereas d^2H-H_2 values range widely from -792% to -607% (Fig. 1e). A negative correlation exists between d^2H-C_1 and d^2H-H_2 values for the HG gas field, whereas a positive correlation is observed for the QS and DND gas fields.

The $d^{13}C_1$ values of natural gas increase with the thermal maturity of the source rocks [15], and $d^{13}C_1$ values can be used to indicate thermal maturity. The d¹³C₁ values of natural gas from the QS gas field are significantly higher than those from the DND gas field (Fig. 1b, Table S1 online), suggesting a higher level of thermal maturity for natural gas in the QS gas field compared with the DND gas field, whereas the H₂ is isotopically more enriched in ¹H than that in the DND gas field (Fig. 1e). This suggests that the conversion of H₂ to CH₄ during FTS in the QS gas field is more intensive than that in DND gas field. A positive correlation is observed between d^2H-C_1 and d^2H-H_2 values for gas from the Zambales Ophiolite, with values ranging from -175‰ to -118‰ and -756‰ to -581‰, respectively (Fig. 1e), indicating an increase in d²H-H₂ values with increasing d²H-C₁ values for mantlederived CH₄ and H₂. Hydrogen formed by serpentinization in the Oman peridotite complexes and Chimaera ophiolites has a relatively narrow range of d^2H-H_2 values (from -725‰ to -699‰), whereas CH_4 produced by FTS has a wide range of d^2H-C_1 values (from -413% to -129%). This suggests that H₂ formed by serpentinization has a relatively narrow distribution of d²H-H₂ values, whereas CH_4 produced by FTS has a wide range of d^2H-C_1 values. Gases of the Taoudenni Megan Basin, Kansas Basin, New Caledonia ophiolites, TC hot springs, and JM hot springs have similar origins to those of the Oman peridotite complexes and Chimaera ophiolites, which have a wide range of d²H-H₂ values for H₂ produced by inorganic chemical reactions. Consequently, methane produced by FTS is more isotopically enriched in ¹H than methane produced by thermal cracking of organic matter (Fig. 1e). Although there are insufficient d²H-H₂ data to evaluate the origin of H₂ in the Canadian Shield, the ³He/⁴He ratios (R/Ra < 0.32), d¹³C₁ values, d²H–C₁ values, and ln(CH4/H2) indicate that the H2 is a typical crustderived abiogenic gas. The only available d²H-C₁ value indicates that the H₂ was formed by radiolytic decomposition of water, as its d^2H-H_2 value (-637‰) is markedly higher than that of H_2 formed by serpentinization in the Chimaera ophiolites.

Table 1 summarizes the formation and co-evolution of H_2 and CH_4 under different geological conditions based on gas composition, ${}^{3}\text{He}/{}^{4}\text{He}$, and $d^{2}\text{H}-C_1$ and $d^{13}C_1$ values. It is important to note that the threshold of constrained parameters for H_2 is not constant due to the mixing of gases from different sources. Sources of H_2 can be identified by considering geological backgrounds and formation processes in combination with relevant compositional and isotopic data. The present summaries are empirical, and the boundary values of the identification indexes may vary as the amount of data increases; however, the general rules and trends are believed to be consistent.

Q. Liu et al.

Table 1

Thresholds of different indicators for H2 and associated gases in geological deposits.

H ₂ source	H ₂ (%) (Min.–Max./Avg.)	ln(CH4/H2)	$d^{2}H\!\!-\!\!H_{2} \ (\text{\sc w}, \text{VSMOW})$	d ² H–C ₁ (‰, VSMOW)	d ¹³ C ₁ (‰, VPDB)	R/Ra
Mantle	0.12-58.50/18.26	-0.5 to 0.5	-700	> -180	> -20	4.0
Thermal cracking	0.02-0.24/0.056	>5	-750 to - 600	-280 to - 180 (freshwater) or >-160 (saltwater)	-55 to - 30	< 0.32
Microbial degradation	47.70-95.40/74.54	-5 to 0	-850 to - 750	-240 to - 200 (freshwater)	< -55	< 0.32
Serpentinization	0.0007-99.00/28.16	<5	-780 to - 700	-450 to - 200	> -55	0.32 to 4.0
Radiolytic decomposition of water	0.01-26.00/1.76	>0	-700	-450 to - 180	-50 to - 30	< 0.02

Conflict of interest

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgments

This study was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (U20B6001, 42141021, 42172149, 42172168, and U2244209) and the Tencent Foundation through the XPLORER PRIZE. We deeply appreciate the constructive comments from the reviewers, which greatly improved the quality of the manuscript.

Author contributions

Quanyou Liu and Zhijun Jin conceptualized the study; Quanyou Liu and Xiaoqi Wu performed the methodology; Quanyou Liu, Xiaoqi Wu, Xiaowei Huang, Qingqiang Meng, Dongya Zhu, and Jiayi Liu performed the investigation; Qingqiang Meng, Quanyou Liu, Pengpeng Li, and Kaiqiang Zhang performed the visualization; Zhijun Jin, Zheng Zhou, and Kaiqiang Zhang were responsible for supervision; Quanyou Liu, Zhijun Jin, and Xiaoqi Wu wrote the original draft; Quanyou Liu, Zhijun Jin, Zheng Zhou, and Kaiqiang Zhang carried out the review and editing.

Appendix A. Supplementary materials

Supplementary materials to this short communication can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scib.2024.07.004.

References

- Hand E. Hidden hydrogen: Does Earth hold vast stores of a renewable, carbonfree fuel? Science 2023;379:630–6.
- [2] Truche L, Donzé F-V, Edmond G, et al. A deep reservoir for hydrogen drives intense degassing in the Bulqizë ophiolite. Science 2024;383:618–21.
- [3] Etiope G. Massive release of natural hydrogen from a geological seep (Chimaera, Turkey): Gas advection as a proxy of subsurface gas migration and pressurised accumulations. Int J Hydrogen Energy 2023;48:9172–84.
- [4] Milkov AV. Molecular hydrogen in surface and subsurface natural gases: Abundance, origins and ideas for deliberate exploration. Earth-Sci Rev 2022;230:104063.
- [5] Graham DW. Noble gas isotope geochemistry of mid-ocean ridge and ocean island basalts: Characterization of mantle source reservoirs. Rev Mineral Geochem 2002;47:247–316.
- [6] Chavrit D, Burgess B, Sumino H, et al. The contribution of hydrothermally altered ocean crust to the mantle halogen and noble gas cycles. Geochim Comsochim Acta 2016;183:106–24.
- [7] Ni Y, Dai J, Tao S, et al. Helium signatures of gases from the Sichuan Basin. China Org Geochem 2014;74:33–43.

- [8] Liu Q, Wu X, Jia H, et al. Geochemical characteristics of helium in natural gas from the daniudi gas field, Ordos basin, central China. Front Earth Sci 2022;10:823308.
- [9] Vacquand C, Deville E, Beaumont V, et al. Reduced gas seepages in ophilitic complexes: Evidences for multiple origins of the H₂-CH₄-N₂ gas mixtures. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 2018;223:437–61.
- [10] Javoy M, Pineau F, Delmore H. Carbon and nitrogen isotopes in the mantle. Chem Geol 1986;57:41–62.
- [11] Liu Q, Wu X, Wang X, et al. Carbon and hydrogen isotopes of methane, ethane, and propane: A review of genetic identification of natural gas. Earth-Sci Rev 2019;190:247–72.
- [12] Sherwood Lollar B, Westgate TD, Ward JA, et al. Abiogenic formation of alkanes in the Earth's crust as a minor source for global hydrocarbon reservoirs. Nature 2002;416:522–4.
- [13] Liu Q, Dai J, Jin Z, et al. Abnormal carbon and hydrogen isotopes of alkane gases from the Qingshen gas field, Songliao Basin, China, suggesting abiogenic alkanes? J Asian Earth Sci 2016;115:285–97.
- [14] Sherwood Lollar B, Onstott TC, Lacrampe-Couloume G, et al. The contribution of the Precambrian continental lithosphere to global H₂ production. Nature 2014;516:379–82.
- [15] Stahl WJ, Carey Jr BD. Source-rock identification by isotope analyses of natural gases from fields in the Val Verde and Delaware basins, west Texas. Chem Geol 1975;16:257–67.



Quanyou Liu is a Boya distinguished professor from Institute of Energy, Peking University, China. His research concerns crust-mantle organic-inorganic interactions on carbon cycling, hydrocarbon enrichment in the context of multi-sphere interactions, accumulation of hydrogen and helium.



Zhijun Jin is a petroleum geologist and a Boya chair professor from Institute of Energy, Peking University, China. He focuses on marine petroleum geology, hydrocarbon generation under deep fluids, enrichment of shale oil and gas, and natural hydrogen resource potential. He is the academician of the Chinese Academy of Sciences and foreign academician of the Russian Academy of Natural Sciences.