

The dark side of optimism: Musical dreams, belief, and gambling

Musgrave, G., Gross, S., & Klein, M.

Abstract:

Being a career musician is typified by high risk. Despite low earnings, many musicians pursue their careers driven by self-belief, high expectations, and optimism. However, failure to obtain the success many optimistically aspire to has been seen to pose psychosocial risks relating to mental health conditions such as anxiety and depression. While studies have shown dispositional optimism as having many health-related benefits, it has also been conceptualised negatively in encouraging a tendency towards loss-making in one key area: gambling. In this article we develop the argument that the risks of professional music-making are analogous to gambling, and the optimism displayed by many aspiring career musicians may therefore represent a form of what Berlant calls *cruel optimism*, with negative effects on mental health and wellbeing. In doing so, we draw on Berlant's theoretical position to examine the potentially harmful intersections between risk-taking behaviours and creative desire. Drawing also on our clinical experience, we consider when and how musicians who are emotionally struggling with their work might find it advantageous to reorient their careers, or even withdraw from the labour market altogether, to support their health and wellbeing, and the challenges around the loss of identity these can present.

Keywords: musicians, wellbeing, mental health, risk, costly persistence, cruel optimism

“You have to eat the dream.
 You have to sleep the dream.
 You have to dream the dream.
 You have to see it when nobody else sees it.
 You have to feel it when it’s not tangible.
 You have to believe it when you cannot see it.
 You’ve got to be possessed by the dream”

– Meek Mill [rapper], *Wins & Losses* (from the album *Wins & Losses*, Maybach Music Group/Atlantic Records Group, 2017)

In this article we reflect upon empirically demonstrable poor mental health and negative wellbeing among musicians. These are attributed in many studies to the psychosocial features of musicians’ working lives (see Musgrave, 2023b, pp. 284-86 for a review). Our focus is on those for whom music-making is more than recreation, leisure, or a hobby, but represents instead a desired career orientation. We are mostly concerned with musicians working in contemporary genres of popular music such as pop, rock, dance/EDM, hip hop, and others for whom recognition is derived from recording and sharing music across a variety of formats simultaneously, as opposed to one-time performances such as recitals given by a solo violinist, for example.

Popular music careers are typically associated with the concept of risk. For example, they are commonly connected with the risky use of substances such as drugs and alcohol, and occasionally linked to tragic early death (Miller & Quigley, 2011; Holm-Hadulla & Bertolino, 2013; Kenny & Asher, 2016). However, there is another – perhaps more prosaic – labour-market risk associated with music-making as a career. That is, the decision to pursue a musical career is economically risky given demonstrably poor financial outcomes (Hesmondhalgh et al., 2022) and the prevalence of what Mulligan (2014) refers to as a *superstar music economy* with a low probability of career sustainability. This has led Moxey and Daniel (2023) to characterise musical careers as taking place within what they call an “unpropitious creative field, [defined as] a field in which a significant number of expert practitioners cannot establish a viable and sustainable career, despite sustained and skilful efforts to do so” (pp. 242-43). These uncertain career outcomes and connected subjective perceptions of failure have been demonstrated to be among the most important explanatory factors for another kind of risk or by-product of careers in music: high levels of clinical anxiety and depression (Loveday et al., 2023). In other words, evidence points to high levels of mental ill-health among musicians working in a range of genres (Détari et al., 2020; Gross & Musgrave, 2016, 2017, 2020; Kegelaers et al., 2022; Vaag et al. 2014, 2016a), and these high incidences relative to the general population might be explained, at least in part, by the risks associated with the various uncertainties that are connected with these poor labour market outcomes. Thus economic, market-based risks can have negative psychological consequences.

However, in the face of these economic risks and their concomitant psychological risks, unquantifiable numbers of young people dream of careers in which they can pursue their creative work as professional musicians. They do this in a context where they are increasingly supported by a growing tertiary educational infrastructure in the United Kingdom seeking to prepare musicians for careers in music (Bennett, 2015;

Born & Devine, 2015). Driven and propelled by their love for music, their dreams, and their belief in themselves and their artistic abilities, young people are seemingly undeterred by the risks. As Menger (1999) noted, “[t]he attractiveness of artistic occupations is high but has to be balanced against the risk of failure” (p. 541). In this article we view the potential causes of mental health challenges experienced by a specific group of creative artists through a psychosocial lens. We examine the implications for some musicians of pursuing their career dreams when confronted with the possibility of failure in the face of high risk, and the emotional losses and poor wellbeing outcomes this can engender. We explore these implications in three parts. We begin by highlighting three features of careers in music: first, the high-risk nature of the labour market; second, the high levels of optimism and self-belief often exhibited by musicians; and third, the contribution of failure to obtain the success one dreams of to poor mental health. In the second part of the article we turn to the work of Gibson and Sanbonmatsu (2004), and evaluate the extent to which it is reasonable to conceptualise the risks inherent in the pursuit of a musical career as being akin to gambling, and, if so, whether gambling is relatively unusual in that optimism represents a negative disposition, given the tendency to chase a loss. We then draw on the concept of *cruel optimism* (Berlant, 2006, 2010, 2011) to ask whether the optimism required to pursue a musical career – the belief in the quality of one’s own musical creations that drives musicians forward to produce music and be heard by audiences – might, in itself, be a source of suffering, in that it can keep musicians tethered to careers that might be harming them and others around them.

In the final part of the paper we draw on our combined experience as creative industries educators and a clinician to explore the potential usefulness of our argument for both clinicians/therapists/counsellors and musicians themselves. We hope our analysis will facilitate meaningful conversations around approaches to musicianship and musical careers in order that musicians who are experiencing emotional stress might consider techniques for re-orienting their approach to their musical careers. They might do this by seeking alternative forms of work (musical or otherwise), or even by ceasing to view music-making as a possible source of income so that they can preserve or re-engage with the ways in which practicing and playing music is a positive force in their lives. We also reflect on why such re-orientations can be painful for musicians, given that they can entail a loss of identity connected with their musicianship. We hope our discussion of these issues might be used as a springboard for musicians who are suffering and the clinicians who are working with them, enabling them to consider the sources of pain in musicians’ lives, and how best to minimise it.

Musicians: Belief and identity

Aspiration and risk

Careers in music are understood to be risky in various ways. Most obviously, perhaps, an individual or group may write, record, and release a song, but the extent to which it is eventually enjoyed by audiences and successful in terms of metrics such as chart success, high streaming rates, or critical acclaim in the form of what Bourdieu (1993) calls *cultural consecration* is reliant on marketplace risks and uncertainties rooted in subjectivities vis-à-vis how a song will be received. Caves (2003) characterises this as the nobody-knows principle or “the fundamental

uncertainty that faces the producer of a creative good” (p. 74). In other words, songs are products that their producers cannot be sure audiences will actually like.

However, careers in music are also risky from the labour-market outcomes perspective. Brook et al. (2020) define cultural work such as music-making as “an exemplar of [financial] precariousness” (p. 145). In 2014 it was reported that, globally, 77% of income from recorded music derived from the earnings of 1% of musicians, an increase from 71% at the start of the century (Mulligan, 2014). More recently, work by Hesmondhalgh et al. (2022) on music makers in the United Kingdom suggested that “[more] than a third of musicians (37%) reported earnings of £5,000 or less from music in 2019 and nearly half (47%) earned less than £10,000” (p. 18). Indeed, for Bourdieu (1993), creative work such as making a career as a musician should be understood as the “propensity to move towards the economically most risky positions, and above all the capacity to persist in them . . . even when they secure no short-term economic profit” (p. 67). This suggests that very few musicians who pursue music as their career will ever earn a sustainable living from their art. This feature of the labour market is true of many similar high-risk, high-reward industries with highly uncertain career outcomes, for example professional football (O’Donoghue, 1999; Bourke, 2003) and even academia, given the increasing numbers of PhDs awarded annually alongside scant opportunities for employment as a researcher, lecturer, or professor (Kim et al., 2018).

Despite these risks, many people seek careers in music. A wide range of factors influence their decision to do so, including their “talent, motivation, parental encouragement, social conditions, resource availability, peer group, personality type” (Musgrave, 2023b, p. 286), and the availability of networks and connections (Längler et al., 2018). However, a critical psychological factor in the emergence of the aspiration to pursue a musical career and hope of eventual success is that of self-belief. Given the low likelihood of success in this particular labour market, musicians have to be optimistic about their own chances. The findings of empirical studies have suggested that high levels of self-belief in the form of musical self-concept are connected with subsequent high levels of musical attainment and proficiency (Asmus & Harrison, 1990) and have highlighted the central role of self-belief in the emergence of musical aspiration, expertise, and eventual career development (MacNamara et al., 2006; Dumbreck & McPherson, 2016; Hallam et al., 2016; Hallam, 2017). This self-belief needs to be sustained over extended periods of time and in the face of potential setbacks such as negative feedback (Creech et al., 2008). A central and related element required by musicians is that of self-efficacy, initially defined by Bandura (1997) as belief “in one’s capabilities to organize and execute the courses of action required to produce given attainments” (p. 3), and more recently as the individual’s faith and perceived feeling of agency in their own abilities and competence (McPherson & McCormick, 2006; Lewis et al., 2022); Schwarzer and Luszczynska (2022) define this simply as “optimistic self-belief” (p. 207). Drawing on the work of Pitts et al. (2000), Hallam et al. (2016) note that “[musicians] who give up playing tend to have lower expectations of success” (p. 530). Being a musician, then, requires optimism, which is bound up with musicians’ dreams and aspirations, encapsulated in the extract from the lyrics of the rapper Meek Mill used as an epigraph to this article.

Failure and loss

While musicians may be optimistic when they hope for success, some researchers see *productive failure* (Thorley, 2018) as potentially beneficial for recording artists and producers, as it can foster self-reflection and the development of critical thinking. Likewise, uncertainty has been conceptualised as a creative asset, a feature of musicians' work to be harnessed to spur artistic output (Ibert et al., 2018). Thus not only are musicians highly likely to fail but failure can actually be seen as evidence of progression, and even embraced in what Newsinger and Serafini (2019) call *romantic resilience* or the artist's commitment to, and embracing of, suffering and setbacks in the pursuit of their creative career. In this sense, failure might actually contribute to the self-efficacy necessary for persistence as well as the rejection of risk. Musicians must therefore both reject the probability of marketplace uncertainty and embrace failure, placing their faith and trust in themselves and their abilities, while aiming high. Being a career musician is thus representative and emblematic of the kind of dream-based work conceptualised by Kuehn and Corrigan (2013) as *hope labour*, or by Duffy (2016) in her gender-focused reframing of this as *aspirational labour*.

However, the discrepancy between the high numbers of those aspiring to musical careers and the low probability of success (Krueger, 2019) means that many musicians are unlikely to realise the optimistic goals and ambitions they may once have set for themselves, with direct consequences for their health and wellbeing. Like others with unrealised dreams, such musicians often experience profound feelings of loss and inadequacy. As Nytch (2018) notes, "failure in music would represent a catastrophic failure to realize our deepest, most personal dreams and aspirations" (p. 4). Work by Loveday et al. (2023) suggests that musicians' subjective definitions of failure are among the strongest determinants of mental health outcomes, such that those who saw themselves as failures had worse mental health, as measured on the Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale and World Health Organization Wellbeing Index, than those who saw themselves as successful, whether they were carving out long careers playing to small audiences but supporting their families, or performing to millions of fans on world tours. Musicians often continue to follow their dreams, striving for markers of success, driven by the one-big-hit logic (Neff et al., 2005), because they "are only ever three minutes of magic away from their life being changed" (Gross & Musgrave, 2020, p. 113), the three minutes representing the typical length of the one song that connects with an audience, goes viral online, or is streamed millions of times. For this reason they continue to pursue their musical careers, even when both economic and affective outcomes appear unfavourable, and remain optimistic.

Musical aspiration and career development are thus premised on ignoring risk, or, at the very least, managing it effectively (Menger, 2006), and harnessing faith; to quote Meek Mill (2017) again, musicians need to "dream the dream . . . see it when nobody else sees it . . . feel it when it's not tangible." Dobrow (2012) and Dobrow Riza and Heller (2015) have suggested that careers in music are rooted in the suspension of disbelief and a commitment to artistry and musicality. Artists more broadly have been characterised as having "a chronic underestimation of the risk involved and the chances of success" (Lingo & Tepper, 2013, p. 338), a point also made by Abbing (2002). Put simply, individuals must believe in themselves, have high hopes, and

remain optimistic, if they are to make successful careers as musicians. The evidence suggests that the odds against success are overwhelming and that failure can have profoundly negative effects on health and wellbeing. This leads us to ask the question as to whether musicians' optimism may be not only misplaced, but also potentially harmful.

Optimism and gambling

Is being a career musician a gamble?

The kind of optimism required by musicians can be seen as a source of significant psychological strength with many benefits. Carver et al. (2010) argue that a positive future orientation concerning expectations can lead to demonstrable improvements in subjective wellbeing and mental health outcomes; resilience and persistence; coping strategies; adjustment to challenges over the life course; health-promoting behaviours; recovery from illness; and physical health and other biological outcomes including lower stress levels and mortality. The findings of several empirical studies suggest that optimism and a dispositional orientation towards perseverance in the face of hardship (cf. Creech et al., 2008) are positive traits not least in relation to mental health and wellbeing.

That musicians must be optimistic, that optimism improves mental health and wellbeing, and that musicians as a population are thought by some to suffer from poor mental health and wellbeing, is an interesting paradox. This leads us to consider, therefore, whether optimism can be counter-productive. Carver et al. (2010) suggest a specific example of optimistic persistence with high expectations for the future representing a negative trait, one that has been considered in the work Gibson & Sanbonmatsu (2004) as a "liability" (p. 157): gambling.ⁱ Part of what leads to positive outcomes for optimists is their belief that stressful events are controllable, resulting in solution-focused behaviours (Carver et al., 1989; Scheier et al., 1986). However the outcomes of gambling cannot generally be controlled, so the gambler's optimistic belief that they can exert control in such a high-risk environment is maladaptive. What makes gambling a problematic rather than a recreational activity is the gambler's expectation that they will win, even when faced by overwhelming odds (Walker, 1992).

Given the evidence, we would argue that building a career as a musician is analogous to gambling since they both involve risk and risk-taking. As gambling offers "bleak odds" (Gibson & Sanbonmatsu, 2004, p. 150), so does the superstar economy of careers in music. "[W]ithdrawal rather than persistence is more financially prudent" for gamblers (Gibson & Sanbonmatsu, 2004, p. 151) and career musicians alike, going by the findings of research on musicians' earnings (Hesmondhalgh et al., 2022). Finally, optimistic gamblers are more likely to "perceive losses as near wins" (Gibson & Sanbonmatsu, 2004, p. 151), mirroring the notion of musicians' productive failure (Thorley, 2018). It is important to note that of course some gamblers do win – there are lottery winners around the world every week – and some musicians do write and record songs that go on to be global hits. In many respects, the odds of winning being so low is part of what makes the winning so attractive.

Other authors have also drawn similar parallels between building a career in music and gambling. In relation to the marketing of music by record labels and the quest for success in popular music, Hennion (1983) suggests that “the notion of a gamble is a fundamental one” (p. 190). In a list of jobs they describe as unusual and typically high-status careers (e.g., being a footballer, actor, racing driver, or film director), Hemsley-Brown and Foskett (1999) included careers in the performing arts such as music as “lottery jobs” (p. 427). Writing about the marketing of hip hop, the rapper Jay-Z notes that “[r]appers can be like gambling addicts who see a potential bet everywhere they look” (2010, p. 70). Choosing a career in music has been conceptualised as a calling, “akin to [being] a compulsive gambler in that it fosters tunnel vision and obliviousness to risky decisions” (Dobrow, 2012, p. 448). Some of the live-music concert promoters interviewed by Cloonan (2012) saw their job as a form of gambling too, and Janosov et al. (2020) have shown that luck and randomness are crucial to some forms of success in artistic careers, including those in music. Finally, Oliveira et al. (2023) use the gambling analogy of hot streaks in their analysis of successful periods in popular musicians’ careers.

Careers in music are not, of course, the only careers that have an affinity with gambling. “[T]he dedicated scientist is exactly like a pathological gambler” (Shaffer, 1989, p. 29), in relation not only to the uncertain outcomes of funding applications, for example, but also the scientific endeavour itself. Indeed, many other areas of life are often described as being a gamble, such as romantic love (D’Aoust, 2013; Howard, 1993), as illustrated in the song *Taking a Chance on Love* (Fitzgerald, 1940). Careers in music are not entirely reliant on chance, however, but also on complex webs of networks, opportunities, talent, specific skills, and luck (Gagné, 2017). They nevertheless share many of the characteristics of gambling.

Taking risks in the form of gambling is not necessarily unhealthy; as a leisure activity it has a social function. In her work on the everyday sociology of gambling among working-class women who play The National Lottery in the United Kingdom, Casey (2008) describes it as a form of escapism, fantasy, and friendships via lottery syndicates. Gambling as leisure has been the topic of several studies revealing the capacity of bingo, for example, not only to present risks but to strengthen social bonds in Australia (Maltzahn et al., 2019), the Pacific Islands (Cox et al., 2022), and the United Kingdom (Mann, 2003). If being a musician is seen as analogous to gambling, it is not necessarily pathological. We can ask when it may become harmful and, if it does, when it is the right time to stop, for the prevention of harm either to the individual or others.

Costly persistence and cruel optimism

The potential harms to which we refer – the effects on mental health of being an optimistic career musician – have been identified particularly in research on the emotional challenges emanating from careers in popular music. They include the disruption of family life (Détari et al., 2020; Vaag et al., 2014); the often relational nature of work that can lead to the breakdown of relationships (Musgrave, 2023a); in certain genres and scenes, the social availability and acceptability of drug-taking and/or alcohol consumption (Forsyth et al., 2016); and long-term financial precarity with all the stressors and strains associated with prolonged economic uncertainty (Berg et al., 2022). These have been cited, among others, as potential psychosocial

causal factors for high levels of anxiety and depression among this population. Nevertheless musicians often continue to stay optimistic, and pursue their dreams, not least because their career aspirations give them joy, fulfilment, self-actualisation, self-confidence, and friendship (Baym, 2018), thus promoting their wellbeing, as well as threatening their mental health (Kegelaers et al., 2022). Such musicians may develop their self-belief and pursue their dreams to the point where they are in denial of the fact that their aspirations may be harming them and potentially those around them.

We have argued above that musicians who persist despite threats to their mental health are like gamblers facing overwhelming odds. Gibson and Sanbonmatsu (2004) describe gamblers as having “the tendency to attend to positive aspects of a situation and reframe negative situations in a positive way [that] may prolong their belief in their gambling abilities” (p. 151); they also found that “optimists are more likely than pessimists to maintain positive expectations and persist in gambling following losses” (p. 158). Lucas et al. (2015) describe such persistence as *costly perseverance*, or determined commitment to a course of action with potentially negative effects. In short, musicians pursue their dreams because they love making music and sharing it with others, and stopping would incur a profound sense of loss. In their Dualistic Model of Passion, Bonneville-Roussy and Vallerand (2020) distinguish between two types of persistence. People with harmonious passion for music, free from external or internal pressures, exhibit *flexible persistence* in music-making, compatible with a healthy family life, other interests, and ultimately increased wellbeing. Those with obsessive passion exhibit *rigid persistence*, pursuing music-making “to the detriment of other important activities, such as family events or even health [leading to] . . . negative emotions, anxiety, and lower levels of wellbeing” (p. 267).

The obsessively passionate musician may exhibit this rigid persistence because they cannot let go of the attachment they have formed to their dreamed-of life and career, and because of the detrimental optimism we have described above. This has also been termed *cruel optimism* in that hoped-for outcomes are uncertain, impossible, or even a fantasy.

[People] who have x in their lives [e.g., the dream of a career in music] might not well endure of the loss of their object or scene of desire, even though its presence threatens their wellbeing; because whatever the *content* [italics in original] of the attachment is, the continuity of the form of it provides something of the continuity of the subject’s [sic] sense of what it means to keep on living on and to look forward to being in the world. (Berlant, 2010, p. 94)

Hoped-for outcomes provide people with a purpose but their inaccessibility may be harmful. Taking a specific historical and political standpoint, Berlant (2006, 2011) includes among these hoped-for but inaccessible outcomes the *good life* promised by post-war social democracies (e.g., a stable career with contractual employment rights, a home one can afford to buy, and upward social mobility). We propose that careers in music represent similar outcomes, and that some musicians who persist, despite feeling that they are failing and in poor mental health, are suffering from the

effects of cruel optimism, which keeps them “tethered to bad lives and unrealizable ideals that exhaust and defeat them” (Zembylas & Keet, 2019, p. 83).

Discussion: Clinical usefulness

Finally, we reflect on the potential usefulness of our argument for mental-health professionals. There is evidence that musicians, as a population, are often receptive, amenable, and responsive to psychotherapeutic interventions (Vaag et al., 2016; Visser et al. 2022), particularly those in which the clinician demonstrates an empathic appreciation of the musician's lived experience (Berg et al., 2018; Gross & Musgrave, 2017; Heyman et al., 2019). Our argument gives rise to three sets of recommendations. First, both clinician and musician need to understand that healthy risk-taking requires a balance between the musician's career aspirations and the pressures of the environment, and it is important for clinicians to acknowledge in their use of language, for example when formulating strategies to help musicians, that a degree of risk-taking is essential to building a career in music. It is also important for those developing policies for future practice in relation to musicians' wellbeing, particularly those targeting mental health professionals who work with musicians. One aim could be to develop ways of educating aspiring musicians and equipping them with the capacity to judge for themselves, or with others, when their risk-taking is and is not healthy, in the context of their work-life balance. To support the meeting of this aim it would be worth carrying out research from a sociological perspective to explore in greater depth when, how, and why musicians disengage from potentially detrimental risky behaviours, such as deciding to quit a stable job in favour of pursuing music full-time despite needing to support a family. In practice, we believe that such decisions should involve members of the musician's family or professional network, including a clinician or mental-health practitioner who could work with the musician to map their available strengths and resources for healthy risk-taking, as well as the barriers they face. Recovery Capital Theory (Cloud & Granfield, 2008), deriving from addiction science, could provide a useful framework for such a strategy (recovery capital comprises *collective life factors* available to individuals that can help them recover from addiction). Again, it would be worth investigating how musicians develop and maintain their capacity for healthy risk-taking, independently and with others. In practice, we believe that musicians should make decisions about taking specific risks with the help of peers and/or therapists.

Second, therapists can also work with musicians to determine whether and, if so, when their risk-taking has become harmful, and the potential for withdrawing from the pursuit of a career in music and building a different career instead. Withdrawal is likely to be hugely painful. Musicians embody their work; it is through being musicians that they understand, construct, and articulate their identities (Ascenso et al., 2016; Beech et al., 2016; Gross & Musgrave, 2020). A musician forges their identity over years if not decades of emotional and financial investment, or the relationship they have with music-making and its (imagined) role in their current and future; “once a possible identity has been formed . . . it is only let go of with great reluctance” (Oyserman & James, 2011, p. 125). Identity is strongly connected with sense of self, or a “mental concept, working theory about oneself, stored in memory and amended with use. It is a working theory about who one is, was and will become” (Oyserman & James, 2011, p. 117). For a musician, it can be deeply upsetting and destabilising to walk away from an identity they have constructed and

a life they have aspired to. Specifically, if an individual has dreamed of being a full-time musician and achieving markers of success (such as fame, money, a large and/or engaged audience, or other indicators) it can be acutely painful for these dreams not to be realised. Relinquishing them might represent the ultimate failure, forcing the musician to imagine an undesirable future self: that of being a non-musician (Carver et al. 1999; Phillips et al. 2007). In practice, we believe that it is crucial for clinicians to understand this, and it could be fruitful for them to discuss with clients the ways in which they might continue to find joy and meaning in music-making *per se* while moving away from it as a career orientation.

Our final recommendation is that a clinician working with a musician should seek to create a non-pathologising and non-stigmatising therapeutic environment in which they can attend to both the constructive and maladaptive aspects of maintaining a cruel-optimism outlook. In practice, the clinician should help the musician understand that their risk-taking represents part but not all of them. This will enable them to recognise that their failures are not their identity, view their risk-taking with compassion, and find out why they are no longer served by identifying with failure. Motivational Interviewing (MI) (Miller & Rollnick, 1991), defined as “a directive, client-centred counselling style for eliciting behaviour change by helping clients explore and resolve ambivalence” (Rollnick & Miller, 1995, p. 325), is an example of an approach of this kind that is often employed in contexts where clients are ambivalent or even reluctant to change their behaviour, such as gamblers. According to the results of a systematic review and meta-analysis by Rubak et al. (2005), MI had a significant and clinically relevant effect on the treatment of a range of lifestyle issues and diseases in 75% of 72 studies. It was effective in the short-term for the treatment of gambling, at least in terms of dollars spent and gambling frequency, although its longer-term effects were less clear (Yakovenko et al., 2015). Raeburn (2000) highlights but does not evaluate MI in the context of musicians and addiction, and Kok et al. (2013) suggest its use for addressing musculoskeletal pain in musicians. It could therefore be used by clinicians working with career musicians on the issues arising from risk-taking.

Conclusion

In this article we have discussed relationships between optimism, risk, and the psychosocial determinants of mental health and wellbeing among popular musicians. While it is hard to measure the popular music labour market, we argue that it attracts workers driven by the desire to make a living from producing creative work. This desire attaches itself to and/or is supported by self-belief and hope or optimism. We have suggested that risk is endemic and the chances of failure are high in careers in music; musicians who hope to make successful careers in music must adopt an orientation of optimistic self-belief despite poor odds; setbacks pose risks to mental health and wellbeing; and finally, given that careers in music share many features with gambling, which is unusual in that optimism has unfavourable outcomes, the optimism displayed by many musicians may be described as cruel. We therefore conclude that musicians must learn to take healthy risks, on the one hand, since risk-taking is integral to career-building in music. On the other hand, musicians must learn to recognise when their careers in music have become harmful to them (and/or others) and make the choice to withdraw, since this is sometimes the most suitable

and prudent course of action. We acknowledge that it can be hard for musicians to take such decisions.

The focus of our argument has been musicians' individual choices and decisions but it also has implications for political economy of careers in music. Collective, social organisation for change may yield improvements to musicians' health and wellbeing by improving their working conditions. Such improvements could include an increased awareness by record labels and other stakeholders that they are potential sources of career stress and anxiety; a re-evaluation of the economics of streaming to mitigate financial precarity for the vast majority of musicians (as seen in campaigns such as #BrokenRecord); and a commitment to fair and transparent contracts.

Finally, we note the implications of our argument for music education. Educators must recognise that being a musician provides not only joy and fulfilment but also the threat of emotional damage. Nobody would want to stop young people from enjoying the many benefits associated with writing, making, and recording music, or to deny them the chance to dream; desire is hard to tame. However educators, particularly in the higher education landscape, must manage young people's expectations. This is not an easy task; most students imagine that their degrees will give them the opportunity to make careers in their chosen field, while in music (and other forms of creative) education it is most likely that they will develop financially insecure portfolio careers (Bennett & Bridgstock, 2015; Latukefu & Ginsborg, 2018). Work on expectation management among performing arts graduates (Bennett, 2009) and students of classical music at conservatoires (Duffy, 2013; Latukefu & Pollard, 2022) showed how higher education institutions could change and adapt to meet the needs of students, accommodating the realities of their future careers. One strategy was to emphasize the benefits of music-making other than writing, making, and recording music: building communities, expanding horizons, and improving health. It would be worth carrying out further research to find out how relevant these and other approaches are to popular music students in particular. We suggest that this is a population demonstrably at risk of negative long-term health outcomes, and that those responsible for the education of the musicians of the future must confront the challenges associated with careers in music, and make a concerted effort to improve these outcomes.

References

- Abbing, A. (2002). *Why are artists poor? The exceptional economy of the arts*. Amsterdam University Press.
- Ascenso, S., Williamon, A., & Perkins, R. (2016). Understanding the wellbeing of professional musicians through the lens of positive psychology. *Psychology of Music*, 45(1), 65–81. <https://doi.org/10.1177/030573561664686>
- Asmus, E. P., & Harrison, C. S. (1990). Characteristics of motivation for music and musical aptitude of undergraduate nonmusic majors. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 38, 258–268. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3345223>

- Bandura, A. (1997). *Self-efficacy: The exercise of control*. W. H. Freeman
- Baym, N. (2018). *Playing to the crowd: Musicians, audiences and the intimate work of connection*. New York University Press
- Beech, N., Gilmore, C., Hibbert, P., & Ybema, S. (2016). Identity-in-the-work and musicians' struggles: The production of self-questioning identity work. *Work, Employment and Society*, 30(3), 506–522.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0950017015620767>
- Bennett, D. (2009). Academy and the real world: Developing realistic notions of career in the performing arts. *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education*, 8(3), 309-327. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1474022209339953>
- Bennett, D. & Bridgstock, R. (2015). The urgent need for career preview: Student expectations and graduate realities in music and dance. *International Journal of Music Education*, 33(3), 263-277. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761414558653>
- Bennett, T. (2015). *Learning the Music Business: Evaluating the 'vocational turn' in music industry education – A positioning report for UK Music*. UK Music.
- Berg L., King B., Koenig J., McRoberts R. L. (2018). Popular musician responses to mental health treatment. *Medical Problems of Performing Artists*, 33(2), 124–130. <https://doi.org/10.21091/mppa.2018.2020>
- Berg, L, King, B, Koenig, J & McRoberts, R.L. (2022). Musician occupational and financial stress and mental health burden. *Psychology of Music*, 50(6), 1801-1815. <https://doi.org/10.1177/03057356211064642>
- Berlant, L. (2006). Cruel optimism. *Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies*, 17(5), 20–36. <https://doi.org/10.1215/10407391-2006-009>
- Berlant, L. (2010). Cruel Optimism, in, M. Gregg, & G.J. Seigworth (Eds.), *The affect theory reader*, (pp. 93-117). Duke University Press.
- Berlant, L. (2011). *Cruel optimism*. Duke University Press.
- Bonneville-Roussy, A., & Vallerand, R.J. (2020). Passion at the heart of musicians' well-being. *Psychology of Music*, 48(2), 163-324.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735618797180>
- Born, G., & Devine, K. (2015). Music technology, gender, and class: Digitization, educational and social change in Britain. *Twentieth-Century Music*, 12, 135–172.
<https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478572215000018>
- Bourdieu, P. (1993). *The field of cultural production: Essays on art and literature*. Columbia University Press.

- Bourke, A. (2003). The dream of being a professional soccer player: Insights on career development options of young Irish players. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 27(4), 399-419. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0193732503255478>
- Brook, O., O'Brien, D., & Taylor, M. (2020). *Culture is bad for you: Inequality and the cultural and creative industries*. Manchester University Press.
- Carver, C., Lawrence, J., & Scheier, M. (1999). Self-discrepancies and affect: Incorporating the role of feared selves. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 25, 783–792. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167299025007002>
- Carver, C.S., Scheier, M.F., & Segerstrom, S.C. (2010). Optimism. *Clinical Psychology Review*, 30(7), 879-889. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpr.2010.01.006>
- Carver, C.S., Scheier, M.F., & Weintraub, J.K. (1989). Assessing coping strategies: A theoretically based approach. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 56, 267-283. <https://doi.org/10.1037//0022-3514.56.2.267>
- Casey, E. (2008). *Women, pleasure and the gambling experience*. Routledge.
- Caves, R.E. (2003). Contracts between art and commerce. *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 17(2), 73-84. <https://doi.org/10.1257/089533003765888430>
- Cloonan, M. (2012). Selling the experience: The world-views of British concert promoters. *Creative Industries Journal*, 5(1&2), 151-170. https://doi.org/10.1386/cij.5.1-2.151_1
- Cloud, W., & Granfield, R. (2008). Conceptualizing recovery capital: Expansion of a theoretical construct. *Substance use & misuse*, 43(12-13), 1971-1986. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10826080802289762>
- Cox, J., Maltzahn, K., Lee, H., Whiteside, M., & Maclean, S. (2022). Bingo, gender and the moral order of the household: Everyday gambling in a migrant community. *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 22(4), 852–869. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14695405211022082>
- Creech, A., Papageorgi, I., Duffy, C., Morton, F., Hadden, E., Potter, J., & Welch, G. (2008). From music student to professional: The process of transition. *British Journal of Music Education*, 25(3), 315–331. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051708008127>
- Détari, A., Egermann, H., Bjerkeset, O., & Vaag, J. (2020). Psychosocial work environment among musicians and in the general workforce in Norway. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 11, 1315. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.01315>
- Dumbreck, A. & McPherson, G. (2016). *Music entrepreneurship*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Dobrow, S. (2012). Dynamics of calling: A longitudinal study of musicians. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 34, 431-452. <https://doi.org/10.1002/job.1808>

Dobrow Riza, S., & Heller, D. (2015). Follow your heart or your head? A longitudinal study of the fascinating role of calling and ability in the pursuit of a challenging career. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 100(3), 695–712.

<https://doi.org/10.1037/a0038011>

Duffy, B.E. (2016). The romance of work: Gender and aspirational labour in the digital culture industries. *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 19(4), 441-457.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1367877915572186>

Duffy, C. (2013). Negotiating with tradition: Curriculum reform and institutional transition in a conservatoire. *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education*, 12(2-3), 169-180. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1474022212473527>

D'Aoust, A.M. (2013) 'Take a chance on me': Premediation, technologies of love and marriage migration management. In M. Geiger, & A. Pécoud (Eds.), *Disciplining the transnational mobility of people*, (pp. 103-125). Springer.

Fitzgerald, E. (1940) Taking a chance on love [Song] On *Cabin in the sky*. Decca Records

Forsyth, A., Lennox, J., & Emslie, C. (2016). 'That's cool, you're a musician and you drink': Exploring entertainers' accounts of their unique workplace relationship with alcohol. *International Journal of Drug Policy*, 36(2), 85–94.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugpo.2016.07.001>

Gagné, F. (2017) The integrative model of talent development (IMTD): From theory to educational applications. In J. A. Plucker, A. N. Rinn, & M. C. Makel (Eds.), *From giftedness to gifted education: Reflecting theory in practice* (pp. 149-182). Prufrock Press Inc.

Gibson, G., & Sanbonmatsu, D.M. (2004). Optimism, pessimism, and gambling: The downside of optimism. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 30(2), 149-160.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167203259929>

Gross, S., & Musgrave, G. (2016). Can music make you sick? Music and depression. A Study into the incidence of musicians' mental health. Part 1 – Pilot survey report, *Help Musicians UK/MusicTank*.

Gross, S., & Musgrave, G. (2017). Can music make you sick? Music and depression. A Study into the incidence of musicians' mental health. Part 2 - Qualitative study and recommendations, *Help Musicians UK/MusicTank*

Gross, S., & Musgrave, G. (2020). *Can music make you sick? Measuring the price of musical ambition*. University of Westminster Press.

Hallam, S. (2017). Musical identity, learning, and teaching. In R.A.R. MacDonald, D.J. Hargeaves, & D. Miell (Eds.), *Handbook of musical identities*, (pp. 475-492). Oxford University Press.

Hallam, S., Creech, A., Papgeorgi, I., Gomes, T., Rinta, T., Varvarigou, M. & Lanipekun, J. (2016). Changes in motivation as expertise develops: Relationships with musical aspirations. *Musicae Scientiae*, 20(4), 528-550.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1029864916634420>

Hemsley-Brown, J., & Foskett, N.H. (1999). Gambling in the careers lottery: A consumer approach to career choice? *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 51(3), 421-435. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13636829900200090>

Hennion, A. (1983). The production of success: An anti-musicology of the pop song. *Popular Music*, 3, 159-193. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261143000001616>

Heyman L., Perkins R., & Araujo L. S. (2019). Examining the health and well-being experiences of singer in popular music. *Journal of Popular Music Education*, 3(2), 173–201. https://doi.org/10.1386/jpme.3.2.173_1

Hesmondhalgh, D., Osborne, R., Sun, H. & Barr, K. (2022). Music creators' earnings in the digital era, *Intellectual Property Office*:

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1020133/music-creators-earnings-report.pdf

Holm-Hadulla, R.M., & Bertolino, A. (2013). Creativity, alcohol and drug abuse: The pop icon Jim Morrison. *Psychopathology*, 47(3), 167-173.

<https://doi.org/10.1159/000354617>

Howard, J. (1993). Taking a chance on love: risk behaviour of Sydney street youth. *Journal of Paediatrics and Child Health*, 29(1), 60-65. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1440-1754.1993.tb02265.x>

Ibert, O., Jackson, G., Theel, T., & Vogelgsang, L. (2018). Uncertainty as an asset for creativity? Dynamic shifts between embracing, ignoring and fixing uncertainty: the cases of music and pharma. *Organized Creativity (Discussion Paper)*, No.18/1.

https://www.wiwiwiss.fu-berlin.de/forschung/organized-creativity/media/ibert_et_al_2018_Disc.pdf

Janosov, M., Battiston, F., & Sinatra, R. (2020). Success and luck in creative careers. *EPJ Data Science*, 9(9). <https://doi.org/10.1140/epjds/s13688-020-00227-w>

Jay-Z (2010). *Decoded*. Random House.

Kegelaers, J., Jessen, L., van Audenaerde, E., & Oudejans, R.R.D. (2022). Performers of the night: Examining the mental health of electronic music artists. *Psychology of Music*, 50(1), 69-85. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735620976985>

Kenny, D., & Asher, A. (2016). Life expectancy and cause of death in popular musicians: Is the popular musician lifestyle the road to ruin? *Medical Problems of Performing Artists*, 31(1), 37-48. <https://doi.org/10.21091/mppa.2016.1007>

Kim, E., Benson, S., & Alhaddab, T.A. (2018). A career in academia? Determinants of academic career aspirations among PhD students in one research university in

the US. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 19, 273-282. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-018-9537-6>

Kok, L.M., Vliet Vlieland, T.P.M., Fiocco, M., Kaptein, A.A., & Nelissen, R.G.H.H. (2013). Musicians' illness perceptions of musculoskeletal complaints. *Clinical Rheumatology*, 32, 487- 492. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10067-013-2199-1>

Kuehn, K., & Corrigan, T.F. (2013). Hope labour: the role of employment prospects in online social Production. *Political Economy of Communication*, 1(1), 9–25

Krueger, A.B. (2019). *Rockonomics: A backstage tour of what the music industry can teach us about economics and life*. Crown.

Längler, M., Nivala, M., & Gruber, H. (2018) Peers, parents and teachers: A case study on how popular music guitarists perceive support for expertise development from “persons in the shadows”. *Musicae Scientiae*, 22(2), 224-243

Latukefu, L., & Ginsborg, J. (2018) Understanding what we mean by portfolio training in music. *British Journal of Music Education*, 36(1), 87-102. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051718000207>

Latukefu, L., & Pollard, J. (2022). How can we prepare music students for early career challenges? *British Journal of Music Education*, 39(2), 218-231. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051722000122>

Lewis, M., Weight, E., & Hendricks, K. (2022). Teaching methods that foster self-efficacy belief: Perceptions of collegiate musicians from the United States. *Psychology of Music*, 50(3), 878-894. <https://doi.org/10.1177/03057356211026744>

Lingo, E.L., & Tepper, S.J. (2013). Looking back, looking forward: Arts-based careers and creative work. *Work and Occupations*, 40(4), 337-363. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0730888413505229>

Loveday, C., Musgrave, G., & Gross, S. (2023). Predicting anxiety, depression and wellbeing in professional and nonprofessional musicians. *Psychology of Music*, 51(2), 508-522. <https://doi.org/10.1177/03057356221096506>

Lucas, G.M., Gratch, J., Cheng, L., & Marsella, S. (2015). When the going gets tough: Grit predicts costly perseverance. *Journal of Research in Personality*, 59, 15-22. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrp.2015.08.004>

MacNamara, A., Holmes, P., & Collins, D. (2006). The pathway to excellent: the role of psychological characteristics in negotiating the challenges of musical development. *British Journal of Music Education*, 23(3), 285-302. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051706007066>

Maltzahn, K., Vaughan, R., Griffin, T., Thomas, D., Stephens, R., Whiteside, M., & Maclean, S. (2019). Pleasures and risks associated with bingo playing in an Australian Aboriginal community: Lessons for policy and intervention. *Journal of Gambling Studies*, 35, 653-670. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10899-018-9779-6>

Mann, K. (2003). 'Sit anywhere you like, we're all friends together': reflections on bingo culture, Goldsmiths Anthropology Research Papers, GARP8.

<https://www.gold.ac.uk/media/documents-by-section/departments/anthropology/garp/GARP8.pdf>

McPherson, G. E., & McCormick, J. (2006). Self-efficacy and performing music. *Psychology of Music*, 34, 322–336. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735606064841>

Menger, P. (1999). Artistic labor markets and careers. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 25, 541-574. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.25.1.541>

Menger, P. (2006). Artistic labor markets contingent work, excess supply and occupational risk management. In V.A. Ginsburg, & D. Throsby. (Eds.), *Handbook of the economics of art and culture*, (pp. 765-811). North-Holland.

Miller, W.R. & Rollnick, S. (1991). *Motivational interviewing: Preparing people to change addictive behaviour*. The Guildford Press.

Miller, K.E. & Quigley, B.M. (2011). Sensation-seeking, performance genres and substance use amongst musicians. *Psychology of Music*, 40(4), 389-410.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735610387776>

Moxey, L. & Daniel, R. (2023). Reimagining careers in unpropitious creative fields through the meta-creativity of alternative creativity: Implication for the music industry. *Creativity Studies*, 16(1), 241-254. <https://doi.org/10.3846/cs.2023.14916>

Mulligan, M. (2014) 'The death of the long tail: The superstar music economy', *Media Insights and Decisions in Action (MIDIa) Research*.

<https://www.midiaresearch.com/downloads/the-death-of-the-long-tail-the-super-star-music-economy>

Musgrave, G. (2023a). Musicians, their wellbeing and their relationships: Creative labour, relational work. *Poetics*, 96, 101762.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.poetic.2023.101762>

Musgrave, G. (2023b). Music and wellbeing vs. musicians' wellbeing: examining the paradox of music-making positively impacting wellbeing but musicians suffering from poor mental health. *Cultural Trends*, 32(3), 280-295.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/09548963.2022.2058354>

Neff, G., Wissinger, E., & Zukin, S. (2005). Entrepreneurial labor among cultural producers: "Cool" jobs in "hot" Industries. *Social Semiotics*, 15(3), 307–334.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/10350330500310111>

Newsinger, J., & Serafini, P. (2019). Performative resilience: How the arts and culture support austerity in post-crisis capitalism. *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 24(2), 589-605. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1367549419886038>

Nytch, J. (2018). *The entrepreneurial muse: Inspiring your career in classical music*. Oxford University Press.

Oliveira, G.P., Silva, M.O., Seufitelli, D.B., Barbosa, G.R.G., Melo, B.C., & Moro, M.M. (2023). Hot streaks in the music industry: identifying and characterizing above-average success periods in artists' careers. *Scientometrics*.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11192-023-04835-x>

Oyserman, D., & James, L. (2011). Possible identities. In S. J. Schwartz, K. Luyckx, & V. L. Vignoles (Eds.), *Handbook of identity research*, (pp. 117–145). Springer.

O'Donoghue, F. (1999). *Scouting for Glory*. Firebird.

Phillips, A., Silvia, P., & Paradise, M. (2007). The undesired self and emotional experience: A latent variable analysis. *Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology*, 26, 1035–1047. <https://doi.org/10.1521/jscp.2007.26.9.1035>

Pitts, S. E., Davidson, J. W., & McPherson, G. E. (2000). Models of success and failure in instrumental learning: Case studies of young players in the first 20 months of learning. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 146, 51–69.

Raeburn, S.D. (2000). Psychological issues and treatment strategies in popular musicians: A review, part 2. *Medical Problems of Performing Artists*, 15(1), 6-16.
<https://doi.org/10.21091/mppa.2000.1003>

Rollnick, S., & Miller, W.R. (1995). What is Motivational Interviewing? *Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 23(4), 325-334.
<https://doi.org/10.1017/S135246580001643X>

Rubak, S., Sandbæk, A., Lauritzen, T. & Christensen, B. (2005). Motivational interviewing: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *British Journal of General Practice*, 55, No. 513, 305-312.

Scheier, M.F., Weintraub, J.K., & Carver, C.S. (1986). Coping with stress: Divergent strategies of optimists and pessimists. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 51, 1257-1264. <https://doi.org/10.1037//0022-3514.51.6.1257>

Schwartz, R. C. (1995). *Internal family systems therapy*. Guilford Publications.

Schwarzer, R & Luszczynska, A. (2022). Self-Efficacy. In W, Ruch., A.B. Bakker., L. Tay., & F. Gander. (Eds.) *Handbook of positive psychology assessment*, (pp. 207-218). Hogrefe Publishing GmbH.

Shaffer, H. (1989). *Compulsive gambling: Theory, research and practice*. Lexington Books.

Thorley, M. (2018). The role of failure in developing creativity in professional music recording and production. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 30, 160-170.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2018.05.002>

Vaag, J., Bjørngaard, J.H., & Bjerkeset, O. (2014). Specific demands and resources in the career of the Norwegian freelance musician. *Arts and Health*, 6(3), 1–18.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/17533015.2013.863789>

Vaag, J., Bjørngaard, J. H., & Bjerkeset, O. (2016a). Symptoms of anxiety and depression among Norwegian musicians compared to the general workforce. *Psychology of Music*, 44(2), 234–248.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735614564910>

Vaag, J., Bjørngaard, J.H., & Bjerkeset, O. (2016b). Use of psychotherapy and psychotropic medication among Norwegian musicians compared to the general workforce. *Psychology of Music*, 44(6), 1439–1453.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/03057356166371>

Visser, A., Lee, M., Barringham, T., & Salehi, N. (2022). Out of tune: Perceptions of, engagement with, and responses to mental health interventions by professional popular musicians – A scoping review. *Psychology of Music*, 50(3), 691-1002.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/03057356211019477>

Walker, M.B. (1992). *The Psychology of gambling*. Pergamon.

Yakovenko, I., Quigley, L., Hemmelgarn, B.R., Hodgins, D.C. and Ronksley, P. (2015). The efficacy of motivational interviewing for disordered gambling: Systematic review and meta-analysis. *Addictive Behaviors*, 43, 72-82.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.addbeh.2014.12.011>

Zembylas, M., & Keet, A. (2019). *Critical human rights education: Advancing social-justice-oriented educational praxes*. Springer Nature.

ⁱ The title of our paper is inspired by that of Gibson and Sanbonmatsu (“The downside of optimism”), although we have reframed it more negatively.