

In the name of God, Most Gracious, Most Merciful

*May the peace and blessings of God be on all His Apostles and their families and
companions*

An inquiry into the work values endorsed in two Pakistani MBA programmes

Sara Khan

Submitted for the for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy,

Management School, Lancaster University

May 2006 / Rabiut-Thani 1427 AH.

ProQuest Number: 11003687

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.



ProQuest 11003687

Published by ProQuest LLC (2018). Copyright of the Dissertation is held by the Author.

All rights reserved.

This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code
Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

ProQuest LLC.
789 East Eisenhower Parkway
P.O. Box 1346
Ann Arbor, MI 48106 – 1346

DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY OF WORK

I declare that this work is entirely my own effort and has not been submitted earlier for the award of any higher degree.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I humbly thank God Almighty for allowing me an opportunity to carry out this research. I am also greatly indebted to Professor Michael Reynolds for supervising this study and helping me throughout the project with not only his academic counsels but also his words of encouragement. I also express my heartfelt gratitude to my research participants and the staff of the two business schools who kindly consented to participate in this research project and extended to me all the help I needed in this endeavour. My colleagues in the Department of Management Learning continually gave valuable suggestions and academic support for which I am very thankful to them. I am also sincerely grateful to Lancaster University Management School and the Universities UK, for offering me financial support throughout the study and enabling me to carry out this project. Finally, I would like to thank all of my family members for supporting me with their kind words and prayers throughout the period of my study.

ABSTRACT

This research explores the work values endorsed in the present day MBA programmes of two Pakistani business schools. By shedding light on some of the values MBA students exhibit with regard to their own selves, their careers, their colleagues, and the society at large, this research comments on the work values endorsed by these programmes and the extent to which they are in harmony with Islamic teachings. Thus a contribution of this piece of work lies in exploring the work values MBA students employ in their day-to-day lives and in raising questions about the potential social impact of the Pakistani MBA.

Traditional MBA education is often considered to be influenced by technicist-managerialist thinking that pays only a little attention to ethical and emotional values. It is also seen as a Western, particularly an American dominated educational system which in the spirit of imperialism marginalizes views and values of other cultures. Seeing Pakistan as a Muslim country, with a colonial past and an MBA education that is influenced by the Western, particularly the American model, I have thus taken a postcolonial perspective to study whether the values endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes are reflective of these two discourses or do they also exhibit harmony with traditional Islamic values.

Using in-depth interviews of various stakeholders in the MBA education (students, teachers, school administrators, as well as managers in industry), supported by observations around school campuses and reading of official publications sent out by

my case study schools, I have revealed that technicist-managerialism and American colonialism are indeed evident in the MBA programmes of my chosen schools. At the same time, Islamic influence in these schools does not seem significant. Since both the discourses of technicist-managerialism and Western colonialism have roots in secularism and since the values do not exhibit a significant Islamic influence, I conclude that the current MBA education in the two business schools is more in harmony with secular rather than Islamic ideals.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	2
1.1	Finding my research topic	2
1.2	Explaining the topic and scope of my research	3
1.2.1	Explicating important terms and the scope of the research topic	3
1.2.1	Relationship between education and culture (including values)	7
1.2.3	Relationship between MBA education and culture (including values)	9
1.3	Methodology used in the research	11
1.4	Contribution and purpose of the study	11
1.5	Organization of the thesis	13
2.0	CHAPTER 2: THE MBA CURRICULUM AS A TRANSMITTER OF VALUES	17
2.1	The growth of the MBA degree	18
2.2	Technicist-managerialist thinking in the MBA curricula	23
2.2.1	Fostering technicist-managerialist thinking through pedagogy	24
2.2.2	Fostering technicist-managerialist thinking through catering to market requirements	28
2.2.3	Critiquing technicist-managerialist thinking	30
2.2.4	Some consequences of technicist managerialist thinking	33
2.3	Westernization or colonization?	35
2.3.1	The Western curriculum	36
2.3.2	From colonization of territory to Westernization of mind	40
2.4	Rewriting the culture of the colonized: from Islam to secularism	43
2.4.1	Creating the Orient(al) through domination and misrepresentation	43
2.4.2	Education in the Muslim colonies: a case of repression and replacement	45
2.4.3	Basis of imperial authority	49
2.5	Chapter Summary	50
		53
3.0	CHAPTER 3: POSTCOLONIALISM – THE THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE OF THIS RESEARCH	
3.1	Finding my theoretical perspective	53
3.2	A history of postcolonial theory	56
3.3	The postcolonial argument	57
3.3.1	Understanding the postcolonial argument	57
3.3.2	The purpose(s) of postcolonial theory	59
3.3.3	Subjects of inquiry of postcolonialism	60
3.3.4	Responding to the colonial discourse through the <i>Minority Discourse</i>	62
3.3.5	Search for an identity: <i>cultural hybridity</i> and <i>mimicry</i>	65
3.3.6	Not a nationalistic struggle	68
3.4	Postcolonialism and other perspectives: interdisciplinarity of purpose and methodology	69

3.4.1	Postcolonialism and the discourse perspective: questions of ideology and consent	70
3.4.2	Postcolonialism and feminism: issues of domination-subordination and masculine objectivity	72
3.4.3	Postcolonialism, Marxism and post-Marxism: concept of class and the critique of capitalism	75
3.4.4	Postcolonialism and poststructuralism: significance of social construction and exclusion	76
3.4.5	Postcolonialism, modernism and postmodernism: questioning universal rationality and truth	78
3.5	Critiquing postcolonial theory	80
3.5.1	Contesting the purpose(s) of postcolonial theory	80
3.5.2	Debating ‘methodological debility’ in postcolonial theory	82
3.5.3	Critically examining the salient features of postcolonial theory	83
3.5.4	Can postcolonial theory be called a discourse?	85
3.6	Research using the postcolonial perspective	87
3.7	Chapter Summary	90
4.0	CHAPTER 4: CONTEXTUALIZING MY STUDY	94
4.1	Postcolonial Pakistan: A brief socio-economic and political history	94
4.1.1	Local influences in Pakistani socio-economic and political spheres	95
4.1.2	American influence in Pakistani socio-economic and political spheres	99
4.1.3	Pakistani society and social values today	100
4.2	Background of Management Education in Pakistan	102
4.2.1	Education in Pakistan: a socio-political and historical account	102
4.2.2	Management education in Pakistan: a socio-historical account	105
4.2.2.1	<i>The Pakistani MBA in the beginning</i>	105
4.2.2.2	<i>The Pakistani MBA today</i>	106
5.0	CHAPTER 5: METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH	116
5.1	My research problem and questions	117
5.2	Important research concepts as I understand them	118
5.3	Determining my research strategy	120
5.4	An explanation of the interpretive paradigm	122
5.5	Postcolonial theory: the theoretical perspective of the study	124
5.6	Pilot Work: what it was and how it helped	125
5.6.1	Pilot interviews	126
5.6.2	Pilot observation study	127
5.7	Research approaches taken towards the study: stakeholder analysis and the case study approach	129
5.7.1	Stakeholder analysis approach	130
5.7.2	Case study approach	132
5.7.2.1	<i>Pioneer Academy</i>	135
5.7.2.2	<i>Leaders’ Academy</i>	138
5.8	Research methods used in the study	142
5.8.1	Starting my research using observation data	144

5.8.2	Looking for research questions in official publications	148
5.8.3	The interview: my main research method	149
5.8.3.1	<i>Individual in-depth interviews</i>	153
5.8.3.2	<i>Focus group and joint interviews</i>	154
5.8.3.3	<i>Practicalities in my interview research</i>	156
5.9	My chosen method for data analysis	159
5.9.1	Method of analysis for interview data	160
5.9.2	Illustration of analysis of a theme	164
5.10	Evaluating interpretive research	166
5.10.1	Assessing the quality of qualitative research	166
5.10.1.1	<i>Reliability</i>	166
5.10.1.2	<i>Validity</i>	167
5.10.1.1	<i>Bias and objectivity</i>	168
5.10.2	Assessing generalization and implications of this research	169
5.11	Reflexivity: myself as a researcher participant	172
6.0	CHAPTER 6: INSIGHTS FROM DATA	177
6.1	From research questions to research findings	177
6.2	Values about work	185
6.2.1	Students' contrasting definitions of "a good job"	186
6.2.2	Business students' and managers' images in academia and industry	193
6.2.2.1	<i>Contrasting images of business students</i>	193
6.2.2.2	<i>Managers' images in industry</i>	198
6.2.3	Consequences of looking forward to a "good job" and harbouring certain images	200
6.2.4	Respondents' understanding of "contribut[ing] to socio-economic welfare of the country"	201
6.2.4.1	<i>Promoting social responsibility in the schools</i>	202
6.2.4.2	<i>Promoting social responsibility in industry</i>	206
6.2.5	Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people"	207
6.2.5.1	<i>Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people" in academia</i>	208
6.2.5.2	<i>Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people" in industry</i>	233
6.2.6	Section summary	236
6.3	Development of the curricula	238
6.3.1	How are the curricula formulated?	239
6.3.2	How are the curricula taught?	241
6.3.3	Research in the two business schools	247
6.3.4	Interaction between business academia and industry	248
6.3.5	Section summary	250
6.4	Non-Islamic (secular) element in the business schools (and organizations)	251
6.4.1	" <i>Liberal</i> " and " <i>Western</i> " values in contrast to "Islamic" values	252
6.4.2	The challenge for ethical and religious subjects in the MBA curricula	254
6.4.3	Section summary	258
6.5	Chapter summary	259

7.0	CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSIONS ON THE THEMATIC FINDINGS IN THE LIGHT OF LITERATURES	265
7.1	Values and ideas about success	267
7.2	Promoting social responsibility	273
7.3	Other professional and interpersonal work values used by students	277
7.4	Chapter Summary	288
8.0	CHAPTER 8: MAJOR ISSUES EMERGING FROM THE FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS	293
8.1	A comparison of the students' and the Islamic conceptions of work	294
8.1.1	The Islamic conception of work	294
8.1.2	Students' conception of work	299
8.1.2.1	<i>Values and ideas about success</i>	299
8.1.2.2	<i>Promoting social responsibility</i>	302
8.1.2.3	<i>Other professional and interpersonal values part of students' work ethics</i>	303
8.2	Technicist-managerialist and secular thinking in the MBA curricula	306
8.2.1	Technicist-managerialist thinking in the MBA curricula	306
8.2.2	Secular thinking in the MBA curricula	311
8.2.2.1	<i>What is secularism?</i>	311
8.2.2.2	<i>A history of the concept of secularism</i>	311
8.2.2.3	<i>What has secularism led to?</i>	314
8.2.2.4	<i>Secularism in the MBA programmes</i>	315
8.3	Individualism in the MBA curricula	317
8.4	Academia and management's responses to addressing problems in present day management education and work values	326
8.5	Colonialism in the MBA curricula	331
8.6	Chapter Summary	344
9.0	CHAPTER 9: CONCLUSIONS	347
9.1	Recap of research and its results	347
9.2	Critiquing this research	356
9.2.1	Strengths (including contribution) and limitations of the research topic	356
9.2.2	Strengths and limitations of the theoretical perspective	358
9.2.3	Strengths and limitations of the literature	360
9.2.4	Strengths and limitations of the methodology	361
9.3	Directions for future research	362
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	364
	INDEX OF TABLES	
1	Sample frame of managers interviewed in industry	158
2	A comparison of values mentioned by respondents	290

1.0	CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	2
1.1	Finding my research topic	2
1.2	Explaining the topic and scope of my research	3
1.2.1	Explicating important terms and the scope of the research topic	3
1.2.2	Relationship between education and culture (including values)	7
1.2.3	Relationship between MBA education and culture (including values)	9
1.3	Methodology used in the research	11
1.4	Contribution and purpose of the study	11
1.5	Organization of the thesis	13

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Finding my research topic

My research was motivated by the kind of questions that had been coming into my mind for a while, such as why are MBA students often considered confident and progressive, but also materialistic and elitist? What kind of work values are Pakistani MBA curricula promoting? Are these values in harmony with Islam or do they relate only to achieving personal goals? With my more than twelve years of experience in Pakistani MBA programmes, in various positions, such as student, teacher, and administrator, as well as a manager in industry, I had also noticed the lack of an ethical, in my case Islamic, perspective in the MBA curricula of my country. These issues were either neglected or given very little attention in comparison to core management subjects. Moreover, the curricula I had been acquainted with appeared to me to follow the lead of world renowned business schools and propound the ideas and values of these institutions, sometimes without regard to their suitability to the culture and context of Pakistan. These thoughts had been disturbing me because I felt that management education, that closely and widely affected people, could not afford to ignore the values it wittingly or unwittingly endorsed in its students. These concerns pre-occupied me till I became conscious of the fact that as an academic of the Muslim world, it was my responsibility to inquire into the values and ideas we endorsed in our business schools. This gave me the topic for my research:

An inquiry into the work values endorsed in two Pakistani MBA programmes

It also framed my main research question:

How far are the values about work endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes in harmony with the teachings of Islam?

1.2 Explaining the topic and scope of my research

In the following paragraphs I explain my research topic in more detail before beginning a detailed study of it.

1.2.1 Explicating important terms and scope of the research topic

My title ‘An inquiry...’ emphasizes that my research is only one of the possible *inquiries* that could have been made into this topic. It is not a truth but an *interpretation*. I am interested in exploring what are some of the values endorsed in these programmes and the underlying value systems and/or educational discourses that these values are a part of. The aim is not to underrate benefits of the MBA degree but to present a critique of the values it endorses.

My study revolves around only *work* values, rather than all that could possibly be endorsed in MBA programmes. The word *values* requires some examination because it is a key term of my study. Therefore I leave it to the last.

I am interested in critiquing the values that are being *endorsed* in MBA programmes. In other words, I am seeing the MBA curriculum as one of the transmitters of certain values, rather than as a source of these values.

Moreover, I am looking at the current MBA degree (including the period of the last two to three years of MBA education in Pakistan). However, I have mentioned historical influences (related to management education and otherwise), particularly which still seem active, on the two schools, in order to present my data in context.

My study relates to two MBA programmes in Pakistan. I do not claim to represent the entire Pakistani MBA or the whole management education system of the country. However, in my writing I have referred frequently to the contemporary MBA not to claim expertise over it but to show its relationship to the MBA programmes of my chosen case schools and to give a context of my findings.

I mentioned earlier that I am keen to find out not only some of the values endorsed in the MBA programmes, but also the value systems and/or educational discourses they are a part of. I am specifically interested in knowing how these values fit into the Islamic work values. Thus, by the terms *how far* and *harmony* in the main research question, I intend to discuss the extent to which the values and ideas endorsed in the MBA programmes are reflective of Islamic teachings (that will be presented in *chapters 7 and 8*). By doing so, I do not want to devalue the contribution made by these schools to management education in Pakistan, but to raise questions about areas, for example, the potential social impact of these values, so as to enable them to address the socio-cultural needs of the country more effectively.

Now I return to describe my understanding of *values*. Since values are generally understood to be part of culture (as I explain below), I find it suitable to first discuss the concept of culture. A fairly well known definition of culture given by Hofstede (1984: 21) is

the interactive aggregate of common characteristics that influence a human group's response to its environment...It is a collective programming of the mind which distinguishes one human group from another.

Schein's (1992:12) definition seems closer to my study. He defines culture as

A pattern of shared basic assumptions that the group learned as it solved its problems of external adaptation and internal integration, that has worked well enough to be considered valid and, therefore, to be taught to new members as the correct way to perceive, think and feel in relationship to those problems.

According to him, there are three levels of culture:

- basic underlying assumptions, which are the source of values and include shared meanings, habits of thinking;
- espoused values, including philosophies;
- artefacts, which include all espoused values (as in official publications), symbols, office layout, language and customs.

Culture change is a matter of 'engineering' values, write Westwood and Kirkbride (1998).

Defining values is at least as problematic as defining culture. Murphy and Davey (2002) note in their paper that a variety of understandings of the word 'values,' ranging from attitudes, motivations, measurable quantities, objects, affect-laden customs or traditions, substantive areas of behaviour, and relationships such as those between individuals, groups, objects, events are found in literature. The Collins Dictionary of Sociology (Jary

and Jary, 1991) sees values as 'ethical ideals.' 'Value is a broad tendency to prefer certain states of affairs over others,' says Hofstede (1984:18). Several scholars consider values as general beliefs that define right and wrong (see for example, Rashid and Ho, 2003).

After considering all these definitions of *values*, I see them as tendencies to prefer certain states of affairs over others, where these tendencies have worked well for solving one's problems and are indicative of one's morals or habits of distinguishing right from wrong. Values provide a way of looking at the world and its people (Zeffane and Rugimbana, 1995). They are the instruments through which we think and feel and interpret and experience the world (Schumacher, 1973). Hence they affect attitudes about the form of behaviour considered appropriate and effective in any given situation (Rashid and Ho, 2003). Values have a size and a sign and a norm. Those held by the majority of a group could be non-rational, mutually related, and conflicting at times (Hofstede, 1984). Moreover, new values can replace, complement or modify existing ones (Westwood and Kirkbride, 1998).

Heath (2002) differentiates between three types of values: personal (such as integrity and wisdom), teamwork (for example, loyalty and care) and public spirited (for example, justice and fair play). Murphy and Davey (2002:18) distinguish between two main types of values: terminal values, 'denoting ultimate goals or desirable end-states,' such as wisdom or happiness, and instrumental values, 'concerning desirable modes of behaviour for the attainment of desirable end-states,' for example, behaving responsibly or honestly.

Murphy and Davey (2002:18) present a further classification of organizational values – beliefs held by an individual or group regarding the means and ends that organizations identify in the running of business – functional and elitist. Functional values refer to explicit guides for members' behaviour, focusing on particular goals, functions or styles of work, such as 'customer is king,' 'quality is job one,' while elitist values emphasize the superiority or importance of the organization itself, for instance 'we are number one' or 'name is enough identification.'

Having outlined my understanding of culture and values, I discuss in the next section how these constructs are related to education.

1.2.2 Relationship between education and culture (including values)

In the opinion of Bourdieu and Passeron (1990), seeing an educational system only as a reflection of the state of an economic system or the direct expression of a value system of the society is to refuse to see its social function. Education is the process through which a culture is historically reproduced, through producing a *habitus* – durable training capable of perpetuating itself even after pedagogic action has ceased (p. 31). Education, seen in this way, is the 'equivalent in the cultural order of the transmission of genetic capital in the biological order' (p. 32). Mohanty (1994:147) writes

The academy and the classroom itself are not mere sites of instruction. They are also political and cultural sites that represent accommodations and contestations over knowledge by differently empowered social constituencies.

In line with the above argument, Hofstede (1984) sees institutions as not only spreading social norms, but also considers social norms as influencing these institutions in turn. For

example, Castea (2000) says that seeing organizations as a system of production rather than as manifestations of human practices situated in diverse historical and cultural horizons is taking a functionalist understanding of human agency, of man as an economic being. This is a very limited picture of economics. Zeffane and Rugimbana (1995) also assert that even economic goals and incentives are culturally defined in that they ultimately 'derive their evaluation from an individual's interpretation of social values.'

Regarding the relationship between education and culture, Husain and Ashraf (1979) report that the First World Conference on Muslim Education, 1977, in Makkah, which was attended by 313 Muslim scholars from all over the world, had reiterated unanimously that the aim of education is to produce a 'good and righteous man' (p. 42), for the Quran (chapter 95) says that man is in the best of moulds when he believes in God and obeys Him and at his worst when in disbelief and rebellion to God. Hence, according to Khusro (1979), the ex-Vice Chancellor of the Aligarh University, India, every education system, particularly an Islamic one, must have a value system to impart to its students. Since Islamic education does not differentiate between forms of education, but rather sees them as interrelated, such education can not be given in a society that has lost its religious moorings. Hence what is needed to bridge the religious-secular gap is 'a common system through which the transmission of values could be integrated with the development of new skills and techniques' (Husain and Ashraf, 1979:3).

The above arguments indicated to me a potent link between education and culture and inspired me to take a deeper look into the topic of the transmission of values, first in literature and then through my field work. Values are usually not transmitted through

formal written procedures but diffused through informal means, such as stories and metaphors, writes Hussaini (1989). Lee et al (2004) and Murphy and Davey (2002) show in their research that the most effective way to reinforce company values is CEO behaviour and corporate strategy. As several executives in Murphy and Davey's (2002) research stated, it was the actions that inculcated values, not words (whether on mission statements or appraisal forms). Westwood and Kirkbride (1998) also assert, after their research on international corporate strategies of effecting cultural change, that there is rarely a 'monolithic imposition' of one system upon another. Instead of merely assimilation or eradication, usually strategies of 'appropriation, adaptation, mimesis and hybridity' are used.

In the next section, I will describe the education-culture relationship specifically from the point of view of MBA education.

1.2.3 Relationship between MBA education and culture (including values)

Several management scholars believe that management theory is significantly influenced by the culture of the place it takes form in. Conversely, laden with values, it in turn affects the values of its recipients. Hofstede (1984), for example, observes that there is no such thing as a culture-free theory of management. Ali (1995) also believes that other factors, such as 'language, history, religion, traditions and values, and external environment,' contribute to the development of management theory.

With regard to MBA programmes as transmitters of ethical values, Roy and Roy (2004:22) write

Experience, practice, and fundamentals that are taught in MBA programs provide the framework within which MBA graduates later make choices as managers. So the material covered in an MBA program becomes important to engage and prepare a new generation of business leaders to be responsible – and ethical – corporate citizens.

Some studies have demonstrated the above effect of MBA curriculum on students' values. For example, a study by the Aspen Institute concluded that students enter business schools with idealistic ambitions, such as creating quality products, but by the time they graduate, their priorities, for example regarding boosting share prices, have sidelined their goals¹ (Schneider, 2002).

With this understanding of the reciprocal effect of values and education on each other, I proceeded with my research on MBA education in Pakistan. The research questions I have explored in my study are:

- Which main values are encouraged in business schools?
- What kinds of careers do students look forward to after completing their MBA degree?
- How do respondents comment on the curricula of business schools, especially on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility?

¹ This study included 1,978 MBAs who graduated in 2001 from 13 top business schools of North America. When asked what a company's priorities should be, 75% said maximizing shareholder value, 71% chose satisfying customers, and 33% said producing high-quality goods and services. Only 5% thought environmentalism should be a top goal; just 25% said creating value for their communities. But two years earlier, when the students started the business school, 68% cited shareholder value; 75% customer satisfaction; and 43% quality goods and services.

1.3 Methodology used in the research

An interpretive inquiry, this research is a study of values and ideas endorsed in MBA curricula in Pakistan, and the extent to which these values are in harmony with Islamic teachings. Taking a postcolonial perspective and using a case study approach, informed by stakeholder analysis, I have based my study on in-depth interviews of business school students and teachers, and managers in industry. To supplement these findings and to understand the context of data better, I have also conducted observations in business schools and read the schools' official publications. Interview data is analysed using the qualitative method put forward by Richard Hycner (1985). Relevant extracts from observation and textual data are subsequently added to it to form a complete theme. Islamic teachings and works of management and postcolonial scholars are then brought in to present a discussion on the findings about work values and highlight main streams of thought emanating from them.

1.4 Contribution and purpose of the study

The above paragraphs discussed the impact of educational culture on the values of students. This being the case, I believe educators should feel responsible for the kinds of values they transmit to their students. Transmission of cultural values and beliefs is to me the major purpose of education. We need to take the MBA programme as a total human experience, not just a curriculum to be taught, says Leavitt (2001). Believing that character education is needed to foster social and emotional development, to develop a sense of self, resolve conflicts in personal values, and gain moral strength to become

socially responsible community members (Gary, 2003), a limited contribution of my research lies in inquiring into the potential social impact of the Pakistani MBA and into the values some of these MBA programmes are endorsing. It appeared to me that previous research on the MBA and other management degrees had concentrated on their curriculum content, saw how MBA graduates adjusted to practical business life, investigated dominant models in MBA thought, and commented on the feasibility of various teaching methodologies used in these programmes. If values were talked about, they were usually from the standpoint of social responsibility, more so since the Enron, Arthur Anderson, Tyco and other corporate scandals had highlighted the need for socially responsible behaviour (I have referred to these kinds of studies in various parts of my paper). What I found missing were studies that could look into the day-to-day values exhibited by MBAs with regard to their own selves, their careers, their colleagues, and the society at large. This is what I have endeavoured to research through my study. By doing so, I hope to encourage management educators and programme developers to think about the potential social impact of their MBA programmes, design curricula that reflect ethical, especially Islamic, concerns more strongly (that is recover the Islamic values in the management curricula) and consequently address socio-cultural needs of Pakistan more effectively. It is hoped that this research can also be of use to other educators and policy makers in reflecting on the philosophies and social repercussions of their programmes of study.

1.5 Organization of the thesis

This study comprises nine chapters. It has been introduced in this first chapter, with a statement on my understanding of the topic, along with the scope and purpose of the research project. It also gives a brief idea of the methodology that is used to carry it out. Following is a summary of the remaining eight chapters:

Chapter 2 takes a look into the history of and discourses in the current MBA, how it was initiated in the United States of America and from there spread to the rest of the world. Investigating how the MBA curriculum could transmit values, I noticed in my readings the prevalence of a technicist-managerialist thinking in the contemporary MBA programmes. This mode of thinking is considered by many scholars to neglect the human and moral side of management and endorse certain values and ideas and obfuscate others. I also found the dominance of the Western, particularly the American, model in the MBA programmes of today. Having a marked similarity to colonial imperialism, Westernization in management theory has been blamed for ignoring other cultures and their values or representing them in a distorted light. Since both these discourses have been said to influence the culture of MBA programmes, I considered them significant for studying the kinds of values MBA programmes were endorsing in Pakistan.

In *chapter 3* I lead into the postcolonial argument, by building on the discussion on Westernization/colonization presented in *chapter 2*. Here I explain my understanding of the postcolonial perspective, debates around its features, its relationship to other theoretical and philosophical perspectives and to the two above mentioned discourses

(technicist-managerialist and Westernization/Americanization), and my reason for selecting it as my research perspective.

A literature review of the topic is carried into the fourth chapter as well. Whereas in the second chapter, I dealt with the MBA in general, in *chapter 4* I narrow my focus to Pakistan. Beginning with a brief history of Pakistan, I come to the introduction of the MBA degree in the country. I then appraise the current situation of management education in Pakistan.

Chapter 5 is a detailed discussion on the methodology of this research. In addition to describing the research approach (as stated above in *section 1.3*), I revisit my research questions and theoretical perspective to present an argument for the use of particular research methods. I also introduce the two schools whose values I am interested in looking at closely and give an account of my role as a researcher participant in this study.

My research findings, including those from interviews, observations and readings of school publications, are presented in *chapter 6*. Bearing in mind this is a qualitative study, I have not used any tables or statistics to chart out my findings. Instead I have presented extracts from interviews (following the model of Hycner, 1985) and publications, as well as notes from my fieldwork, in the form of four *themes*. These four themes address the various values and ideas found in business schools. This chapter also contains comments of respondents on the curricula as well as the non-Islamic element in their schools.

An illumination of the themes, in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures, is laid out in *chapter 7*. Here, using a postcolonial lens, I relate the discourses of technicist-managerialism and colonialism specifically to my research findings. I then present Islamic teachings to enable the reader to see for him/herself the harmony between the values endorsed in the two MBA programmes and those put forward by Islam.

In *chapter 8* I look broadly at all the research data together. Continuing illumination on the thematic findings, in the light of Islamic teachings, I offer a brief sketch of the Islamic conception of work. In comparison to the current one, as described by my respondents in the expression of their values, this sheds further light on the differences and similarities between the respondents' set of values and those envisaged in Islam. I also look at respondents' views regarding the curricula and the non-Islamic element in their schools, along with the four thematic findings, to see if technicist-managerialism, colonialism or any other major trends underlie respondents' value systems.

The study is finally concluded in *chapter 9*. This small chapter recapitulates the research questions and answers them in the light of themes and trends emerging from the study and then puts forward some critique and implications of this research.

2.0	CHAPTER 2: THE MBA CURRICULUM AS A TRANSMITTER OF VALUES	17
2.1	The growth of the MBA degree	18
2.2	Technicist-managerialist thinking in the MBA curricula	23
2.2.1	Fostering technicist-managerialist thinking through pedagogy	24
2.2.2	Fostering technicist-managerialist thinking through catering to market requirements	28
2.2.3	Critiquing technicist-managerialist thinking	30
2.2.4	Some consequences of technicist managerialist thinking	32
2.3	Westernization or colonization?	35
2.3.1	The Western curriculum	36
2.3.2	From colonization of territory to Westernization of mind	40
2.4	Rewriting the culture of the colonized: from Islam to secularism	43
2.4.1	Creating the Orient(al) through domination and misrepresentation	43
2.4.2	Education in the Muslim colonies: a case of repression and replacement	45
2.4.3	Basis of imperial authority	49
2.5	Chapter Summary	50

CHAPTER 2: THE MBA CURRICULUM AS A TRANSMITTER OF VALUES

As outlined in the introductory chapter, the questions that I was looking to answer about the MBA degree related to its endorsement of certain values about work and neglect of certain others. I also mentioned that I found this disturbing because I believed that management education with its widespread and long-term repercussions could not afford to overlook ethical and, from my point of view, Islamic concerns. This led me to take a critical look into the thinking in the present day MBA curricula (including teaching methodology and student-teacher interaction) to see how they could act as a transmitter of values. In my readings, I came across two discourses in the thinking of the contemporary MBA programmes – the technicist-managerialist discourse and the Western or colonial discourse – that I felt I could use to address my research questions.

As I studied these discourses, I found that the first of these sees management in an objective, unemotional light and in so doing overlooks the human and moral values in it. In fact, it divides the realm of management into public and private, emotional and rational, and religious and non-religious. The second sees management as dominated by a Western, particularly the American, point of view and in so doing neglects other voices and hence other cultures and values in management thought. This dominance of American thought in current management literature reminds many management scholars, such as Prasad and Cavanaugh (1997), Mills and Hatfield (1999), and Banarjee and Linstead (2001), of the eighteenth and nineteenth century imperialism in Western colonies. Like the colonial powers which repressed and/or misrepresented the cultures and values of the races they colonized, American management scholarship is considered

to ignore or stereotype cultures and contributions from other countries. Challenging this marginalization of other cultures so as to impose one's own over them is one of the basic premises of postcolonial theory, as I will explain later in the chapter. By promoting certain ideas and values and demoting others, I believe, both of these discourses could have been instrumental in shaping the MBA cultures of today.

In this chapter, after giving a brief introduction of the growth of the MBA degree, I discuss how the technicist-managerialist and the Westernization discourses could be affecting the values of participants in MBA programmes. I then build on the concept of dominance and subordination, suggested in Westernization, to lead into the postcolonial theory (which I will explain as my theoretical perspective, by linking it to both of these discourses, for study in the next chapter). This chapter gives a general introduction of these discourses in the field of management education; they are more fully discussed in *chapters 7 and 8*, where I relate the specific points in these educational philosophies to my research data.

2.1 The growth of the MBA degree

The MBA degree is among the most popular degrees not only in Pakistan but the world over. Friga et al (2003) point out that internationally undergraduate business degrees have grown from 14% of all undergraduate degrees in 1971 to 19% in 1997. For the Master of Business Administration (MBA), the figures are 11% and 23% respectively. Corporations and educational institutions spend a combined \$2.2 trillion on management education and training worldwide, with nearly \$885 billion in the United States alone. At present there

are about 1500 business schools offering MBA courses over the globe (anonymous, 2005).

Management education was initially introduced in the North American business school of Wharton in 1881, followed by the schools in Harvard in 1908 and Stanford in 1925. Concerns about the quality of business education in the early 1950s led to the commissioning of two influential reports, the Carnegie Report and the Ford Report, by the US government, which recommended changes to the business education curriculum. The American Assembly of Collegiate Schools for Business (AACSB) implemented the recommendations of these reports in 1961 by introducing 'standards' for business education masters courses, and in these standards the term 'MBA degree' was first used (Currie and Knights, 2003). A reason they had the word *Administration*, rather than *Management* in the title was because of the influence of civil or bureaucratic governments in school affairs and because MBAs were needed to run statistical operations in administration (Fox, 2001).

The MBA was heavily publicized outside the United States of America, to both the developed as well as the developing world, soon after the threat of European colonization began receding and that of communism appeared to strengthen its hold. They were disseminated to Europe, through the Marshall Plans of 1950-60s (Fox, 2001), to arrest the growth of communism. Clegg et al (2000:106) observe

That the world would be ideologically safe for capitalism – the American version, at least – was not left to chance. Following the First World War, the major US charitable foundations – Ford, Carnegie, and Rockefeller – pursued an intellectual agenda for shaping social science in the United States and Europe.

In Europe, the European Productivity Agency had a significant role to play in the import of American ideas. However, it saw to it that the European countries adapted, not adopted, American concepts; developed European management models, not English or French (McGlade, 1998). In the following lines I summarize the growth of the MBA degree in Europe and elsewhere.

France accepted America's advice for incorporating more practical element in its management education, but seeing more similarity with other European universities decided to build up 'worthwhile exchanges with European universities instead of fashionable links with American ones' (Barsoux, 1989:141). Italy was more impressed with American human relations principles but also realized the difference between its backward infrastructure and that which formed the context of American theories. Management Education here therefore grew erratically – not always based on economic credibility, but also socio-political circumstances (Segreto, 1998; Gemelli, 1998). The British were skeptical of MBA education. Some businessmen did not understand MBA graduates, some thought they were 'overrated,' and some were just prejudiced against American models. Growth of business schools was thus in spurts – 'unplanned and uncoordinated' (Tiratsoo, 1998). Norway worked together with the Americans, never letting its government be dominated by the American ideology. Consequently, adaptation and selection, as against imposition, was the strategy used here (Amdam and Yttri, 1998). Germany and Japan, with their strong academic traditions, never adopted American ideas because they soon recognized cultural differences with America (Thomas and Anthony, 1996; Kipping and Nioche, 1998; Grey, 2002; Currie and Knights, 2003).

In the developing or Third World, President Harry Truman's remark of January 20, 1949, outlined America's global strategy:

We must embark on a bold new programme for making the benefits of our scientific advances and industrial progress available for the improvement and growth of underdeveloped areas (quoted in Banarjee and Linstead, 2001:686).

In the opinion of Banarjee and Linstead (2001:686), 'A new perception of the West and the rest of the world was created on that day, marking the transition to a new imperialism. The Third World was born at that moment – on that day.'

In the same year, President Truman announced aid to the developing world to keep it out of communist hands. It was thought that simple 'transplantation of capital and technology to the Third World would not bear fruit unless it was accompanied by wider and consistent social, cultural and political changes' (Hoogvelt, 1997: 35).

China has picked up the MBA more recently. It is estimated by the Shanghai Education Commission that by 2006 China will need 37,500 MBA graduates each year. To fill this need, MBA and executive MBA (EMBA) programmes are springing up across China (Hulme, 2004). There are at least 21 MBA programmes run with American partners and 40 by Chinese universities (The Economist, May 20, 2004²). Though America is considered the leader in business education and 'imported programmes' teach imported content, not all programmes follow the American model in totality. For example, 'local programmes' modify imported text books for Chinese conditions and teach in Chinese,

² http://www.economist.com/printedition/PrinterFriendly.cfm?Story_ID=2685892

while ‘joint programmes’ teach jointly with foreign and local teachers so as to impart viewpoints of both (Hulme, 2004).

Peterson (2001) and Banarjee and Linstead (2001) believe that seen as a commodity, education is exported to increase scale of operations and revenues. ‘The 10 largest transnational corporations derive more than 60% of their sales from their international operations’ (Banarjee and Linstead, 2001:685). International universities, through selling *international products*, such as information resources, publications, and even services of professors and business experts, hope to do the same. For example, American and British education is heavily marketed in Pakistan, while that of Australia and Canada is catching up. I will discuss growth of the MBA education in Pakistan in detail in *chapter 4*.

Though the MBA is marketed heavily and is certainly among the most expensive educational degree programmes of today (Business2.0, 2005), it is not clear if MBA graduates will recover their expenses in terms of time and money. Slow placements in Switzerland and falling salaries in Hong Kong (Finer, 2001), as well as a decline in applications for full-time MBA programmes in Canada (Vu, 2004) and the United States (The Economist, May 20, 2004³) in recent years indicate different economic trends to different experts.

Despite mixed opinions, the MBA is still growing in popularity. The rest of the chapter looks at the thinking prevalent in this world renowned degree to see how it is affecting its recipients.

³ http://www.economist.com/printedition/PrinterFriendly.cfm?Story_ID=2685892

2.2 Technician-managerialist thinking in the MBA curricula

As I studied the thinking prevalent in the contemporary MBA curriculum, I came across viewpoints of several authors who pointed to a *technicist-managerialist* discourse in current MBA programmes. Currie and Knights (2000) inform that a reason for this could be the militaristic origin of the degree. According to one theory, they write, management education originated in the military academy at West Point and the Pennsylvania Railroad to solve managerial problems from the point of view of managers. Hence it emphasized techniques and was strategic in nature. Some authors see the same trend continuing in present day MBA too. By emphasizing certain ideas and values and ignoring others, it is believed that technicist-managerialism can influence the culture of MBA programmes. In the following paragraphs I explain this conception before moving on to how it is fostered in MBA programmes through their pedagogy and by catering to their stakeholders.

Grey and Mitev (1995a:74) define *managerialist* thinking as

treating management as a morally and politically neutral activity. Hence, management education becomes primarily concerned with the acquisition of techniques, regardless of the context of their application (also see Perriton, 2000, for further explanation of the concept).

In other words, such a discourse presents management as an ‘unproblematic set of techniques and practices’ (Grey and Mitev, 1995a : 76). Students too often imply an attitude to learning management as a set of techniques that should be ‘useful’, ‘practical’ and ‘relevant to the real world.’ Techniques here do not only refer to those used in mechanical accounting and operations management, but also include those employed in

dealing with people and change management. Such a *technicist* label, say Grey and Mitev (1995a:77), ‘relates not only to the focus on techniques but also to the fact that the technicist approach is illuminated by commitment to instrumental rationality⁴.’

Since both the providers and seekers of management education concentrate on giving and acquiring a morally and politically neutral set of techniques and practices and because such a thinking perceives management as a technical activity, throughout this thesis I refer to this perspective as *technicist-managerialist*, after Grey and Mitev (1995).

2.2.1 Fostering technicist-managerialist thinking through pedagogy

This section illustrates how various elements in the current MBA pedagogy, such as courses, concepts, teaching methodology, and the examination system foster a technicist-managerialist mode of thinking that neglects emotional and ethical values and concerns.

Many management scholars, such as Alvesson and Willmott (1996), Grey, Knights and Willmott (1996), and Kallinikos (1996), assert that positivism is the dominant ideology in management circles of today. They believe that courses such as economics and psychology usually give students numerical and linear cause-effect models, while marketing and accounting appear deceptively simple. Their concern is profitability. Marketing creates stereotypes and appeals to newness. Computing restricts the moral element in decision-making, seeming to further subordination, rather than emancipation.

⁴ By instrumental rationality, the authors mean ‘a rationality which is concerned only with the adoption of the most appropriate means to achieve a given end, as opposed to reflection upon the rationality and desirability of ends themselves’ (Grey and Mitev, 1995a:88).

Gosling and Mintzberg (2004) observe that the subject matter too is divided into sharp categories, not fully in resonance with people's experiences, nor including a study of ethics. Spivak (1993) thus calls business schools 'teaching machines' in their being highly influential in production and dissemination of a *certain type* of knowledge.

Huczynski (1993), Fineman and Gabriel (1994) and Birnbaum (2000) criticize popular concepts and models, such as TQM (Total Quality Management), Excellence, MBO (Management by Objectives) BCG (Boston Consulting Group - a matrix on business strategy), and BPR (Business Process Reengineering) and *best practices*, taught in the MBA syllabi, for giving an account of a reality that appears easily manageable. Fineman and Gabriel (1999) see the problem of science-like predictability reflected in the definitions and textbook covers as well. 'Definitions semantically fix concepts to what are presumed to be facts in the real world' (p. 381), while Organization Studies textbooks usually have covers decorated with geometric patterns, stylized human figures and jigsaw puzzles – features 'concordant with an organizational world that is predictable, and a philosophy of science that stresses regularity and laws' (p. 380).

Thus Kallinikos (1996) and Thomas and Anthony (1996) observe that, based on utilitarian thinking and, I add, an understanding of reality that is predictable, models in MBA programmes not only neglect deeper understanding of business issues but also disregard or give very little importance to human rights. Lataif et al (1992), Boyatzis et al (1995), Cavanaugh and Prasad (1996) and Clegg and Ross-Smith (2003) conclude that management education is preoccupied with the objective, rational and masculine part of management and marginalizes emotional and ethical concerns. Sinclair (1997) in her

interviews with female MBA graduates also discovered that women's participation in MBA programmes was not considered as worthwhile as men's; their request for help was stereotyped as a struggle and a woman's physical appearance did not exhibit as much authority as a man's. Analyzing careers of men and women who had obtained their MBA degrees between 1992 and 1996, Heaton and McWhinney (1999) also show that their career progress has been different – women were more likely to work in areas such as training and administration and draw less pay, particularly at higher levels. However, despite this, women felt the MBA had helped their careers in terms of overcoming barriers to career progression.

In addition to sidelining emotional concerns, technicist-managerialist thinking, as some of the above authors have commented, also neglects ethical concerns. Mitroff and Denton (1999) and Roy and Roy (2004) express that in management circles, in comparison to core business concepts, spirituality and ethics are considered airy concepts, above the realities of everyday practice. Hence students find them irrelevant to business life (Zych, 1999; Baetz and Sharp, 2004). McDonald (2004:372) also lists other reasons that are commonly presented against the teaching of ethics in business education:

- One can not teach moral standards
- Ethics are not part of the domain of business studies
- Ethics do not have analytical foundation of the kind other business subjects have.

As such the topic lacks credibility

- If ethics courses are taught, it is primarily for appearance
- Students are not able to transfer ethical skills to work life

Among practical reasons, Baetz and Sharp (2004) observed in their research that some of the reasons why teaching of ethics is a challenge in management studies is curriculum constraints, lack of subject material, and lack of teachers' ability to deal with the subject. In their study of textbooks on various business subjects, they found few textbooks acknowledging the existence of ethical theory; those that dealt with the topic covered it in a variety of different ways, with little consistency in these varied approaches. This makes not only the study of the topic difficult but also hampers training of teachers in the subject.

Regarding teaching methodology, case studies – which are frequently used in MBA programmes – reinforce technicist thinking, according to Ehrensall (2002). Coming prepared with answers or solved by the teacher's own understanding of the problem, they give students the idea that they can solve any company's problems after just two hours of desk work, using the theories and analytical skills they have learnt.

In addition, the tightly packed MBA routine creates pressure, not permitting much reflection of the kind that not only means musing, but also wondering, analyzing, and struggling, say Gosling and Mintzberg (2004). Lists, so commonly found in management texts, foster 'routinized learning' rather than argument, providing a 'short-cut to understanding' (Fineman and Gabriel, 1999: 383). Moreover, believing themselves to be customers of business knowledge, business students expect knowledge to come to them in 'a pre-digested and immediately usable form' which the teacher happily imposes on them (Roberts, 1996:56; Currie and Knights, 2000), for example through lectures and handouts,

I think. Moreover, according to Currie and Knights (2000:100), use of modern technology, such as OHPs (overhead projectors), Power Point and videos, in teaching further strengthens the technist thinking by ‘remov[ing] the dynamic quality of teaching and thus make[ing] the experience of students more formal and distant.’

Test scores and grades, that are only one measure of student performance (Gosling and Mintzberg, 2004) and MBA ranking lists and accreditations (anonymous, 2005) that are only one measure of school performance, in my opinion, further reinforce the technicist calculative mentality. By encouraging students to compete for higher grades, opt for prestigious schools, pay attention to market rankings and calculate return on investment (ROI) when selecting programmes of study, as a Business report 2.0 (2005) recommends, such measures, I believe, can reduce the due importance of other criteria of learning and selection, such as the opportunity to benefit from professors and colleagues, to develop a spirit of inquiry, and to select courses of interest.

2.2.2 Fostering technicist-managerialist thinking through catering to market requirements

In addition to its pedagogy, another reason, I believe, MBA programmes are technicist managerialist in their outlook is their consideration of education as *a product for the market* of students and employers. Hence both providers and seekers of education see it as a commercial exchange, defined in terms of specific, definitive requirements.

Metaphors, such as *quality assurance*, *benchmarks*, *exporting* education or *marketing* syllabi, *standardizing* educational *products*, and students as *customers* are increasingly

heard in business academia and market. League tables, target-setting (Cope and I'Anson, 2003), calculating return on investment (ROI), and rankings (Business 2.0, 2005) reinforce this image. Students' evaluations of teachers further add to the 'teacher as producer' and 'student as consumer' concept (Grey and Mitev, 1995a). Studies have demonstrated that recruiters too do not always give much importance to behavioural coursework in education. Rynes et al's (2003) study, for example, showed that while evaluating resumes, employers gave same employability rating to students who took both functional and behavioural coursework as to those who studied only functional subjects, although 78% of them had indicated in an earlier study that they preferred graduates who supplemented behavioural coursework with functional expertise. Such findings send confusing signals to students and educators who therefore do not consider behavioural coursework as important as functional. Burke et al (2003) had also written that many students find OB (Organizational Behaviour) matters, which deal with people management, 'common sensical, unimportant, irrelevant and of little use to them.'

Auken et al (2005:44) state industry's influence on MBA programmes in these words

Most MBA programs are indeed influenced by their stakeholders. More and more, the student is being treated as a customer, and student and alumni satisfaction have become key metrics along with employer and recruiter satisfaction. At the same time, the student is also a product. Therefore, it may be that narrowing of core curricula in favor of marketable skill building has gone too far.

Pring (1998) also believes that development of the intellect as a goal of education is becoming difficult because of economic reasons: research agendas are set by economic, military and government needs; instead of intrinsic value, usefulness of education is being

considered. Kellie (2003) too showed in her 12-15 month research on two company-based management education programmes in the UK that ‘what constitutes *relevant* knowledge is no longer the exclusive domain of the educationalist. It is more closely tied to the perceptions of the organizational stakeholders.’

2.2.3 Critiquing technicist-managerialist thinking

The following paragraphs present a debate on the advantageous and disadvantageous features of the technicist-managerialist discourse in management education. Some scholars see it as a necessary feature of management education, while others think it is a short-sighted approach.

Growth in technicist managerialist thinking and metaphors, such as students as customers and business schools as producers continues unabated, even though Grey and Mitev (1995a) remind us that the value of education cannot be determined beforehand. Payment of fee is only a condition of entry, not a guarantee of learning. Among scholars who criticize such a mode of thinking, Thomas and Anthony (1996) believe that reducing management education’s educational aspect will make it more like short-term training undertaken to learn a specific technique or course. Seeing education merely as commodity ignores the character building and personality development in education, add Cope and I’Anson (2003). Moreover, as Thomas and Anthony (1996) observe, learning only for earning (utility) is short-term; it does not affect students’ being and is boring and destructive to curiosity and imagination. Real management education, on the other hand,

engages social, political and conceptual abilities, and not merely techniques that can be learnt on the job and that can change over time.

Among those who view the technical part in management education favourably, Burgoyne (1995) observes 'it would be morally wrong and wasteful to fumble or fail at a morally valuable performance for reasons of technical inefficiency. To fail to teach or learn or apply genuinely useful technical expertise is at least indirectly immoral' (p. 94). He sees technical competence 'as a necessary adjunct to moral development' (p. 91). Besides, King (1995:101) points out that it has never been adequately proven that technicist managerialist MBA is not intellectually demanding or that it refrains from illustrating detailed understandings or that a concern for quality is dictated by a 'market conception' that sees students as consumers and teachers as producers.

Taking the debate forward, Grey and Mitev (1995b: 104-5) reply to Burgoyne's (1995) and King's (1995) arguments by acknowledging that 'managers are aware both of moral issues (they are human beings!) and, often, the limits to management techniques...But the question is how *management* is presented and understood.' The point, according to them, is not whether management education syllabi should or should not teach techniques but whether the discipline of management is presented as a set of techniques to be mastered or an educational discipline that develops students' social and conceptual abilities.

Fox (1994) and Jessop (2002) bring in another point about management education not being value-neutral. They point to the managers' role in reproducing and transforming cultures through participation in activities having extended social consequences. As such, management education should contribute to socio-economic development of a country, as

against equipping students with a mere set of techniques to carve out their careers with. Such a socially responsible attitude, Jessop (2002) says, will give them not only techniques, but also values, ethical reasoning and ability to link with people.

Though I believe that a professional degree like MBA needs to take account of market needs, it must pay significant attention to the 'nurturing side of education' – development of a sense of responsibility through inculcation of moral values. Education which fails to clarify our central convictions is mere training or indulgence (Schumacher, 1973). If education cannot teach non-material values that give meaning to life, how can it create a fair society, questions Gatto⁵.

2.2.4 Some consequences of technicist-managerialist thinking

Several authors, as seen above, have criticized technicist-managerialist thinking for neglecting emotional and moral issues, and fostering task-oriented models of learning and problem-solving, and consequently influencing the pedagogy of MBA programmes in a positivistic way. Following are some of the personal, professional, and moral consequences of such thinking.

According to Vince (1996), Musson and Cohen (1999) and Lowe et al (2002) excessive training in technicist or objective issues makes MBAs deficient in social skills, such as communication, leadership and supervisory skills. Learning to see a leader endowed with competitiveness, aggression, objectivity and lack of emotions, MBA graduates are not as

⁵ www.spinninglobe.net/gattopage.htm

effective when it comes to emotional issues in organizations, such as absenteeism, employee morale and downsizing observe Lataif et al (1992) and Currie and Knights (2000).

Why shy away from teaching about emotions in management education, asks Leavitt (2001). After all, effective implementation requires more than competent analysis.

Understanding of emotions is necessary for teamwork, cooperation and coordination of human effort. Getting along with people requires empathy, sensitivity and a sense of belongingness. In fact, suppressing one's emotions all the time can result in emotional dissonance and eventually job burnout (Sanchez and Levine, 1999). Companies tinkering with mechanistic ideas of production efficiencies, cost reduction, sales and training have employees complaining of corporations not nurturing the human spirit. Companies do not fully realize how they are related to the environment – local tribes, flora and fauna and the human community in general (Debold, 2005).

According to Roberts (1996:65), technicist-managerialist imagination also leads to compliance, managerial isolation and personal retreat. There is no realization of moral or managerial responsibility; it is amoral and ineffective, triggered by greed. A study by Tenbrunsel (1998) showed how mechanical and materialistic thinking on the part of MBA students led them to misrepresent information in order to win rewards. Using a hypothetical business simulation, she demonstrated that about 55% of young MBA graduates, with an average of 4 years of work experience, misrepresented their estimates of market share to an arbitrator in order to win a high prize. These people justified their

behaviour by claiming others would be doing the same, and the higher was the incentive for the focal actor, the higher was the expectation of misrepresentation by the opponent.

Such technically managerialist mentality trickles down into management practice, says Park (1998), where a manager is supposed to respond 'objectively, professionally, and dispassionately' to 'objective' factors. He must work as a technician. Alimo-Metcalfe (1995:4-5) also shows in her study how leadership is often conceived of as a set of 'male-biased' values, including force, action and confidence, excluding feminine concerns about care, sensitivity and empathy. Poole (1996) raises the issue of opposing constructs. Familial and emotional relationships are deemed 'irrational' in capitalistic and bureaucratic means of production and must therefore be kept separate from work or public life. Within the public sphere human beings are valued so far as they serve as means towards distinct goals. Hence technicist-managerialist thinking engenders a difference between masculine and feminine, public and private, work and non-work, and I add religion and non-religion.

In the above section I have pointed out how some authors see technicist-managerialist thinking in MBA curricula promoting objectivity and rationality and neglecting emotionality and ethics. In the next section I will take up the Westernization discourse, and tracing its origin back to colonization, suggest that the way the colonizers influenced the cultures of the colonized races, the current MBA, with its imperialistic stance, could also be affecting the values of its students.

2.3 Westernization or colonization?

The other main point that my readings about the current thinking in the MBA indicated is the dominance of Western, particularly American, constructs in the MBA curriculum. From text books to journals to teaching methodology, the American model seems to direct the MBA of today. MBA programmes 'are remarkably standardized in content – across schools and around the world' even though 'management is neither a science nor a profession, neither a function nor a combination of function. Management is a practice – it has to be appreciated through experience, in context' (Gosling and Mintzberg, 2004:19).

I find this domination of Western, particularly American, constructs, as I will explain later, akin to the colonial discourse that had contributed to bringing in secularism in the Muslim world and redefined the traditional culture in a more secular light. I would therefore like to discuss the Western or the American model in some detail before commenting on how it could link to secularization and be a source of secular values.

2.3.1 The Western curriculum

Many business schools are eagerly adopting *international* management curricula to respond to the challenges of globalization. However, a closer look at the so-called *international* curriculum reveals in it a major presence of Western, primarily American, constructs, theories and illustrations and a general neglect of management concepts from

the rest of the world. The following paragraphs show this dominance in the case of text books, journals, concepts, and teaching methodology used in MBA programmes.

In their study of American textbooks, Francis and Globerman (1992) showed that even books which claimed to be international had only a few international topics presented separately. Accounts textbooks were observed to be least international in content; marketing books had 5% international content and production or strategy 9%. On average, a book that claimed to be international had a mere 7% international content.

They thus conclude

By and large all textbooks reflect a strong home country [US] bias...By far the most cited examples of international content have to do with Japan...Except for China, most Third World countries are ignored, and some geographic regions are never mentioned, or if so usually from stereotypical stances' (p. 144).

Metcalfe and Rees (2005) find genuine research in International Human Resource Development still 'sparse and fragmented' and not linked adequately to countries' specific social, cultural or governmental institutions, despite the word *international* in the title of the discipline (p. 451). Jaya (2001) and Murad (2002) also blame international texts for being predominantly American. Steingard and Fitzgibbons (1995) question the missing 'stories of the impoverished' and the 'pleas for the desecrated virgin rainforests in South America' and 'voice of dissent to globalization' in the international texts.

In addition to ignoring certain cultures, many management text books represent or misrepresent different cultures in different ways. For example, Mills and Hatfield (1999) established through their content analysis of 107 widely used North American texts published between 1959-96, that they constitute a narrative built around a 'white, male,

liberal American view of reality' (p. 37). Some texts very explicitly see the American manager as 'self-determined,' 'rational,' 'frank and open,' while his/her foreign counterpart is 'driven by mysticism or fatalism,' is 'irrational' and 'deceiving' (p. 51). Nwanko (2000) also points out how the developed world is failing to take notice of developmental and modernization work going on in sub-Saharan Africa, but insists on maintaining its stereotypical image of a dysfunctional and backward region.

Moreover, management education does not provide students with a study of language, power, and context (Reynolds, 1999). Issues of race and gender have rarely been addressed (Frenkel and Shenhav, 2003). 'Nowhere in the text book are the theories placed in their historical and epistemological context' (Ehrensals, 2002:143), even though assumptions built into theories are often culture-specific (Prasad and Cavanaugh, 1997). Moreover, rarely do the authors give a critique of the theories they propound (Ehrensals, 2002). Management text books, for example Daft (1988) (another American text), permit very little reflection upon the conditions and consequences of established theory and practice. 'Established priorities and values are assumed to be legitimate' and the darker side of management is presented as an 'aberrant or unavoidable deviation' (Alvesson and Willmott, 1996:31; see also Younis, 1993).

Fineman and Gabriel (1994) thus conclude that the textbook is being used increasingly to advance certain ideologies. They depict it as a

rhetorical device that does not persuade through argument. It comforts and reassures. It *asserts* and it *infuses* to a relatively passive, but normally willing, recipient (p. 385).

This leads Mills and Hatfield (1999) to question how such a limited, distorted and ethnocentric view of reality could contribute to the development of managers.

Top journals of management are all US-based (Kumar and Usunier, 2001). According to Clegg and Ross-Smith (2003), since 90% of the publications in top journals are written by US scholars, it is to be expected that the research reported deals mainly with US practice. This allows the US reviewers to reject not only 'shoddy' research, but also that which does not 'fit their favoured paradigm.' Susanne Wagner, Executive Director, United States International University-Mexico, for example, says, 'There is unfortunately a tendency to downplay what Mexico can contribute,' (de Lopez, 2001). Grey (2002) also remarks that though the Americans claim management to be no more than morally neutral technique, they stand ready 'with an overtly moralistic stance' to reject anything that does not support the values of market populism.

Blunt and Jones (1997) illustrate how deviation from the norms is becoming increasingly difficult: concepts such as team-working have become 'tyrannical, and their denial tantamount to heresy.' At the same time, Islamic concepts of motivational needs that regard spiritual needs at least as important as material and achievement needs (Ali, 1990 and 1996), Confucian beliefs that underlie the working of Chinese and Korean organizations, and African models of leadership that highly value consensus, tolerance and kindness (Blunt and Jones, 1997) are not only not taught, but not even recognized as alternative theories. Even European authority figures, like Foucault and Weber are found of little interest by American scholarship and their debates seldom given serious thought by their counterparts across the Atlantic (Clegg and Ross-Smith, 2003). Thomas (1998)

thus affirms that Americans have failed to take notice of alternative models, even if they have proved superior to their own.

In addition to the curriculum that apparently follows a certain set of ideas, the teaching methodology too seems to be based on a few selected methods. A very popular method is that of the case study. However, case studies used in many business schools are more often than not developed in America and discuss stories of American multinationals. Even if local cases are used to teach business students, students try to solve them on the bases of their American dominated knowledge. Hence, they are led to believe that what works in America works in their country as well (Ehrensals, 2002). Moreover, ‘the value stance [in cases] is usually managerial,’ add Fineman and Gabriel (1994).

Summarizing the debate on internationalization, Clegg et al (2000) conclude that international means, more precisely, North American and European.

2.3.2 From colonization of territory to Westernization of mind

The above discussion, with its explanation of the dynamics of dominance and subordination of some ideas, bias for and against certain cultures and marginalization or *othering* of certain people, reminds me of Said’s words that largely rescued from ‘alienation and obscurity, the existence of the Orient [however] has remained fixed in time and place for the West’ (Said, 1991:108). The work of eighteenth and nineteenth century imperialists, philosophers, and travelers is being carried on by the media,

multinational corporations and business educators. Orientals or *natives*⁶ are either ignored from standard management texts or represented in stereotypical ways. An examination of management school curricula shows how the picture of the *Other*⁷ is still more or less intact today. In the words of Mills and Hatfield (1999:49):

The business text...is but a newer form of fiction and, by its direct relationship to business enterprise, more likely to reveal traces of imperialism noted by Said.

The fact that English is the medium of instruction and official language of many postcolonial countries and many are still utilizing colonial education systems is a living testimony to the continuation of colonialism. This seems more potent when one remembers that language is the medium through which a hierarchical structure of power is perpetuated, and the medium through which conceptions of *truth* and *reality* become established (Ashcroft, et al 1989). The national language of Pakistan too is Urdu, but its official language is English. Every time we speak or write in English, we pay homage to Western intellectual and political hegemony (JanMohamed and Llyod, 1997:236), especially when we are reminded that 'Language not only ensures the continuity of national thoughts but also maintains and reinforces cultural identity' (Ali, 1995).

Peterson (2001:639) explains the above arguments from the point of view of globalization

In the dynamics of globalization there are not equal players and the playing fields are not level. This is not about educational partnerships where the flow of information, ideas and talent is based on equal footing.

⁶ Postcolonial term, from a colonial point of view, for subjects of colonized races (see Spivak,1988:281, for example)

⁷ Same as footnote 6

Dirlik (1996) explains that globalization, of which I see Westernization of management education as an ingredient, is the control of the 'process of production.' In addition, it has no centre (or headquarters). In the game of imperialism today only a few things have changed. Control is now negotiated, not imposed. I believe the term *globalization* has displaced *colonization*. To me it is an obscuring term for colonization. During colonization, it was the hold of the physical resources of the colonized, now it is that of the human resources of the globalized.

Banarjee and Linstead (2001:683) make the same point:

globalization becomes the new global colonialism, based on the historical structure of capitalism and is a process that executes the objectives of colonialism with greater efficiency and rationalism.

A political process, it is sustained through relationships of power, domination and subordination that are written by transnational corporations and international institutions. It is associated with capitalist society and Western culture, that is, political, cultural and social positions in the non-Western world are defined in relation to the capitalist West (Loomba, 1998; Dirlik et al, 2000). In the opinion of Amin (1997:32), 'Capitalism is more than just an economic system; its economy is inconceivable without a social and political dimension.' Young (1995) has the same observation in that capitalism does not simply control desire; it must first do away with cultures and institutions already established, reduce everything to the value of money and then reterritorialize nations and families – just as colonialism did.

Here I would also like to add Grey's (2002:188) comment on business schools as a major player in the globalization process.

Business schools are therefore able to play a pivotal role in the ideological projects of globalized capitalism in promoting, and especially, socializing students into a sanitized representation of corporate management.

In his article titled *The Essential Library: Management Books That Every Manager Ought to Read*, Sridharan (2005), a manager from postcolonial India, recommends a set of books that are almost all from America. Some of these are criticized for containing only fads, some for following a very positivistic frame of thinking, while others for the doubtful authenticity of their claims (I have mentioned many of these books in my earlier discussions). To me such a strong recommendation for literature that is heavily criticized (though I do acknowledge it has some worth) appears as an example of consenting to American dominance.

Prasad and Cavanaugh (1997:316) sum up the role of management texts in upholding relations of domination and subordination that support the process of globalization

Implicitly, therefore, the texts of conventional management often function as instruments for reproducing the (organizational or societal) status quo. Put another way, wittingly or unwittingly, conventional management texts frequently serve as ideological devices that legitimate or perpetuate existing structures of domination and, consequently, limit individual, organizational, and societal potential.

In the paragraphs above I explained why I find management education of today similar to colonization of the previous centuries. In the next section I illustrate how management texts sometimes appear to be using the similar strategies of domination,

misrepresentation, and repression, which were employed by the Orientalists to influence the values and cultures of colonized nations.

2.4 Rewriting the culture of the colonized: from Islam to secularism

British colonists first came to Mughal India in the seventeenth century to secure and develop markets for their surplus goods and capital. Representing the interests of only a few classes, primarily investors and financiers, colonialism used not only exploitative means, such as militarism, wars and imperialism (Berberoglu, 1987) but also socio-cultural and educational means for *improving* the natives for their purpose (Said, 1993). In the process they ended up rewriting the culture of the colonized.

2.4.1 Creating the Orient(al) through domination and misrepresentation

Occident's, i.e. the East's (understood to be spreading from the Mediterranean to China) relationship to the Orient, i.e. the West (primarily seen as Europe and later America as well) was that of 'power, domination and hegemony,' states Edward Said (1991:2). The Orient became known to the world through the tales and experiences of merchants, crusaders, travelers, and the writings of poets and philosophers, many of whom had never even set foot on the Orient. These people – the Orientalists – had particular ways of describing the 'Oriental' or the colonial subject. Taking a position outside of the Orient, the Orientalist was not really concerned with what the Oriental or the Other thought or

felt. Yet he/she insisted on speaking for the Other him/herself. Hence, believes Said (1991:22)

the value, efficacy, strength, apparent veracity of a written statement about the Orient therefore relies very little...on the Orient itself...It depends more on the West than on the Orient (also see Robert⁸).

Being learned, the Orientalists imposed 'disciplinary orders' upon the data they collected from the 'natives' to create the Orient of their dreams. The Oriental was 'childlike,' 'depraved,' and 'irrational,' while the European was 'mature,' 'rational,' 'virtuous' and 'normal' (Said, 1991:40). The Oriental was a follower of 'strange' customs and an 'Asiatic mystery,' as Disraeli remarked (Said, 1995). For the Oriental, the Orient stood culturally, intellectually and spiritually 'outside' Europe (Said, 1991:71). On the furthest limits of the 'outside' lay Islam. It was created by Muhammad (pbuh)⁹, and followed by the 'dishonest' and 'degenerate *Mohammadens*.' It was characterized by a 'retrogressive position when compared with other human sciences...its methodological and ideological backwardness, and its comparative insularity from development... in real world circumstances' (p. 261) because it held to its origins. Gruesome imagery of Islam continued as it increasingly threatened Christianity and outshone Rome. Till the very end of colonial rule, it remained for the Orientalists 'a degraded representative' (Said, 1991:261) of the Orient (also see Robert¹⁰).

⁸ <http://www.muslim-answers.org/orientalism.htm>

⁹ The Muslim salutation 'Peace be upon him'

¹⁰ Same as footnote 9

2.4.2 Education in the Muslim colonies: a case of repression and replacement

Not only did the Orientalist assign the Other a misrepresented, falsified and stereotypical identity through his/her writing, but also assumed for himself/herself a superior, cultured and universally appealing personality. Seeley (quoted in Said, 1993:226) declared

We in Europe...are pretty well agreed that the treasure of truth which forms the nucleus of the civilization of the West is incomparably more sterling not only than the Brahmanic mysticism with which it has to contend, but even than the Roman Enlightenment which the old Empire transmitted to the nations of Europe.

With this in mind, the colonist sought to reform, educate and acclimatize the 'subject' into his own culture. Lord Macaulay spoke of his intent to produce 'a class of persons Indian in blood and colour, but English in tastes, in opinions, in morals, and in intellect' (quoted in Bhabha, 1994:87). The more the native adopted the mother country's ways, the more he/she rose from his/her jungle status. However, the colonial master made sure that the 'subject' remained the 'subject' and not became too much like him. It was feared that too aware a native could become too proud to fit into the colonial apparatus and could agitate for liberty. Therefore he must be improved 'partially' (Bhabha, 1994; also see Fanon, 1970).

English education in the colonies was thus aimed at producing 'loyal, obedient administrators' (Szyliowycz, 1995:417). Only modern policies would lead to advancement, it was decided by the colonists. If traditional values did not fit, they were seen to be 'dysfunctional' to the process of development (Badger, 1994). Thus traditional Islamic education was neglected or in some cases discouraged to make room for English

education. Here I would like to elaborate a little on Islamic education and its values by pointing out its salient characteristics and how it furthers the values espoused in Islam. This will hopefully enable the reader to see the difference between the education system of Islam and that brought down by the colonists and contribute towards understanding the conclusions of this research.

Traditional Islamic education, according to Sharifi (1979), Professor of Sociology and Philosophy at the University of Tehran, it saw all knowledge as interrelated (Husain and Ashraf, 1979). Concept of knowledge in Islam, as Nasr (2000) explains, begins with the concept of oneness or unity of God. Since all knowledge begins with God, it is all inter-related. There is no distinction between religious and worldly knowledge, since all knowledge is created by one God. A clear example of this precept in practice was seen in the Muslim empire of the 8-10th centuries, when the caliphs had the Greek, Egyptian, Indian and other non-Islamic works translated and incorporated into knowledge generated in the Muslim world. This also meant that whatever was taught in educational institutions was presented with both its material and spiritual aspects. Character-building and inculcation of virtuous values, such as discipline, integrity and humility, went hand in hand with professional training. The purpose was to strive to become the *insaan alkamil* or the ‘universal man’ envisaged in Islam. Hence pupils were educated in such a way that their lives, actions and decisions could be governed by the spiritual and ethical values of Islam, with an eye on the Hereafter (Husain and Ashraf, 1979). Moreover, acquiring of knowledge is an obligation on each human being, irrespective of gender or class or any other difference, so that he/she can attain the status of the *insaan alkamil* envisaged for him/her in Islam. This led to the widespread propagation of knowledge throughout the

Muslim world, especially of the 8-13th centuries. Seen as essential to the preservation of the vitality of society, education was widely supported by every capable person who participated in giving educational instruction or funds (*awqaaf*), whether in/for mosque schools, *madrassahs* or universities and medical schools. Thus learning was pursued both formally and informally, depending on the needs and resources of the educators and the students (also see Qureshi, 1975 and Attas, 1979a).

The model of education described above prevailed in Muslim India as well. But with the onslaught of colonization that brought out the importance of race and culture to secure material benefits in the colonial world, Muslims' links with the Holy Quran continued to be severed (Attas, 1979a) as the new form of education distinguished between the religious and the secular aspects of education. Szyliowycz (1995:418) believes that the major difference between traditional and the British schools in India was not so much 'in the methods or in the behaviour of teaching, but in the bureaucratization and formalization of schooling.' This, as Qureshi (1975) observes, was more conducive to the development of clerics, rather than leaders. The formal examination system, he explains, encouraged focus on a narrow set of concepts useful from the examination point of view instead of on research and discovery. Rent-free land, on which *madrassahs* (Islamic schools for traditional education) were located were also often reclaimed. Thus local education continued to be destroyed or neglected as Muslim thinkers lost control of their educational and legal systems and sons of affluent classes cast their votes in favour of the British system to secure jobs in it.

As the hold of the colonists and secular values they brought strengthened, some Muslims, such as the Islamic institution at Deoband, eschewed from Western systems and societies and others, such as Anjuman-e-Hayat-e-Islam and Madrasah Manzoorul Islam of Bareilly, tried to protect Islamic values from Christian and Hindu influences. Other institutions such as Nadwat-ul-ulema tried to synthesize it with Western *modernity*. Influence of many of these institutions, such as the Darul Uloom, and the educational centres they established, such as Islamia College in Peshawar by the Anjuman-e-Hayat-e-Islam and the Sindh Madrasatul Islam in Karachi, still exist in Pakistan. Moreover, individuals, such as Syed Ahmad Khan, Mohammad Iqbal and Nawab Abdul Lateef in India also strove to bridge the gap between Islamic and Western thinking (Siddiqui, 2005). But local people began looking at Westernized youth with askance, questioning the value of the Western education per se, as early as the late nineteenth century. Besides, they felt aspirations of the elite and rulers were not those of the community, but of colonists. Several other experiments in Islamic and secular educational systems took place, but always caught in the dilemma of how much of Western education to import, without unnecessarily secularizing the curriculum (Husain and Ashraf, 1979; Barazangi, 1995; Iqbal, 2004). Thus English or secular education ran in parallel with Islamic education, with the bifurcation, hitherto unknown in the Muslim educational set-up, dealing a severe blow to the mental and spiritual health of the Muslim community in India (Qureshi, 1975).

A rude shock to the Muslims of India came when the caliphate in Turkey, for which they had fought for several years and which was considered the stronghold of the Muslim world by many was abolished by Kamal Ataturk in 1924. With the caliphate out of the

way, it was relatively easy for Mountbatten to proclaim a secular state in India, although ‘voice of Islam and semitized Hinduism as alternatives to the European English Enlightenment continued to be heard for some time’ (Spivak, 1993:265). This, I believe, was an event that paved the way for secular education as distinct from religious education in pre-Partition India and later in Pakistan. Professor Moazzam Hossain, Vice Chancellor and Professor Emeritus of the Dacca University brings out this separation in these words:

By dividing education into secular and religious education and by establishing separate institutions for both divisions, the British scheme of dual education replaced the unitary Islamic system of education, resulting in perennial discord among the products of the two systems (1979:101).

2.4.3 Basis of imperial authority

After Dr. Fieldhouse, Said (1994: 11) states ‘The basis of imperial authority was the mental attitude of the colonized. His acceptance of subordination...made empire durable.’ He lists quotations from many reformers of colonial India who had made similar observations. Hall (1998: 225-6) stresses the same point

They had the power to make us see and experience *ourselves* as “Other.” It is one thing to position a subject or set of peoples as the Other of a dominant discourse. It is quite another thing to subject them to that “knowledge”, not only as a matter of imposed will and domination, but by the power of inner compulsion and subjective con-formation to the norm.

Following a prolonged period of subordination, the ‘native’ did stir up. At first there was actual fighting in the middle to late nineteenth century (primary resistance) and then ideological struggle (secondary resistance) in the twentieth. The latter was expressed in the rejection of Christianity and Western dress and the teaching of nationalism. Said

(1994), however, remains wary of nationalistic struggle, as in his opinion, it is coercive and not a solution for remedying economic or social injustice.

The more Westernized natives continued emulating modern European ways and undertaking journeys to the West to learn from them (Spivak, 1993). Bhabha (1994) calls such emulation 'mimicry' that was necessary to the colonized and desirable to the colonist. Said (1994: 264) writes, 'Out of the learning process, millions grasped fundamentals of modern life, yet remained subordinate dependents of a foreign imperial authority' because that was what was aimed.

2.5 Chapter Summary

In this chapter I discussed two modes of thinking in present day management education – technicist-managerialist and Westernization/Americanization – that I feel have an influence on the cultural values of its students. The first of these marginalizes emotional and ethical values in managing by obscuring them under quest for objectivity and rationality. For example, I discussed how text books, theories, as well as teaching methodologies, such as case studies and student-teacher interaction, emphasized positivistic streams of thoughts that overshadowed moral and human values and split the managers' world into public/private and religion/non-religion. The second, Westernization/Americanization, seemed to me to be using similar strategies of misrepresentation and repression of other cultures that the colonists used to impose their cultures over those of the colonized. In the case of the Indian subcontinent, for example, aiming to produce specific type of men for their own purposes, the colonists overpowered

the traditional Muslim education system, by stereotyping and repressing the Muslim traditions and replacing them with their own 'more sterling' European cultures and secular agendas. Since both of these discourses affect the value systems of participants in a secular, as opposed to a religious, way, I see them related to each other and possibly capable of explaining the values endorsed in the MBA curricula of Pakistan, which (as I will explain later) are borrowed heavily from the Western, particularly the American, MBA.

Having detailed these two discourses, the question that comes to my mind is whether Western imperialism in contemporary management education, with its technically managerialist philosophy that sidelines religious and ethical concerns, could impact upon the values of present day Pakistani MBA students just as Western colonialism with its secular agenda did in the case of the Indian Muslims. To address this question, I will need to look at the curricula of my chosen case studies and the values endorsed in those schools. This is what I have dealt with briefly in *chapter 4* and in detail in *chapter 6* of this study. But I would first like to describe my theoretical perspective that has been the background of my research, influencing my research questions, literature review and methodology.

3.0	CHAPTER 3: POSTCOLONIALISM – THE THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE OF THIS RESEARCH	53
3.1	Finding my theoretical perspective	53
3.2	A history of postcolonial theory	56
3.3	The postcolonial argument	57
3.3.1	Understanding the postcolonial argument	57
3.3.2	The purpose(s) of postcolonial theory	59
3.3.3	Subjects of inquiry of postcolonialism	60
3.3.4	Responding to the colonial discourse through the <i>Minority Discourse</i>	62
3.3.5	Search for an identity: <i>cultural hybridity</i> and <i>mimicry</i>	65
3.3.6	Not a nationalistic struggle	68
3.4	Postcolonialism and other perspectives: interdisciplinarity of purpose and methodology	69
3.4.1	Postcolonialism and the discourse perspective: questions of ideology and consent	70
3.4.2	Postcolonialism and feminism: issues of domination-subordination and masculine objectivity	72
3.4.3	Postcolonialism, Marxism and post-Marxism: concept of class and the critique of capitalism	75
3.4.4	Postcolonialism and poststructuralism: significance of social construction and exclusion	76
3.4.5	Postcolonialism, modernism and postmodernism: questioning universal rationality and truth	78
3.5	Critiquing postcolonial theory	80
3.5.1	Contesting the purpose(s) of postcolonial theory	80
3.5.2	Debating ‘methodological debility’ in postcolonial theory	82
3.5.3	Critically examining the salient features of postcolonial theory	83
3.5.4	Can postcolonial theory be called a discourse?	85
3.6	Research using the postcolonial perspective	87
3.7	Chapter Summary	90

CHAPTER 3: POSTCOLONIALISM – THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE OF THIS RESEARCH

In this chapter I explain the theoretical perspective informing my research. I begin with how I came to choose a particular perspective, that is, the postcolonial theory, and then present its major features. Since this theory borrows considerably from other philosophical perspectives and notions, I also describe these, pointing out features they have in common as well as those where they differ with postcolonial theory. Both these discussions are presented as debates. In explaining these various arguments, I pay special attention to how the various notions inform my inquiry. A critique of postcolonial theory is given towards the end of the chapter. Finally, I lay out examples of a few researches to give an insight into the variety of issues addressed by postcolonial research and the various methodologies employed to research them, before moving on to my own methodology in *chapter 5*.

3.1 Finding my theoretical perspective

Before elaborating upon my chosen theoretical perspective, I would like to put forward my understanding of paradigms, perspectives and theories. I take a paradigm to be a cluster of beliefs that determines what should be studied, how research is to be done and how results are to be interpreted (Bryman and Bell, 2003). ‘It represents a world view that defines for its holder the nature of the ‘world,’ the individual’s place in it, and the range of possible relationships to that world and its parts’ (Denzin and Lincon, 1998a: 200).

Perspectives, though they share many features in common with paradigms, are not as unified or as solidified as paradigms (Denzin and Lincon, 1998a).

Authors such as Vaughan (2000) and Yin (2003a) provided me with a meaning of and purpose for using a particular theory. They see theory as a 'sensing device' to look out for and pick up information of interest. Since such a commitment can bias data collection, the authors recommend the chosen theory must be made explicit at the outset to enable readers to understand why certain elements in the data are given more prominence than others.

In choosing this theoretical perspective, I first responded to the questions that had perturbed me for some time. As mentioned in the introductory chapter, these regarded the nature of work values endorsed in business education syllabi and the little attention such curricula gave to religious and ethical concerns. These impressions were disturbing to me because I felt management education, with its wide social impact, could not afford to neglect such concerns. As I searched for links between education and values, Husain and Ashraf's (1979), Hofstede's (1984), Bourdieu and Passeron's (1990) and Ali's (1995) ideas on the interplay between culture, education and power (as I laid out in *chapter 1*) strengthened my belief that education has a definite impact upon one's values. By the same token, I believe, MBA education could also impact upon the values of business students. I therefore decided to inquire into the values encouraged in MBA programmes through a study of the thinking prevalent in their curricula. The more I read about the MBA degree (as discussed in *chapter 2*), the more it appeared a technicist-managerialist Western artefact to me – an artefact that marginalizes human and moral values, especially

those of non-Western cultures. Scholars who see management education as a Western or American artefact, criticize it for talking about certain people in certain ways: such as the white male American as the universal manager, while the others are constructed as a digression from this only acceptable model; only some countries dominate the so-called international texts; if others are mentioned, they are from stereotypical stances. A detailed description of this part of the research was given in *chapter 2*, where I also linked Westernization/Americanization in management education to colonialism in pre-Partition India to show how the colonial history of the place affected its cultural history.

I also mentioned in the previous chapter, that the ‘othering’ of some people and painting particular images of them and their culture had led me into postcolonial theory. According to this theory, it was the colonized subject who was the target of marginalization and stereotyping. Pakistan too had a colonial past; Islam too had been affected by colonialism. In fact, many Islamic traditions were overshadowed by the colonial zeal for secular education (as explained in *chapter 2*). These points had attracted me to postcolonial theory that seemed to address the Westernization/colonization discourse as well as shed light on the Islamic culture lost in the educational syllabi of postcolonial countries. Yet I was conscious of Yin’s (2003a) suggestion that one should look at all theories relevant to one’s study. Theory not only guides research design and data collection, but is also the main vehicle for generalizing results of the case study. For my research I looked at feminist theory, Marxist theory, discourse perspective, as well as poststructuralism and postmodernism. Since I found all of these to highlight one or another aspect of postcolonial theory, I decided to adopt postcolonial theory as my theoretical perspective. Besides, putting together the relationship between history, culture

and education, I thought that if territorial colonialism could affect the culture of the 'subject', could academic imperialism also influence cultural values? I have sought answers for this question not only from the business students and teachers but also from managers in industry who hire and work with business graduates.

3.2 A history of postcolonial theory

Each perspective has a history behind it. Very often social and political circumstances lead to the proliferation of certain ideas that assume the shape of a theoretical perspective. For example, the rise of social movements contesting dominant ideas of race, gender and ethnicity, distribution of global power, and concepts like nationalism and democracy, which have formed modern history, have often led to instabilities and revealed the inadequacies of old narratives of progress and pointed out reasons for addressing contemporary realities (Mongia, 1996). Postcolonial theory is one such attempt. It made its maiden journey as a separate theoretical perspective with the launch of Edward Said's influential text *Orientalism* in 1978. *Orientalism* is considered as the 'antecedent' of postcolonial theory by many philosophers in the field. Though Moore-Gilbert et al (1997) criticize it for not clarifying the fundamental issue of the book – whether *Orientalism* is a cause or consequence of imperialism – they find it 'difficult to overestimate' the importance of Said's contribution to postcolonialism criticism. Before *Orientalism*, Fanon (1970) had alluded to similar thoughts of the black man's destiny lying only in adopting the white man's ways. Then in 1980 and 1982 symposia in Essex publicized works of Spivak and Bhabha. This was followed by *The Empire Writes Back* by the Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies in Birmingham around the same time (Mongia, 1996:3-4).

Since then there has been a stream of postcolonial authors such as Dirlik, Mongia, and Ahmad and postcolonial theory is now a part of such diverse fields of study as management, sociology, literature, and criminal studies (ibid).

3.3 The postcolonial argument

This section presents the major features of postcolonial theory, including the various understandings of the concept, its purpose, its subjects of inquiry, its response to the colonial discourse, its concept of identity and its denial of being a nationalistic struggle.

3.3.1 Understanding the postcolonial argument

The term 'postcolonialism,' inform Moore-Gilbert et al (1997), was first used in 1959. However, it is still a contested term. Moore-Gilbert et al (1997:1) speak of this problem of defining it. 'It is an elusive and contested term. It designates at one and the same time a chronological moment, a political movement, and an intellectual activity. This multiple status makes exact definition difficult.' Hall (1996:242) too puts forward a basic question, 'When was the post-colonial?' Moore-Gilbert et al (1997) reply that if we take 'post' to mean 'after' and 'colonialism' to denote the 'period of imperial rule of foreigners, primarily Western, in other continents,' postcolonialism will mean a 'period after the end of colonial rule'. This is how the term is commonly understood. But the authors do not accept the word 'post' so unquestioningly. They ask whether 'post' means 'after, semi, late, ex or neo?' To them postcolonialism 'hints at withdrawal, liberation and

reunification, a period marked by suspicion of progress' because of the 'degrading past' and 'enslavement of the Other' (Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997: 2).

But to Mongia (1996) and Loomba (1998), postcolonialism is primarily a change in intellectual approaches. Postcolonialism is not a periodization but a

methodological revisionism which enables a wholesale critique of Western structures of knowledge and power, particularly those of the post-Enlightenment period' (Mongia, 1996:2).

Ashcroft, Griffith and Tiffin (1995: xv) see postcolonialism as:

the totality of practices, in all their rich diversity, which characterize the societies of the postcolonial world from the moment of colonization to the present day, since colonialism does not cease with the mere fact of political independence and continues in a neocolonial mode to be active in many societies.

To Dirlik (1996), it is both a period after colonization as well as the discourse on it produced by postcolonial intellectuals. For my understanding of the term, I consider both Ashcroft et al's (1995) and Dirlik's (1996) conceptions necessary. Periodically speaking, I regard postcolonialism as a period after colonialism, and epistemologically as a discussion produced on a variety of practices in the postcolonial world from the moment of colonization to present day.

Postcolonial perspective 'insists...that cultural and political identity is constructed through a process of othering' urging us to rethink the language of cultural community (Bhabha, 1998:219). Along with globalization, postcolonialism believes that culture is the 'site on which Eurocentricism needs to be challenged' (Dirlik et al, 2000:29). Hence postcolonial studies are interested in investigating how stereotypes, images, and

knowledge of colonial subjects and cultures are utilized to serve different institutions of control (Priyadharshini, 2000). My study is one such attempt. Directed at inquiring into the values different MBA programmes are endorsing, my study aims to question whether the local religious values of the students are being *othered* in order to serve certain ends.

3.3.2 The purpose(s) of postcolonial theory

No perspective exists without a purpose (Priyadharshini, 2000). The purpose of the postcolonial perspective is to many, according to Mongia (1996:2), to deconstruct European thinking in areas as wide ranging as philosophy, history, literary studies, anthropology, sociology and political science. Postcolonial theory denies Europe's or America's claim to universality and sees them only as one of the provinces of the world. From an academic point of view, it revisits, but in no way demotes, old canonical works 'that conspired to make the straight white Christian man of property the ethical universal' (Spivak, 1993:275). According to Bhabha (1994:171), postcolonial theorists

formulate their critical revisions around issues of cultural difference, social authority, and political discrimination in order to reveal the antagonistic and ambivalent moments within the *rationalization* of modernity.

I too use this perspective to challenge the discourse of Westernization (as well as the technicist-managerialist thinking, as I will show later) in the field of management education.

This is because, to the postcolonial theorist, authority is not neutral – it is formed and disseminated; it establishes canons of value, it is indistinguishable from certain ideas it

dignifies as true and from perceptions and judgments it transmits. 'It must be analysed,' is his/her message (Said, 1995:19). Hence, postcolonial perspectives challenge those ideological discourses of modernity that attempt to give 'hegemonic normality' to the uneven development and the differential, often disadvantaged, histories of peoples. In a similar vein, by directly asking respondents, by observing classes in schools and by inquiring into school publications, I see myself questioning the authority of the established management curricula and the discourses prevalent in them (for example, technicist-managerialist and Westernization/Americanization) with regard to the work values they are endorsing.

3.3.3 Subjects of inquiry of postcolonialism

Philosophical and theoretical perspectives, due to their selection of topics for problematization, usually look at specific elements in society (Bertman, 1974). The most obvious subjects of postcolonialism are the races which were once colonized. Hence conducting a research study in Pakistan, I see my study of the Pakistani MBA students and teachers as well as managers as one by a postcolonial researcher on a postcolonial race. But since postcolonialism talks as much about the colonizers as the colonized or perhaps even more so, some authors, including Bhabha and Ashcroft et al believe that the subjects of inquiry of postcolonialism should include both these groups (in Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997). Moreover, Loomba (1998) and Young (1995) caution that it should be borne in mind that not all colonized subjects had similar experiences. Spivak (1988) also insists that the subaltern, or the colonized subject, is heterogeneous, with different genders, experiences, and histories, not any singly defined individual. Besides, experiences of

natives varied from America and Australia to India and Africa (Ahmad, 1996; Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997).

The characteristic feature of the *subaltern*¹¹ is often understood to be his/her muteness but this is not unanimously agreed upon by all postcolonial theorists. To Spivak, (s)/he has been silenced. 'There is no space from which the sexed subaltern subject can speak.' If he or she has spoken he or she has not been understood (in the intended way) by the privileged of the first or third worlds (Spivak, 1988:307); to Bhabha (1994), (s)/he has already spoken through mimicry. Loomba (1998) is not too sure of what *speak* means.

Nevertheless in the opinion of (Spivak, 1988:298), 'To ignore the subaltern today is...to continue the imperialist project.' This is one of the major purposes of my study: to find out the opinions and experiences of postcolonial students and teachers in their MBA programmes and those of the managers of their interaction with MBA graduates. To give voice to these postcolonial subjects as to the values being endorsed in the MBA programmes, I have used data collection methods that could allow them to comment freely on their experiences, feelings and opinions. This has enabled me to comment if the subaltern is still being reproduced in the management academia of Pakistan through internalization of certain values, for example, technicist-managerialist or colonial, in opposition to the Islamic.

¹¹ Another postcolonial term, often used by Spivak (1988), for the colonized subject.

3.3.4 Responding to the colonial discourse through the *Minority Discourse*

A set of reading practices, postcolonial study signifies ‘a subjectivity of oppositionality to imperializing/colonizing discourses and practices’ (Loomba, 1998:12) that contribute to the perpetuation of stereotypes and the resulting discrimination and subordination. These re-reading and re-writing practices are called the *Minority Discourse* by Moore-Gilbert et al (1997).

Reading and writing texts, according to postcolonial theorists, whether in print or in electronic media, are never neutral activities; instead there are interests, powers, passions and strategic calculations involved (Said, 1993). The colonists too used particular strategies to write about the natives and strengthen control over them. ‘Fixity,’ ‘rigidity’ and ‘daemonic repetition’ are the main features of colonial discourse, according to Bhabha (1994:79-80). Stereotyping is its primary strategy, which made the native ‘objectified’ and his subjectification possible. Abbot (in Bhabha, 1994) adds discrimination on basis of easily visible characteristics, such as colour and skin of the colonized as well, as contributing to the process of stereotyping and subjectification. Postcolonial theory thus thwarts Marx’s pitiful image of the natives who ‘cannot represent themselves; they must be represented,’ dismisses Balfour’s (French ruler in colonial Egypt) presumption about the native of ‘We know them in and out,’ and challenges Lord Cromer’s arrogant ‘I content myself with noting the fact that somehow or other the Oriental generally acts, speaks and thinks in a manner exactly opposite to the European’ (Said, 1995:39). Some of these images are still apparent in the Western dominated management texts of today, as I detailed in *chapter 2*. In critiquing these

constructs and rejecting the colonial assumption that when the marginalized unite to speak they have nothing to say except ‘incoherent babble’ (JanMohamed and Llyod, 1997: 237), I see my research as a refutation of these pitiful images the dominant Western nations have of the postcolonial races.

In addition to refuting the stereotypical claims of the imperialists, postcolonial reading and writing practices describe and define the common denominators that link various subordinated cultures which share an antagonistic relationship to a dominant culture that marginalized them. Hence, Minority Discourse is an attempt to make the marginalized realize that they actually constitute the majority, help them examine the nature of their marginalization and develop strategies for their re-empowerment (JanMohamed and Llyod, 1997). For example, JanMohamed and Llyod (1997) remind the postcolonial races that their cultures have been erased by the colonists either through ‘institutional forgetting’ (JanMohamed and Llyod, 1997: 239), obliterating minority texts from publication or turning blind to minority concerns. The physical survival of minority groups lies in their recognition of their culture as viable, to break out of such ‘ideological encirclement’. Being a minor is not a matter of essence, but of position – social manipulation and ideological domination (p. 242). This is what is to be articulated. Structures that lead to exploitation and discrimination must be critiqued. Minority Discourse is also wary of pluralism that disguises in its garb the perpetuation of exclusion and hides differences so that the capitalist subject can be produced efficiently. Finally, it believes that those who have undergone the above mentioned damage and discrimination are in a better position to document and analyse ‘how relations of domination can destroy the *human* potential of its victims’ (p. 245). My research too, framed in a qualitative

methodology, has endeavoured to empower the MBA educator and/or student by inviting him/her to reflect on the potential social impact of the curricula he/she is teaching/learning, to see if these curricula reflect Islamic values or are more in harmony with the technicist-managerialist and colonial discourses that marginalize emotional and ethical concerns, especially from non-Western cultures. The ultimate purpose of this project is to enable curriculum developers to frame subsequent curricula in a way that address the country's socio-cultural needs more effectively.

Minority Discourse is much criticized by critics of postcolonial theory. In the words of Moore-Gilbert et al (1997:49), 'the project of Minority Discourse is nothing less than an alliance of the marginalized with the aim of overthrowing the canon together with the state power that produces it.' Moreover, as Ashcroft et al (1989) report, the idea of recovering pre-colonial cultures that Minority Discourse so forcefully promotes is contested by critics who think it is impossible to separate history from the present. JanMohamed and Llyod (1997) respond by saying that the purpose of Minority Discourse is not to degrade the dominant culture but to recover the excluded culture. I too, through my research, want to examine the culture dominant in the MBA programmes and the values (technicist-managerialist, Western/colonial) such a culture is encouraging. I bring Islamic teachings into my analysis of the study not in opposition to the value system of the MBA but because I want to make an attempt to recover them in the Pakistani MBA curriculum.

3.3.5 Search for an identity: *cultural hybridity* and *mimicry*

‘Identities are the names we give to the different ways we are positioned by, and position ourselves within, the narratives of the past’ (Hall, 1998: 225). Hall (1994:122) explains that Freud’s concept of the unconscious and Lacan’s thesis of the contradictory origin of identity that overthrew the concept of a ‘rational scientific man’ so vigorously promoted by the Enlightenment of the eighteenth century form one of the key themes of postcolonial theory. Man’s identity remains always ‘in process,’ ‘incomplete’ as he tries to fill in the ‘lack of wholeness’ from the outside, he explains. Man is like a child who possesses no self-image as a whole person, so by looking into the mirror or at other human beings he imagines himself ‘whole.’ This looking at other men brings him into a symbolic system of language, culture and sexual difference. This entrance or transition is accompanied by contradictory feelings of love/hate for parents, good/bad parts, etc. that remain unresolved and leave him divided for life. However, a part of identity is stable and unchanging, the true self, that needs to be discovered and excavated.

This conception of cultural identity as being constantly processed by external forces has been used by postcolonial authors to explain the Oriental’s tendency to look up to the White man for reassurance of ‘wholeness,’ the colonist’s control of the native’s society through imposition of a secular culture of reform, and the spread of the discourse of modernity and progress (Hall, 1998). Ashcroft et al (1989:9) describe this state of affairs as:

A valid and active self may...have been destroyed by cultural denigration, the conscious and unconscious oppression of indigenous personality and culture by supposedly superior racial or cultural model.

Since the Western or American curricula are (often unhesitatingly) used in most of the postcolonial world, including Pakistan (as I explain in the next chapter), I have looked at the MBA curricula of my case study schools and my research participants' ideas of progress, through interviews, observation studies and readings of schools' official publications, to see whether these schools and students too look up to the Western models for determining their work values.

The coming together of multiple cultures has been described by Bhabha (1998) as *hybridity*. The concept of hybridity comes from the genealogy of difference and the idea of 'cultural translation.' When the latter concept, that sees all cultures as related to one another because of their symbolic activity, denies the incommensurability of cultures as promulgated by the former concept, hybridity emerges. This hybridity or *Third space* gives rise to new positions and to a new area of negotiation of meaning and representation, with the original cultures informing the hybrid one. 'Third space' may

open the way to conceptualizing an international culture, based not on the exoticism of multiculturalism or the diversity of cultures but on the inscription and articulation of cultures' hybridity. To that end we should remember that it is the 'inter' - the cutting edge of translation and negotiation, the in between space - that carries the burden of the managing of culture (Bhabha, 1994:38).

Hybridity proceeds by mimicking a new culture alongside one's own. According to Bhabha (1994:86), mimicry is a 'complex strategy of reform, regulation and discipline.

Describing the hybrid, Bakhtuin (in Bhabha, 1997:58) observes

[The] hybrid is not only double-voiced and double-accented...but is also double-linguaged; for in it there are not only (and not even so much) two individual consciousnesses, two voices, two accents, as there are [doublings of] socio-linguistic consciousnesses, two epochs...that come together and consciously fight it out on the territory of the utterance. It is the collision between differing points of view on the world that are embedded in these forms.

Seeing students' and teachers' enculturation in foreign curricula, I too have looked for instances of hybridity in the values expressed by my research participants.

Despite encouraging the subject to mimic the masters' way, hybridity makes one of two distinct things by retaining distance necessary for subjugation (Young, 1995). For example, mimetic discourses can conceal the fact, through shifts in vocabulary used by authority, that hegemonic structures of authority are maintained (Bhabha, 1994). Challenging the entire concept of development, Bhabha (1994) writes that transfer of technology has not resulted in transfer of power, nor philanthropy in political control. In fact, he questions, 'What is the desire of this repeated demand to modernize? Why does it insist, so compulsively, on its contemporaneous reality, its spatial dimension, its spectral distance?' (ibid: 244). However, he adds that mimicry also 'poses an immanent threat' to disciplinary powers as it is dependent on some difference between the colonist and the colonizer. Hybridity is not simply a compromise, but also subversion and transgression.

Hybridity unsettles the mimetic or narcissistic demands of the colonial power but reimplicates its identifications in strategies of subversion that turn the gaze of the discriminated back upon the eye of power (Bhabha, 1994:112).

Young (1995) adds that hybridity can be intentional or organic. When organic, it creates new spaces, but when intentional, it challenges dominant cultural power. In my research, I have therefore paid special attention to conflicts in mimicking foreign curricula and cultural values that some of my respondents brought out in their conversations.

Ahmad (1996:287) and Loomba (1998) express dissatisfaction with Bhabha's concept of hybridity in that it is undifferentiated by gender, class or race constraints. Dirlik (1996) also calls postcolonial theory to account because of the vagueness of this concept – failing to discriminate between diverse modalities of hybridity, postcolonial theory mimics the Western epistemology it sets out to repudiate.

Regarding his concepts of hybridity, Third Space and mimicry, Bhabha (1998) urges that intellectuals have the responsibility to intervene in such situations of political negotiation. In my research, I have thus looked at how the cultural identities of the MBA students are being influenced by their educational milieu, by the discourses prevalent in management academe, and whether there are instances of hybridity between cultures of Islam and the Western MBA, and if so, is any conflict acknowledged.

3.3.6 Not a nationalistic struggle

Several postcolonial authors are wary of a nationalistic struggle that ideas of difference and an urge to recover one's culture can produce. In Said's (1993) opinion, nationalism is coercive and not a panacea for dealing with economic and social disparities. In fact, his concept of 'Orientalism' is precisely a rebuttal of the idea of forcing people and cultures into 'distinct breeds or essences.' He says

No one can deny the persisting continuities of long traditions, sustained habitations, national languages, and cultural geographies, but there seems no reason except fear and prejudice to keep insisting on their separation and distinctiveness, as if that was all human life was about (1994: 336).

Mongia (1996) and Dirlik (1996) too remain distrustful of the nationalist project. My research too is not an attempt to devalue other cultures in a nationalistic spirit. On the contrary, it is aimed at (ultimately) recovering the Islamic values marginalized by the discourses dominant in the MBA culture.

In the preceding paragraphs I described salient features of postcolonial theory that are unique to it. In the next section I look at those aspects of this theoretical perspective that it shares with other theoretical and philosophical perspectives.

3.4 Postcolonialism and other perspectives: interdisciplinarity of purpose and methodology

The postcolonial perspective is interdisciplinary: it utilizes Foucault's notions of power and discourse, Marxist socialism, theories of feminism, poststructuralism and postmodernism, and theories of identity given by Hall. In order to understand postcolonialism, I deem it essential to have a good understanding of how these perspectives and theories relate to postcolonial theory. As I explain the relationship between the postcolonial theory and these other theories and perspectives, I also note down how these common elements can answer my research questions, that is the how these common points can shed light on the values endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes. Psychoanalysis was covered briefly earlier under the topic of identity; the rest of the perspectives and theories are detailed below.

3.4.1 Postcolonialism and the discourse perspective: questions of ideology and consent

I see the postcolonial theory as a challenge to the colonial discourse. Based on Foucault's ideas of discourses, postcolonial theory confronts the discourse of colonialism by critically analyzing structures of authority (Said, 1995), deconstructing European thoughts that privilege some over others (Mongia, 1996), and challenging the concept of modernity that decides what is progress (Bhabha, 1994). Explaining the term discourse, Gee (1996: 10) writes

A discourse is composed of ways of talking, listening, reading, writing, interacting, believing, valuing and using tools and objects, in part settings and at specific times, so as to display or to recognize a particular social identity... The discourse creates social positions or perspectives from which people are 'invited' 'summoned' to speak, listen, act, read and write, think, feel, believe, and value in certain characteristic, historically recognizable ways, in combination with their own individual style and creativity.

From a postcolonial view, Loomba (1998: 39) says that in determining what is to be included and what is to be excluded, what is acceptable and what is not, discourses make it difficult for people to think outside of them. Hence, they are exercises in power and control. I mentioned two discourses – technicist-managerialist and Westernization/Americanization – in management education of today, in *chapter 2*, that I think could be influencing the values of Pakistani MBA students. Thus my research is a critique of these discourses from the viewpoint of Pakistani MBA education. In addition, I have also pointed out other discourses, such as the MNC discourse, in the present day management education of the country.

A discursive strategy that is often used to advance certain interests is that of ideology. Ideology, born in the turmoil of the French revolution of 1789, marks an epoch of secular, scientific rationality, which aims to liberate man from mystifications, false reverences and absolute monarchy and restore him to dignity as a fully rational and self-determined being. Theories of ideology explain why people hold certain views. They assert that for oppressed people to emancipate themselves, they must understand how the social system works and their position within it (Eagleton, 1994a). However, Eagleton (1994b:58) also argues that ‘Ideologies exist because there are things which must at all costs not be thought, let alone spoken.’ Ideologies may be group interests but they need to work through and upon individuals. Ideology is a discursive strategy for spuriously accounting for embarrassing realities. In so doing it contributes to the power’s self-legitimation. According to Prasad and Cavanaugh (1997:313)

Ideology is distorted knowledge because it fails to unveil social contradictions, and ideology is a device for perpetuating elite domination because it conceals rather than critiques.

Eagleton (1994a) also believes that though emancipatory, ideologies hint at converting mind to a material, fully predictable object. In other words, every oppressive power depends on the consent of the subjugated. But consent is usually given when one has some benefit in doing so or harm in not doing so. This idea forms another key link in the chain of thought of the postcolonial argument. Several postcolonial authors believe that without the host country’s collaboration, Europe would not have conquered them (see for example, Said, 1993; Dirlik et al, 2000). Until as late as 1930-40s, eager students from various colonized countries kept visiting colonizing countries to learn their ways (Said,

1993). Clegg et al (2000:110) also observe, ‘imperialism colonizes those who get too close without opposing it vigorously on its own ground.’

I do not think the state of affairs is much changed today. Management educators and practitioners in many developing countries are still dependent on management gurus of the West for management knowledge and know-how (as I have argued in *chapter 2*). In my research, I have tried to see if management education is operating like an ideology (whether technicist-managerialist and/or Western/American) in the case of Pakistan. Since ideology works in a system of give and take, I have tried to notice if any of my respondents derive any benefit from promoting such ideologies or discourses.

3.4.2 Postcolonialism and feminism: issues of domination-subordination and masculine objectivity

Both feminist and postcolonial theorists break away from dominant Western, patriarchal philosophies and investigate how certain categories of people (such as women, the colonized) are subjected to ideologies (positivistic, colonial) that justify their exploitation. Frequently, feminist theorists try to find out some kind of analysis and explanation of how and why women have less power than men and how this imbalance could be challenged and transformed (Priyadharshini, 2000). They do this by challenging ways of representing history and culture which they view as sites of oppression. Postcolonists too are concerned with analyzing authority structures (Said, 1993) and rereading the colonial literature to recover lost cultures buried under their texts. My research too is an endeavour

in the same vein to (ultimately) recover Islamic values in the management education of Pakistan.

Feminists hold colonialism responsible for instituting a hypermasculine culture of aggressive imperialism that subjugated 'feminine' territory. Considering language as a tool of domination and a means of constructing identity, they impugn literary texts of hiding political affiliations and creating stereotypical images of particular groups. Postcolonial theorists too, for example, bell hooks, Spivak and Bhabha, foreground the role of theory in the perpetuation of the domination-subordination relationships. Regarding colonialism as far from over, bell hooks declares (in Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997:44-5)

Politically, we do not live in a postcolonial world, because the mindset of neo-colonialism shapes the underlying metaphysics of White supremacist capitalist patriarchy.

Even today, all Third World women are clumped together as one in Western texts, especially management, which is described as a male-dominated discipline. Issues of emotion and feelings are ignored and instead a very positivistic and objective philosophy rules the Western model (Priyadharshini, 2000; also see Spivak, 1988), for example, through the positivistic or technicist-managerialist model (as I have discussed in detail in *chapter 2*). In contrast, feminist theory puts forward an 'ethics of care' (Hughes, 2000). Feminists consider objectivity to be masculine, although human nature has both masculine and feminine elements: man needs both political domination and social reproduction. Not only individual, but national interest too is multidimensional and contextually contingent, not power-based, but cooperative. In other words, power is

masculine and assumes universal validity, whereas empowerment is feminine. Not only power, but also morality and justice are necessary for ensuring social reproduction (Tickner in Smith, 2001). Feminists are deeply concerned about ameliorating the worst excesses of competitive and individualistic societies. Rather than living as separated beings, they emphasize the ways in which human beings can live together (Hughes, 2000). Keen to know if business students are being introduced to any 'ethics of care,' I have asked my respondents questions about the various values, especially about ethics and social responsibility, which they feel are being endorsed in their MBA programmes. At the same time, I have noted their comments on the dominant and subordinate values (systems) in their curricula. Moreover, I have collected views and opinions of various stakeholders in the MBA programmes, through open-ended in-depth interviews, to allow all different participants of this community to air their views freely. Even when I have used observation studies and schools' official publications, I have asked for interviewees' comments on what I saw or read. Thus my research methodology has also tried to address postcolonial and feminist concerns about domination and marginalization.

Both postcolonial and feminist perspectives also agree on the combination of coercion and consent for the realization of domination. Transformation of the desires and practices of the oppressed and the oppressed's passive acquiescence or active adoption of the oppressor's ways are necessary conditions for winning control of him (Priyadharshini, 2000). I too have tried to inquire into the advantages the business schools and students derive out of agreeing to their subordination to foreign syllabi that marginalize emotional and ethical values.

3.4.3 Postcolonialism, Marxism and post-Marxism: concept of class and the critique of capitalism

Marxism gives the concept of class based on economic prosperity and a critique of the capitalist mode of production. Some Marxists believe that imperialism is still in some sense alive as a major feature of such a system (Sutcliffe, 1977). They see multinational corporations and international organizations, which constrain state as well as individual behaviour, as the major 'classes' in a capitalist economy. The rest of the world can be seen as peripheral or semi-peripheral to this core of dominant market players (Baylis and Smith, 2001). Many postcolonial authors hold the same views about capitalism. They therefore visit colonial texts and other contemporary capitalist literature, such as management texts and modern ideas of progress, to expose the new form of imperialism. My research too explores whether colonialism is still alive in the field of Pakistani management education of today, for example, in its values about work, and whether these values reflect the capitalistic and technicist-managerialist ideas of economically and materially defined prosperity and elitism.

Though Marxists and postcolonialists join together in their condemnation of the exploitative capitalistic system, postcolonialism does not agree with Marxist tendency of reducing social, cultural, and political actions to mere economic determinants. In fact, Bhabha is 'hostile' to the idea, and Said 'skeptical' of it. Spivak seems more 'affirmative' of it (Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997:27). Dirlik (1996) is also not a party to Marxist philosophy, though he acknowledges that postcolonial theory is inspired by Marxism. Marxism, on the other hand, sees postcolonial history as only a transition to capitalism.

Many postcolonial theorists are also uncomfortable with Marxist somewhat rigid system of classes, which they find 'unconsciously Eurocentric' (Ashcroft et al, 1989). Besides, postcolonialism sees Marxism as 'bound up with logics of foundationalism and metanarratives' (Cornbridge, 1994:98). Post-Marxists, on the other hand, think it is necessary to examine 'multiple sites of oppression.' For them, not speaking for Others is as foundational a claim as the suggestion that one should speak for them (ibid: 102).

3.4.4 Postcolonialism and poststructuralism: significance of social construction and exclusion

Poststructuralism undertakes to examine the structural significance of dualistic constructs, such as sacred/profane, black/white, nature/culture that are often found in the logic of rugged individualism and the genres used by mass media and the promoters of consumer culture (Scholte, 2001; Hirschman, 2003). It sees how these ideas are learnt over time and naturalized into general truths. Poststructuralism perceives the world as 'constructed by texts' that privilege some ideas over others. This textual interplay can be exposed by deconstructing texts, that is, by showing how 'artificial stabilities' in texts are achieved by using seemingly objective and natural oppositions in language (Smith, 2001:240). Basically anti-foundationalist, poststructural theorists, in fact, look skeptically at the very concepts of learning (AlAli, 1998). To Chow (1996), poststructuralists dismiss anything spontaneous and self-evident.

The purpose of postcolonial inquiry too is to contest colonial constructs about cultures of the colonized races by exposing how strategies of stereotyping and misrepresentation did

and still are achieving particular images of the (post)colonized people. In fact, the languages of postcolonialism and poststructuralism are so similar that Dirlik (1996) states that the language of postcolonialism is that of First World poststructuralism. Poststructuralism's concerns about managing, representation and subjectivity are also found in postcolonial theorizations. Such incidence of 'opposing constructs' (Poole, 1996) through strategies of marginalization, stereotyping and misrepresentation, are particularly relevant to the discipline of management education, as I showed in my discussions on the technicist-managerialist and Westernization/colonization discourses in *chapter 2*. I have also looked for such 'opposing constructs,' for example, personal/social, rational/emotional, religion/non-religion in the analysis of my research data (from respondents' interviews, my observations and school publications) while studying the Pakistani MBA education in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures. In addition, postcolonialism and poststructuralism both see Western epistemology as a system of exclusion. According to Spivak (1988:292), 'The question is how to keep the ethnocentric Subject from establishing itself by selectively defining an Other.' Both perspectives ask, 'How many people are left out of our [American] theories? With what consequences? What differences are not represented in these assumptions?' (Calas and Smircich, 1999). I too have questioned the lack of Islamic, ethical and emotional element, that I believe results from submitting to such dualistic constructs, in the values obtained from my research data.

Though postcolonialism is blamed for its proximity to 'regressive politics' of poststructural theory, postcolonialism gives an argument in favour of this association by acknowledging that it is this parentage that has taught it to diagnose the epistemological

implications of colonialism (Priyadharshini, 2000). However, a point of departure between the two perspectives is the poststructural discomfort with the analytical categories and representational approaches postcolonial theory gives to the Others to represent themselves in, in their own terms. For example, Calas and Smircich (1999) see the postcolonial use of terms, such as *woman* and *native*, as universalistic constructs, as if all women and all natives, no matter where they came from, were essentially similar. The authors consider such practices ethnocentric.

3.4.5 Postcolonialism, modernism and postmodernism: questioning universal rationality and progress

According to Giroux (1997:184), 'the notion of social modernity corresponds with the tradition of the new, the process of economic and social organization carried out under the growing relations of capitalist production.' It celebrates rationality as the guiding force and modernism as 'synonymous with civilization itself.'

Postmodernism is 'some kind of crisis in or departure from the circumstances of modernity' (Scholte, 1996:21) for it sees the 'uneven development of modern world founded in the exploitative and anarchic logics of expanded commodity production' (Cornbridge, 1994:102) that turns everything, including religion, 'for sale' (Mongia, 1996). Giroux (1997:192-3) appraises it as

The value of postmodernism lies in its role as a shifting signifier that both reflects and contributes to the unstable cultural and structural relationships that increasingly characterize the advanced industrial countries of the West...It refus[es] all natural laws and transcendental claims that by definition attempt to escape from any type of historical and normative grounding.

Postmodernism has also attacked those forms of academic knowledge, for example in management education, that serve to reproduce the dominant Western culture as a superior academic and cultural model, immune from any kind of historical or social criticism (Giroux, 1997). It refutes any society's claim of exclusivity (Appiah, 1996). Instead, postmodern thinkers reconsider questions of power and subordination, and make visible important ideological and structural forces that construct race, class and gender. Since truth is never immune from power, according to them, there is no truth. If something is asserted as the truth, it is only in certain discourses (Smith, 2001). This is precisely the postcolonial response and my critique through this research on the discourses of colonialism and technicist-managerialism that have resulted in the fortification of the imperial hold in the management education of today.

Like postmodernism, postcolonialism also celebrates plurality of voices of all, especially of those who have been marginalized. It also shares postmodernist suspicion of the electronic media 'as apparatuses of cultural production' (Giroux, 1997:200) capable of transgressing cultural borders. Both perspectives observe the critical and ethical element missing from educational syllabi. Moreover, as Cornbridge (1994:95) observes

In a quite fundamental way, the voices of postmodernism and postcolonialism force us to ask what should be the first question(s) of development studies: What is development? Who says this is what it is? Who is it for? Who aims to direct it, and for whom?

I too have inquired into the values endorsed in the MBA education of today to comment on respondents' understandings of success and development, the values (ethical, emotional, professional) they think are necessary to achieve these and whether these values are more in harmony with Islamic teachings and/or technicist-managerialist,

colonial or modernistic ideas. Asking opinions and views of various stakeholders in MBA education, I have also tried to give voice to plural voices.

However, postmodernism promotes diversity more emphatically than the postcolonialism and is not content with postcolonialism's stereotypical descriptions of the *Oriental*, *native*, etc. Moreover, it stresses more vigorously the need to include ethics in curricula to fight against inequality and safeguard human rights (ibid). On the other hand, according to Kincheloe and McLaren (1998), postmodernism fails to analyse enunciation of oppression in relation to larger dominating structures of oppression.

3.5 Critiquing postcolonial theory

Despite the significance of postcolonialism to my research, I would like to point out some criticism the theory has invited. In the following paragraphs I present a debate around these points as well as my response, through this research and by what I have understood about this theory, to these criticisms.

3.5.1 Contesting the purpose(s) of postcolonial theory

A criticism about the basics of the postcolonial inquiry is that its central purpose is not clearly understood, perhaps because of the diffused usage of the term. Aijaz Ahmad tries to frame the problem (1996: 283)

‘Colonialism’ thus becomes a transhistorical thing, always present and always in process of dissolution in one part of the world or another, so that everyone gets the privilege, sooner or later, at one time or another, of being coloniser, colonised and postcolonial.

Moore-Gilbert et al (1997:3) ask whether postcolonialism occupies a space between the ivory tower of academia and the cultural community, a place between Marxism and existentialism, or between literary and cultural studies. Postcolonial critics, observes Dirlik (1996:295), have also generally remained silent on the relationship of postcolonialism to contemporary capitalism. Loomba (1998) informs us that Eagleton also criticizes postcolonial theory for not talking about economic exploitation. In her opinion, the theory does include a reference to economics, though it is not often included in mainstream postcolonial debates. Responding to some of these criticisms, I can say that my research is framed in the background of a capitalistic education system and I have made an attempt (even though slight) to raise questions about MBA graduates’ exploitation by the multinational industrial sector. However, in my opinion, though the postcolonial theory inspires people to struggle to achieve social change and deconstructs the colonial mystique, it does not shed enough light on how to construct a new world order or suggest whether there will be something of a world order in future. This leads critics, such as Moore-Gilbert et al (1997) to assert that postcolonialism is not about securing consent or consensus, but about negotiating the difference between consent and dissent. ‘It is to the maintenance of this productive dissensus, rather than its resolution, that the most challenging work in this field is dedicated’ (ibid: 6).

3.5.2 Debating ‘methodological debility’ in postcolonial theory

Drawing upon Foucault’s ideas on power, feminist poststructuralism, textual deconstructionism, and Freud’s and Lacan’s psychoanalysis, postcolonial theory is also criticized for being too elastic. Besides, some of the theories it borrows from, for example poststructuralism, are considered ‘politically regressive’ by many, while others, such as Freud’s psychoanalysis, are still combating charges of ‘methodological debility’ (Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997:60). Postcolonialists, such as Spivak (1988) reply to this by pointing out that colonialism affected different people in different ways and hence, there can be no one way of analyzing their experiences. Besides, this ‘clash of epistemes’ or comparative methodologies make postcolonial theory well rounded and provides conditions for theoretical innovation (Bhabha, 1994; Ashcroft et al, 1989). The language of postcolonialism is also accused for being ‘lucid,’ ‘complex,’ and interspersed with ‘inflationary rhetoric’ (Ketu Katrak, in Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997:61). Using Western tradition to understand Eastern problems is a ‘hybrid’ methodology, according to Ashcroft et al (1989:36), something the postcolonial theorist him/herself looks suspiciously at. Agreeing with Spivak and Bhabha, I too think that it is the fluid methodology of postcolonial inquiry that has made the theory relevant in several fields of study, ranging from literature, to politics, to sociology and to management. My research too makes use of these several methodological tools in order to study the values endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes, from the point of view of different stakeholders. Without so much methodological flexibility, I would have been compelled to limit my research to a few groups of respondents, data sources or data collection methods. Even if such a methodology be considered ‘hybrid’ and not free of tensions, I have acknowledged

the limitations in such a methodology, while making use of its advantageous features (c.f. chapter 9).

Another point of criticism against the epistemology and methodologies of postcolonialism, particularly against the ‘Holy Trinity’ of Said-Spivak-Bhabha (Young, 1995:163) and Fanon, is that they have spent major parts of their lives in the West and borrowed heavily from the European tradition (Dirlik, 1996). This makes many question their claim of speaking for the people they have not lived long enough with (Ashcroft et al, 1989:39). Postcolonial texts, observes Shohat (1996) have also remained dependent on the very structures they are interested in dismantling. The term postcolonial itself ‘linguistically reproduces, once again, the centrality of the colonial narrative’ (ibid: 328). I would reply to this by acknowledging that though these pioneers of postcolonial theory may have spent significant proportions of their lives in Western countries and even if their contributions reflect Western epistemes, they have at least laid the foundation for subsequent postcolonial researchers to develop the theory and improve upon its arguments. My research too, though in no way comparable to these celebrated authors’, makes a slight addition to postcolonial epistemology and methodology by utilizing texts from non-Western sources, for example, management texts and data from Pakistan and religious texts from Islam.

3.5.3 Critically examining the salient features of postcolonial theory

Individual features of postcolonial theory have also been criticized by some. For example, Spivak has been called to account by Ashcroft et al (1989) for speaking for the subaltern

despite her fervent claims that the *subaltern* has no place to speak (Spivak, 1988), and for underlining the importance of Derrida's work for understanding the native, despite pronouncing that only 'the native can know the native' (Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997). Spivak replies that Said's work has given us a place to speak from (Spivak, 1996:200). Loomba, on the other hand points out, we first need to define 'speak' (1998). Though I do not agree with Spivak's view that the postcolonial subject has no place to speak from, I value her comment on not ignoring the native. My research too is such an attempt. But instead of speaking for the postcolonial subjects, I have offered them (postcolonial management teachers, students and practitioners) an opportunity to speak of their views and opinions about their MBA programmes and/or with MBA students.

Bhabha's (1994) concept of hybridity is also criticized by Dirlik (1996) for being vague and failing to distinguish between types of hybridity. Though Bhabha may not have given details of hybridity, subsequent postcolonial researches, such as mentioned in this study (c.f. 3.6) and even my own, have problematized the concept of hybridity and illuminated various aspects of it.

The project of Minority Discourse is also taken by critics to mark not only the return of the native but also the return of Eurocentricism. The project of Minority Discourse is nothing less than a collaborative effort on the part of the marginalized to overthrow the canon and the state power that produced it, contend Moore-Gilbert et al (1997:49). Moore-Gilbert et al (1997) also detect such proletarian tendencies in Spivak's concept of the *subaltern* and to a lesser extent in Fanon's writings. For them Fanon-Algeria and Said-Palestine associations as well as some postcolonists' insistence on class reorients the

concept of class. JanMohamed and Lloyd's (1997) response to this is that the project of Minority Discourse is only to recover lost cultures. My research too, even if it be called a part of the Minority Discourse, is intended to recover the lost Islamic values in management education of Pakistan. It does not aim to devalue the management cannon, but suggests to the imperialist educator and the management subaltern to look critically and realistically at the established cannon to identify shortcomings in its knowledge.

Moore-Gilbert et al (1997) also question that though some postcolonial authors, such as Said (1993) and Dirlik (1996), distrust nationalism, why do others, such as Bhabha (1994), retain cultural difference. Loomba's (1998:13) reply to that is why should there be a homogenization of a 'white culture.' I add, why shouldn't there be an attempt to recover lost cultural values and why should such an attempt be seen in a nationalistic light? Thus my research is not a nationalistic project, but an attempt to salvage some of the Islamic values buried under the colonial project.

3.5.4 Can postcolonial theory be called a discourse?

Finally some critics of postcolonial theory, such as Dirlik (1996) and Moore-Gilbert et al (1997), often refer to it as a discourse. Ashcroft et al (1989) also call postcolonial theory a discourse or a conglomerate between several discourses 'grounded in a struggle for power.' In my view, this discursive label is misapplied. Not only is the definition and methodology of postcolonial theory not fixed, unlike the case with discourses, but different authors have used it differently to air different ideas. It does not define any truths or any acceptable rules of speaking or writing but is itself fiercely against rigidity

of metanarratives (see Gee, 1996, for explanation of discourse). Besides, though postcolonialism shares much with the discourse perspective, it must be remembered that what postcolonial authors discuss is not 'postcolonial discourse,' but rather a problematization of the colonial discourse. Moreover, the reference of Moore-Gilbert et al (1997:49) to the reading/writing practices of postcolonialists as the 'Minority Discourse,' is a term they have used to criticize what in their opinion is a dogmatic project of overthrowing the European canon. Even if they consider this project as discursive, they do not refer to the entire postcolonial theory as a discourse. Instead they mostly use the word 'theory' to critique postcolonialism, as do other critics, such as Ashcroft et al. (1989) and Dirlik (1996).

Despite the criticism faced by postcolonial theory, Moore-Gilbert et al (1997:57) acknowledge that

postcolonialism has transformed university syllabuses, reconsidered and extended established canons, constructed an expanding material base of journals, conferences and academic networks, stimulated new areas of both academic and non-academic publishing and changed the way that a whole range of academic disciplines have traditionally been configured and studied.

Yet they do not forget to add that within Euro-American academy postcolonialism is still not recognized as an 'important or even distinct mode of cultural analysis' (ibid: 57). Even though, in a small way, I hope my research can contribute to the recognition of postcolonial theory as a distinct theoretical perspective.

3.6 Research using the postcolonial perspective

Before I describe my methodology in the next chapter, I would like to give the reader an insight into the kind of researches, including their methodological and philosophical approaches, which are being conducted using the postcolonial perspective. The postcolonial perspective is rather flexible in its methodological approach. Researches using postcolonial theory have employed a variety of qualitative techniques, ranging from interviews to textual analysis, to address their questions. At the same time, they often use the theory in conjunction with other notions that have informed the postcolonial theory. Presented below are some such examples.

A study in management education which I found strikingly similar to mine is that of Priyadharshini's (2000). The author uses deconstructive ethnography to explore elements reminiscent of the colonial era in the curricula and teaching methodology of two Indian MBA programmes. She brings out through the use of postcolonial, as well as the feminist and discourse perspectives, students' fantasy of the MBA as a ticket to a life of modernity and material success, their disregard for the universal application of the Western management thought, as well as the tension some feel in working like a cog in the capitalistic machinery. Works of Foucault, Said, Spivak, and Bhabha form the cornerstone of Priyadharshini's thesis. Parameswaran (1999) has also used an ethnographic approach, along with interviews and observations, in her postcolonial study to examine the reception of imported popular novels among urban Indian women.

Moulette's (2003) study contests the idea of fixed identities. He maintains that colonialism is not limited to specific time and place, but can be related to all kinds of power relationships, for example, to cross-cultural encounter. With the help of in-depth interviews, based on the conversation technique and observation of three meetings in three companies, as well as Glaser and Strauss's grounded theory, the author studied adaptation attitudes of people in foreign countries. Some respondents gave accounts of successful adaptation, while others spoke of divided selves and confessed a change in their self-images as a result of cross-cultural interaction. Thus the researcher demonstrates that identity is not a fixed and finished product. Bradley and Hebson's (1999) study of class categorization behaviour of non-native English residents of Bristol, also based on open-ended interviews and Hall's and Bhabha's ideas on identity and class hybridity, showed similar results.

In the field of marketing, Thompson and Tambyah (1999) use textual analysis of phenomenologically oriented interviews, employing the postcolonial and poststructural perspectives, to study the role of marketing in promoting *modern* ideas of consumerism. Armond (2001) employs a critical hermeneutical analysis from a postcolonial vein, to see how 'international accounting' is 'constructed' and to identify some forces shaping this construction. A paper by Caldas and Alcadipani (2003) unveils the recolonization of Brazil after World War II. Using historical documents, the authors describe how national development, conceived of as a process of modernization, extended an open invitation to multinationals, imported managerial technology from America, and negotiated between the Ministry of Education and USAID to contribute to the growing influence of America in Brazil.

Westwood and Kirkbride's (1998) study of a Hong Kong company documents how the American culture, with all its elements familiar and non-familiar to local people, is being brought to the company through a variety of activities. Using observation and a simple textual analysis of the company's mission statement and logo and its promotion of certain American texts, and even the architecture of buildings – elements heavily borrowed from the American style – the authors raise questions about the value of successfully transplanting Western notions into an Asian company's culture.

My research explores the work values endorsed in the MBA curricula of two business schools in Pakistan. Collecting data from various stakeholders in management education (students and teachers in business schools and managers in industry) through open-ended interviews, supplemented with observation studies and schools' official publications, I have tried to shed light on how far these values are in harmony with Islam and/or reflective of other main discourses in MBA education of today – technicist-managerialist and Westernization/colonialism. I have used the postcolonial perspective to conduct this study not only because I am interested in inquiring into the incidence of Westernization/colonialism in postcolonial Pakistani MBA education, but also because certain characteristic features of technicist-managerialist thinking, such as marginalization of certain ideas and values, rationalistic constructs of progress and modernity (as I mentioned in my discussions above) are also challenged by postcolonial authors. Thus the postcolonial perspective offers a suitable lens to critique Pakistani MBA education of today.

3.7 Chapter Summary

In this chapter I described my theoretical perspective of study, along with its critiques and its relevance to my research. Though I had been interested in the theory on account of its addressing the Westernization/colonization discourse in management education and its promise to shed light on the values of Islam lost in colonial educational agenda, I also found it to critique the technicist-managerialist discourse I discussed in *chapter 2*. I have thus chosen it as my theoretical perspective for this research. In this chapter I have noted how the theory's unique characteristics as well as points in common with other perspectives have helped me frame my research questions, develop my analysis and select my research methods. For example, I mentioned how the unique features of the postcolonial theory, such as that of the subaltern, mimicry, hybridity, consent, and Minority Discourse relate to specific elements in my research topic and how I have used them to research whether Islamic values are being othered and whether the subaltern is being reproduced in the MBA curricula by mimicking the curricula of foreign countries; in the spirit of the Minority Discourse, I have pointed out Islamic values lost in socialization in imported curricula; regarding issues of identity, I have identified any instances of hybridity and mimicry in the curricula and the values of the Pakistani MBA education of today.

Regarding features of postcolonial theory in common with discourse, feminist, Marxist, postmodernist and poststructuralist perspectives I found it to challenge the authority of discourses, question marginalization of other cultures' ethical and social values, contest capitalistic ideas of (career) development, confront modernity's narrative of progress, and

challenge the dominance of the colonial constructs in the spirit of each of these perspectives respectively. Thus in my data collection, I questioned respondents about their ideas of progress, their comments on the case study schools' curricula content, development and teaching and some of the values they believed were being endorsed in MBA programmes. In my analysis I identified any discourses and ideologies, pointed out issues of marginalization of ethical and emotional concepts and values in MBA curricula, and critically looked at the narratives of progress and development, domination and subordination that respondents mentioned in their interviews or I found in my observation studies or readings of schools' official publications.

In addition to data collection and analysis, I also used the postcolonial theory to select my data collection and analytical methods. In order to give voice to the postcolonial subjects' views and feelings, I allowed respondents, through open-ended interviews, to comment freely on their experiences and opinions of MBA degree programmes and MBA graduates. To supplement interview findings, I conducted observation studies and read official publications of schools. But even these were taken back to the respondents to ask for their views on the relevant pieces of information I gathered from these sources. Use of multiple methods therefore helped to reduce any personal bias in the collection of data. To prevent preconceived notions from colouring my understanding of data, I used an analytical procedure which allowed for emergence of my interpretation without any predefined reference points or hypotheses. A detailed account of all these methods is given in *chapter 5*.

In the next chapter I would like to give a brief contextual account of Pakistan and my respondents before moving on to describe my research methodology and data findings. By providing this context I expect to present my findings more realistically.

4.0	CHAPTER 4: CONTEXTUALIZING MY STUDY	94
4.1	Postcolonial Pakistan: A brief socio-economic and political history	94
4.1.1	Local influences in Pakistani socio-economic and political spheres	95
4.1.2	American influence in Pakistani socio-economic and political spheres	99
4.1.3	Pakistani society and social values today	100
4.2	Background of Management Education in Pakistan	102
4.2.1	Education in Pakistan: a socio-political and historical account	102
4.2.2	Management education in Pakistan: a socio-historical account	105
4.2.2.1	<i>The Pakistani MBA in the beginning</i>	<i>105</i>
4.2.2.2	<i>The Pakistani MBA today</i>	<i>106</i>

CHAPTER 4: CONTEXTUALIZING MY STUDY

In *chapter 2*, I presented two discourses in management education that in my opinion could be contributing to the value system of the MBA – the technicist-managerialist and the Westernization/Americanization. I also gave an account of how the American discourse relates to colonialism and in *chapter 3*, why I chose postcolonial theory as my theoretical perspective for this study. Before I relate all these viewpoints to my research (in *chapters 6, 7 and 8*), I would like to brief my readers on the socio-economic and political history of Pakistan. I would also like to describe the current situation of management education in the country, with special emphasis on the two business schools I have selected to study. These sketches will hopefully be helpful in obtaining insight into how management education has evolved in the country and where it is heading. Hughes (1999: 288) has a similar observation about presenting context:

Context is the backdrop of sense-making. Recognizing context allows the researcher to extrapolate subjective and shared meanings, to consider the multiple phenomena which constitute the life of the case, to consider the links between internal and external environments, formal and informal processes.

4.1 Postcolonial Pakistan: A brief socio-economic and political history

The Western part of the Indian peninsula, once part of the Mughal empire of the Indian subcontinent, had been colonized by the British since the eighteenth century. It became part of the British empire when the *Raj* (British rule in the Indian subcontinent) was officially established in 1857. After a full-fledged colonial rule that lasted almost 200 years (from the point of establishment of unofficial colonies in 1757) that did to radically

alter the future and fortune of the subcontinent, Pakistan was finally born on August 14, 1947.

The colonial history of undivided India from the standpoint of my research was summarized in *chapter 2*. The following paragraphs give a brief historical view of the influences in Pakistan's socio-economic and political spheres ever since its independence from British rule in 1947. They also present, in the words of respondents, a comment on the current socio-economic thought in the country.

4.1.1 Local influences in Pakistani socio-economic and political spheres

According to Alavi (1998), Pakistani society at the time of Independence was divided into three major classes – the feudal or landholding class, the salaried middle class and the labour class. On top of these was a Westernized ruling elite which 'as a result of its educational system...reflected values that were part Westernized and part liberal' (Ahmed, 1998:5). A small group of industrialists also formed part of the society, along with the other three classes. They came either from the landed class or took charge of factories handed over to them by the government in 1947 (Patnaik, 1977). Today this segment has grown larger to include those who have moved up the economic ladder from the salaried class.

The only segment of the society that has been both politically and economically potent ever since Independence is the feudal class. Owning lands, they are actively involved in capitalist industries by supplying raw material to transnational corporations. Berberoglu

(1987) considers them 'imperialist allies'. Under Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's regime of 1970s their hold extended to the political sphere as well. Though they met with resistance from the military governments of the 1960s and 1980s and the upcoming bureaucracy, they have never relinquished their hold of the economy or politics (Alavi, 1990). For example, it is reported that even today they own almost 80% of the total resources of the country (Siddiqui, 2005).

Pakistan also inherited a *salariat* or the formally educated class at the time of Partition. It comprised the bureaucracy at the top, the scribes at the bottom and the intelligentsia in the middle. Educated in British style convents, grammar schools and colleges (Haq and Haq, 1998), the *salariat* was 'produced' by the colonizers to fit into the 'state apparatus' (Alavi, 1990:32; also see Khilji, 2001). 'As men of routine rather than audacity and imagination, they tend to have small conception of growth and change' as C.B. Marshall (from the US State Department of Policy Planning, 1959, quoted in Alavi, 1990:34) described the bureaucrats, they never got involved in issues of state policy and strategy until 1960s. However, since then they have time and again fletched their political muscle during different military regimes.

According to Alavi (1990), the subdivision of the society that had mused at all over the political and socio-economic future of the country had been the intelligentsia – the salaried class of academics, journalists and writers. They spearheaded the Freedom Movement of the 1930s and 1940s in the subcontinent and remained somewhat active until the 1960s. But the rise of the bureaucrats stripped the thinkers and educators of their social influence to the point of general apathy. Siddiqui (2005) believes that they

themselves were disunited and selfish and never gave enough thought to social service (Siddiqui, 2005).

Uniting all these various classes was the religion Islam, which had a significant influence on the socio-political, including educational (c.f. section 4.2) and economic spheres of Pakistan. The next few paragraphs present a history of Islamic governance in Pakistan:

Pakistan is the only country on the world to be claimed on Islamic grounds (Mahmood, 1985). It was conceived of as a state based on Islamic values, as in the Objectives Resolution of 1949, but not as a theocratic state (Mir, 1986). However, Islamic governance in the country has not followed a steady path but has undergone fluctuations over the country's history.

Ahmed (1998) and Siddiqui (2005) summarize the Islamic trends in Pakistan from the time of its birth to the present day. According to Ahmed, from 1947-71, a Westernized or modernized Islam prevailed in the country because of the influence of a government educated in colonial times. The 1956 constitution had named the country the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, reassuring that no laws executed in the country will be repugnant to Islam. This was reaffirmed in the constitution of 1962 as well. From 1971-79, a more eclectic and informal Islam took over, as Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto tried to socialize Islam. Nevertheless the 1973 constitution declared Islam as the state religion of Pakistan, instituting a Council for Islamic Ideology to advise on the Islamization of legal, economic and political procedures. More academic independence was granted to *madrassahs* (religious schools) than other nationalized schools during this period (also see Ali, 2005). After him, President General Zia-ul-Haq, who professed a more orthodox

Islam, tried to Islamize the country in the 1980s through measures such as institution of the zakah and ushr ordinance, establishment of the Federal *Shariat* (Islamic law) Court and *qazi* courts to implement it, and encouragement of interest-free banking. Educational measures, such as setting up of the International Islamic University in Islamabad and segregating boys and girls in schools were also taken (Mahmood, 1985; Choudhry, 1988; also see *section 4.2*). Many of these laws are still in force in the country, but many others have slipped away. According to Mir (1986), this was because of their ‘cosmetic’ nature that allowed people to evade them by finding loopholes in their execution. Since Zia’s regime, mostly a Westernized or modernized Islam has dominated the political scene, though an orthodox or traditional Islam promulgated by *Jama’at-e-Islami* has occasionally offered resistance.

Looking at present day Pakistan, Siyal (2006), interpreting saint Zawqi’s framework of Islamic governance, characterizes Pakistan as a *dar-ul-Islam* or a state where Muslims have a freedom to express their Islamic identity. Even though unIslamic practices have affected social customs and values, religious institutions are coming under increasing surveillance by the government, basic religious rites do exist in the country and the head of the state professes to be a Muslim. The state cannot be called a *dar-ul-harb* or one which represses expression of Islamic identity. Ali, (2005) further adds that the victory of the religious parties in the 2002 elections in many electoral constituencies and the existence of some 12 -15,000 religious schools shows presence of some religious zeal, especially in the rural areas. Government’s financial support of selected *madrassahs* also shows that it is not opposed to religious education. (For more on religious values of the society, see *section 4.1.3*).

4.1.2 American influence in Pakistani socio-economic and political spheres

Alongside the local influences, a set of foreign influences, notably American, have also operated in Pakistani socio-economic and political spheres. During the first five years of its existence, Pakistan was largely ignored by both Britain and North America in order not to put at risk the relationship with a more economically viable India. British foreign investment in the country, however, dominated the economy while that of America amounted to a mere 4.5%. Alavi (1990) claims much was achieved in terms of economic gains during these five years, so much so that by the middle of 1950s Pakistan had become attractive in the eyes of the Americans. Britain's interest waned as that of America grew. American investments in oil, pharmaceuticals, natural gas and education picked up suddenly in the 1950s. Khilji (1999) notes how establishment of business schools and transfer of management programmes (for example, from the Harvard Business School) continued in the 1950-60s, under the Marshall Plans (Fox, 2001). The Institute of Business Administration, Karachi (IBA, Karachi), the first business school in the country, was set up in 1955 as a joint project of the United State Agency for International Development (USAID) and the University of Pennsylvania, while the Pakistan Institute of Management (PIM) was a collaborative effort with the Ford Foundation in 1961. US involvement in Pakistan continued until it was interrupted by the Pakistan-India war of 1965 (also see Shirazi, undated).

Hastening to counter Russian influence in Afghanistan, America resumed ties with Pakistan in 1979, when the country's soil was needed for intervention in adjoining Afghanistan. From then onwards, Pakistan has provided America ample opportunity for

intrusion in its economic and political spheres: Pakistan's strategic location with regard to the Persian Gulf, menacing Pak-Afghan drug trafficking, the country's 'threatening' nuclear programme, the row with India over Kashmir (Alavi, 1990), and lately, the war on terrorism.

A major reason why Pakistan has allowed the United States a free hand (or nearly so) in its socio-economic sector is the relative backwardness of its educational and industrial sectors. Having inherited few industries from the *Raj*, being politically and economically isolated for a large part of its initial phase of existence, and the political weakness of its trading community and peasantry, Pakistan keenly and gratefully accepted North America's offers for industrialization and educational advancement (Alavi, 1990; Khilji, 1999). The arrival of American companies, the supply of grants and loans for setting up management institutes, such as the IBA and PIM mentioned above and the Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS) and an Islamabad branch of American Management Association more recently (in 1984 and 1997, respectively) (Fagiano, 1997), and the popularity of the American manager in business circles (Khilji, 1999) provide a glimpse of American involvement in the management education and practice in the country.

4.1.3 Pakistani society and social values today

After discussing the various influences on the country's socio-economic and political spheres, I would like to present a brief sketch of the urban Pakistani society and dominant social values today. Pakistan has a rich cultural background, with each

ethnic group recognizable by its own culture. However, a national Pakistani culture unites all these groups through the Urdu language and the religion of Islam (Siddiqui, 2005). In addition to these two cultural facets, the urban society is also displays a certain element of Westernization. Khilji (1999) thus describes the Pakistani society of today as having three different ethos: religious, that is, Islamic, Western and traditional.

Each of the above mentioned ethos and accompanying social values are visible in different intensities in people belonging to different socio-economic classes. Among the educated urban classes that are the subject of my research, various social commentators¹² have observed the distinct categories of religious-minded and Westernized youth. Scholars, such as Siddiqui (2005) believe that the traditional element is also stronger than the religious all throughout Pakistan. However, I feel that in urban centres traditionalists, such as speakers of the local languages and the wearers of ethnic or Pakistani dress, are fewer in number than those in rural centres. According to Khilji (1999) there also seems to be a segregation between work and religion in the urban centres. Simultaneously, there seems to be a tendency towards materialism, scramble for status, and less trust among people. According to Siddiqui (2005), class difference as between providers of labour and capital and people belonging to different socio-economic strata is also evident. People in the towns are often self-centred, leisure-loving and have pretentious life-styles. They demonstrate less sincerity than their rural counterparts and often have 'unstable' moral standards.

¹² www.islamfortoday.com/mixedcultures.htm

At the same time, they have more flexible social norms and laws, are more willing to adopt new trends and engender broader visions. Other commentators¹³ have also made similar remarks about Pakistani social values of today. In fact, Qureshi (1975) described the Pakistani educated class of the 1970s in similar words of ‘materialistic,’ ‘selfish,’ ‘disunited,’ and of ‘little interested in social service.’

4.2 Background of Management Education in Pakistan

Before describing the background of Management Education in Pakistan, I would like to give a brief contextual account of the development of education in Pakistan in the following section.

4.2.1 Education in Pakistan: a socio-political and historical account

The Founder of the Nation, Mohammad Ali Jinnah, highlighted the need for education suited to the needs of Pakistan, immediately after Independence in 1947. The First Educational Conference, held in November, 1947, decided that the educational policy of Pakistan, claimed on grounds of providing freedom for people to practice Islam, would be based on Islamic thinking. However, these ideas were not fully clarified and have remained merely vague generalizations (Qureshi, 1975). A secular attitude towards higher education with an emphasis on the technical aspect of education prevailed in the 1950s. Education was closely controlled by the government and higher education became rather

¹³ www.aasianst.org/absts/1995abst/southasi/sases131.htm

elitist in orientation. The next decade saw some endorsement of 'inculcation of Islamic values as an instrument of national unity and progress' but was considered inadequate by the religiously oriented classes. Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto then tried to widen the spread of education but also maintained a secular orientation. President Zia-ul-Haq tried to reaffirm Islamic values more strongly. He pledged to organize education in the country according to *Nizam-e-Mustafa* (system of Prophet Muhammad, pbuh), setting up an International Islamic University in Islamabad and strictly enforcing the teaching of Islamic subjects at all levels of primary, secondary and higher education (Jones and Jones, 1982).

Commenting on Pakistan's education policy, Qureshi (1975) writes that it has been motivated primarily by economic development, with the intelligentsia thoughtlessly implementing the educational policy inherited from the British. Today also economic development appears as the main guiding force towards Pakistan's education policy (see the paragraphs below). Only 'half-hearted attempts at teaching some aspects of Islam' have been seen (Qureshi, 1975:59). For example, text books for both Islamic and non-Islamic subjects, are largely borrowed from the West. Moreover, those for religious subjects taught in professional colleges are prepared haphazardly. Religious instruction is thus often 'meagre' and 'unsatisfactory.' Teachers for religious subjects taught amidst secular curricula are also rare to find. Talking about religion is considered 'reactionary' and 'dangerous' in the secular spirited Pakistani educational system. In religious institutions, on the other hand, teaching of worldly subjects, such as mathematics or geography, has been slow to pick up. Attempts are being made to spread religious schools (*madrassahs*) and local and international (for example, USAID) funding is being made

available for them (Ali, 2005) but Western and traditional education systems have functioned independently in Pakistan. Similar opinions about Pakistan's educational set up of today were expressed by my respondents too. This will be discussed in later chapters.

Narrowing the focus to higher education, at present there are 59 public and 55 private HEC (Higher Education Commission)¹⁴ recognized institutes of higher education (HE) in Pakistan. The major objective of the HEC, which oversees the planning and accreditation and working of all public and private institutes of higher education in Pakistan, is to promote advancement of knowledge that values critical thought. Currently about 3% of the 18-23 year age group receive HE but the plan is to double this number by 2010. The Medium Term Development Framework, 2005-2010, emphasizes the developing of research and researchers, procuring and writing of books, striking linkages with institutes of higher education abroad, and providing latest teaching/learning equipment for students and teachers. The HEC sees higher education as playing 'a central role in the development of both human beings and modern societies as it enhances social, cultural and economic development, active citizenship and ethical values.' There is a need mentioned to evaluate Pakistani programmes against international standards and ranking local universities according to international ranking procedures. However, the mission statement or other policy statements of the commission do not specifically mention Islam as a guiding principle for the commission's work.

¹⁴ www.hec.gov.pk

4.2.2 Management education in Pakistan: a socio-historical account

After presenting an insight into the various influences on the Pakistani socio-economic spheres and the development of education in the country, I would now give a brief account of the history of the Pakistani MBA and describe the current situation of business education in the country in some detail. In writing these paragraphs I have consulted Pakistani business literature, websites of nine reputed business schools (including my two chosen ones) and my interviews in academia and industry. I must mention that interviewee comments referred to in this section are those that provide a background of management education in Pakistan and are therefore better placed in this context chapter rather than in the findings chapters.

4.2.2.1 The Pakistani MBA in the beginning

In Pakistan, the MBA degree was introduced in 1955 with the establishment of the Institute of Business Administration, Karachi (henceforth IBA). This business school was set up as a joint project of the Government of Sindh (the southern province of the country), the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the Wharton School of Finance, University of Pennsylvania. Later the school became affiliated with the University of Southern California. Hence it is a public sector institute with the Government of Sindh as the controlling body. Initially IBA offered only a two year MBA, but in 1982 Dr. Abdul Wahab, the Dean and Director of the school at that time, launched the BBA programme as well. According to Abdul Wahab (interview), this was the first time an undergraduate degree in Business Administration was offered to

Pakistani students. Several other MBA programmes soon followed at IBA: an MBA in International Marketing, an MBA in Banking, and an MBA in Management Information Systems. Social science subjects, such as psychology, logic, as well as Islamic economics were added to the curriculum to develop “*well balanced personalities.*” Academia-industry participation was also encouraged by inviting industry personnel to seminars, guest lectures and corporate dinners to share their experiences with students. Seeing the success of the MBA degree (and later other business administration degrees), several other MBA programmes emerged in Pakistan on the model of IBA’s programmes (interview, Abdul Wahab).

Some of these programmes, such as the Institute of Business Administration, Sukkur, (IBA, Sukkur) are still affiliated with IBA, Karachi. IBA, Sukkur’s website reads:

Initially IBA, Sukkur offered Programs of DBA, BBA (Pass), BBA(Hons), MBA & PGD leading to MBA (evening) in Affiliation with IBA Karachi. Latest Curriculum were developed in accordance with rules and regulation of IBA Karachi.

4.2.2.2 The Pakistani MBA today

In the following paragraphs I present a picture of business education in Pakistan. Utilizing articles from Pakistani business magazines and extracts from business schools’ websites, I give an account of the textbooks, teaching methodology, and research activities used in current MBA programmes in Pakistan.

The MBA degree is among the most popular degrees in Pakistan. According to Dr. Abdul Wahab (2004) mentioned in the previous section, the basic reason for the backwardness

of the country is mismanagement at both macro and micro levels. MBAs are therefore needed in large supply (maintaining a minimum standard of education though) so that all businesses can afford them. With consideration of the social uplift of the country as an essential part of higher education, one of the current focus areas of the HEC also is the Humanities, Social Sciences and Economics. Business schools are considered a part of this field. Many of the 114 HEC recognized institutes are pure business schools, while many others offer degrees in business administration. HEC not only encourages writing of books in this Humanities, Social Sciences and Economics field but also offers scholarships to pursue subjects in this area. Sometimes this is affected through foreign help. For example, HEC-USAID scholarships are provided to LUMS' (Lahore University of Management Sciences) MBA students. In April 2005 the HEC formulated a National Curriculum Revision Committee (NCRC) for Business Administration that revised in consultation with representatives of several public and private business schools the curricula for BBA (Hons) and MBA programmes of the country. This is perhaps the biggest attempt at standardizing the MBA curriculum in the country. For example, the Committee has decided that the BBA (Hons) degree will be extended to 4 years and the MBA to 2 years of full-time study, in order to provide students a well-rounded education in the field of business administration. A list of subjects to be taught in each of the programmes has been drawn up, along with an approved list of text books for each. A majority of the text books are written by Western, particularly American authors. Those that are by Pakistani authors are usually, but not exclusively, for subjects that talk specifically about Pakistan and Islam, such as Pakistan Studies and Islamiyat. Though the number of such subjects and books is small, the inclusion of books by Pakistani authors in

management curricula may perhaps be a step towards adapting the MBA curricula of the country to the needs of Pakistan.

At present, business schools are among the most expensive educational institutions in Pakistan. The annual tuition fee alone of well known business schools is at least PKR 100,000 (approximately USD 1500) a year (school websites), in a country whose per capita income is around USD 700 per annum¹⁵. Nevertheless, business education is still in high demand in the country. Business schools are confidently assuring students of the need for high quality business graduates in Pakistan (Kazmi, 2002) and welcoming them to their schools for prosperous careers ahead. For example, the President of the Institute of Business Management (henceforth IoBM) says in his welcome message to incoming students:

We are firmly committed to enable you to explore new horizons leading to excellent career prospects. We have faith in your ability, through which you met IoBM's exacting admission criteria, and you will now be groomed to progress towards academic and professional laurels. IoBM is positioned to make an indelible mark (website, IoBM).

This school, like several others, also announces acceptance of its students to top Western universities for further education:

IoBM students have gone abroad for higher studies to Harvard, New York University and other business schools in Europe, USA and Canada (website, IoBM).

Another school lauds the career success of its graduates in these words:

HIMS [Hamdard Institute of Management Science] graduates have proven to be very successful, whether they have occupied managerial positions at the leading multinational and national organizations in private or public sectors, or have

¹⁵ www.pakpositive.com/2005/03/25/page/2/pakistan-per-capita-income-jumps-up-by-160/

gone abroad for further studies at the leading North American or European universities, or have started their own entrepreneurial ventures, or have revolutionized their family businesses.

HIMS graduates have attained a professional caliber and leadership role and have proved their competence in diverse business environments like those of the Middle East, Europe and North America. They compete favorably with the MBAs from foreign schools (website, HIMS).

But the Dean of this school also stresses other benefits of learning:

You will learn to look at human problems in new and innovative ways. At times, answers will not be provided, rather a challenge put forth to question, analyse and learn to solve problems on one's own— skills that every employer puts a high premium on (website, HIMS).

Two of Pakistan's schools, the Lahore University of Management Sciences (henceforth LUMS) and the Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science and Technology (henceforth SZABIST), are internationally recognized in FT and Asia Week rankings, among 'top Asian MBAs,' securing the 18th and 41st positions¹⁶, respectively.

As far as programme development is concerned, I noticed several schools endeavouring to develop programmes on the model of Western, particularly American, business schools. The IoBM website announces:

IoBM's academic programs are modern and comprehensive in concept and structure. They broadly resemble honors programs offered by US universities.

Preston Institute of Management Science and Technology (henceforth PIMSAT), Karachi, is even affiliated with the Preston Institute of Management Science and Technology (PIMSAT) America (website, PIMSAT).

¹⁶ www.careerdynamo.com/asia-mba.html

Many business schools, including IBA, IoBM and HIMS, have launched four year BBA programmes, which until lately were three year programmes. However, some still follow the old system (school websites). Though the schools have their own specialized programmes (as seen on their websites), such as MBA in Health and Hospital Management, MBA in International Marketing, MBA in Banking, or the distance learning Executive MBA at LUMS (Hameed, 2002), I found the course titles strikingly similar. Admission procedure also is usually the same – an aptitude test followed by an interview or in some cases a group discussion at the end (school websites).

Critics too find the MBA curriculum to be based on the American model. For example, Chaudhry (2003a¹⁷) remarks, ‘Business schools in Pakistan are mostly using textbooks printed in foreign countries, in majority of the cases in USA. These books generally contain studies relating mostly to American or European businesses.’ Moreover, though many topics of international significance are being included in the MBA curricula in Pakistan, but due to a heavy dependence on American texts, examples and illustrations are often Western (interview, Ikraam). Literature on Islamic management is even scarcer because of secular systems in most Muslim countries and a dearth of scholars on this topic (Khilji, 1999). Consequently, the Islamic perspective on management education is not fully developed and attempts at Islamizing management education are still not concerted. Whatever material exists is not sufficient to develop a whole curriculum, and this makes the use of already developed theory imperative (not only in Pakistan, but other Muslim countries as well) (Amir, 1989).

¹⁷ www.pakistaneconomist.com

However, as I saw in programme websites and announcements, business schools, such as IBA and LUMS, are increasingly adding subjects related specifically to Pakistan as well as those in the social sciences. Courses in finance, accounting, economics and marketing are being adapted to address Pakistani business problems. Many schools, including Mohammad Ali Jinnah University (henceforth MAJ) have also started teaching languages, Urdu poetry and world religions (MAJ prospectus, 2004; above given school websites).

Teaching methodology used in Pakistani business schools is usually a mix of lectures, case studies, group exercises and inviting of speakers for guest lectures or seminars.

These are more often than not invited from large, successful companies or foreign MNCs, as interviews (for example, Ikraam) and school websites indicated

Marketing, HR and IT Societies of IoBM arrange regular seminars in which leading professionals from Corporate sector of Pakistan are invited to share their experiences with the students, faculty and guests (website, IoBM).

Reputed schools are trying to hire highly qualified faculty, preferably educated in foreign universities, and proudly mention this in their programme announcements or websites.

MAJ's prospectus (2004), for example, reads

The faculty of MAJ is highly educated with doctoral and master degrees from USA, Canada, UK and reputed institutions in Pakistan.

Yet the dearth of such qualified faculty is a serious problem in this educational sector. Business school faculty is frequently not sufficiently experienced in practical business life that can help them relate theoretical concepts to the actual world of business (Kamal, 2002). Moreover, shortage of funds also prevents the recruitment of teachers from top international universities (Chaudhry, 2003b).

Business schools are eager to forge links with international business schools too, for example, through inviting foreign faculty and sending theirs abroad on short-term assignments. IoBM's website reads:

IoBM has extensive links with North American Universities. Professors from the Universities of Arizona State and Brock have served as Chief Academic Officers of IoBM.

However, the foremost issue faced in inviting faculty from abroad is deciding from where to invite them. If they are from top business schools of the world, they have packed appointment schedules and/or demands for unaffordable emoluments. If they are from mediocre institutions, the very objective of inviting them and investing in them to market the home institution is not satisfactorily achieved. Thus these programme are often subject to randomness and an as-and-when-possible status. LUMS' initiatives, as I was informed (interview, Saima), however, have been more regular than those of other schools, perhaps because of better management and financial facilities.

Research is slowly picking up in the country. LUMS has a separate Case Research department to prepare cases of local companies. So far it is the only business school in Pakistan to undertake this initiative (interview, Saeed). IBA has also established a Research Wing 'providing useful research and evaluation guidance.' It is a repository of core research of IBA students and faculty, as well as of works by other scholars (website, IBA). Several other schools have also begun conducting research for corporations (school websites). IoBM publishes *Pakistan Business Review*, country's first business research and policy analysis quarterly (Hameed, 2002). However, there is still a lack of rewards to

recognize research efforts and therefore little motivation to undertake it (Chaudhry, 2003b). There seems no urgency to conduct research; the culture of conducting research to solve business problems does not exist (interview, Ikraam). At LUMS though publishing is rewarded financially and is considered necessary for promotion, it is a long process and obtaining recognition is not easy (interview, Shakeel). Besides only a few professional networks and management associations, such as PIM, exist in the country. Even so, from my experience, such associations do not usually work together with business schools.

In addition to research, many schools provide consultancy services to businesses. The Business Support Centre of IoBM, for example, provides consultancy to small and medium enterprises (SMEs). The Centre also provides research, recruitment, training programmes, project feasibility studies, and the like (Ahmad, 2002). LUMS has its Rausing Executive Centre for training executives.

Nevertheless, as some of my respondents emphasized (interviews: Sikandar; Ikraam; Akram) and some critics point out, there is still need for more liaison between professional colleges and universities. Inadequate interaction with industry prevents faculty from understanding practical business issues, results in weak financial support from the corporate sector for research and other developmental activities and closes doors to discussing improved management curricula that can more appropriately address the economic needs of the country (Kamal, 2002; Chaudhry, 2003b).

After reviewing the situation in Pakistan, Ayub Mehar (2004), a senior academic of the country, concludes that universities in Pakistan are not creating knowledge. The pivotal problem appears to be a lack of planning and a holistic approach to education (Kamal, 2002; Kazmi, 2000, 2001a and b; 2002).

This chapter presented a contextual study of the Pakistani socio-economic and political histories. Both local and foreign, particularly American, influences were seen to have contributed to the country's socio-economic and political thought. Moving on from the social influences, I gave a brief sketch of the current Pakistani society and an insight into some of its cultural values. A background of management education, particularly the Pakistani MBA, was also presented. It was seen that business schools often made references to Western, particularly American, programmes of study and American firms with regard to their curriculum design, in the hiring of their foreign qualified faculty, in the placement of their graduates, and in their building up of contacts with international universities to assure students of prosperous futures through study in their programmes. With this background, I would like to begin my research in the field of business education in Pakistan in the next chapter.

5.0	CHAPTER 5: METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH	116
5.1	My research problem and questions	117
5.2	Important research concepts as I understand them	118
5.3	Determining my research strategy	120
5.4	An explanation of the interpretive paradigm	122
5.5	Postcolonial theory: the theoretical perspective of the study	124
5.6	Pilot Work: what it was and how it helped	125
5.6.1	Pilot interviews	126
5.6.2	Pilot observation study	127
5.7	Research approaches taken towards the study: stakeholder analysis and the case study approach	129
5.7.1	Stakeholder analysis approach	130
5.7.2	Case study approach	132
5.7.2.1	<i>Pioneer Academy</i>	<i>135</i>
5.7.2.2	<i>Leaders' Academy</i>	<i>138</i>
5.8	Research methods used in the study	142
5.8.1	Starting my research using observation data	144
5.8.2	Looking for research questions in official publications	148
5.8.3	The interview: my main research method	149
5.8.3.1	<i>Individual in-depth interviews</i>	<i>153</i>
5.8.3.2	<i>Focus group and joint interviews</i>	<i>154</i>
5.8.3.3	<i>Practicalities in my interview research</i>	<i>156</i>
5.9	My chosen method for data analysis	159
5.9.1	Method of analysis for interview data	160
5.9.2	Illustration of analysis of a theme	164
5.10	Evaluating interpretive research	166
5.10.1	Assessing the quality of qualitative research	166
5.10.1.1	<i>Reliability</i>	<i>166</i>
5.10.1.2	<i>Validity</i>	<i>167</i>
5.10.1.1	<i>Bias and objectivity</i>	<i>168</i>
5.10.2	Assessing generalization and implications of this research	169
5.11	Reflexivity: myself as a researcher participant	172

CHAPTER 5: METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH

In *chapter 1*, I described my research topic of inquiring into the values and ideas endorsed by the Pakistani MBA. In the next two chapters, I presented insights from literature on the discourses affecting work values of management students and the theoretical perspective I have adopted in studying this topic. Keeping the main research question as ‘How far are the values about work endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes in harmony with the teachings of Islam’ and continuing with the postcolonial theory as my selected perspective, in this chapter I give a detailed account of how I carried out my research – what research questions were asked, what approaches and methods were used to answer them, why were certain choices made, and how were they executed in the field. The next two paragraphs present the structure of this chapter.

I begin by reiterating my research interest and the main question, along with the three other questions arising out of the main question. I then explicate my understanding of some important research concepts and my purpose in using a qualitative, particularly interpretive, inquiry. This is followed by a brief note on my research perspective – postcolonial theory. Before moving on to the proceedings of my actual research, I have found it suitable to give a summary of my pilot work and how it helped me in carrying out my research in the field.

I have used a case study research approach, informed by stakeholder analysis as explained by Burgoyne (1994), to study two MBA programmes in Pakistan. After discussing this, I have given detail of each of the research methods I have used. I started my research with

observations of people and artefacts around campuses and referred to official publications of these two schools before conducting in-depth interviews with my respondents. The interview (including focus group and joint interviews) has been my main research method, with observation and readings of text supplementing it. Having described the data generation methods, I have summarized my data analysis technique and illustrated it with the help of a real example. This is followed by an assessment of interpretive research to give readers an insight into the criteria used for evaluating such researches. Finally I have reflected on my position as a participant in this study.

5.1 My research problem and questions

Having mentioned earlier that I had the impression of MBAs as being more centred on personal gains, paying little attention to social responsibility and ethical concerns (that I deem an essential part of a discipline, such as management, that relates closely to society) and encultured more in Western, rather than Islamic traditions, I wanted to inquire into the work values endorsed in two Pakistani MBA programmes and the extent to which they were in harmony with the teachings of Islam (c.f. 1.1). I was particularly interested in looking at the following areas to investigate my concerns:

- Which main values are encouraged in business schools?
- What kinds of careers do students look forward to after completing their MBA degree?
- How do respondents comment on the curricula of business schools, especially on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility?

The aim of this study was not to evaluate people, but to examine the values endorsed in the programmes they were a part of. Topics for my research questions were selected primarily from my teaching experience of the MBA programmes and from literature on management, postcolonial theory and Islamic teachings (see Bryman, 2001:491 for an explanation of selection of research questions). I refined my research questions in the field after observing classes in progress, noticing certain artefacts or reading through various school publications.

As might be seen, these questions do not relate to any experimental ideal but are concerned more with exploring a social issue or, as Dahrendorf (Bulmer, 1977: 16) calls it, a ‘puzzlement about the world.’ Deriving out of the main question, research questions

are a set of defined questions (not necessarily hypotheses) [that] represent the facets of an empirical domain the researcher wants to explore, setting priorities and foci of attention, and implicitly excluding a range of unsuited topics (Huberman and Matthew, 1998: 204).

Taken together, they express the essence of a researcher’s inquiry (Bulmer, 1977).

5.2 Important research concepts as I understand them

Before embarking upon explaining my research methodology, I would like to clarify my understanding of certain technical terms as I understand them for the purpose of this research.

For me, methodology is the systematic and logical study of the general principles guiding sociological investigation, ‘concerned in the broadest sense with questions of how the

sociologist establishes social knowledge and how he can convince others that his knowledge is correct. As such it has clear and direct links to the philosophy of social science' (Bulmer, 1977:4). In simple terms, methodology describes how knowledge is produced, considering one's beliefs about ontology, epistemology and human nature (also see Denzin and Lincoln, 1998a).

To me a research design is 'a framework for the collection and analysis of data' (Bryman and Bell, 2003: 32). According to Mason (1998), it includes the description of one's ontological and epistemological positions, the definition of the problem, formulation of research questions and a comment on the purpose of the research. Creswell (1994) also includes one's research paradigm to the list.

My understanding of a research strategy or research procedure is the way in which a particular empirical study is designed and carried out, including what types of research design and techniques are employed (Bulmer, 1977; also see Mason, 1998). The two main research strategies are the qualitative and quantitative (Bryman and Bell, 2003: 25).

Of these two main research strategies, I have used the qualitative, where arguments are typically interpretative, often comparative, and deal with meanings implied by participants. Explanation is typically in terms of how something works; the richer it is the more persuasive it becomes (Myers, 2004).

I consider a research method as 'simply a technique for collecting data' as Bryman and Bell (2003: 32) describe it.

5.3 Determining my research strategy

Chapter 2 elaborated upon how the Orientalists *wrote* for the objects of their study. This domination of the research object by the subject, according to Mies (1997), was because of colonialism and neo-colonialism, which created a hierarchy or a ‘view from above,’ defeating the purpose of research. Spivak (1988:275) also sees such positivistic empiricism to be ‘the justifying foundation of advanced capitalist neocolonialism.’ I, on the other hand, wanted my respondents, whether students, teachers or managers, to speak for themselves or in other words, I needed a ‘view from below’ (ibid: 68) that could give voice to all these postcolonial subjects.

I also found terms, such as *logic, rationality, power of abstraction*, which are the key concepts of positivistic philosophy, very limiting in understanding the reality of values and ideas encouraged in MBA curricula (Mies, 1991). Positivism considers only that which can be experienced by the senses as knowledge, while it regards concepts lying beyond this domain as superfluous constructs. Value judgements, normative statements, concept of the spirit are not considered scientific knowledge; at most they are seen as one’s arbitrary choices.

Thus positivism constantly directs its criticisms against both religious interpretations of the world and materialist metaphysics, and tries to work out an empirical position free of metaphysical assumptions (Kolakowski, 1997:8).

This too meant I could not use positivistic approach to answer my research questions about values and ethics.

Another concern I had with the positivistic world view, that often employs quantitative research strategies, is that it detaches from social processes subjects who are studied, splitting their lives into distinct constituent parts (see for example, Mies, 1991). Aiming to understand people's opinions of their MBA programmes (about their curricula, colleagues, interpersonal relations, etc.) and/or with MBA graduates, I could not separate people from their surroundings or split up their lives into some distinct aspects. All of the above characteristics of positivism showed the incongruity of the philosophy with my research project and I turned to non-positivistic research instead.

Qualitative research provides knowledge for understanding, rather than for prediction and control (Altheide and Johnson, 1998). Schwandt (1998) informs that non-positivistic social sciences focus on the ways that the life world is produced and experienced by members. All ontological judgements about the nature and essence of things and events are suspended. Instead, the researcher focuses on the ways the members of the life world themselves interpret and produce the world they treat as 'real.' These interpretations are based on people's *stock of knowledge* composed of images, ideas, theories, values and attitudes, and subsumed under 'ostensibly shared constructs' and categories people use to communicate with one another.

Qualitative methods, such as in-depth interviews and focus groups, chiefly associated with such non-positivistic research, also offer the opportunity to retain living connections and to collect or interpret findings in context. Taking participants as wholes, they do not neglect the uniqueness of human experience or opinion, instead empower the underprivileged (Mies, 1991; Henwood and Pidgeon, 1997). Adopting a postcolonial

perspective, this is what I was striving for, and this is what Maria Mies (1991) has also stressed in her guidelines for research on and by the oppressed. Research must not only produce knowledge, but also encourage emancipation, strive to change the status quo and help the oppressed. It must be seen as a *process of conscientization*, suggests Paulo Friere (1975:76).

Bourdieu and Passeron (1990) and Stavenhagen (1997) also stress that the life of the individual operates within certain structures that influence his/her experience and understanding of the world. These are relatively more enduring than individuals who inhabit them. I also needed a picture of the whole system that endorsed certain values and ideas in MBA programmes. I thus carried out direct observation at the way people interacted in the structures, interpreted them and maintained their membership in them and took a look at the marks, such as records or published material, left by the people who inhabited these structures. Observing people in their respective campuses and reading official texts from their schools enabled me to understand more fully what people within a system were talking about, what ideas and values they were learning and how they were reproducing the same structures.

5.4 An explanation of the interpretive paradigm

In the previous paragraphs I mentioned how I chose a qualitative strategy over a quantitative one to conduct my research. In this section I explain my research paradigm to clarify the type of qualitative inquiry I undertook. As I was seeking to understand the opinions and views of my respondents, from their own viewpoints and in the light of their

own experiences (see for explanation Burrell and Morgan, 1979), I selected the interpretive approach towards my study. Besides allowing for collection of data in a relatively open-ended way, this approach also ‘looks for culturally derived and historically situated interpretations of the social life-world’ (Hughes, forthcoming). Thus, it seemed congruent with my research perspective for the study – postcolonial theory.

Prasad and Prasad (2002:6-7) understand interpretive research as

committed to the broad philosophy of social construction, which sees social reality as a constructed world built in and through meaningful interpretations. The goal of the research, therefore, is not to capture some pre-existing or ready made world presumed to be available out there but to understand this process of symbolic “world making” through which the social world is ongoingly accomplished.

By preparing interpretations, interpretive researchers offer their constructions of the actors’ points of view. Hence multiple interpretations of a phenomenon are possible, better judged on criteria of comprehensiveness, coherence and thoroughness rather than verification, assessed on pragmatic grounds of usefulness, fittingness and generation of further inquiry (Schwandt, 1998). Interpretive research had traditionally been identified with the understanding of local meanings and everyday symbolic worlds, centering exclusively on the micro worlds of individuals and far removed from macro provinces of large-scale institutional processes, structures, and networks (that are studied as diligently as observable reality) (Fleetwood, unpublished paper). But now interpretive scholars, as Prasad and Prasad (2002:7) inform, are beginning to ‘bridge the gap between micro practices and macro structures and to work on establishing the connections between local subjective worlds and macro organizational and institutional processes and phenomena.’ Thus the interpretive paradigm allowed me flexibility to research not only individuals but also texts and objects that were part of the MBA system.

Moreover, Prasad and Prasad (2002:7) believe, ‘The act of drawing interpretive thinking to its full potential practically demands some form of fundamental questioning that is not very far from an overtly critical orientation.’ This feature of interpretive inquiry also agreed with my ultimate purpose of changing the status quo in MBA education by pointing out the need for teaching Islamic values alongside the core curricula in a way that invited the participants, and will hopefully the readers too, to critically question the values being endorsed in the Pakistani MBA curricula.

5.5 Postcolonial theory: the theoretical perspective of the study

In choosing a theoretical perspective for my doctoral work, I was, of course, motivated by the kind of questions that were coming into my mind. These related to the nature of work values endorsed in business education, incidence of conflicting values among MBA students, and the general neglect of religious and ethical concerns in MBA curricula. In my readings I noticed many management scholars *digging out old bones* (as we say in Urdu) and tracing the incidence of current management thought in the developing world to colonial times. In *chapter 1*, I described how Husain and Ashraf’s (1979), Hofstede’s (1984), Bourdieu and Passeron’s (1990), and Ali’s (1995) ideas on the interplay between culture, education and power had given me a starting point for my inquiry.

The more I read on management education, the more I saw it as putting forward certain kinds of ideas from certain standpoints and countries, namely technicist-managerialist ideas from Western, primarily American, models and neglecting social and ethical

concerns, especially those from non-Western cultures (c.f. chapters 2 and 3). Such control of the discipline in the hands of only a few easily made me see the link between education, power and culture, just as it had been demonstrated during colonial times, when the dominant secular Western educational system had overshadowed the Islamic system in the case of the Indian subcontinent. I had therefore decided to use the postcolonial perspective to carry out my study. In *chapter 3*, I gave a detailed discussion on this theory. It appeared relevant to dealing with issues raised by the critics of the discourses of not only Westernization/Americanization but also of technicist-managerialism, as well as addressing my own research concerns about how far the values endorsed in Western dominated, technicist-managerialist programmes could be in harmony with Islamic values. I also mentioned briefly how it facilitated development of my research methodology. In this chapter I will relate the theory more specifically to various aspects of my research methodology as I describe in the subsequent sections.

5.6 Pilot Work: what it was and how it helped

My pilot work was conducted in two phases. Phase 1 took place in Lancaster, while phase 2 was carried out in Pakistan just before commencing my actual fieldwork. Since I was considering choosing the interview as my primary method, I decided to begin piloting by interviewing to see if this method could likely answer my research questions. After that I carried out an observation study to gain experience in this method, which I considered complementary to my main method of interviews.

5.6.1 Pilot interviews

Two pilot interviews were conducted in Lancaster with a lecturer and a recent overseas graduate of Lancaster University Management School. These interviews were more like discussions about my research topic and the approach I was using to address it. We also talked about question wording and the suitability of other methods that could shed additional light on the topic.

In Pakistan, I interviewed two managers to see how managers in industry responded to my queries. These respondents were friends with whom I thereafter discussed my research project and collected useful tips, such as those about wording questions, managing interview time and tape recording. Regarding question wording, I kept the main research question fairly open-ended and did not intervene till my respondent had finished answering. My question was, ‘What, other than technical concepts, have you learnt from your MBA degree?’ My respondents spoke at length on this question, but contrary to what I was expecting, that is values about work, they covered skills instead. This indicated I needed more structure and probing to guide my respondents. In successive questions in actual interviews, I therefore asked, ‘What are some of the values being endorsed in your MBA programme?’ or added “Value ‘xyz’ is listed in your programme announcement for the year. How would you comment on it with regard to your MBA programme?” if need be.

Note-taking during pilot studies turned out to be helpful. For example, recognition of respondents’ emphasis on skills rather than values in the above question became apparent with my review of my interview notes. I also obtained insight into interviewing

practicalities, such as placement of the tape recorder, quality of recording, and average time required for an interview through these pilot studies. For example, since the interviews had taken around 45 minutes each, I decided to buy C90 tapes for the study. The quality of the recording was also acceptable, so I decided to go ahead with my portable Panasonic recorder, rather than buying a more sophisticated digital recorder that some friends had recommended.

5.6.2 Pilot observation study

In order to obtain an insight into observing how people behave in group situations, how different ideas and values come to be regarded significant, how communication flows between members, as well as how the nature of surroundings (along with various artefacts) can impact upon the promotion of certain values and ideas, I carried out a pilot observation study at the Pioneer Academy. Working there as a lecturer, I did not have difficulty gaining access to an official meeting. Being a high level confidential meeting of senior administrators and policy makers of Pioneer, it required me to play the role of a silent observer. As I sat quietly at the corner of the table, I noted down details varying from appearance of the furniture and quality of stationery provided, to my feelings of surprise, anxiety, disappointment, etc. Since I did not know the optimum amount of detail required for my study or whether my feelings could impact upon my interpretation later, I noted down everything I saw. As I began my formal research I appreciated the use of these detailed observations in helping me link values talked about in interviews or publications with those mentioned in classrooms or expressed through artefacts around campuses. However, as the fieldwork progressed and I began to feel the practical

challenge of detailed inquiry (as I will explain in the later paragraphs of this section), I began to look more for patterns of behaviour and relationships, while noting down any peculiar objects I could.

Through this pilot study I also realized that my observer role would not be chosen arbitrarily but would depend on the setting. For example, I had entered the above setting at Pioneer with an expectation of contributing to the discussion, but had soon realized that the strategic significance and protocol of the meeting could not permit me, as a young lecturer, to air my opinions; my participation and even obtrusive location could disturb the natural flow of events. This proved correct in subsequent observations in classrooms as I played by the rules of the actors in order to get access to their activities.

This study also highlighted the challenge of listening, seeing and note-taking at the same time. I soon realized that fixing my eyes on one small event at the setting, or on listening to one speaker at a time would prevent me from seeing and hearing others. I thus realized that I would have to make choices throughout my observation sessions to record some happenings and ignore others.

The importance of research ethics became apparent to me for the first time during this observation study when I participated in a confidential meeting and felt grateful for how much the organization had trusted me to let me sit through their private discussion. I felt responsible for maintaining the trust placed in me and for not reporting anything about respondents or organizations that was not meant for public usage.

As mentioned earlier, pilot work was more helpful in revealing the practicalities of interview and observation research rather than directly addressing my research questions. Pilot interviews served as a practice in my interview technique, while observation was primarily a study of the patterns of communication of senior Pioneer staff (and some artefacts at random). Hence, none of the data revealed from any of these studies was included in my findings.

5.7 Research approaches taken towards the study: stakeholder analysis and the case study approach

Researchers use a methodology that enhances their involvement with the phenomena they study (Golden-Biddle and Locke, 1997). I mentioned in previous sections that I wanted to understand the encouragement given to certain values in my chosen business schools by not only talking to members of these schools but also inquiring into the whole system as to how it contributed to these values. This meant I was not looking for simplistic, ‘reductionist,’ ‘decontextualized’ and ‘non-reflexive truths’ as positivistic research is known to produce (Prasad and Prasad, 2002) but for:

- patterns of relationships, not just reports or traces of such interactions
- studying action and interaction
- reality that gives a whole picture of actors, the setting, relationships, etc. rather than pieces of it.

This is what Webb et al (1977) characterize as intensive research. I thus decided to undertake an intensive research of my topic. In the following paragraphs I describe my analysis of stakeholders operating within particular arenas, using a case study research approach and a postcolonial theoretical perspective.

5.7.1 Stakeholder analysis approach

In deciding upon my 'intensive approach,' I found *stakeholder analysis* and *arena thesis* (which I will describe shortly) very relevant. I wanted to approach my participants with an open mind; listen to the opinions of students, teachers and managers regarding MBA degree and graduates in their own words, without fixing them in any stereotypical ideational positions. Besides, remembering Spivak's (1988) insistence that the subaltern is not any homogeneous individual but different people with different experiences, I felt it necessary to ask for the views of the various members of the MBA community in order to form a more realistic picture of the MBA programme in these schools. 'Stakeholder analysis proceeds by identifying some, many or all of [the] stakeholders and collects data about their actions, perceptions, behaviours, experiences, and thoughts in relation to the phenomenon' (Burgoyne, 1994:187). 'Stakeholders are actors, agents, interested parties, interests, interest groups' (p. 190) presenting themselves as people (with names), role occupants (for example, director) groupings (for example, Pioneer Academy or Leaders Academy) or occupational groupings (for example, students and managers).

From a postcolonial point of view, a stakeholder analysis approach to research also allowed me to take a constructionist and pluralistic view of reality (see for example, Loomba, 1998), since it lets different stakeholders view the 'same' phenomenon

differently, sees situations as created by 'the interaction of multiple purposes and multiple agendas for achieving them' and behaviour as the 'manifestation of cultural software that actors have internalized' (Burgoyne, 1994:189). Its recognition of conflict between different interest groups and the questioning of taken-for-granted was its biggest strength from the point of view of the theoretical perspective of my research. 'Stakeholder-mapping seems common sense, but it is the contrasting realities and interactions of these meanings that provide the subtlety in stakeholder analysis' (ibid: 203). Hence it not only enabled me to answer my research questions from perspectives of different people but also to identify stakeholders (such as MBA programme administrators and support personnel, in the libraries, for example) I had not thought of in the first instance. I also found the stakeholder analysis approach flexible with regard to my choice of multiple data collection techniques.

Reflecting my theoretical perspective and my position as an interpretive researcher seeking to influence a social phenomenon, and related to stakeholder analysis, is Burgoyne and Jackson's (1997) *arena thesis*. Having

strong emancipatory tones, it [the arena] implies the opening up of organizational processes to minority or low-power voices, but within an understanding of the power dynamics concerned...The underlying theoretical orientation of the arena thesis is that organizations are, and are part of, multi-stakeholder situations, to be understood in terms of stakeholder analysis' (pp. 66-7).

I would thus say I have carried out analysis of stakeholders operating within the arena of management education in Pakistan. A critique of the thesis, according to the authors, is that it does not elucidate how desires of various stakeholders are formulated, though it

can be inferred they are constructed in interactions among people in organizational settings.

5.7.2 Case study approach

Stakeholder analysis and the arena thesis both lend easily to *case studies* (Burgoyne, 1994; Burgoyne and Jackson, 1997). In fact, I see a case study, an ‘approach’ according to Hammersley, Gomm and Foster (2002), as a means of carrying out a stakeholder analysis within an arena. Creswell (1994) explains this approach as a study in which the researcher explores a single entity or phenomenon – the case – and collects detailed information about it by using a variety of data collection procedures during a sustained period of time. A case study is bounded by time and activity, in the sense of being about or of a program, event, process, institution, or social group (Huberman and Matthew, 1998; Ragin, 2000). It is ‘unique,’ ‘specific’ and ‘complex’ (Stake, 1995:1-2). It is ‘both a process of inquiry about the case and the product of that inquiry’ (Stake, 2000: 436).

The major advantage I saw in a case approach is that it provides in-depth and intensive data on the case in a very flexible way by not limiting itself to a specific category of social science methods or to specific sources of evidence. On the contrary, it makes use of a variety of both quantitative and qualitative techniques (Yin, 2003a; Ragin, 2000). I too chose a variety of methods and data sources, such as interviews, observation and records (these methods will be discussed later) to answer my research questions and to form a rich picture of the phenomenon of the values endorsed in the two business schools I studied. I looked at the MBA programmes of two business schools, whose background

and ethos I provide in the following section. I have called them *Pioneer Academy* (henceforth Pioneer) and *Leaders Academy* (henceforth Leaders) so as not to disclose their actual names for reasons of privacy.

The primary reason I have selected these two business schools for my research is the leading positions they occupy in the field of management education in the country (Areola, 1998) and the influence they have on curriculum formation in other business schools. Pioneer's historical importance to management education in Pakistan and Leaders' reputation for the leading edge technology (including curriculum, teaching methodology and physical facilities) of its MBA programme makes the study of the two schools critical to my research. Besides, a difference in their legal status, that is public versus private, I believe, can also help develop a wider breadth of argument.

My reason for selecting these schools was to shed light on the phenomenon of values endorsed in Pakistani MBA programmes and the extent to which they were in harmony with Islamic teachings. Stake describes such a study as an 'instrumental' case study. Since I used more than one case, my study would also be considered of a 'collective' nature, one in which multiple cases are studied for their relevance to investigating a particular issue (Stake, 1995:3-4 and 2000:437; also see Gomm, Hammersley and Foster, 2002).

My purpose in studying multiple cases was not to compare the various institutions on particular attributes, but rather to expose issues in MBA education in Pakistan through the use of relevant cases. Since I saw Pioneer and Leaders as the leading business schools

that have a considerable influence in directing MBA education in Pakistan, I selected programmes of these two schools for the purpose of my study. Wieviorka (2000) informs us of the evolutionary and historicist views regarding comparisons of cases. Evolutionists see phenomena studied being determined by the same cause, and therefore do not believe comparisons can yield new information. On the other hand, historicists see every historical experience as original and consequently comparisons appear futile to them. Hence neither view sees comparisons as adding to any knowledge. Huberman and Matthew (1998) are also wary of generalizations from such comparisons since in their view such generalizations may become simply a 'compromise,' not fitting any case. Vaughan (2000), on the other hand, believes that comparisons can yield startling contrasts that can challenge one's theoretical constructs, leading to elaboration of theory. Though I have not carried out an explicit comparison of Pioneer and Leaders, I have identified the speakers' schools and organizations as I have commented on the management texts, teaching methodology, and values and ideas encouraged in these places to facilitate the reader to place the findings in context.

According to several researchers (see for example, Yin, 1994; Huberman and Matthew, 1998; Bryman and Bell; 2003) replicating the same methodology in various cases makes the study more 'robust' and 'powerful'. I also considered a variety of data sources, such as interviews, observation and records to answer my research questions, an 'holistic' analysis according to Stake (2000). On Yin's (2003a: 40) taxonomy of case study types, having case design and unit of analysis as two dimensions of a matrix, my research falls in *Type 2: a case study characterized by a multiple-case design and an holistic analysis.*

I ventured into the field with a general set of questions, with the aim of discovering or raising further questions. I had a theory to inform my research and a broad idea of impending analysis, but the exact dimensions of the research or the specific questions were unfolded only in the field. According to Yin (2003a), such '*exploratory* studies aim to find out what is happening; to seek new insights; to ask questions and to assess phenomena in a new light' (also see Yin, 2003b:6; Ragin, 2000). Considering these points, I believe my research is exploratory in nature.

A lecturer at Pioneer, I had no problem gaining access to respondents, classrooms or publications, although of course I would make prior appointments with interviewees or seek their permission beforehand for sitting in their classes. At Leaders also, I was very grateful for the generous cooperation of all staff who allowed me to access people, classes and documents at short notice. The following sections provide an insight into the philosophy and culture of my two case studies.

5.7.2.1 Pioneer Academy

Pioneer Academy was set up in 1955 as a joint venture of the Government of Pakistan, USAID and the Wharton School of Finance, University of Pennsylvania. The first business school in the country to offer an MBA degree, it is still recognized among the top business schools in Pakistan (Areola, 1998), with several other business schools affiliated with it and/or following its lead in curriculum development (school websites). Pioneer has several MBA programmes, including MBA, MBA-MIS (Management Information System), BBA (Bachelor of Business Administration), BBA-MIS for both

morning and evening students (Program Announcement, 2004-5:22-3). Each of these at each of the two campuses boasts from 50-100 students. These students have generally completed their undergraduate degrees in business administration, commerce, medicine, or engineering if they are MBA students or their A' Levels or Intermediate if they are in the BBA programmes. None of the programmes emphasize work experience as a stipulatory requirement. However qualifying in an aptitude test, followed by an interview with a panel of teachers, and a group discussion with fellow candidates is essential for admission.

Pioneer has a vision of becoming a world-class business school for leadership and innovation in management. Such ideas are repeatedly found in the Program

Announcement (2004-5). Its philosophy (Program Announcement, 2004-5:7) reads:

Business education should be relevant and looking into the future...[Pioneer] programs are designed to provide world-class professional managers and entrepreneurs for the business and industry in Pakistan.

With teaching, research and other extracurricular activities students can learn to think and become 'leaders' and 'responsible citizen[s]' (ibid: 7). I also found Pioneer's slogan for 2004 'No wastage of time' posted in every room and communal area.

A public sector institute, Pioneer's patron and members of the Board are industrialists and senior government officials. Government influence was evident in Pioneer's routine office procedures, such as requirements of various documents and attestations for applying for any student post. Old style of language used in official notices around bulletin boards, official letters and even the heavy and dark old English style furniture in

Director's office that is used in government organizations reminded me of the governmental origin of Pioneer. The Founder of the Nation Mohammad Ali Jinnah's photograph and the Pakistani flag were displayed prominently in offices, libraries, etc.

Since Pioneer was a joint effort of the Government of Pakistan, USAID and the Wharton School of Finance, University of Pennsylvania, it had an American influence as well. The school's first few directors and professors came from America. Pioneer's Centre for Computer Studies was sponsored by IBM (International Business Machines, USA) in 1983 (Program Announcement, 2004-5:6). A plaque commemorating this sponsorship stood visibly at the entrance of the Centre. Several of the institution's teachers have received degrees from the USA (ibid: 6) and some are currently enrolled there in various Ph.D. programmes. Among the artefacts I saw at Pioneer, I noted an official memo from an Assistant Professor of marketing informing the Head Librarian of her keeping in the library a new reference book brought from Kelloggs School of Management, USA. She kept it there along with this message, 'I would like the faculty to encourage the use of this information in their teaching processes' (August 9, 2004). The lady's photograph with the American marketing professor Philip Kotler, who is very popular among Pioneer's students and teachers, was also prominently presented in the Program Announcement, 2004-5 (p. 22).

The Western or American influence could also be seen in men's wearing of jeans and trousers instead of the traditional *shalwar* and *qamees* (Pakistani loose trousers and shirt). Women also wore fashionable dress, but it was mostly Pakistani. This was because Pioneer regulations forbid women from wearing western clothing to class. Moreover, I

frequently heard English around campus, which I consider another legacy of the western or American influence.

The Islamic influence was also visible at Pioneer. Few men wore a typically Islamic dress, though many women had heads covered. Many men wore the traditional Pakistani dress on Fridays, the Muslim Sabbath. The Orientation began with recitation from the Holy Quran. A few minutes later, however, the Director announced no need for a separate course in Islam in Pioneer's curriculum as the important thing was to practice good values of tolerance, progressiveness, and honesty, rather than learn Islam formally through a specially designed course.

I felt that the school's image was also strengthened by teachers' references to the school's culture. From amongst these teachers, Salaam reflected, "*Pioneer is a philosophy, a culture, not an institution...we're a family.*" Then he bound all Pioneer people together in an encompassing statement by claiming that Pioneer people were good because of knowledge and discipline. Pioneer's logo was also printed on curtains, clocks and calendars that hung in every office and classroom.

5.7.2.2 Leaders' Academy

The MBA is the flagship programme of Leaders. Started in 1984, I found it had around 150 enrolled students, of which only 10-15% were women. These students came from a wide variety of disciplines, such as medicine, engineering, arts, computer science, etc. Admission to the programme required a GMAT or LMAT (Leaders' Management

Assessment Test) and 2-3 years of work experience. The Executive MBA, introduced in 2003 (Leaders' general booklet), is attended by local and multinational professionals with at least 6-7 years of work experience (interview, Asma).

Leaders' vision (on the website) reads:

We will be a pre-eminent academic institution, serving as a catalyst for economic prosperity and social development with a focus on management of resources

Its mission (Leaders' website) is to:

- Develop high quality professionals and scholars who are committed to the pursuit of excellence, and are endowed with vision, courage, and dedication.
- Improve academic and management practice in the country through the generation, assimilation, and dissemination of knowledge.
- Make a significant and meaningful contribution towards the social and economic betterment of Pakistan through development of its human resources.
- Serve as an intellectual resource base in the region.

Leaders' philosophy, as given on the website, mentions the values of a merit based approach, hard work, value addition (to students' learning), intellectual rigour, and character building. Leaders' general booklet (not dated) adds diversity to this list, while the Student Handbook (2004-5) adds inculcation of 'the highest standards of personal integrity, social responsibility, tolerance and respect for humanity' to the philosophy.

Based on the above, the Dean's message reads (Leaders' website):

[Leaders] is already well recognized as the premium business school in the country. Our vision is to become recognized as the top ranked business school in the region. Our mission is three-fold: (i) to develop individuals with the integrity and intellectual capacity to assume a leadership role in society, (ii) to impact the practice of management, and (iii) to contribute to knowledge generation and dissemination.

Leaders owes its existence in a big part to Mr. S.B.A who teamed up with Pakistani businessmen to set up the university. Leaders is a private institution, run under the auspices of a governing body many of whose members are eminent businessmen of the country. Leaders' faculty informed that Leaders' values owed a great deal to its founders. These early pioneers, who often had degrees from world-renowned universities and were appreciative of the American university system, toured universities of the USA, Europe and Canada to study their systems before launching their own MBA programme.

"Harvard was the role model for us. That we wanted to create a school somewhat on that model," said Saeed in his interview. So much was Leaders a reaction to the established university education system of Pakistan that, as one of the teachers informed me, they had made a rule in the beginning not to hire any teacher from a Pakistani university for the fear that they would bring in the *"same habits."* These founders and sponsors were not only vividly remembered, but some were still active in Leaders. As I saw in written publications of Leaders, many of its patrons were sponsoring its outreach activities, its funds for deserving students and its scholarships. In fact, several medals and scholarships were named after these prominent industrialists. Auditoria too bore the names of patrons. The business school has recently been renamed to recognize the generous support of the Pakistani industrialist family who had patronized it since the beginning.

Influences of both Islam and the West, particularly America, were seen in Leaders. Both influences were more strongly visible in Leaders than in Pioneer. For example, Leaders' faculty who had attended some of the leading western universities openly acclaimed the American Ph.D. degree to be superior to the British one. Leaders' Student Handbook (2004-5:16) acknowledged taking of disciplinary rules on plagiarism from Harvard and

Sussex universities. Journals in the library too were mostly from America. In my observations around the campus, I saw acknowledgement of USAID funding for the Academic block (that Nasim referred to in his interview) and a plaque commemorating a special address by Lady Hillary Clinton on March 27, 1995. Leader's dining centre was also named 'Pepsi Dining Centre,' perhaps to recognize the patronage of the Pepsi Corporation. English was more often heard among Leaders' student body compared with that of Pioneer. Women in this school were also more frequently dressed in fashionable Pakistani clothing or western jeans and shirts.

At the same time, the Islamic influence was also observable. The Quranic inscription of 'My Lord, increase me in knowledge' (20:114) dominated the main entrance and was seen in several other places. I attended a lecture on misconceptions about Islam in auditoria and attended regular congregational prayers in a well-furnished and frequented mosque. The Islamic Ethics teacher, who is a patron of the Islamic Society, appreciated students' reading of the Quran despite their hectic schedules, at his voluntary Quran classes. The influence of an influential religious party in the country, *Tablighi Jamaat*, was also seen in people's (students' and teachers') attire, (though the university holds no political affiliation).

At Leaders too I felt the school's image was reinforced by such remarks as Professor Ejaz's during one of his classes, "*You are not students; part owners of this place.*" Furthermore, I noted the Leaders logo on exercise books and other stationery.

5.8 Research methods used in the study

Research methods are more powerful when chosen deliberately for being seen as best suited to the character of the data that the researcher deems most useful for his/her research (Greer, 1977; Arksey and Knight, 1999). Bulmer (1977) differentiates between methods and techniques by the level of specificity and contextual concern. When research strategy and techniques are given a specific format, in concurrence with the context of the situation to be investigated, they are called research methods. Thus a concrete, context-specific technique adapted to the study of a situation at hand is a method. Bulmer (1977:8) calls data collection methods the Achilles' heel of sociological research.

I felt my research would be more robust with a blend of different methods and data sources. Hence I used a variety of research methods and data sources to obtain a well-rounded picture of the values endorsed in the MBA programmes in my chosen business schools. A major part of my data came from unstructured, in-depth interviews. To supplement these and to see how more durable business school structures influenced their inhabitants, I also observed various school settings, such as some classes in progress (as outlined by Edwards and Westgate, 1994) and campus life in general, and collected textual material from school offices. I compared beliefs and opinions put forward in interviews (Henerson et al, 1988) and school publications with my notes of observations and asked participants to elucidate events I found intriguing or relevant to my research topic (Angrosino and Perez 2000; Altheide and Johnson, 1998).

Using several data sources and methods is called by some *triangulation*. Arksey and Knight, 1999:21) describe triangulation as 'An integrated research design in which

several different methods are employed to seek answers to a single set of research questions.' Huberman and Matthew (1998:199) consider triangulation a mode of inquiry that selects data sources with different biases and strengths to complement one another, rather than a tactic for converging measures of data, which cannot converge fully in a 'disorderly world.' I have used triangulation of two types:

- a) Between methods, by including interviews, observations and some basic textual analysis to illuminate various aspects of my research problem
- b) Of data sources, by gathering data on the same questions from both informants as well as published material and cultural artefacts

To me all these methods (that is, interviews, observations and basic textual analysis) and data sources (such as gathering data on the same questions from informants, observation studies and published material) appeared complementary to one other. They shed light on both the same and different aspects of my research topic (Sunderland, 2004), allowing me to obtain a rich array of views and opinions and comprehend the phenomenon of values endorsed in business schools more comprehensively.

In addition to these primary research methods, I consulted secondary sources of information, such as programme websites and publications of some of the other schools as well. This information provided me a background for this study by enabling me to obtain an insight into the current situation of the Pakistani MBA.

5.8.1 Starting my research using observation data

My reason for observing classroom and other social interaction, as well as any relevant news items and physical objects around the school was to see for myself the context in which students and teachers learnt certain ideas and values and interacted with one another. I felt observation was necessary, as Mort (2004) says what people say and what they do are not always the same. Not that they want to mislead the researcher, but more so because they often cannot articulate exactly what they want to talk about. Besides, they may not consider it significant enough to tell the researcher about some routine or unconscious part of their work which may be very relevant to his/her study.

Before beginning my field work, I collected 'maps' that guided me towards various venues and timings of availability of different participants and the physical layout of premises, etc., enabling me to sample sites to visit at particular timings (Schatzman, 1973).

An exploratory observer, I began with a few themes in mind and let the study unfold as it progressed. I began by noting down anything I observed. For example, on September 14, 2004, I wrote these '*initial thoughts*' about the Leaders' campus in my diary:

Quite posh building. Traditional red brick, geometrical figures, clean and spacious. New-looking furniture and everything seems systematic and disciplined....Students often in Western dress, not allowed in Pioneer. English is heard more often. I still haven't heard any crude language. Reminds me very much of Lancaster.

I became more focused as the study continued, as is often the case with observation studies as they develop (see for example, Edwards and Westgate, 1994; Silverman, 2000). I looked at interactions amongst teachers and students, both inside and outside the classroom. I looked for patterns, trends and styles of behaviour that spoke of certain values around school campuses and caught on minute elements of social interactions if I could (Adler and Adler, 1998). For example, a few days after having visited some classes in progress in Leaders, I wrote of one:

It's an eclectic course. They are discussing profitability of shares and the giving of dividends. No one speaks out of turn – quietly raise hands and wait for turn. No one laughs at another or aggressively disagrees. They seem seriously involved in class.

In addition to such notes, I occasionally recorded speakers' (whom I came across in my observation studies) words that I felt could be of relevance to my study. In my data analysis I sometimes quoted the fieldnotes and speakers' words as presented above, but more often used them to supplement my analysis of interview data in order to form a complete theme or report on some other aspect of my findings presented in *chapter 6*. I also used these notes and words, along with extracts from school texts, to write a background and ethos of the two schools, as given in *chapter 4*.

Part of culture change involves construction, presentation and manipulation of symbols (Westwood and Kirkbride, 1998). As I was interested in finding out how different ideas and values in schools were communicated through artefacts, I noted down during my observations any objects that caught my attention and that I felt contributed unobtrusively to endorsing certain values and ideas in business schools. In my data analysis I made use of these notes to shed light on my interview findings. These objects and artefacts included

buildings, trophies, curtains and stationery with logos, plaques and rolls of honour.

Hodder (1998:122) says, 'Some material culture, precisely because it is not overt, self-conscious speech, may give deeper insights into the internal meanings according to which people lived their lives.' 'Material culture is often a medium in which alternative and often muted voices can be expressed' (ibid: 127). Objects 'are not innocent, but fraught with significance for the relations that they materialize' (Suchman, 2003: 2). By figuring in the identities of people, standing for particular ideas or viewpoints, objects are used 'as a vehicle for the pursuit of other things' (p. 7) and have a role to play in the 'micropolitics of everyday organizational life' (p. 13).

Observing people and artefacts in classrooms, school grounds, and offices provided me, as I said earlier, with an insight into the ethos of the schools (c.f. chapter 4), indicated further aspects of inquiry (Bulmer, 1977) and illuminated my interview findings and readings of school texts. For example, I referred to the lists of sponsors, disciplinary notices, and plaques around schools in my interviews. Observations also identified candidates for further interviews: for example, noting the frequent occurrence of a particular teacher's name under Islamic activities at Leaders and the Placement Officer's name under internship notices at Pioneer, I thought of interviewing them regarding these aspects of management education in their respective schools. In addition to these, I undertook visits to school libraries and computer laboratories to obtain some idea of the importance of research as an activity at both schools and the way some values, such as discipline, were enacted in the two schools. I would call my observations primarily *naturalistic*, in that I observed people, interactions and objects in their natural work

settings, without interfering with them (Angrosino and de Perez, 2000).(I asked them any questions I had later).

In the classrooms I maintained a rather distant relationship with the participants to be able to report on them (Law, 2004). Not because I was taking an imperialist stance by gazing at my subjects, but because I soon realized that my participation would disturb the flow of interaction as students and teachers did not seem used to the presence of a ‘stranger’ in class. Some teachers explicitly requested me to sit silently in a corner if I needed to attend their class. Some teachers introduced me to their student groups, which made them conscious of me for a little while. In other instances, teachers did not notify my presence, so the students also did not pay much attention to me. In both cases, teachers and students soon appeared to forget about me as I quietly blended into the group.

I took notes of my observational visits while I sat in classrooms or soon after if I could not write down anything there and then (such as presented above). In line with the postcolonial position of avoiding claiming expertise over my observed participants (see for example, Said, 1991) or artefacts (Stavenhagen, 1997), I asked respondents for elucidations in successive interviews. My observations continued during interview breaks or even after I had started reading textual material.

As mentioned earlier, data from observation studies was used to inform interviews and readings of text. Hence, I reported my observation notes with whatever interview themes they appeared relevant to (c.f. 5.9).

5.8.2 Looking for research issues in official publications

I agree with Lazarsfeld (1977:78-9) that

Man is a data producing animal. Wherever he goes he leaves certain kinds of data...This leads to the possibility of using existing institutional data as indicators of complex social trends and relationships.

I thus collected various texts, such as programme announcements, alumni magazine, and other pamphlets circulated by business schools in regard to their MBA programmes.

These records provided me with material in which I could look for evidence of the philosophy, objectives and core values that underlay the working of MBA programmes, in a relatively researcher-unobtrusive manner (Hodder, 1998). Thus they also informed my interviews and observation studies and enriched my data analysis. Besides, they yielded background information, such as the duration of the MBA degree programme and the technical requirements for admission to schools (c.f. chapter 4), that helped me understand qualitative findings more clearly.

Several researchers, including Potter and Wetherall (1992), see texts as not merely reflecting reality, but constructing it. Fairclough (2003:8) sees them as even more powerful builders of ideas and ideologies: 'Most immediately, texts can bring about changes in our knowledge, our beliefs, our attitudes, values and so forth.' In the long term, they can affect identities and social relations. They have ideological effects too. By representing aspects of the world in particular ways, they can contribute to establishing, maintaining and changing social relations of power, domination and exploitation. Taking

a postcolonial perspective towards my study, this was my second major reason for looking into the documents – how they constructed certain ideas and contributed to endorsing certain values.

I did not carry out a full-fledged hermeneutical study of these texts but, but wearing a postcolonial lens, noticed the content and linguistic characteristics of these materials pertaining to values endorsed, ideas spread about prospective careers and some salient features of the curricula. As mentioned earlier, since this data was used to supplement interview and observation data, I reported it with whatever interview themes it seemed to fit in (c.f. 5.9). Selecting some limited category of data to scrutinize, such as headlines or some specific kinds of words is also advised by Silverman (2000). There is no limit to what depth one can textually analyse a written document. The commission of words to text opens up possibilities for different interpretations. ‘There is no “original” or “true” meaning of a text outside specific historical contexts’ (Hodder, 1998: 111).

5.8.3 The interview: my main research method

Since I was interested in finding out respondents’ beliefs, feelings and behaviours about their MBA programmes and their work lives, I conducted in-depth interviews with them. Gubrium and Holstein (2003b) call interviewing a special form of conversation in that it provides a way of generating empirical data about the social world by asking people to talk about their lives. Arksey and Knight (1999:2) say of an interview:

It is not a research method but a family of research approaches that have only one thing in common – conversation between people in which one person has the role of researcher.

‘They get at what people say, however sincerely, rather than what they do’ (ibid: 15).

I began preparation for my interviews by glancing through the publications (such as programme announcements, brochures, and pamphlets) of business schools to find out the core values they explicated, and programme objectives and philosophies they propounded. I observed for the same in classrooms, libraries and computer laboratories, as well as on notice or bulletin boards around school campuses. These informed my interview questions and helped me develop a background of my cases (as given in *chapter 4*). Following is a more detailed version of my interview questions:

Instead of proceeding directly with the main questions, I asked respondents warm-up questions, such as their reason(s) for joining or establishing their MBA programmes, their expectations from their business schools and how far they were met, and their concept of an ideal business graduate in terms of his/her work values (a ‘posing the ideal’ question, according to Schatzman and Strauss, 1973).

I then moved on to the main questions. Underlined below are the main questions, followed by their variants that were used while probing. (This point is explained later)

The research question ‘Which main values are encouraged in business schools?’ was put to respondents as:

Based on your experience, what are the main values encouraged in your business school?

How would you comment on the values about work MBA graduates come endowed with when they enter practical (work) life?

- How would you comment on your programme's objectives and philosophy?
- Considering 'x' is listed as one of the core values of your school, how would you comment on the way it is being implemented in your school?
- MBAs have an image that they are 'xyz.' How would you comment on that? (a 'Devil's advocate' question, according to Schatzman and Strauss, 1973)

The question 'How do respondents comment on the curricula of business schools, especially on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility?' was asked as

How would comment on the curriculum of your business school? Please include in your answer your comments on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility in your programme.

- Do you have any courses in ethical or social responsibility?
- Do teachers or colleagues talk about ethical or social responsibility?
- How are ethical and issues of social responsibility dealt in your curriculum?
- If you were to design the curriculum of your school, what changes would you make in the present one? (A 'hypothetical' question, according to Schatzman and Strauss, 1973)

The question 'What kinds of careers do students look forward to after completing their MBA degree?' was put as:

What kinds of careers are you (or your students) looking forward to after completing your (their) MBA degree?

- What kind of work do MBAs prefer?
- How do MBAs respond to work when they join as fresh graduates?

To close the interview and to provide respondents with a last chance to add something or qualify their earlier comments, I ended with a neutral concluding question, such as, ‘What recommendations, if any, do you have for improving business school curriculum(a)?’ or ‘Any other point you would like to add?’

Research questions underlined above led to more specific ones (following below the main question), generally following respondents’ line of reasoning. This meant that follow-on questions differed from interview to interview (including focus group and joint interviews) and none were asked in a particular order. My research questions were in my mind when I began my fieldwork and I was expecting my respondents to move automatically from one value to another but, after the first few interviews, I realized I had to make my questions more structured in some cases. Trying not to put my words in respondents’ mouth but at the same time leading them to my topic of interest, I found probing difficult at times. Probes can also be a source of interviewer bias in that they push respondents in a certain direction (Oppenheim, 1992). Deutscher, (1977) also forbids the use of probes because, for him, what is said is as important as what is not. However, some other scholars take a different view. Henerson et al (1988) and Denscombe (1998) consider probes a necessary part of an interview in that they help to clarify vague and

incomplete answers. Moreover, respondents may not remember to cover all points in a single response or may give a different frame of reference than the researcher's question implies. In such cases, probing can provide more complete answers and insights into unthought of issues.

5.8.3.1 Individual in-depth interviews

I mentioned earlier that as I wanted my respondents' uninhibited views on their MBA programmes and/or with MBA students, I decided to collect their views through open-ended questions in an unstructured format. I was careful of my interview approach because interviews are often criticized for being a form of 'active control' in that it is usually the interviewer who decides what questions to ask, from whom, the acceptable length of answers, and when to probe (Schatzman and Strauss, 1973:60). Brigg (2003:243) also blames interviews for being discursive in that they are 'highly adapted to producing the precise types of information that will be reconceptualized in books.' 'Systems of difference' and political patterns are obscured beneath notions of objectivity and science (ibid: 245). A postcolonial researcher who did not want to impose any hierarchy of authority over her research participants but wanted them to speak for themselves in ways they desired (see for example, Spivak, 1988), I tried to conduct my interviews in a way of inviting participants to freely air their views and opinions, leaving order of questions, length of answers, the language of the interview and other such practicalities largely to their consideration (also see Gubrium and Holstein, 2003a and b). These interviews offered participants (including myself) an opportunity to clarify questions, explain answers, and probe beliefs, feelings and attitudes (Henerson et al,

1988). A variant of the interpretivist approach (Hughes, forthcoming), the desire of unstructured interviews is to understand, rather than explain. Fontana and Frey (1998) and Altheide and Johnson (1998) also highlight understanding as against control as the goal of interpretive research. Unstructured interviews are also called 'naturalistic' or 'non-directive' in that the respondent uses his/her own ideas and language and the researcher has only a few general themes to guide him/her. According to many of the above mentioned researchers, they are the most demanding and time-consuming category of interviews. However, I had to provide some of my participants with more guidance regarding my research topic and therefore had to add more structure to my interview questions.

A total of 21 respondents were interviewed from the corporate sector and 22 from the academia, of which 14 were teachers and 8 were students (excluding students in joint and focus group interviews). Though most interviews ran for more or less half an hour, some became longer if the participant was very enthusiastic and some shorter to accommodate participants' schedules. Sometimes participants seemed carried away as the interview provided them an opportunity to vent their concerns with business graduates, while at other times they gave short answers if they had anything else to attend to.

5.8.3.2 Focus group and joint interviews

Interested in exploring how certain values and ideas operated within my given cultural contexts, I decided to conduct focus groups and joint interviews in addition to the one-to-one interviews that had given individual opinions. 'Focus groups are group discussions

exploring a specific set of issues,' with the word focus implying some kind of 'collective activity' (Kitzinger and Barbour, 1999:4). Krueger (1994:6) sees them as 'carefully planned discussion[s] designed to obtain perceptions on a defined area of interest in a permissive, non-threatening environment.' Their strength lies in exploring how 'accounts are articulated, censured, opposed and changed through social interaction' (Kitzinger and Barbour, 1999:5). According to Arksey and Knight (1999) and Fontana and Frey (1998), focus groups can give multiple versions of the same reality and fill in gaps to counterbalance bias in other simultaneous interview accounts. Moreover, focus groups also offered me a practical way of saving time of respondents who were not willing to wait in queue.

I thus arranged three joint (two in one school and one in another) and two focus group (one of each school) interviews with the students of each school. Joint interview participants (two in number in all cases) did not develop a discussion on each other's comments and gave rather individual responses, though they could have been affected by the presence of their partners. Focus groups that each had around eight participants (with an equal number of men and women) however, did flow into discussions. Though some participants talked more than others in these sessions, I did not observe any negative instances of anyone dominating the group and causing others to turn quiet. Maybe this was because both focus groups were made up of participants from the same cohorts and everybody was very familiar with everybody else. Moreover, in both focus groups it was often one or two participants who collected their friends together, which was another reason why no one was really shy voicing his/her opinions. Some social science researchers consider members' knowing of one another an advantage, since these are the

very groups in which people are likely to discuss the issues raised in the focus group session, lending an air of reality to the discussion (Kitzinger and Barbour, 1999). Others, such as Krueger (1994) and Farquhar (1999) think this can be constraining as well, especially if the topic of discussion is personal or sensitive.

Each focus group ran for around 80 minutes.

By virtue of being of a particular gender, an age group and a member of an ethnic group, a researcher cannot be 'neutral' (Krueger, 1994; Myers and Macnaghten, 1999). Kitzinger and Barbour (1999) say focus groups can either dilute the identity of the researcher (moderator) or position themselves in relation to their collective identity against the researcher. I experienced the former at Leaders where participants became so involved in their discussion that I spoke mainly to remind them of my presence. At Pioneer, perhaps because of our student-teacher relationship, students often addressed me and at times I had to guide them to respond to the comments of other participants as well.

5.8.3.3 Practicalities in my interview research

The language of interviews was adopted to suit the interviewees. Many respondents began in English but gradually switched to Urdu as the interviews progressed or as they got more involved. I allowed for this to enable them to speak comfortably and express themselves fully, especially since I was keen to know the opinions of the silent voices to counter Oakley's criticism of interviewing as generally embedded in the masculine paradigm and ignoring emotionality and sensitivity (Fontana and Frey, 1999). This also seemed more appropriate from a postcolonial point of view, which too endeavours to

allow postcolonial subjects to speak in their own terms (Spivak, 1988; JanMohamed and Llyod, 1997).

I did not have a sample size in mind, for as the convention goes, I kept on interviewing from various samples until I stopped getting new themes for my analysis (Arksey and Knight, 1999). At Leaders, the Dean of the Business School provided me with an indicative list of faculty and staff, of varying demographics and dispositions, to which I was free to add or subtract names. I was very grateful for this consideration. From Pioneer and the corporate sector I was completely free to interview whoever I wanted to. Here I made an effort to choose people from diverse backgrounds – position, age, experience, public and private sectors, teaching both non-Islamic and Islamic subjects, men and women. In this way I can be said to have used stratified random sampling. In setting up corporate interviews, I was greatly helped by the Pioneer Placement Office, my late father (who had contacts in some companies), some interviewees themselves and my friends. My sample comprised three frames:

a) Students of business schools: Most of this group belonged to the 20-25 years age bracket, had both men and women, belonged to at least the middle class by virtue of the schools they were studying in, and had often been educated in reputed *English-medium* (where the language of instruction is English) schools and colleges.

b) Teachers and administrators of business schools: They ranged in age from 25 to 75 years, and varied from young lecturers at the beginning of their careers to Deans and Directors and Vice Principals awaiting retirement. Most of them were qualified from the

top national and international universities, with seniors in age and rank being more qualified than younger faculty.

c) Managers in industry: From this group I interviewed basically two subgroups: i) middle to senior level managers who had experience working with MBA graduates and ii) young managers or management trainees who had completed their MBAs 2-3 years ago and could therefore comment on their recently attended MBA programmes. Keeping this time factor in mind was important so that I could compare the comments of current MBA students with those of recent (2-3 years old) MBA graduates. In addition to this classification, I made sure I had respondents from both local and multinational sectors, as well as from public and private sectors. Choosing respondents from industry thus had to be planned more carefully. The sample frame of interviewee managers can be depicted on the following table:

	Public	Private local	Private multinational	Total
Middle-Senior	2	8	6	16
Junior	0	3	2	5
Total	2	11	8	21

Table 1: Sample frame of managers interviewed in industry

As I mentioned earlier, observations of people's interactions and of artefacts and notice boards around school libraries and in communal areas also guided me as to whom to interview (Hycner, 1985), while at the same time my interviews disclosed phenomena to observe in action. In addition, if needed, I asked for respondents' views on statements made by other groups on the same phenomenon and looked for the same in my observations and texts. Engaged in qualitative research I was not aiming to 'find the truth' but only inquiring into the perception of various data sources about the values they thought they were endorsing.

I recorded only what people actually said, taking it as sufficient proof of their beliefs, as put forward by Hammersley (1997) (also see Atkinson and Coffey, 2003; Silverman, 2000). All interviews were recorded on a portable cassette recorder using C90 tapes, which according to Krueger (1994), are most suitable, especially for longer focus group interviews. I also took notes during some interviews and focus groups. Although I was expecting the task of managing and recording several respondents at one time a challenging one, participants themselves helped me by moving around the cassette recorder to the speaker in turn.

Green and Hart's (1999) and Baker and Hinton's (1999) focus group researches showed that venue can affect the content of findings. In their studies, participants related different kinds of stories and behaved differently in different contexts, such as a school setting versus a Saturday club or public versus private settings. I also conducted interviews in real settings, including teachers' offices, classrooms, student lounges, and corporate office rooms – where the ideas I was researching were more likely to be aired.

In addition to the interviews directly related to my research problem, I also conducted other interviews with library, laboratory and administrative personnel to find out technical details about MBA programmes. These were more structured interviews, the purpose of which was to collect facts, such as the duration of the MBA degree programmes, technical requirements for admission, number of students in each class, facilities provided in libraries and laboratories, etc. in order to put qualitative findings in context.

On the whole, I found my respondents exceptionally cooperative and most of my interviews went smoothly and efficiently. The few small problems I faced were the dishonouring of their commitments by some respondents. Though all interviews were fixed beforehand, some managers and teachers declined to give me promised time because of urgent tasks that came up. Students also at times refused to be interviewed because of pre-occupation with examinations.

5.9 My chosen method for data analysis

In analyzing my findings, a postcolonial researcher, I looked for an analytical framework that did not detach respondents from their contexts or confine them to a limited range of research parameters. Besides, I had no hypotheses to prove or disprove; nor was I aiming at prediction of any sort. Methodologically speaking, I did not want to consider my respondents' answers as facts or figures drawn out in tables or diagrams but as their opinions of the values endorsed in the business schools they were associated with. These I wanted to supplement with my notes from observations in the schools and relevant extracts from school publications. As an interpretivist, I saw my respondents as autonomous and goal-directed individuals, capable of interpreting their own behavior (Schwandt, 1998).

5.9.1 Method of analysis for interview data

Using a postcolonial lens, I too did not want to impose any preconceived interpretations upon my data. Looking for a framework that gave precedence to the research participant's

voice over the parameters of the analytical tool, I came across Hycner's (1985) and Huberman and Matthew's (1998) frameworks. Hycner believes that 'any research method must arise out of trying to be responsive to the phenomenon' (p. 280). A work that considerably guided me in framing my own analysis was AlAli's (1998) Ph.D. thesis that showed how only some steps from an analytical method, for example Hycner's (1985), can be effectively woven into one's own analytical procedure. I started my analysis as soon as I obtained the data. Interim analysis allowed me to undo errors next time I was in the field and adjust and readjust instrumentation, for example, wording of questions (Huberman and Matthew, 1998).

There follows a step-by-step account of the procedure I used to analyse my interview findings. It has been adapted largely from Hycner's (1985) analytical framework to suit my purpose.

1. Listening

After collecting my interview data, I initially listened to the entire tape to get a sense of the whole interview. Even listening entailed bracketing my own interpretations and entering into the world of the interviewee. This was necessary to rule out any preconceptions or stereotypes. After gaining some experience in listening I began to transcribe interviews as I listened to them the first time.

2. Transcribing

I thoroughly transcribed the first few interviews.

3. Obtaining units of general meaning

Transcriptions enabled me to obtain some 'units of general meaning' (retaining as much of respondents' words as possible) by getting at the essence of the meaning expressed in a sentence(s) or phrase(s) (Hycner, 1985: 282).

4. Obtaining units of relevant meaning

Units of general meaning were then evaluated for their relevance to the research topic and then combined to determine 'units of relevant meaning' (ibid: 283). Irrelevant units were ignored.

5. Clustering units of relevant meaning into themes

Next I put together units of relevant meaning from various interviews that appeared to fall into a natural 'cluster.' To me a relationship among units of relevant meaning appeared if two or more values reflected similar tendencies, for example, a high image of self and a low image of others; reflected contrasting tendencies, for example honesty and dishonesty, or were talked of in proximity, such as tolerance alongside discipline.

Clustering helped display data, revealed themes and associations, and hence facilitated understanding of data. It also helped in 'pattern clarification' or identifying key themes coming from related clusters (Huberman and Matthew, 1998:196).

Labels for clusters, or in other words 'themes,' were derived as much as possible from respondents' own words. Determining themes turned out not to be a simple linear process but a challenging task because it was not only ambiguous, but there were also overlaps

among themes. It required several attempts before I could discover a system of relating various clusters. However, I still believe different researchers could have arrived at different clusters and themes.

6. Obtaining themes from remaining interviews and modifying them when necessary

Once clustering from the fully transcribed interviews was complete, I picked up and transcribed only relevant bits from remaining interviews. Arksey and Knight (1999) report that different researchers hold different opinions about this practice of transcribing only certain portions from interviews. As long as I understood the contexts of my interviews, I considered this practice workable. However, I had to guard against pre-conceived notions as I worked with incoming data and modified themes in its light.

7. Presenting and contextualizing themes

In presenting each set of values in a theme, I included illustrative quotes of all the different sample frames along with observation and textual data that reflected similar ideas. In sections 5.8.1 and 5.8.2 I mentioned how I added relevant portions from my observation and textual readings into the thematic analysis of my interview data. These themes are presented in *chapter 6*, without any discussion. In *chapters 7 and 8*, I have placed the themes back within the contexts from which they emerged, along with thoughts from literature, to determine the presence of any underlying phenomena.

Though I used most of Hycner's (1985) steps I ruled out a few due to my particular requirements and/or circumstances. For one, I did not use the service of any independent judges as I did not want verification. I feel interpretive research is aimed at offering

interpretations that do not need to be verified. Instead they should be thorough, fitting and coherent (see Schwandt, 1998). I wrote summaries of the first few interviews but because of shortage of time in Pakistan within which to conduct a series of interviews that my family and colleagues were helping me arrange, I had to drop the practice. I also tried returning to some participants, as Hycner (1985) advises, but due to their other engagements they did not respond. After reminding them more than once I felt it more appropriate to discontinue the practice.

5.9.2 Illustration of analysis of a theme

In order to better explain how I used Hycner's method, I illustrate in the example below how I analysed my interview data and added observation and textual data to it to give a well-rounded analysis.

For example, this is how one student elaborated about the career plan and the company she had in mind.

At a place where I'll be able to develop my marketing skills. May be an MNC where there is good working environment, good pay. And after earning good amount of money, I'd like to start up my own business related to arts and crafts.

This quote belongs to the theme 'Students' contrasting definitions of a "good job". To develop this theme, I first collected from various parts of the interview and from several interviews respondents' comments on the kinds of careers they desired, subsequently organizing all of the units of relevant meaning into clusters. I labeled these clusters 'Good job' or 'looking for a prestigious position' or 'looking for prestigious company.' For

example, the ‘good job’ cluster included respondents’ comments about a well-paying job, preferably one in a multinational or at least in a large local corporation, while the ‘prestigious position’ cluster contained comments on jobs enabling one to quickly become “*a Sahib or Begum Sahibah*” (akin to the English *Lord* and *Lady*) (interview, manager Khurram). Clusters that seemed related were then grouped together as a theme. For example, finding all of the above three clusters related, I combined them into a single theme of ‘Students’ contrasting definitions of a “*good job*”’. In presenting a theme, I used both my own words such as describing the constituents of a ‘good job,’ as well as extracts, such as given above, from respondents’ interviews.

I made sure that I represented the concerns of all the different groups of participants, whether in my own words or as extracts from their interviews. I then supplemented these interview data with findings from my observations and school publications. For example, below interview findings reported in the above mentioned theme, I write in *chapter 6*:

Leaders’ publications (general booklet and Leaders’ MBA pamphlet) often listed major recruiters of their students, including some of the prominent MNCs and top Pakistani firms. From what they said, Leaders’ teachers also seemed to be giving students ideas of profiteering as a part of their future work. For example, in one marketing class that I attended, the professor repeatedly pointed out at various points of case discussion that one should not be “*afraid*” of becoming rich.

After a complete analysis of all related clusters in a theme, I named the theme using words as close as possible to words from interviews or in publications. For example, the above group of clusters was presented as the theme ‘Students’ contrasting definitions of a “*good job.*”’

5.10 Evaluating interpretive research

This section is about assessing interpretive research for validity, reliability, objectivity and bias from the viewpoint of qualitative research. I have discussed these issues so as to appraise qualitative research, such as mine, in the light of relevant criteria. In this section, I also present a debate on generalization or external validity and how I have incorporated these issues in my own work.

5.10.1 Assessing the quality of qualitative research

I believe qualitative data to be composed of social constructs and as such reflect presuppositions and socio-historical circumstances of their production. Hence, qualitative researchers have no single stance or consensus on addressing traditional topics such as validity and reliability in qualitative studies (Creswell, 1994:157). In fact, many researchers think it is futile to worry about painstaking validation and meticulous reliability.

Reliable measures of social life are only needed by positivists...Once we treat social reality as always in flux, then it makes no sense to worry about whether our research instruments measure accurately (Silverman, 2000:10).

5.10.1.1 Reliability

The question of reliability emerges because asking and answering questions can never be separated from mutual interpretations which are inherently local and non-standardizable' (Silverman, 2000). Following Arksey and Knight (1999) and (Yin, 2003a), I consider a

case study reliable if it explains all data collection and analysis procedures used so thoroughly that they can easily be replicated or operationalized. An interview is reliable as long as the interviewer's actions are 'appropriate.' Observation studies are reliable when the researcher observes repeatedly and systematically (Adler and Adler, 1998). In fact, authors such as Arksey and Knight (1999) and Hodder (1998) prefer to think in terms of consistency (researcher's handling of the topic, plausibility of thoughts and actions, *thick descriptions*), trustworthiness (honestly reporting data) and coherence rather than reliability.

5.10.1.2 Validity

Validity in qualitative research, as I explain below, comes from bracketing one's own judgements on various phenomena, allowing research participants to freely comment on their words and actions and putting all findings in context. In an interview it depends on the skill of the interviewer in managing it within a limited time and successfully creating rapport ('degree of understanding, trust and respect,' according to Henerson et al, 1988) with the interviewee to encourage him/her to talk uninhibitedly (Silverman, 2000; Ellis and Berger, 2003; Rosenblatt, 2003). In observation research, it rests in the opportunity provided to research participants for explaining their behaviour and viewpoints (Schtzman and Strauss, 1973; Adler and Adler, 1998). Finally it also comes from putting all findings in context (Altheide and Johnson, 1998; Hodder, 1998).

I was conscious of these reliability and validity criteria during my data collection and analysis. However, criteria of credibility, transferability, and dependability seem more

plausible in the case of social science research (Bryman and Bell, 2003:288). In addition, as I mention below, a qualitative researcher is as much a participant in the research process and cannot maintain complete objectivity at all times.

5.10.1.3 Bias and objectivity

I believe qualitative analysis is not looking for the kind of 'objectivity' required in experimental research. Since understanding of the respondents' world is the cornerstone of such method, it makes issues of testable hypotheses, predictability and interpretation according to some theory redundant. If objectivity is desired in phenomenological (or interpretive studies), Hycner is of the opinion that it can be achieved by trying to be 'comprehensive' and 'faithful' (1985:297), while Fontana and Frey (1998) stress that one should report one's assumptions.

Angrosino and Pérez (2000:689) say that 'people come into interactions by assuming situational identities that enhance their self-conceptions or serve their own needs, which may be context-specific, rather than socially or culturally normative.' The researcher, by his/her presence, stimulates such identities or interactions. Observation research, for that matter I think interview research as well, thus becomes a 'dialogue' or 'collaboration' between the researcher and participants (ibid: 675; also see Altheide and Johnson, 1998). Some social scientists (including Atkinson and Hammersley, 1998; Edwards and Westgate, 1994; Schatzman and Strauss, 1973) call this 'observer bias' as the fieldworker has a significant influence on the form and content of the relationships that he/she finds, chooses or creates to gather information. But Fox (2001) refers to it as 'academic bias' or

theoretical underpinnings that are necessary to *observe*. The researcher notices what he/she finds interesting, perceives it in the way his/her stock of knowledge allows him/her and writes about it from the viewpoint of his/her chosen theory. Taking into consideration all the various interpretations of researcher' effects on his/her observation study, it can be said that observation studies, as well as interview studies I think, can never be called complete or independent of the observer (also see Altheide and Johnson, 1998; Marcus, 1998). I will have more to say about this issue at the end of the chapter.

5.10.2 Assessing generalization and implications of this research

Previous paragraphs discussed the issue of validity in interpretive research. One type of validity, external validity or generalizability has elicited more debate than perhaps any other issue in case study research.

Lincoln and Guba (2002:27) describe generalizations as 'assertions of enduring value that are context-free.' Social science researchers generally see them as claiming to pertain to 'each and all' elements of a set and as deterministic, nomothetic and reductionist in nature (as against voluntarist and idiographic, which are the fundamental beliefs of social sciences). Their aim is to predict and control. In interpretive research generalization becomes 'pointless,' assert Prasad and Prasad (2002). According to Danmoyer (2002:62-3) too

the role of the [social science] researcher is not to find the correct interpretation. Indeed, the search for the correct interpretation may well be a search for a Holy Grail...[Rather] the purpose of research is simply to expand the range of interpretations available to the research consumer...The bottom line for

assessing the quality of a case study, however, is still the richness of the data presented (see also Schofield, 2002).

Some qualitative researchers, however, permit using generalizations cautiously. Without generalizing universally so as not to overshadow the unique features of a case, Stake (2002:22) suggests what he calls *naturalistic generalizations*. These are arrived at by recognizing the similarities of objects or issues in and out of context and by seeing the natural covariations of happenings. This concept also is not without debate. Gomm et al (2002) view everyday generalizations with suspicion. They say, although we do them all the time, we have access to very few cases on the basis of which we generalize. Our conclusions are therefore likely to be inaccurate. Another question on such generalizations is that being products of individual experience, how can they be shared publicly. Stake thinks they cannot, while Hamilton (in Lincoln and Guba, 2002) thinks they can.

By studying two business schools of Pakistan and interviewing some managers in the corporate sector of the country, I am attempting to raise questions for management educators about the values and ideas they are disseminating among their students and the extent to which these values reflect Islamic traditions. Tending towards subjectivity, I believe, an interpretive approach does not worry about universal generalization. My research too has not established any universal truths, but is only one researcher's interpretation, based on experiential accounts of research participants and published records of concerned organizations, of how an educational (management) discourse is impressing itself upon various people. I do not claim my findings to be generalizable but have hoped to have identified issues and processes that could be relevant in other settings.

This is what Lincoln and Guba (2002) and Lieberman (2002) call *probabilistic generalizations* and are similar to the concept of Stake's (2002) naturalistic generalizations described above.

Lincoln and Guba (2002:40) consider such generalizations to depend on the degree of fit between contexts. Fittingness can be defined as the degree of congruence between 'sending and receiving' contexts and can be recognized if the case that is to be generalized is sufficiently 'thickly' described by the researcher. If a generalization does not accurately fit another apparently similar case, the primary researcher can defend his/her study by stating that the subsequent case was not exactly like the original. Schofield (2002) and Silverman (2000) also advise on clarifying degree of fit before claiming the level of generalization.

Gomm, Hammersley and Foster (2002) criticize such generalizations and transferability for placing the burden of generalization on the reader, rather than the researcher, though it is only the latter who has access to original data. Besides, they hold authors who talk about 'fit' responsible for not explaining adequately how 'fit' is to be assessed or which cases need to be studied to see 'fit.' But in leaving generalization to the inference of the reader, I am implying that generalization in case study research is not statistical, but rather *analytical*, based on theoretical propositions (Wieviorka, 2000; Yin, 2003a; Ackroyd, unpublished paper). It is largely an unconscious process on part of both the researcher and the reader. Gomm, Hammersley and Foster (2002) also hold that a case cannot be independent of researchers or readers. Case study reports some facts and leaves out others. To these, each reader adds and subtracts his/her own understanding based on

readings of previous cases (Stake, 2000). Through this process of finding commonalities and distinctions is a case ultimately and subjectively understood.

5.11 Reflexivity: myself as a researcher participant

Before explaining my findings (in *chapters 7 and 8*) I would like to reflect upon my role in this research. Reflexivity is not only a way of knowing but also a way of coming to know the social world, reminds Hughes (1999). She adds that reflexivity is all the more important because in piecing together bits of evidence from several places, one ends up constructing an entirely new reality of one's own (also see Perriton, 2001). In this section I examine my position as a researcher both in the field and in the formulation of my literature questions, analysis and conclusions.

I am cognizant that being an academic in the community I have researched, my person and presence could have led my research participants to modify their beliefs. 'In the company of truer believers than himself [taking cues from them], he may become more entrenched in his belief and more highly motivated to perform the behaviour' (Kiesler et al, 1976:250). A familiar face at Pioneer Academy, my respondents often talked to me about non-research related issues both before and after completing the interviews. I too identified with them more than I did with respondents in Leaders. Similarly Pioneer alumni in industry, seeing the academic linkage we had, also gave candid views about the institution's educational policies. Apart from Pioneer students, faculty and alumni, the other group that I felt trusted me more than others, at least as far as the religious aspect of the research was concerned, was the religiously oriented one, whether at Pioneer, Leaders

or in the corporate sector. They openly criticized the secular, American or the non-Islamic element in MBA curricula and management practice. Others who apparently had no strong religious issue with MBA education also brought in religious arguments into their comments, something I felt was triggered off by my Islamic attire. I find this a strength of my research since people did not feel inhibited talking about the Islamic values present/absent in the academia – a topic that is usually not encouraged or considered ‘reactionary’ in academic circles (c.f. chapter 4).

On the other hand, my *insider* position at Pioneer, I felt, also led some respondents, surprisingly mostly teachers, to exercise some caution while speaking. Perhaps this was because of the close contact I had with the senior administrators, a fact that was known to most faculty. During observations too I might have caused some anxiety about being watched to some participants, though most seemed to forget about me as they got more involved in the class or in other work. I too felt conscious as I sat in a corner in the classroom or on a bench in the hallway.

I have revealed my influence on my research because I believe a researcher and other participants are both partners in the construction of a social reality. Research is not separate from the researcher (Prasad and Prasad, 2002). ‘Much research is partly personal process’ (Marshall, 1999:157). ‘What we say is always in context, positioned,’ (Hall, 1998: 222). All researchers in my opinion, particularly social science researchers ‘select, interpret, colour, emphasize, shape their findings’ (Watson, 1994: 79). Besides, while collecting data, different researchers stimulate different identities of participants (Angrosino and Pérez, 2000; Altheide and Johnson, 1998). Even interpretation of past experiences can be influenced by the personality of the researcher, whose presence could

bring to mind specific parts of retrospective events, leading to the formation of a new *joint* reality. It is thus important to clarify one's position as a researcher in the field so as to let the reader judge for him/herself why and how the researcher influenced his/her work the way he/she did. This will hopefully provide a more realistic understanding of the work.

Having mentioned instances where I have myself stepped into my research field, I will also explicate my position elsewhere in my research. I began my research as a postcolonial Muslim researcher, who aimed to expose the vacuum left in management literature by focusing on ideals and discourse that often seemed neglectful of Islamic teachings. This had long concerned me because calling ourselves Muslim teachers, I felt it necessary that Pakistani management curricula mentioned relevant Islamic teachings alongside other management literature. Though I sincerely appreciate much in management education of today, I am of the opinion that it cannot be called complete or fully beneficial unless it includes religious, in my case Islamic, thought within its curriculum. Disturbed by such 'incongruities in values and perceived lack of social justice' in the academia I am a part of, I have considered myself responsible for voicing these concerns. This notion has run as a key theme throughout my research. In fact, my main research question has been to inquire into the harmony between values endorsed in Pakistani management academe and those put forward in Islam (c.f. chapter 7). Hence my subsequent research questions have tried to explore this. This notion also guided me towards selecting the postcolonial perspective towards my study as I sought to understand the effect of colonial culture on the Islamic culture of the Indian subcontinent. As I analyzed my research data, I reviewed Islamic literature and research on Islamic values to

find out how the values my data sources mentioned compared with those espoused in Islam. Hence my conclusions also reflect the Islamic point of view. I thus see myself as a 'tempered radical' – one who works within mainstream organizations and professions, but also wants to transform them (Marshall, 1999:159). This 'confession' I think, is necessary to 'both support and contradict rationality which is embedded in progressive narratives' and enhance integrity of research' (Hughes, 1999; also see Perriton, 2001; Fontana and Frey, 1998).

6.0	CHAPTER 6: INSIGHTS FROM DATA	177
6.1	From research questions to research findings	177
6.2	Values about work	185
6.2.1	Students' contrasting definitions of "a good job"	186
6.2.2	Business students' and managers' images in academia and industry	193
6.2.2.1	<i>Contrasting images of business students</i>	193
6.2.2.2	<i>Managers' images in industry</i>	198
6.2.3	Consequences of looking forward to a "good job" and harbouring certain images	200
6.2.4	Respondents' understanding of "contribut[ing] to socio-economic welfare of the country"	201
6.2.4.1	<i>Promoting social responsibility in the schools</i>	202
6.2.4.2	<i>Promoting social responsibility in industry</i>	206
6.2.5	Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people"	207
6.2.5.1	<i>Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people" in academia</i>	208
6.2.5.2	<i>Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people" in industry</i>	233
6.2.6	Section summary	236
6.3	Development of the curricula	238
6.3.1	How are the curricula formulated?	239
6.3.2	How are the curricula taught?	241
6.3.3	Research in the two business schools	247
6.3.4	Interaction between business academia and industry	248
6.3.5	Section summary	250
6.4	Non-Islamic (secular) element in the business schools (and organizations)	251
6.4.1	" <i>Liberal</i> " and " <i>Western</i> " values in contrast to "Islamic" values	252
6.4.2	The challenge for ethical and religious subjects in the MBA curricula	254
6.4.3	Section summary	258
6.5	Chapter summary	259

CHAPTER 6: INSIGHTS FROM DATA

6.1 From research questions to research findings

In *chapter 1* I described how MBA graduates' varied work values had intrigued me to the point where I decided to study the values and ideas endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes. Before undertaking research in the two chosen business schools, I had sought (as I described in *chapter 2*) to study the thinking prevalent in present day MBA education and had come across two discourses in management education that in my opinion have had a considerable role to play in the value system of the MBA – discourses of technicist-managerialism and Westernization/Americanization. It was seen that technicist-managerialist thinking was unduly concerned with the objective, unemotional part of management, to the point of neglecting emotional and ethical values, while Westernization/Americanization described the dominance of Western/American ideas in management education of today. This domination by Western countries, especially America, was, as we saw, considered by many postcolonial critics, such as Prasad and Cavanaugh (1997) and Mills and Hatfield (1999), as a continuation of colonialism, which had been responsible for marginalizing and misrepresenting the cultures of the colonized nations. Cognizant of the fact that much in the Indian sub-continent's religious culture has been overwritten by the colonial educational system, it was thus a short step to my selecting the postcolonial theory as my research perspective (for details see *chapter 3*). Besides, the postcolonial theory also appeared relevant to addressing some of the critique raised against technicist-managerialist thinking, and had therefore seemed suitable as a theoretical perspective for this study. I had earlier read (as outlined in *chapter 1*) that

educational development is not an independent phenomenon but a part of a country's socio-economic and political development. In *chapter 4*, I therefore presented the development of the MBA degree in Pakistan in the light of its socio-economic and political history, ending the chapter with a contextual account of the two business schools I have studied for this research.

The main research questions I explore in this study are:

- Which main values are encouraged in business schools?
- What kinds of careers do students look forward to after completing their MBA degree?
- How do respondents comment on the curricula of business schools, especially on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility?

In an earlier section (see *chapter 1*) I discussed the numerous understandings of the term values. I also asked my respondents for the same before putting my main research questions to them. In the next few paragraphs I furnish some of my respondents' understanding of values. For example, Dawood, a senior administrator from one of my case studies, understood values as something basic to one's life:

Values are such an all-inclusive thing, fundamental postures towards life and acting in life, being a person, that you can't just say, 'Hey, this is for business school, that is for medical school, and this is for a shopkeeper, that is for a judge' ... Whatever you learn in a business school in terms of knowledge and all that gets outdated very quickly but the values remain forever.

However, not all respondents agreed to experiencing the same values or to the same extent, nor even if inculcation of any values could be possible at this stage or in this type

of education. Considering society to have a strong influence on personality, Moeen, from the administration of Pioneer Academy, one of my case studies, believed that unless society or business market endorsed the values the school considered essential in its curriculum little could be achieved in imparting them to students

See if these values are important in society. If yes, you can inculcate them in students through your education system. But if they aren't important in society, then if you try hard, perhaps you can make some impact, but I don't think you'll achieve much. It might be only temporary.

He also thought it was futile to attempt to worry about giving values because this was not what the market had demanded

Business education is a job-oriented degree; the objective is to train people. Basically you're preparing a product for the market. It's not that what values you are giving them but seeing that your product should be acceptable in the market. Values and philosophies, these are jargons, I am sorry to say. I don't think anyone seriously believes in it.

Dawood, from the administration of Pioneer, believed that business schools could influence the values of students, but also held that values from the society have already had their impression before students came to Pioneer. Hence, the impact of society cannot be disregarded

I've heard young people say, 'Hey, you can get away with anything in this country.' So before they [students] come to Pioneer they have learnt lessons, right or wrong, about how the society really operates and how people who are privileged and have power and money, how they can manage to be treated differently...that to succeed what you need to do is to be able to use connections and use money and use power.

Explaining how business schools could influence students' values, he highlighted the role of teachers in this regard. By paying attention to teachers' histories and psycho-social dynamics during hiring, rewarding them and recognizing their efforts, Pioneer

encouraged them to demonstrate its values. Only after this they could be hoped to inculcate them in their students

Actually faculty members are individual members and they have their own histories, their own psycho-social dynamics what they have learnt in their homes, their early lives. That's very important and just won't go away like that. Of course we do pay attention to these aspects when we are choosing new faculty to come in...we are rewarding by way of recognition, by way of increments and all, and we keep in mind which faculty member is more serious, more dedicated, more devoted to students, openness and challenge, and which faculty member is doing research, and which faculty member is going out and responding to whatever the business requirements are for research and case writing and publications.

Among teachers at Pioneer, Ciran, acknowledged that being a teacher, especially in a privileged school such as Pioneer, it was her (as well as her fellow teachers') responsibility to share her experiences with her students and awaken them to the idea of serving society. Some other faculty members, such as Sikandar and Maqsood, also considered teachers to have a critical role to play in the personal development of students. According to Maqsood, all of the Pioneer values of merit, integrity, tolerance, and creativity were "*interrelated and driving force is teacher's behaviour.*"

Though Asma, from amongst the students of Pioneer, affirmed that only the new students who purchased the prospectus (Program Announcement as it was called) knew about the school's values, Omar was conscious of the extensive role of this business school in shaping students' personalities, "*In four years Pioneer transforms you. When you come in you are raw material.*"

At Leaders Academy, students in a focus group believed that teaching ethical values in the MBA was "*too late,*" since people have already formed their ethical beliefs by the

time they enter professional education. Taking influence from family, early schooling and the rest of the society, personality forms much earlier in life. Nasim from Leaders' faculty too agreed to this. In fact, according to him, one of the reasons for the Westernization or liberalism (as some respondents called it) in Leaders' culture, was the schooling in elite English-medium schools of the majority of its students. However, he did not dismiss the school's role in affecting its students' value systems.

Explaining how his school endorsed certain values, Karim from the school's administration expressed that their values were adhered to in the hiring of staff, the admissions of students and the grading of assignments. Zaheer, also from senior administration, further elaborated:

It's not the notion that we teach them [students] these things; it's how we do certain things, more importantly. Hopefully they can see things happening in a certain way in this institution. So when they go and work somewhere they will have certain reference point, certain expectations from those organizations. If they find things not up to the standard, then they'll try to bring in little change.

This was in fact what one of the students and her class fellows actually did at an internship. Feeling annoyed with fellow interns' whiling away of their time, my respondent and her colleague reminded them to make the most of their limited time at the company.

After these initial remarks about values, questions became more focused on topic of values endorsed in the two business schools. As mentioned earlier, I have carried out case studies, from a point of view of stakeholder analysis, of two Pakistani business schools, with the help of these in-depth interviews and observational and textual studies.

Interviews were also carried out in industry with managers who were either working with MBA graduates and could therefore comment on the values MBA graduates generally brought with them to their practical lives or were recent MBA graduates themselves who had just begun their careers and could therefore provide insights into their MBA experiences of the near past. I also attempted to obtain an insight into these managers' own management practices to see any connection between corporate and academic value systems.

The above mentioned questions were asked in broad terms to allow respondents to freely comment on their opinions and experiences. I began my interviews with values listed in the school publications by asking students and teachers direct questions as to how they saw particular values being implemented or endorsed in their schools. To managers, my first question was usually about values fresh MBAs came endowed with and how did this compare with values they would have liked to see in their ideal business graduates. As I listened to respondents' conversations, I kept probing into comments I found laden with value judgements. Sometimes it was necessary to prompt participants to continue talking and I had to provide leads in the form of questions such as, "It's a common perception that MBAs demonstrate 'value xyz' quite often. How would you comment on this?" In focus group interviews participants' comments also came in response to others' remarks.

In support of my interviews, I observed classes in progress, read notice boards and any publications I could obtain, and toured communal areas, such as school libraries and computer laboratories, to find out more about the values talked about by my research

participants. Research questions listed above were not only put to respondents but also kept in my mind as I observed business school surroundings and read their publications.

In *chapter 5*, I also described my method of analysis of interview data, that is clustering of data into particular themes, largely following the method of Hycner (1985). I also mentioned how I added observational and textual data into my analysis to complete the explanation of each theme that described how a particular value or set of values was being endorsed in the MBA programmes.

In this chapter I present insights from interviews about the values respondents thought were being endorsed in the MBA programmes or from my observations and readings of publications of my case studies. I have also noted down the circumstances under which I obtained particular insights. In presenting the quotes, I have tried to select the ones that most clearly point out the role of business schools in the endorsement of values. Of course not all participants saw the inculcation of values in an identical way. Some saw them fully endorsed, some partially and some not at all. They also differed in their opinions about the major values that were being endorsed. Observations and texts gave additional accounts of the endorsement of different values. I have noted down findings from all these sources in order to paint a realistic picture of the extent to which each value was being endorsed in each institution. Whenever I have found a striking similarity or contrast between comments from academia and industry about the values being endorsed in their respective work environments, I have presented them alongside values found in academia to suggest a possible link between industrial and academic values, especially since both the schools were eagerly encouraging interaction with industry. It must also be

noted that interview quotes do not appear in the order in which respondents handled the topic because open ended interviews let them decide what values they chose to talk about first. I have italicized and put within quotation marks respondents' words extracted from interviews. Findings from observations and texts, including words of people who spoke during my observation studies but did not directly address me, are placed with the interview ideas they support the most, after which the whole is presented as a theme. These words collected from observations or from texts appear within quotation marks but are not italicized in order to distinguish them from interview data. All respondents and organizations participating in this research are anonymised in order to keep them confidential. Instead hypothetical names are used throughout.

This chapter contains these constituent sections:

- Section 6.2: Values about work

Respondents' views, my observations and my reading of school publications on values about work, organized into four themes.

- Section 6.3: Development of the curricula

Respondents' views on the curricula of their schools. Though these comments were obtained as part of the in-depth interviews, I have presented them separately because they reflected on not one but all of the above mentioned four themes. Besides, as they offer some factual material about curriculum formulation and teaching, I decided to present them separately.

- Section 6.4: The non-Islamic (secular) element in the business schools (and organizations)

Respondents' overall views on the prevalence of Islamic and/or non-Islamic values in their schools or organizations. Although these quotes were also embedded in answers to the main research questions, my reason for presenting them separately is that I see them overarching the four themes and hence not belonging exclusively to any one of them.

In this chapter I lay out themes, emerging from various data sources, along with my brief explanatory comments, but I do not interpret any theme. This will be taken up in *chapters 7 and 8*. I must mention that I do not claim that the following values are found exclusively in the MBA students of the two schools I studied, nor that the two programmes are the sources of origin of these values. What I suggest is that these values are *endorsed* (no matter where their origin may be) by the two business schools through their MBA curricula.

6.2 Values about work

This section deals with respondent's accounts of their experiences and opinions of the values and ideas about work prevalent in their schools. I have identified the schools of the speakers in order to enable the reader to place the quotes in their respective contexts. As mentioned earlier, views of work values endorsed in industry are also included in order to let the reader see any similarities or contrasts in the sets of values in the two sectors. The idea is not to compare the two sectors, nor the two schools, but to enable the reader to see the links between them and develop a contextual understanding of the phenomena. Titles for the themes are taken from the interviews of participants or the texts of schools'

publications in the form of words that most comprehensively encompass the discussions in the respective themes. The four themes I arrived at from my data are as follows:

- (i) Students' contrasting definitions of "a good job"
- (ii) Business students' and managers' images in academia and industry
- (iii) Respondents' understanding of "*contribut[ing] to the socio-economic welfare of the country*"
- (iv) Other professional and interpersonal values "*working for people*"

6.2.1 Students' contrasting definitions of "a good job"

This section details respondents' answers to the research question:

What kinds of careers are you (or your students) looking forward to after completing your (their) MBA degree?

My reason for asking this question was to obtain an insight into students' conception of the purpose of work and the values they thought were associated with success. It also presents managers' understanding of the kinds of jobs MBA graduates generally look for after completing their degrees. In addition, it includes extracts from school publications and my observations on the schools' and industry's role in the promotion of specific ideas about success and a debate on multinational companies as prospects for individual careers and economic growth of Pakistan.

When I asked students about their career preferences, most said they looked forward to "*good job[s]*" or setting up businesses of their own, and wanted to reach there quickly. A

“good job” meant a well-paying one, preferably in a multinational or at least in a large local corporation, which in Khurram’s words (interview), perhaps sarcastically, was such that could enable them to quickly become “a *Sahib or Begum Sahibah*” (akin to the English *Lord and Lady*).

A final year student, Sadaf, not only expressed her choice but also mused on where she and her fellow students could have got such ideas:

This is one very good thing - this link with outside world, that we’ve to go to an MNC, get a good job...Somewhere along the line we think if we get such a GPA¹⁸, we’ll get such a job; if this will happen, that will follow. I don’t know where we learn it from. Through teachers? Internships as well because we’re getting hands on experience and practical knowledge... as well as elective courses because they’ve got professional teachers...Pioneer culture?

Written publications of Pioneer (anonymised name for one of my case study schools) frequently referred to well known local or multinational companies (MNCs) with regard to career opportunities for its students. For example, I noted that the 2004-5 Program Announcement of Pioneer had laid out concepts echoing Sadaf’s ideas above. It talked about a ‘promising journey’ into Pioneer (p. 4) and ‘Pioneer alumni have achieved phenomenal success in the corporate world and a large number of them occupy top positions not only in Pakistan but around the world’ (p. 8).

Leaders’ students saw a good job as one where “*I can apply the things I’ve learnt.*” And this was seen more probable of being achieved in multinational corporations (MNC) compared to local companies because the latter were “*very bureaucratic...can’t go up the*

¹⁸ Grade Point Average, a scale of academic performance, ranging from 0.00 to 4.00, often used in MBA programmes.

corporate ladder very easily.” One student elaborated about the career plan and company she had in mind:

At a place where I'll be able to develop my marketing skills. May be an MNC where there is good working environment, good pay. And after earning good amount of money, I'd like to start up my own business related to arts and crafts.

Leaders' publications (general booklet and Leaders' MBA pamphlet) often listed major recruiters of their students, including some of the prominent MNCs and top Pakistani firms. From what they said, Leaders' teachers also seemed to be giving students ideas of profiteering as a part of their future work. For example, in one marketing class that I attended, the professor repeatedly pointed out at various points of case discussion that one should not be “afraid” of becoming rich.

A focus group student seemed to grasp the above-mentioned idea and explained that students' main purpose of being at Leaders was to carve out careers for themselves:

Focus in Leaders for me is towards getting a good job. All the accounts courses we have, in the end what we are trying to do is to generate profits. One core value is that...If someone gets a very good job at Procter and Gamble, he would go for it...I mean that could be one of the goals that we have.

I heard no counter argument to this from the focus group.

Students' fascination with MNCs was noted by both teachers in their schools and managers in industry, many of whom had an opportunity to work with Pioneer's and Leaders' graduates. Nasim from Leaders' faculty confessed that they prepared students primarily for careers in MNCs, rather than for those in local companies. Moreover, MNCs themselves proved more attractive for fresh graduates because of their infrastructures and

policies. It was not only Leaders' students who liked to work for multinationals, but, as Nasim said, also those from Pioneer (as many themselves admitted) because

they provide good growth opportunities, they pay very well, they treat you well and have nice air-conditioned offices, so you're attracted. Pakistani companies are not offering such environments, perks, attractive packages, mixed boys-girls environment. They would have male-dominated culture, men with beards and moustaches, MBAs will not go there.

Managers in industry were also cognizant of this fascination with MNCs. Although some of the local companies were offering salaries in commensuration with multinationals and improving their infrastructures and recruiting and hiring programmes to attract more qualified graduates, Ghani, a senior official from a public sector company reported that business students still aspired to join MNCs because

the environment in MNCs is more or less the shadow of the environment these companies are having in their parent places. That is a major attraction for the young graduate. He is going to work in an environment that is close to the Western things because the West is still an ambition or the West is still a dream for us, particularly for those who are in a growing era of life.

Salim, an exhausted manager-owner of a local printing firm said of fresh MBA graduates, "All want to target MNCs...I really needed to sell the organization and the idea for them to work [here]."

Ifat considered people's fascination with foreign multinational companies as a bigger social problem that concerned the whole workforce.

It is the MNC taboo. We all have a chip on our shoulders. I don't know when we are going to shrug it off and start realizing that we are no less than anybody. Why do our students and workforce excel when they go abroad? Here we are fussy about things we like to do; there we're willing even to wash dishes.

Another dimension of a successful career that quite a few students talked of while discussing their prospective careers was setting up businesses of their own. Considering entrepreneurial spirit as a key quality of an ideal business graduate, a female student Nosheen said, “*Unless you venture into new things, I don’t think you are truly a business man.*” Leaders’ publications, such as Alumni Annual 2003, also recounted entrepreneurial achievements of several of Leaders’ graduates, including some women. These alumni were highly appreciative of the Leaders’ experience – for providing them with diverse management knowledge, training for the real world, creditable qualification, discipline and perseverance, and enabling them to launch their businesses successfully. Pioneer students, however, denied being encouraged to become entrepreneurs. Although they had courses in entrepreneurship, the school’s culture seemed more focused towards MNCs, a focus group unanimously believed. Yet some students expressed a desire to set up businesses of their own in future.

In addition to looking forward to “*good job[s],*” business students seemed to be demanding “*instant gratification,*” as some teachers and managers noted. An administrator from Leaders described his students as being “*in a hurry.*” A teacher from the same school added

They also think we can do it and start doing it from day one. We should be CEOs when we graduate. That doesn’t happen that way.

Akram, a young manager, blamed training in a business school for students’ impatience. I sense that perhaps faculty’s frequent references to a prospective managerial career could have affected students’ perception of taking up managerial roles soon after entering practical life. For example, at the freshers’ Orientation session in August 2004, which is

the new entrants' first official day in Pioneer, the Director stressed, "Think like managers – take decisions, learn to use theories and formulas." Another faculty member, Ausaf, touched upon the same issue, urging students to "develop good habits first as students and then as managers."

In pursuit of success, not only did the students run after "*outwardly glittery*" jobs, as Ifat from industry observed, but companies themselves paid attention to outward appearance of candidates for jobs. This too, I think, could have helped students form particular images of managerial life. An executive manager in a local company, Ifat reported of Leaders' graduates.

Their packaging is so glittery and glamorous that after talking to them, employers are willing to pay twice the price for them.

Asma, a hardworking but relatively quiet MBA student, also found MNCs' policy of hiring for "*social competence*" or how a person came across in his/her interview rather disappointing.

Ifat vehemently criticized fresh graduates' approach of seeking work primarily in MNCs. She expressed the opinion that this approach not only reduced students' chances of learning, as MNCs often assigned them clerical tasks, but also restricted their movement to other less paying but growing companies where opportunities to learn could have been more.

From a different viewpoint, respondents such as Omar saw a negative side in career plans described above. A final year MBA student from Pioneer, he grieved that the narrow-minded pursuit of careers was developing a materialistic mentality in students:

Pioneer in your initial semesters makes you very materialistic. For example, studies are more of a materialistic nature than [being] applicable. We lack faculty which can orient us towards that [non-materialism]. Teacher will tell you how to go out and earn salary. But in BBA6, for the first time, I studied the Development Economics course. There I had the introduction to the idea that there is a lot more besides money in this world.

For him personal development was a necessary part of success and the purpose of one's life. Noting the lack of personal developmental opportunities in his business school, he had been struggling to find the purpose of his life:

I thought that after three years I'll have the MBA degree but what will be the purpose of that degree? Will it be a mere piece of paper to get me a job or the end for me will be earning money for myself or my family, for the future of my children, their education, etc. It's a cycle that's going on and I will be part of that cycle...At one point I was so discouraged that I wanted to quit Pioneer...But then I inclined towards religion and met people who said, 'No, it's not that you should quit studies. Study is not the purpose of life.' They said your purpose of life is to be a good man in every thing...People said your education, your employment will be a medium to spread the message of humanity, of love, of brotherhood in the world.

These ideas had come to him, as he said, through his readings of the life of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) and other religious scholars of Islam, many of whom were businessmen by profession. Ciran, from Pioneer faculty, testified to the above. Sounding upset, she said:

We really teach students to be selfish – get a good GPA, go to an MNC, improve quality of your life; go abroad. Do everything for yourself; don't do anything for anyone else. Emphasis is always on yourself; emphasis is never on society, on people around you. I mean it's ridiculous. The philosophy of Pioneer, as I see, is always profit-making, always profit-making. But profit can be in spiritual terms also. But we never bother about spiritual terms.

Shahan, from a local bank, considered selfishness of MBA graduates as symptomatic of a social malaise, “*Everybody is selfish in society, not only business graduates.*”

6.2.2 Business students’ and managers’ images in academia and industry

This section presents business schools’ and corporate sector’s perception of MBA graduates of my two case studies. I did not ask students direct questions about how they saw themselves in relation to other business graduates, but their views about themselves came up as they described their experiences at internships and other school assignments (while commenting on their school’s curricula) or their expectations of their future careers. Teachers’ and managers’ views too about students were obtained in response to values MBA students demonstrated in business schools or brought to practical job life. Since all these opinions and ideas reflected certain value orientations, I have included them in the section on work values.

Managers also occasionally gave insights into their perceptions of their jobs and their colleagues in industry while answering my research questions. I have included these responses in this section because I feel industrial images of managers and managerial work could be filtering into academia and influencing students’ images of their present status and future work.

6.2.2.1 *Contrasting images of business students*

Students' images about their privileged status seemed to be based on the images of their institutions, whether for their rigorously selective admission procedures or for their modern infrastructures. The school fee was also debated upon as contributing to the school image. Teachers and publications from schools, as well as managers in industry, held students from the two schools in high esteem. At times students also realized the privileged status they enjoyed viz. a viz. other students in academia and the job market. However, they sometimes saw a conflict in this perception and gave negative opinions about themselves.

The privilege of being a part of Pioneer was an idea that students were introduced to from the very start. Pioneer's selection procedure chose only a few candidates from hundreds of applicants (for example, less than a 100 from nearly 2500 applicants to the flagship Morning BBA-MBA programme) and it had been the number one business school in Pakistan for more than three decades. Pioneer's Program Announcement (2004-5:18) described its students as 'crème de la crème' because of this selection from several thousands of applicants from all over the country and their capability of withstanding the demanding curriculum of Pioneer. So just joining the school accorded the student an elite status. On the day of the Orientation, similar ideas were heard. At this event, the Disciplinary Head smilingly welcomed newcomers with "I welcome you because you deserve to be welcomed." Several teachers and school societies' representatives also referred to Pioneer as the "great institution" in their welcome addresses. Once here they did not have to worry about their jobs, the Director added. Sikandar from the Management department reminded them once again before they left the ceremony, "I hope you will contribute to the prestige of Pioneer and join me on the alumni forum."

Artefacts reflecting of the prestige of the institution were also displayed in various places around the school. For example, trophies from the celebrated HEJ applied chemistry institute, in commemoration of the event inviting faculty from America – American Faculty 2001 programme, and for various sports events occupied a distinguished corner in the library. Newspaper clippings of Pioneer’s congratulatory message to the Prime Minister of Pakistan, Mr. Shaukat Aziz, who was a Pioneer graduate, on assuming office also bedecked several notice boards.

Qaiser’s narration of the kind of reception he and his classmates received when they visited a multinational bank demonstrates the internalizing of such privileged status:

We walked in a door we said we were from Pioneer. They offered us lassi [more expensive drink in place of the usual tea served in offices], they offered us an air-conditioned room. ‘You’re from Pioneer, come on in, come on in,’ with open arms they took us in. And these are the companies that are topmost companies in Pakistan; they give you this kind of reception.

Still very much at the top of MBA education in the country, Pioneer, which from 1955-84 had been unchallenged in the business academia and the practical world of Pakistan, was facing competition from Leaders and certain other upcoming schools. If Pioneer was praised for its education, it was also criticized for declining standards. Some managers noted this in their interviews, while I heard rumblings of being secondary to Leaders among the school’s own students and teachers. This issue was of much concern to a focus group at Pioneer, which did not agree with the eulogistic accounts of Pioneer. Ahmar, from this focus group, complained of the lack of individuality of his fellow students:

It’s a big assembly-line with lots of products. There might be a few defects, that’s another thing. Otherwise you’re on an assembly line.

Waqar saw the issue of not being up-to-date with one's profession as a weakness of Pioneer's curriculum. Recognizing that Pioneer teachers often adhered to old text books, discouraged use of the internet for assignments and did not refer to multiple books in their lectures, he pointed out to the necessity of keeping oneself up-to-date through one's own efforts. He acknowledged that not being able to understand business bulletins on television had made him ashamed of himself, "*If I'm sitting with an Harvard graduate I'll feel inferior, no matter how much knowledge I have.*" That is why he had made up his mind to study further (preferably abroad) before joining industry.

In contrast, other students such as Omar were not ready to accept any ideas about the falling quality of Pioneer graduates. He complained of the students' and faculty's harbouring of the idea that "*Pioneer is lagging behind.*" He acknowledged that though his school's buildings and infrastructure were more modest and its faculty less qualified than that of Leaders, "*Pioneer is topmost still.*" Regarding students from other schools, he declared

Whatever impression I have of CBA [another upcoming business school] graduates, by meeting them, they are no way near us.

Leaders' publications also painted a very positive picture of the university. Though they did refer to modern physical facilities that the school provided for its students, they tried to call the reader's attention more to the academic and professional worth of the institution. Leaders' general pamphlet proudly began:

[Leaders], a premier institution of Asia, is located in the historic city of Lahore, Pakistan. A custom-built campus, housed in an area of 100 lush green acres, provides the ideal setting for accomplishing your career goals. The University, in

its 16 years of existence, has made more than a mark in the corporate as well as the academic arenas where its graduates are demonstrating outstanding performance.

Leaders Alumni Annual (2003:3) introduced it as a ‘fine institution.’ It then gave founding members’ opinions of the school. For example, Saquib claimed that Leaders had “set a standard for other institutions,” (p. 35), while Hakim informed, “We are ranked among the top 20 institutions in Asia” (p. 35). The MBA pamphlet described Leaders’ graduates as ‘highly marketable individuals with a diverse set of relevant skills.’

Students also informed me that teachers, as in Pioneer’s case, kept reminding them that they were very fortunate to be studying at Leaders. Hence Leaders’ students also saw themselves “*different*” from others, even if in a professional sense. Two women students in a joint interview observed

When you go home during summer holidays, then you realize change within yourself. When you’re doing internship, when you’re at a workplace, then you see the difference between yourself, other Leaders’ people and other people who are not from Leaders.

Seeing this image of difference as a “*natural thing*,” Saeed from the school’s faculty, said:

At this age people are young, young are always arrogant to a certain extent. They’ve spent a lot of time, they’ve learnt a lot, and they look around and they feel other people are not so well-trained. So it’s a natural thing.

Leaders’ image of a school for the elite also seemed so because of its high fee that only very few people could afford to pay. This struck me as soon as I entered Leaders. Everything looked sophisticated and expensive, from the school’s location in an elite residential area, to classrooms, to its electronically equipped library (cataloguing, book

reservation, photocopying). Classrooms, in the form of auditoria, were furnished with overhead projectors, sound systems, carpets, and plastic name placards in front of each desk. This was in marked contrast to the public-sector Pioneer.

In my interviews I found that teachers from Leaders, for example, Zaheer and Saeed, also accepted the common perception of the school being primarily for the elite because of its high fee and other educational expenses. Others denied the idea on grounds of the school's admitting of students from a wide socio-economic base. Calling the idea of Leaders being for the elite a "myth," Karim gave some statistics, though he too acknowledged that the school's fee was high:

Typically middle class families send their children to Leaders. The very rich don't send their kids to Leaders, either because they don't get in or they can afford to send them abroad. 80-85% of students at Leaders are from salaried middle class. This is a myth that exists in the market. The fee is high because the quality that is provided is high.

Leaders' National Outreach Programme (Leaders NOP pamphlet) and Unilever-Leaders MBA Fund for Women (general booklet) reached out to the less financially strong students by giving out scholarships and loans to the bright ones. Nosheen, a female student who did not belong to a very privileged family, in terms of financial and educational background, attested to Leaders' no discrimination policy in admission:

They don't discriminate among students. My school was below average but my interview went very well... There are of course certain criteria you have to fulfil.

6.2.2.2 Managers' images in industry

In industry too, managers talked of their job positions and organizations as defining their public image. Hamid, a young manager from one of the most coveted multinationals, spoke proudly of his position:

Jobs are an integral part of our lives. These days they are defining who we are; they give us a sense of identity that gives us recognition in society. So initially I may be known as Hamid; now a lot of people know me as brand manager of Riz [anonymised name for a world renowned brand of tea].

Other managers talked of the reversal of the MNC domination in the corporate sector – their nose-diving profits, their tough competition with local companies, and the fact that working for local companies was becoming a matter of pride. Ikraam, from a local pharmaceutical company, announced

People now working with Haleem, Qaiser or Karachi Foods [anonymised names for large local companies] tell people with pride that I'm heading marketing for Karachi Foods. Previously if they were not working for Procter and Gamble, Unilever and Citibank, they wouldn't consider themselves successful business graduates.

A local human resource manager, Ifat, also acknowledged that management trainees were assigned to departments on the basis of the business schools they came from. Students from top schools went to front-line marketing positions, while those who had less “glittery packaging” ended up in the relatively less glamorous Human Resources department. But other industrial participants expressed contradictory ideas. A Human Resources manager of another well-known multinational said they did not discriminate against fresh graduates on the basis of their schooling.

6.2.3 Consequences of looking forward to a “good job” and harbouring certain images

Students’ ideas and values about their preferred jobs (c.f 6.2.1) and images they had in academia and industry (c.f. 6.2.2) appeared to be resulting in certain negative consequences. For example, they created for students problems of adjustment to the rigours of practical life in the beginning and problems of balance in future. Some of these consequences are given below.

Looking forward to glamorous careers and being in a hurry to move up, fresh graduates, in managers’ and teachers’ words, often faced adjustment problems. Not prepared for modest jobs, they encountered problems when they had to carry out menial work, such as filing, stamping, and sitting on the ground with rolled up sleeves with agricultural clients. They were also considered to be outspoken by their colleagues. Explaining the initial entrance period of business graduates, Mariam from a local chemicals company, related

When they came in the job market they realized that if you’re working in Shell, you’ll have to be there at the port. Roll up your sleeves and be there where the truckers are. You’ll have to sit with them on the ground, soil your clothes because they’re your customers. And they were not ready to do that.

Ikraam, a senior manager at a local pharmaceutical company also observed about Pioneer’s students

As far as practical application is concerned, usually for the first 2-3 years you find yourself totally disoriented and out of place.

Although the Pioneer’s Program Announcement (2004-5:14) states that the school’s placement service ‘ensures that the transition from classroom to career is smooth and successful’ through employer seminars, workshops, career counselling, etc., Pioneer

students realized, either during their final years or after stepping into industry, that this was not always so. They blamed teachers' limited professional experience as the main reason for this, though managers saw it as the students' own limitation. Perhaps both students and teachers were responsible for this, as well as the school culture that so frequently and often strongly put forward the ideas and values of success students talked about.

Material and elitist concerns also created problems of balance in practical work life.

Hamid, an alumnus of Pioneer and a manager at a famous multinational, noted:

Balance is very important in one person's life. I guess initially we are so zesty about lots of things that we lose our balance - of personal life, our family and our commitment to others.

6.2.4 Respondents' understanding of "contribut[ing] to socio-economic welfare of the country"

This section presents respondents' concepts of social responsibility and their views on how their schools or business organizations were promoting it. As mentioned earlier, this question was asked because of my opinion that management education, a field of study I see closely connected to society, can not afford to ignore social concerns. The following paragraphs give respondents' views on whether or not their schools were contributing to society and whether they were teaching their students the same. To obtain their views on social responsibility, I asked them directly how their schools encouraged it, if they had mentioned the concept of social responsibility among other values earlier in their interviews, for example while describing their own or their students' career choices, or if

their school publications included social responsibility in their school philosophy.

Otherwise I asked them the following question:

How would comment on the curriculum of your business school? Please include in your answer your comments on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility in your programme.

Though respondents talked about this topic along with several others mentioned above, I have not included it in any of these in order to avoid limiting it to only one of the above categories. Hence, presenting it separately, I believe, will enable it to be understood more easily.

6.2.4.1 Promoting social responsibility in the schools

Written publications of Leaders, such as Leaders' NOP pamphlet and Student Handbook (2004-5), noted social responsibility in their mission statement. Hence I asked Leaders' respondents direct questions about how their school was encouraging social responsibility. Pioneer respondents were usually asked the above stated question because other than Pioneer's reference to produce 'responsible citizen[s]' in its Program Announcement (2004-5:7), I did not see any other instances of the school's emphasis on social responsibility.

Moeen, Sikandar and other Pioneer faculty and administrators, regarded Pioneer's students' quick employment in successful companies (local and multinational) as the school's contribution to society. Students also named a few teachers who explicitly

reminded them of their social responsibilities but informed me that the subject was not really stressed upon. For example, a student Sadaf said:

SI [Statistical Inference] teacher Nadeem used to talk about giving back to community. Lots of people [meaning teachers] do, for example, Entrepreneurship guest speaker, but not much emphasis on this. 'Grab a good job' - I think that's the emphasis in Pioneer.

However, another student, Ahmar, from a Pioneer focus group stated, his voice rising as he spoke:

Pioneer is catering to MNCs. Brand Managers, Financial Analysts, that's just one line you are towing. It's either Finance or Marketing. You're not looking at Social Marketing, you're not looking at people opening NGOs, you're not looking at entrepreneurs. You're just looking at managers.

There seemed to be a general agreement or at least no counter argument to this view from this focus group. Ciran, from Pioneer faculty, also thought more emphasis needed to be given to social responsibility in the curriculum because business graduates were “*responsible for lives of hundreds of thousands of people.*” This made it incumbent upon teachers to facilitate students to think more critically, to encourage them to compete “*with themselves*” rather than with others, and to give up “*selfish*” career aims. Among students Omar seemed to agree with this view. Elaborating that a business should satisfy the needs and wants of customers, Omar’s aim in life was to contribute to the development of society through his employment either in business, where he can make an effort towards this, or in journalism.

At Leaders, some staff considered their students’ hard work and professionalism and their school’s production of quality research as their service to society. Zaheer, a senior member of the administration, announced that the purpose of Leaders was to bring about

“change which contributes to socio-economic welfare of the country.” When I asked students if these concepts were ever explicitly brought into class discussion, one replied

Make changes in society for the better, it's a responsibility and it's talked about. We are told repeatedly this is something we have to do...because we are very fortunate to be studying here.

Another student related the incidence of a young man who despite scoring above 700 mark in the GMAT was refused admission to Leaders because he answered that his main purpose of joining the school was to learn to make money. Leaders Alumni 2003 (p. 37) also contained quotes from Leaders' founders, exhorting students to remember their social responsibility.

Another way Leaders was playing a socially responsible role in society, as Karim and some other of Leaders' staff informed me, was through the school's National Outreach Program. Through this programme, it sought out underprivileged students from all over the country, coached them in the admission requirements of the school and funded their studies if they passed the school's selection criteria (Leaders' NOP pamphlet). In addition to this Outreach Program and Women's Fund (arranged in collaboration with Unilever Ltd.), other students also received one or another kind of financial support from the institution. As much as 40% of the total students were benefiting from Leaders' scholarships and loans, informed Zaheer and Karim from Leaders' administration.

Another dimension of Leaders' social responsibility according to Saeed and some other respondents was entrepreneurship. Setting up businesses of one's own as opposed to working for multinationals was considered a part of social responsibility. Leaders'

teachers claimed their students had a higher proportion of entrepreneurs than those found in other business schools. This was also indicated in Leaders' publications, such as Alumni Annual 2003, that recounted entrepreneurial achievements of several of Leaders' graduates.

Despite teachers' encouragement to contribute to society and graduates' entrepreneurial activity, not all respondents saw Leaders as contributing to social development. Nasim, from the faculty, who believed that 80-90% of students should serve Pakistan, said that producing managers for employment in MNCs or sending one's graduates abroad was not "useful" for Pakistan. In a frustrated tone, he said:

Our system, everything we do here, encourages students to leave the country. It's not telling people to become good Pakistanis, no... They are very useful for MNCs but they are not useful for Pakistani society... I don't think we've done that job. We failed to produce people who are sensitive to our socio-cultural relations because from the beginning we decided to produce managers who will fit in MNCs... Everyone here has back towards Pakistan and face towards America.

He called the students "misfits" because, despite being "very bright" problem solvers and being able to voice their opinions courageously, they were "rebellious" and "freedom-seeking" instead of being respectful towards elders, towards religious values and towards authority – values that were expected, in his opinion, in the Pakistani culture. He called producing such graduates a "failure" of Leaders; however, if the mission of the school was to produce managers for foreign firms, the same could be called a "merit" of this "internationally oriented" institution.

A student from Leaders' focus group also reflected:

Leaders, as an educational institute, is failing in its non-technical aspect. It's producing excellent computer scientists, excellent managers, we're producing

excellent technicians but they don't have social thought as part of their education.

I did not hear any counterargument to this statement.

6.2.4.2 Promoting social responsibility in industry

Managers in industry generally saw social responsibility as upholding ethical values. Although a common confession was that it was very difficult to maintain complete ethical behaviour in Pakistan, because one had to resort to unethical ways to earn even one's rights, companies (both foreign and local) did have codes of conduct that were often required to be signed by new employees. Some companies had ethics committees that trained people in ethical behaviour. Mariam detailed how ethics meetings were held regularly every year or two in her organization, how new employees were oriented towards company values (including those about ethical behaviour), and how booklets documenting such topics were issued. Other managers considered ethical orientations of candidates during hiring and awarded punishments to employees who violated ethical values of the organization. Naveed, an MBA from the United States, disclosed that his purpose of returning to the home country was "*to bring about change over here*" and to give to the country some of what he had acquired in America. Hence, he said he was striving to encourage people to think and become more proactive in solving problems of their society.

6.2.5 Other professional and interpersonal values “*working for people*”

This section presents values related to students’ work lives in response to the question:

What are the main values encouraged in your business school? Or

How would you comment on the values about work MBA graduates come endowed with when they enter practical (work) life?

Though respondents discussed several values in answer to this question, they also expressed other values prevalent in the business schools at other points in their interviews, for example, while relating the positive and negative features of their curricula or while describing their experiences with recent business graduates. When my respondents needed prompting, I intervened by reminding them of some values listed in their schools’ official publications and asking them directly how they saw those value(s) being endorsed in their school.

In discussing these values, different respondents (from both academia and industry) talked about different values, they differed on the extent to which each value was being endorsed in a certain business school and expressed different understandings of the ways any particular value was being endorsed in a particular school. For example, those respondents who talked about honesty saw their organizations endorsing honesty either wholeheartedly, partially or not at all, in which case they talked about dishonesty instead. Since I wanted respondents’ own understanding of the way(s) in which each of the values was being understood and endorsed in the business schools, I did not bring to their attention school’s explanations of these values, even if the publications had mentioned

them. I have tried to cover all these different viewpoints in this section to present a realistic discussion on the endorsement of various values in the two business schools.

Since I did not find most of these values, except a few, as contentious as the subjects of career aspirations, students' images in academia and industry or social responsibility, I have not presented them in as much detail. However, values that did invite argument or were emphasized by my respondents, for example, the incidence of competition in the MBA programmes, are accordingly dealt with. In laying out these values, I have also grouped them broadly into two subdivisions, depending on whether they were more related to students' professional work or their interpersonal dealings. I am aware that the two subdivisions would have many overlaps, but by organizing them into these two broad categories, I hope to enable the reader to better understand the relationships among the various values covered in this theme. I have also tried to point out the links between various values so as to present a more coherent picture of the different professional and interpersonal values "*working for people*." Furthermore, this section gives an insight into the kinds of values working in Pakistani industry so as to enable the reader to see any link between values endorsed in academia and industry.

6.2.5.1 Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people" in academia

Several work values were mentioned in the written publications of both schools. Values of merit, hard work, honesty or integrity were given in Leaders Alumni Annual (2003:35) and Leaders' general booklet; tolerance and respect in Leaders' Student Handbook (2004-5); professionalism in Leaders Student Handbook (2004-5: 15) and diversity in Leaders

general booklet. Pioneer had merit, truth, integrity, creativity, discipline, and tolerance given in its Program Announcement (2004-5). The following is a presentation of all these and other values that respondents mentioned in relation to students' work and interpersonal dealings and that I found in my field research.

As I said earlier, I divided all these written and espoused values into the two major subdivisions of professional and interpersonal values, depending on whether I found them more fitting to one category or the other.

- The subdivision of professional values includes values of merit, hard work, professionalism, fun and enthusiasm at work, diversity, non-discrimination, discipline, tolerance (of ideas), honesty and integrity, and disloyalty and irresponsibility (as in job switching).
- Interpersonal values include values about networking, cooperation and care, respect, assertiveness and arrogance, flattery and favouritism.
- The value of competition, appearing to me to relate to both these subdivisions, is placed it in the middle of the two subdivisions.
- The value about personal development (self enhancement), concerned with respondents' personal selves (rather than exclusively to professional or interpersonal domains), is presented below the two subdivisions.
- Finally, respondents' comments about the leadership slogans of their schools, which were given in conclusion to their experiences in their business schools, are given at the end of the section.

Professional values

By professional values I mean those that I found related to students' work in school.

Some such values that were talked about are as follows:

Merit

The foremost work value that was notified among both schools' core values and for which almost all respondents from Leaders applauded their institution was the school's commitment to merit. Karim from Leaders' administration proudly asserted, "*The bedrock of Leaders, how we define ourselves, is one word – merit.*" Merit was practised in selecting students, hiring faculty, awarding scholarships and promoting students and staff. My observations around campus also showed that meritorious performance was recognized through award of regular medals and scholarships. The school's honour lists were prominently displayed in the frequented central lounge. Students also attested, "*Leaders is more based on merit than others [meaning other schools].*" However, many students and some faculty added that sometimes the subjective awarding of grades, based on teachers' perceptions, undermined the value of merit.

Several respondents from Pioneer also appreciated prevalence of merit at their school. Pioneer had an "*almost callous attitude*" towards merit, Dawood from the administration declared. No kind of requests whatsoever were entertained for admitting or upgrading any unmeritorious candidate for admission. He proudly announced at the new students' Orientation meeting that Pioneer did not have any kind of a quota system. I found this

quite unusual for a public sector organization in Pakistan, where such organizations often admit or hire people on bases other than merit, in order to benefit the disadvantaged or the influential. Students and teachers also agreed to the meritorious selection of students, though they felt it was sometimes compromised in the hiring of less qualified teachers. Besides, the schools' insufficient recognition of meritorious performance but undue concern with episodes of poor performance disappointed Ahmar and other students from a focus group.

Hard work

As hard work was also listed among the core values in both schools' publications (Leaders' Alumni Annual, 2003:35; Leaders' general booklet; Pioneer Program Announcement, 2004-5), I asked respondents direct questions about it. Leaders' students saw hard work associated with diligent studying. For example, they were required to do a considerable amount of background reading and discussion with their student group before coming to class every day. One of the students told me that they considered themselves lucky if they managed to obtain four hours of sleep a night. Leaders' teachers also explained how the system did not "*let the students take a break*" and how proud they felt when late in the night they would see their students labouring over assignments. I had the opportunity to see this with my own eyes when I went out late in the night to purchase something from the convenience store on campus. Publications I read also approved of this 'high pressure environment' (Leaders' Student Handbook, 2004-5:2), as did the alumni who valued the 'rigorous programme' of the school (Leaders' MBA pamphlet).

Reflecting on hard work, Pioneer's students also acknowledged that the school had taught them to work hard, be it at studies or practical jobs. Students and faculty, having studied or worked in American business schools, found Pioneer students more hardworking than American ones. One student, Qaiser, found hard work an essential ingredient of a successful work life

Tomorrow you go to an organization...Nobody's gonna say 'You know what, you work so hard, I'll make you manager tomorrow.' No, you have to do the work. As long as you do the work, God himself will show you the way. As long as you do the work, rewards will come.

An Executive Students' Forum's (ESF), a student society at Pioneer, representative also prepared newcomers at the Orientation about "Pioneer life becom[ing] very hectic," but also that it provided good learning opportunity through extracurricular activities.

Teachers, such as the Administrative Head, Salaam, reinforced the idea by giving statistics of how many students did not "survive" the "demand[ing]" Pioneer system. Of those who joined Pioneer at the Orientation Day, only around 75% managed to graduate on time, he warned.

Mariam in industry, however, was not satisfied with the amount of effort put in by MBAs in their work in industry. Thinking highly of themselves, students, especially from Pioneer and Leaders, found routine tasks a drudgery and beneath their position, often quitting their jobs in frustration. Thinking this detrimental to graduates' career progress, she counselled:

In the first few years you do have hardships but then rewards are always there...in the beginning you have to put in effort, you have to take the rigour. Be prepared for that.

Professionalism

Another work value, related to hard work, that my interviewees brought up in their conversations and which was mentioned in detail in Leaders' Student Handbook (2004-5) was that of professionalism and quality in work. Stress on professionalism was such that the Handbook (2004-5:15) stated that any student dismissed for 'unprofessional conduct' may not be considered for readmission to the school. It elaborated this value in such detail that it mentioned formal dressing for presentations, seminars and other academic events as requirements of professionalism. I felt this value was also evident in the behaviour of the staff around, the tidy appearance of the buildings, and the business-like office spaces, classrooms, and the dining centre.

Leaders' students too referred to having become more "*professional*" as one of the major benefits of going through that school. Leaders' teachers also mentioned quality in work as one of the basic values they expected of students. This, as Zaheer from the administration declared, was taught to students by giving them exposure to best international practice, principles of good governance, and

the best and highest world standards in view. Our context is not the other institutions in Lahore or Pakistan, our reference point is always the best institution in the world.

When I questioned him about his school's rationale behind borrowing standards from others, Karim saw no harm in borrowing and adapting from more professionally advanced institutions.

Pioneer's respondents gave mixed responses regarding professionalism in their school. One student appreciated, "*By the time you graduate out of Pioneer, rough edges get smoothed, you get a professional outlook.*" When during the Orientation electricity went off for a few seconds, the speaker did not pause, nor did anyone panic. The Director seized the opportunity to remark that Pioneer never stopped imparting knowledge in face of such interruptions. To keep up with modern infrastructure advancements, Pioneer was also in the process of computerizing campus management system and the library catalogue, informed the computer laboratories manager. However, some age old methods of communication were still in use in the offices. For example, the computer manager was disappointed that some faculty still did not use computers regularly.

Managers in industry did not always see professionalism in business graduates. Akram, from a local bank, found the concept of quality missing at Pioneer, where it was sacrificed in rushing from one assignment to the next. He said

All goes in Pioneer. But in real life you have to finish at a 100%. That concept of quality is lacking over there. You know, you're always running around, just want to fill in the blanks, do the papers or whatever, just to go back to the next course, to the next grade, to the next semester.

Ifat, an Human Resource manager from a local textile firm also complained of the light-hearted way some MBAs wrote their curricula vitae and found every task capable of being "*done in a jiffy.*" However, I discovered that Leaders was already responding to these hiring needs of its students by providing workshops in resume writing, mock interviews, and job search strategies (Leaders' general pamphlet). Ikraam linked this trend to society's standards of work

Society accepts mediocrity, 'all goes.' Unless we start rejecting mediocrity and we start accepting excellence first from ourselves and then from our colleagues, you cannot progress.

Enthusiasm and fun at work

In addition to hard work and professionalism, managers, such as Hatim, greatly admired the zest and “*incredible idealism of fresh graduates.*” But this enthusiasm and zeal could not always be sustained in practical life, as reality often killed fresh graduates’ spirit

We kill their spirit by reality. They are taught state of art things, nothing wrong with it, and shown target conditions. So extreme zeal and enthusiasm. We need that, but the leadership and mentorship they get [in industry] kills that.

Some students, staff and managers also considered fun an important part of studying and work. Realizing the importance of fun, Iman from the Internship and Placement Office of Pioneer allowed students to work in any city of Pakistan or even outside the country if they could arrange an internship abroad. This, he said, was a new development that had been effected to make the internship a more thrilling experience.

Diversity

Stated as one of the core values in their general booklet, diversity was often talked of at Leaders. Nasim, from the school’s faculty, called ability to live and work with people from different socio-cultural values and backgrounds as a “*professional attitude towards life.*” Leaders also encouraged taking up and sending students and faculty abroad (as I could gather from scholarship notices on bulletin boards). They intended to increase the scale of such operations, as Zaheer announced, “*We not only accept diversity but seek*

diversity.” This seemed evident in Leaders’ participation in several international programmes, such as the Confluence 2003 at Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad, and school’s participation in student exchange programmes with Copenhagen Business School, Stockholm School of Business, University Utara Malaysia, F H Joanneum School of International Management, Austria, a linkage with McGill University, and research collaboration with Essex University (Leaders general booklet). Besides, some respondents saw diversity as entertaining difference of opinion in class, thus allowing for a diverse set of views to be aired freely.

Dawood, from Pioneer faculty and administration, also expressed his desire to interact with universities from all over the world, including those in China, India and Israel, in addition to those in the west. Some faculty had also been invited from various American and European universities to conduct short courses in Pioneer in 2001 and 2002 and one faculty member had been sent abroad to Kellogg’s Business School, USA, in 2003. However, Pioneer was encouraging more collaboration with foreign universities and was in the process of embarking on a student and teacher exchange programme, as announced by the Director at the Orientation. I could see quite a few scholarship notices from abroad around the campus. Iman from the school’s Internship and Placement Office also notified that allowing students to intern with international companies had “*brought in lot of diversity*” to Pioneer. Some courses, such as Comparative Management also taught diverse management models from around the world (Program Announcement, 2004-5: 87).

Non-discrimination

The topic of non-discrimination was often talked of in relation to diversity. Calling discrimination as a “*characteristic of Jahiliyya (Age of Ignorance)*”, the Director claimed that Pioneer did not discriminate among students on bases of gender, age, colour, or nationality. Leaders’ students also vouchsafed that their school was not discriminatory in that it did not show any bias among candidates who met the admission criteria of the school and could afford to bear the heavy expenses of the institution. Everyone, students and staff, was also encouraged to demonstrate equality with lower staff, by way of dealing respectfully with janitors and sweepers and dining in the same dining centre.

Though diversity and non-discrimination was also mentioned by some managers in their hiring of fresh graduates, Ifat thought companies placed new comers in departments according to the schools they came from. For example, Leaders graduates being the most “*glamorous*” were sent to front-line marketing positions, while CBA’s (an upcoming business school) graduates to the less glamorous Human Resources department.

Discipline

I found Leaders a very disciplined place. Disciplinary notices were posted everywhere – auditoria, library, and computer laboratories – warning against eating, making noise, or using mobile phones. To me, even Leaders’ buildings, with their identical geometrical designs, spoke of discipline around campus.

Students were expected not to be late in coming to class or in submitting assignments “*by even a minute.*” Lateness was penalized by being marked absent for the session and not getting any marks for class participation. A cumulative of seven low class participations (LPs) in the first year meant an expulsion from the school. The ‘Values and Ethics’ and ‘Disciplinary’ committees, which had representatives from both the administration and the student body, also dealt with issues of indiscipline.

I had the opportunity to attend a few classes in Leaders. For doing so, I was acquainted with rules for entering and leaving classes in progress. All classes began punctually and no one spoke out of turn or without raising a hand. For example, I once noted in my diary

It's an eclectic course. They are discussing profitability of shares and the giving of dividends. No one speaks out of turn – quietly raise hands and wait for turn. No one laughs at another or aggressively disagrees. They seem seriously involved in class.

Despite the strict discipline, classes also had a slightly relaxed atmosphere. I could hear light jokes at times. Ejaz, the Dean of Leaders Academy, used informal tone once in a while, though everyone sat attentively. Professors would call people to account if their attention wavered.

Pioneer also had strict disciplinary rules, which were called ‘principles of success’ (Program Announcement, 2004-5:48). ‘Warnings’ and fines for misbehaving and ragging were posted on all notice boards. In fact, on the day of the Orientation, the Director brought to students’ attention that the campus where they were sitting at that moment was built in a cantonment and that a cantonment had “basic rules and regulations.”

Students, teachers and alumni of Pioneer also commented on the rigorous discipline of the place, with many students and alumni listing discipline as the foremost value they had learnt from the institution and which had proven very beneficial in their professional lives. To “*survive*” in Pioneer students had to discipline themselves. A Disciplinary Committee, comprising teachers and other administrators, looked into issues of misconduct. Punctuality was also stressed at Pioneer. Lateness was written down as an absence and more than six absences in a course automatically resulted in an ‘F’ or failure in the course. Late coming to school’s official events, such as seminars or the Orientation meeting, called for special explanation (late comers to the Orientation I attended were also asked to report to the office at the same time when others were invited for refreshments), while absence from these usually resulted in levying of fines. At the Orientation, the head of the Disciplinary Committee began stating the punctuality rules by relating the story of a student, who could not arrive on time on account of a road accident. Despite this emergency, she was awarded an ‘F’ in the course, for she had finished her quota of six allowable absences. Praising the discipline at the school, Moeen also related in his interview how a student, who was admitted to a nearby hospital, had to be brought on a stretcher to the class because he could not afford to miss his attendance.

At Pioneer also, the classes I attended began on time, though I saw some late comings to one of the classes in the evening. There was frequent in and out movement too in this session, perhaps because the class was set up in the evening to accommodate part-time students. Many of these were much older to the regular day scholars and hence seemed to be treated differently. Classes often had a relaxed, though disciplined atmosphere. For example, the Director, who was known for his strict disciplinary policies, tried to create a

light atmosphere by inserting informal quips in his class that I attended. Classes did not have specific rules for participating and many students spoke out of turn or without raising their hands. I also found the library and its adjacent laboratory somewhat noisy, perhaps because there was no other proper sitting area for group work. Students also sat around clumsily at times. Moreover, I noticed scribbling on class room and library furniture.

Despite appreciating the discipline at Pioneer, a number of respondents also saw rigidity in the school's disciplinary policies. Pioneer's students related several incidents of school's uncooperative behaviour in student affairs, such as issuing of official letters, correcting wrong grades, or not allowing certain guest speakers to deliver lectures in the school premises. This made them think of Pioneer as "*inflexible*" and "*anti-student*." These disciplinary policies, students thought, often paid no heed to genuine excuses, causing serious inconvenience to them.

Some faculty and students did not consider Pioneer a very forgiving place either. Maqsood, a faculty member for example, expressed dismay at the school's not accommodating for genuine excuses and not forgiving students' mistakes. What worried him was the social effect of such intolerant policies. Sounding concerned, he said

Young people spend 4-5 important years of their lives with you. You tell him we can't ignore or forgive your mistakes. If he's not forgiven, how can we expect him to ignore those [meaning mistakes] of others. Society can't develop on natural path then.

Tolerance (of ideas)

Leaders' Student Handbook (2004-5) spoke of tolerance as one of the core values of the institution. When I asked respondents what they understood by the concept and how it was encouraged in their school, I heard that the foremost way of encouraging it was the case method. Many students testified to their learning tolerance and ability to accept difference of opinion because of the training the case method was giving them. Some people linked tolerance to allowing for a diversity of views in class discussion. Others pointed to the liberal policies of the institution as promoting tolerance and acceptance of others, "*The conservatives do what they want; the liberals do what they want.*"

For Saeed, the in-charge of the case development centre at Leaders, the concept of tolerance extended from the class to students' personal lives. Leaders expected tolerance in students' behaviour outside of the school too. He related an incident of awarding punishment to a student who engaged with another man in a physical fight, in the presence of a Leaders' sticker stuck on his nearby parked car. Representing Leaders, he could not be allowed to abuse others.

Honesty and integrity

Both schools also had honesty and integrity written down in their publications (Leaders' Alumni Annual, 2003:35; Leaders' general booklet; Pioneer Program Announcement, 2004-5) as one of their major work values. Nosheen from Leaders' student body confidently claimed, "*Everywhere you can get away with cheating, but not at Leaders, definitely. That I can say for sure.*" Other respondents from Leaders' also vouchsafed for

this, especially as far as examinations and student selection was concerned. However, instances when subjective grading and false claims to knowing had compromised integrity were also mentioned.

Omar from Pioneer also proclaimed of having seen “*people speak up, whistle-blowing, at least try to do what they can do*” in organizations, even when they were serving only as interns. On the other hand, “*wrong*” ways of achieving ends at Pioneer were also mentioned. For example, Farhat, a management trainee in a multinational and a Pioneer graduate, confessed, “*It [Pioneer] taught me there’s always a wrong way of getting things done, which usually works [laughs]. It’s a reality in Pakistan.*” As such, Pioneer students said they had learnt from their interaction at their business school not to trust one another. Among the faculty, Maqsood thought that integrity at Pioneer also suffered when teachers themselves came inadequately prepared to class but expected high standards from students. Some students and alumni too complained of teachers not being fully prepared for class, which is why they too did not bother studying for their classes.

Ifat and Mariam from the corporate sector also criticized business graduates for behaving dishonestly on job interviews. Instead of speaking the truth about not finding any other job, only to “*park*” themselves, they often showed interest in whatever position they were being interviewed for. As soon as they found better options they left the organizations, thereby exposing their false assertions and sacrificing trust, a work value deemed very important in industry.

Disloyalty and Irresponsibility (Job-switching)

A common complaint in industry against the MBAs was their erratic job-switching behaviour. Many managers implied that they found MBAs graduates' frequent and unplanned job-switching irresponsible and disloyal on their part and even dishonest, especially when they had shown keen interest in the job in their interview a little while before quitting. Moreover, it was threatening to students' own careers. Allowing graduates some flexibility in choosing their careers, Ifat from a local textile mill, expressed the view that they should at least gain some experience of a job before moving to another. Mariam from industry also thought that patiently working at a job for at least some time brought in rewards. But Shahan, from the banking sector, saw nothing unfair in switching jobs. "*They are squeezing you out; you want to squeeze them out,*" he dryly remarked.

Competition

I see the value of competition relating to both students' work and their dealings with people. I have therefore placed it in the middle of the two subdivisions discussed in this theme. References to both fair and aggressive competition were heard in Pioneer. The Director referred in his interview as well as in his class to the significance of (fair) competition for innovation. On a more aggressive note, students and alumni described competition at Pioneer as "*cut-throat.*" A BASC (Business Administration Students' Club) representative said in his welcome address at the Orientation meeting, "Pioneer is full of opportunities but you will have to fight for them." In line with the above situation, Hamid (a Pioneer alumnus, a manager and a visiting faculty at Pioneer) reflected

One of the problems I have with the way we are taught [at Pioneer] is that it is very centred around us. We are supposed to compete individually with others and we are supposed to beat them and win. So it's all about coming first, second and third. If you're first, the guy who is second is not first. So it's always about 'I have to beat the other guy.'

He added, *"in their zeal of proving themselves, I don't find Pioneer people great team players."* Mariam and Ifat in industry too found the *"take along everyone concept"* usually missing in business graduates. Ciran, a faculty member at Pioneer, also acknowledged the school's role in advancing such ideas, *"We teach them to fight among themselves. There's only one pie, we teach them."*

Pioneer's selection procedure, courses and grading system, I believe, also endorsed the idea of competition. From the point of beginning of the admission procedure, candidates aspiring to join the institution had to pass an aptitude test to qualify for an interview. Success in the interview was followed by a group discussion that made the final selection on the basis of communication, leadership and other skills. Several courses at Pioneer, such as those in marketing and trade, dealt with competitive strategies while others, such as *Game Theory and Competitive Strategy*, were actually centred on the concept. Monthly and yearly examinations and quizzes, which awarded grades from A+ to F and GPAs from 0.00 to 4.00 were also much emphasized (Program Announcement, 2004-5).

Leaders' MBA pamphlet also noted a 'highly competitive' admission process. Candidates to Leaders had to sit a GMAT or Leaders' GMAT to qualify for interviews. The school's grading plan also contained various types of passes, from a distinction to a Low Pass (LP), which were marked *"on a curve"* (on a relative basis). An accumulation of seven

LPs in the first year or six LPs in the second meant expulsion from the school. Though students did not generally see themselves or their class fellows as aggressive competitors, they did realize that helping others could mean pulling oneself down in the marking of curve-based class participation. One student described her helplessness at not being able to assist a class fellow:

I could tell this person would not be able to survive. He'd lost hope. The system is very scary in this sense. Nobody can stop to help anybody else because if you help somebody else that person might cross over you and you might be the person at the bottom.

Interpersonal values

By these values I refer to those that relate to students' dealing with their colleagues in their schools. The following paragraphs present some of these.

"The way to get things done" – networking

As far as their interpersonal relations at work were concerned, Pioneer students underlined the importance of networking as essential to take work from others. For example, Qaiser underlined the importance of networking for obtaining jobs.

Look at Harvard. It's renowned to be one of the best schools in the world. Where's the key that makes them so strong? It's the Old Boy network; it's the connections. Big companies would come to your doorstep and say, 'Hey, you did this.' Even if your GPA is not the best, they'll take you in and give you the opportunity.

Similar ideas were echoed by other Pioneer students and alumni. Akram, one of the most successful managers of Pioneer's MBA batch of 1997, included modulation of tone of message, ability to raise desired questions and ability to reach a consensus as important qualifications of taking work from others. Adjusting behaviour with different people was also considered an essential tool for managing people. To Farhat, behaving modestly and humbly was "*the way to get things done...to get around people.*" Hamid, a manager in a consumer goods multinational company and a visiting lecturer at Pioneer, recalled of Pioneer student groups often including a "*nerd*" in the team to make him/her do most of the work. This made students mistrust others' motives for being friendly. They were not trustworthy because they could "*stab me any day in the back. They always have an ulterior motive,*" a focus group participant observed. This comment received mixed responses, with Neelum noting that, contrary to the argument, in her experience one good turn usually deserved another.

Cooperation and care

Despite competition and networking for contacts, respondents also expressed care for their colleagues and cooperated with them in various activities. By forming learning groups of students with different talents, Leaders was endeavouring to encourage students to learn together and form bonds with class fellows. This was done as early as the Introduction week to Leaders' MBA programme. The same was one of the major reasons for using the case method of teaching, Leaders faculty explained.

The need for working cohesively in both academic and extracurricular activities was also pointed out by faculty members (for example, Ausaf) and senior students of Pioneer in their welcome addresses at the freshers' Orientation session. Ciran from Pioneer faculty, also informed of occasionally reminding students to take care of each other's needs. For example, she related how her narration of Prophet Muhammad's saying of "*Choose for your brother what you choose for yourself*" to students, along with the words, "*Islam is a very natural system. It's never going to ask you to do something irrational or unnatural*" had made students more conscious of caring for each others' needs inside classrooms, such as reserving seats for friends. Though she had earlier remarked that the school taught students to compete and "*fight*," Ciran also pointed out that at other times Pioneer students were "*cohesive*," worked in "*concert*" to deal with teachers, and would "*take him along*" who was "*backward*" in any way .

Students from both Pioneer and Leaders appreciated the friendliness at their institutions. Adnan from Pioneer found the place more "*friendly*" than he had expected. He acknowledged that this had contributed to his own growing friendliness and given him more confidence and ability to accept and respect others. A gesture towards this, perhaps, were the birthday notices I saw posted on student notice boards around Pioneer. A Pioneer alumnus also notified that working together in student activities made students sensitive to one another.

I also found Leaders' staff and students generally very hospitable and helpful. I had no difficulty in obtaining appointments, especially with teachers, when I mentioned I had come to their city for only a short time. Teachers, including the most senior

administrators and professors, often offered me tea, invited me into their offices rooms themselves (quite unusual in a Pakistani organization; perhaps a Western trait) and generally accepted my requests for sitting in their classes. In fact, my accommodation and office space, which were usually reserved for regular faculty, were given to me only because I felt uneasy living in the town on my own and my research required me to observe and interview at whatever hours my participants were available. Surprisingly, Pioneer students were less cooperative in granting appointments, perhaps because they did not recognize that I was in Pakistan for only a few days.

Respect

Teachers from both schools informed of requesting their students to be courteous to all around. A Leaders' focus group also testified to how their teachers' own attitudes towards other staff facilitated their learning to respect others. Pioneer teachers also, such as Salaam and Dawood, pointed to students on the Orientation day to respect each other, those "who impart knowledge and mould your personalities," meaning teachers, as well as other staff around campus.

But Ifat from industry was "*disgusted*" with the "*non-sensical*" gestures that MBA applicants often showed during interviews. To her this lack of respect represented candidates' lack of sense of direction of career. She also implied that this showed arrogance on the part of students. Iman, from Pioneer administration and faculty, also noted the deterioration in students' respectful conduct towards teachers. Voicing one's

opinion was certainly to be desired but that did not require one to leave the bounds of decorum, he added.

Confidence/assertiveness and arrogance

Pioneer students considered meeting with different people, going to organizations for course work, doing internships, and attending courses (such as Oral Communication) in presentation skills helpful in building their confidence. For example, an MBA final year student, Waqar, assigned the credit for his developing self-confidence to a teacher:

Asima really groomed me. Gave us a lot of freedom to be as creative as you want to be. After that my confidence level shot up...I joined [several societies], arranging these, meeting people, then I contested the election and became General Secretary [of BASES, a student society at Pioneer].

Many of Leaders' students also appreciated that the school provided them freedom to explore. Reflecting on the same, one woman remarked that the school's liberal environment had made her confident enough to "come up with my own ideas" and develop a "belief in myself." In the classes I attended in both schools, students generally talked confidently. A student in a joint interview proclaimed:

They teach you how to assert yourself. If you're a good person by default, you become a better person but if you're a bad person by default, you learn to make your way out of the system.

Her partner did not disagree with her.

Practitioners appreciated MBA graduates' confidence as evidence of critical thinking on their part but also found in it elements of self-assertion, arrogance and, as mentioned

above, disrespect at times. Staff, such as Karim and Saeed, understood the practitioners' discomfort with Leaders' graduates' (over)confidence but considered it a necessary part of the training they received at Leaders. Karim reflected

Their opinion is important because they're listened to in class. When they go out into the market place, some of them may become a little too outspoken, and in Pakistani organizations sometimes that's not appreciated so much.

Saeed rationalized Leaders' graduates' arrogance as also a characteristic of their age:

At this age people are young, young are always arrogant to a certain extent. They've spent a lot of time, they've learnt a lot, and they look around and they feel other people are not so well-trained. So it's a natural thing.

Flattery and favouritism

Both male and female students noted strong favouritism at Pioneer in favour of female students or those who ran errands for teachers. One student complained in disgust (I still remember the anger in his tone)

This guy gives A grade to students who get his engine serviced or take him out to a meal to cafes outside the hostel. That's how dirty it gets at Pioneer. I plan to drop that subject if I get that teacher.

Teachers also flattered one another and students flattered them in order to get their way through. One student from a Pioneer focus group remarked, "*It may be a very bad value but it is working for people.*"

Personal development (self enhancement)

Though I did not ask respondents direct questions about the topic of personal development, it came up in participants' reflections on their experiences in their MBA programmes (whether as students, teachers or administrators) or my observations at the Orientation session or around school campuses. However, it was a subject that only a few respondents touched upon.

At the Orientation, student representatives informed of various student societies and clubs operating at Pioneer to enrich students' personalities and experiences. Though Pioneer students participated in poetry, debating and quiz contests, Ciran from faculty regretted availability of only a few extracurricular activities at the business school. She saw painting, literature, sports necessary for building well-rounded personalities. Other teachers and administrators kept students' careers in mind when talking about personal development. Moeen regretted of students' growing interest in activities, such as picnics and movies that "*don't contribute to character-building*" and their declining participation in more intellectual ones, such as, debates, poetry competitions, and corporate dinners. Iman, from Pioneer Placement Office, related how he gently guided students in their personal matters, such as physical appearance and manners, so that they could overcome their weaknesses before entering the job market, including "*the best of MNCs.*" Ausaf, at the Orientation, also lay stress on "develop[ing] good habits first as students and then as managers."

Leaders' students also mentioned participation in various societies and extra-curricular activities, such as non-management seminars, voluntary social welfare activities, travelling, etc. One teacher was also happy to report students' keen interest in his after-

school Quran and Arabic classes. During my observations around Leader I saw several notices calling for participation in various events.

Highlighting the importance of acquisition of knowledge for personality enhancement, Hamid, from industry, criticized students' '*knowledge-for-job*' approach towards education as keeping them away from obtaining the full benefit of education. He assessed the situation, "*Over here knowledge is about degree, translate into job.*" A visiting lecturer at Pioneer, he tried to encourage his students to read more, for "*At the end of the day it's the accumulation of all these ideas that will make them the type of people they want to be.*"

Thoughts on the schools' slogans

Finally I asked my respondents for their thoughts on the leadership-related slogans of their schools, to obtain if I could, any more insight into the values endorsed there. Pioneer had a vision of 'a world-class business school for leadership and innovation in management,' while Leaders had a slogan of 'Preparing business leaders for tomorrow.' Not many respondents agreed to their business schools' building of leadership skills in their students, though several teachers and alumni argued to the contrary. For example, Sikandar from Pioneer faculty claimed, "*Our graduates are working in leadership positions almost everywhere* [local and multinational firms within and outside Pakistan]." Pioneer's Director also asserted that they strive 'to turn bright and diligent students with leadership potential into outstanding business professionals and leaders' (Program Announcement, 2004-5: 2). Several alumni too spoke of having learnt useful

leadership skills at their schools through participation in extracurricular activities and societies' events.

Nasim, from Leaders' faculty, who himself taught the subject *Leadership*, attested to the answers I received from students and some other teachers.

We are producing more like managers – very good in analytical skills and good communication skills, they lack really leadership qualities. Even though I teach leadership, I'm not very confident if we're doing a good job.

6.2.5.2 Other professional and interpersonal values “working for people” in industry

Many of the values regarding work and professional life seen in business schools were also reflected in my interviews with managers in industry. In the following paragraphs I provide an insight into such values.

The work values managers appreciated most were hard work and professionalism. They pointed to hard work, whether working under pressure, until late night or steadily throughout the course of work without reaching such a point, in order to remain competitive and “*produce results.*” However, enjoying of work was also considered an important work value. Mariam's company listed ‘fun and enjoyment’ as one of their core company values. An enthusiastic Hamid declared, “*If you take the discipline that you work in as a hobby and not as work, you'll just love it.*” But Hatim reported of work life practicality and leadership as making it difficult to retain such enthusiasm.

Dishonesty and corruption too was a part of the work ethic of the local corporate sector. Salim considered MNCs to have a “*certainly low*” probability of engaging in corrupt or malpractices. Large Pakistani organizations were also seen to be similar in this respect. But medium-sized and small Pakistani firms, according to him, seem to achieve their ends without ethical considerations in mind. To receive even fair treatment one had to bribe the authorities. Hence it was “*very difficult to maintain ethics in Pakistan,*” he sighed.

Job-switching, however, was not considered a serious breach of the employee’s commitment to the organization. Bilal in fact felt “*proud*” when people left his company to join others in leadership positions. Ghani also dismissed any ideas of loyalty in the business world when talking about career progress, “*There’s no thing loyalty as such.*”

Competition seemed more intense in the corporate sector. Hatim emphasized the need to be “*sharp, incisive, cutting-edge and aggressive*” to survive in the business world. Ifat expressed her opinion that the corporate environment was also often about “*how I cut you down, strike you and erect my palace of dreams over befallen you,*” which, she added, was completely against Islamic principles. Hamid also explained the intensity of competition in the market he and his team were facing and the challenges they were encountering in promoting their brand. I felt the competitive pressure he talked about in his words

It’s about making your brand part of the integral life of the consumers wherever they go. I guess that’s the challenging bit. Taking it out of the TV and putting it in front of their face. How do you do that?

However, care and concern for employees as a necessary business strategy or value was also mentioned by one manager. Salim, a young owner of a small private company related how his company valued the aspirations of their employees and shared the company's meagre profits with them, even when the company was in a financial crisis some ten years ago. This enabled them to motivate their employees to work harder and helped the company emerge from its critical situation. Mariam also detailed the safety and security policy of her company framed around requiring people to take care of themselves and their colleagues. Ifat complained against flattery as being essential for career advancement, while Farhat found favouritism only a "*natural*" inclination on part of people.

As far as personal development or self enhancement was concerned, managers saw it primarily concerned with developing professionally useful skills, such as oral communication, confidence-building and the like, by training in personal and interpersonal skills. Mariam described various training initiatives in her company, while Hamid collected knowledge and ideas for his own development from anywhere he could. However, lack of thinking and narrow-mindedness in the workplace was also pointed out. A senior manager in a local pharmaceutical company and a visiting lecturer at a business school, Ikraam, passionately condemned the lack of knowledge acquisition and research in the business world. Managers neither read nor encouraged their subordinates to remain up-to-date; in fact, some proudly proclaimed not having read since graduation, Ikraam said. Very few managers actively sought and valued knowledge. Ikraam also spoke at length on the need for business and academia to collaborate to advance research for the benefit of both groups.

6.2.6 Section summary

This section presented respondents' values about work organized as four themes of: (i) Students' contrasting definitions of "*a good job*" (ii) Business students' and managers' images in academia and industry (iii) Respondents' understanding of "*contribut[ing] to socio-economic welfare of the country*" and (iv) Other professional and interpersonal values "*working for people*".

In defining a "*good job*," most students preferred jobs in large Pakistani or foreign companies and seemed fascinated with multinational corporations, as their teachers and managers in industry also pointed out. Respondents' ideas about MNCs seem almost like a discourse on MNCs to me and their aspirations to join them like the consent of the native to the imperial project. Some also spoke of their inclination to set up their own businesses in future. Students and managers realized a sense of privilege studying in their schools or working in certain companies and often displayed impatience in reaching managerial positions. I also noted these ideas and values about academic and managerial positions and prestige in school publications and the observations I made around campuses. The stereotypical ways respondents and school publications talked about students' prospective careers and their positions in the academia remind me of the eager mimicking by the colonized subjects, who felt superior the more they copied their masters' ways. At the same time, some students and their teachers felt a tension in pursuing or teaching "*materialistic*" ideas and ignoring religious or spiritual aspects in management. In fact, some respondents did not see themselves or their schools as elitist at all, but rather to the contrary. Such ideas of and values about progress that focus on

objective material gains to the marginalization of spiritual or emotional aspect in them also indicate to me a technicist-managerialist way of thinking.

As far as social responsibility was concerned, some respondents considered their students' ready employment in successful local and multinational companies or their setting up of their own businesses as their contribution to society. However, some other students and teachers felt that students' employment in large or multinational companies ignored a large part of the economy and hence could not be called a worthwhile contribution to society. Though the schools were also extending financial assistance to underprivileged students and some of their teachers mentioned the idea of social responsibility in their interaction with students, their respondents still did not find in these endeavours an adequate concern for social welfare. In industry, managers saw adherence to ethical standards of conduct as their contribution to society. These varying ideas about social responsibility and students' little concern with the society at large are also indicative to me of technicist-managerialist thinking.

In talking about the main values found in business schools or in MBA graduates, respondents professed of both commendable and not so commendable values as working for students. For example, students spoke of honesty, professionalism, discipline, cooperation, and respecting others, but also of dishonesty, lack of commitment to quality, intolerance, competition and favouritism. Hence, they were not sure if their schools were enabling them to develop leadership skills. Many of these values also seemed to be endorsed in industry. In fact, at times managers themselves noted impact of these values on fresh graduates. Considering these mixed responses about values seen in business

schools, I feel business schools were endorsing values which were at times in harmony with Islamic values and at times contrary to it. Perhaps, from a postcolonial point of view, their curricula were marginalizing cultural values of Islam. These findings also seem to me to be inclined towards a technicist-managerialist mode of thinking in that students seemed to pay attention to social and ethical concerns usually when they benefited them. Though their schools espoused concern for commendable work values, students did not seem to internalize these values.

These brief interpretations that I offer of the values and ideas laid out above are based on my initial impressions about my findings. In *chapters 7 and 8*, I hope to illuminate and critique my findings in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures and present a fuller discussion on them.

6.3 Development of the curricula

This section looks from the viewpoint of respondents and the observations I made and the texts I read, into the details of the curricula in the two schools. It is divided into four sub-headings

- How are the curricula formulated?
- How are the curricula taught?
- Research in the two business schools
- Interaction between business academia and industry

These subdivisions address the question:

How would comment on the curriculum of your business school? Please include in your answer your comments on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility in your programme.

Though the findings in this section reflect on those presented in the above themes, it also contains some factual material (although implying certain value orientations) as well. Considering this relationship to all themes and the factual content of the section, I have presented it separately.

6.3.1 How are the curricula formulated?

The paragraphs below detail how courses and texts to be taught in the MBA curricula of my case study schools were selected and formulated.

Dawood, a senior representative of Pioneer faculty and administration, neatly summarized curriculum formulation at Pioneer:

Courses and curriculum are approved by our Academic Board and the teachers, of course, talk about or think about bringing in new courses because may be their students tell them this is what the market wants or their contacts in the industry tell them. Sometimes you can search and send out questionnaires about, 'How do you like our programme? And what items are not useful to you? What items you like to be added?' And so on. And you find out what new kind of programmes MIT or Harvard or Kellogs are offering which we don't have. And we like to see textbooks from different philosophies of teaching, you know. For example, Harvard has a case philosophy, Kellogs' has another philosophy and Chicago has another philosophy. We'd like to see what kinds of methods and approaches different schools are using and you try to choose what is most relevant...So if you have an idea that you need to offer courses then you start looking for faculty for that.

Among other teachers, Sikandar seemed confident that “*most teachers* [at least from his department] *would look at syllabi offered in good American schools, and based on their judgement will fine tune it*” when formulating their own course outlines. But he was of the opinion that more exposure to American business education was needed by Pioneer faculty. Ciran, on the other hand, calling foreign models, “*essentially incorrect for our market. They’re all for the developed world*” opposed too much foreign involvement in her school’s curriculum development. Remembering her student days of the recent past, she recalled that only 2 out of 48 courses in her BBA-MBA programme cautioned students not to take things at “*face value.*”

Pioneer had also recently introduced (in 2003) the four year BBA programme. Students disapproved of this as in the longer programme, only a few new courses had been added, of which some, such as anthropology, did not seem of any use to them. Instead coursework was usually repeated in later semesters, sometimes on account of “*revision.*” Filler course material was also found, such as “*clicking and opening a file,*” in a computer course, mocked one of the students. Teachers too were often those who could be easily available, students complained. Moeen, from Pioneer administration, also regarded the four year BBA programme a waste of students’ time and money because it was not demanded by the market. He saw it as yet “*another American concept they’ve taken.*”

References to America were also heard in the curriculum formulation procedure of Leaders. Nasim from the faculty informed me that most of the Ph.D. teachers at his business school were from the United States, some from the United Kingdom and a few from Australia. The curriculum was closely based around Western, particularly American

universities. Even for teaching Islamic Ethics (or any other course in Islam), that the charter of Leaders had imposed upon the university to teach Muslim students, Kabir, the course teacher, said he took out small cases from an American text and related them to Islamic teachings as he saw no difference in ethical values around the world.

They have their own problems. Sometimes the problems can be related to the teachings and principles of Islam. It's not that, obviously, what we've been taught in Islam is completely different or just the opposite of what is considered ethical in the West. In fact, ethics is universal, there's no doubt about it. But when you want to approach things from your own perspective, then you mention your own teachings. So that I did in those 13-14 sessions. I added what I thought to my knowledge were relevant verses of the Holy Quran and words of the Prophet (pbuh).

Responding to if a Western curriculum could be a way of imparting Western values and concepts, Zaheer replied, “*You can't mimic them, you can't just copy them, you can definitely learn a lot from them.*” He later supported his argument with, “*Islam encourages us to learn from others.*”

6.3.2 How are the curricula taught?

Following paragraphs put forward students' and teachers' opinions of the teaching of the curricula in their schools.

The dominant teaching methodology at Leaders, as all respondents agreed, was the case method. Zaheer called the case method the “*true Islamic way*” because it was a consultative method that is much appreciated in Islam. Besides, put together into discussion groups for the purpose of working on case studies and other assignments, students learnt to work together. Belonging to various educational backgrounds, they

provided different expertise to the group. Moreover, the case method encouraged people to ponder, which again was what God has repeatedly emphasized in the Holy Quran.

Explaining God's command, Zaheer recalled frequently reminding his students, "*Don't take anything on its face value. Try to understand why is this and give your own ideas.*"

The rationale behind using (both local and foreign) cases, as Leaders' faculty explained, was to encourage decision-making skills in students, enable them to see how problems could be solved in real life and equip them with more knowledge and know-how by the time they entered practical life. Karim elucidated

Our philosophy is that when you teach people to start thinking like managers, they automatically acquire the skills and the techniques and the tools that managers need because they learn the process of managerial decision-making.

Nasim described the following benefits of the case method of teaching:

If they struggle three hours on their own and they've gotten it wrong and then they come to class and they realize where the mistakes were, how they could have done that differently, that stays with them.

Another advantage of the case method, using local cases, was that very often a single case introduced students to the working of the entire industry. Moreover, by finding out the way a certain need was met in a certain context, irrespective of if it were foreign, students could use similar ways to satisfy the same need if it were to arise in Pakistan. In response to my question if studying foreign case studies were of any relevance to the Pakistani business environment, a female student, Nosheen, from Leaders, replied:

Problems are the same but different scenarios. So I think I will be able to replicate all that into the Pakistani society. Some people do object to that but I haven't seen any issues in that.

Other students too appreciated the case study method. Commenting on how students have responded to this methodology, Nasim observed, “*Most of them get into the rhythm of it very quickly.*” Hatim, a Harvard graduate in industry, told me that Harvard employed the same method and testified to Leaders’ programme being “*structured very closely after our programme.*” Recognizing this, Nasim acknowledged, “*Method of teaching [at Leaders] is broader than just Harvard; discussion is Socratic method, but still West.*”

However, quite a few teachers and students pointed out to the need for more lectures in some subjects, such as Islamic Ethics (IE) and statistics. Kabir, the IE teacher, was also dissatisfied with the teaching of the course. Based on God’s words, Quranic principles and *sunnah* (words and actions) of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh), Islamic Ethics needed a treatment different to that accorded to other non-Islamic courses. The dominance of the case method had made teaching IE a “*challenge,*” he confessed.

Classes I attended at Leaders were discussion-based, with no imposition of teachers’ viewpoints on students, I felt. Some teachers did give their opinions but kept asking “Is it OK?” before writing anything on the whiteboard. This, however, seemed over-nurturing to me. Nevertheless, students agreed and disagreed confidently. If they hesitated in giving their opinions, teachers themselves asked them to talk straightforwardly. Discussing teaching methodology at Leaders, some students also described how a teacher’s questioning style had made them think about their own beliefs.

In addition to classroom discussion, various company projects and reports students worked upon, seminars and workshops they held, and the internships they did in

companies contributed to building their confidence and providing them training for practical life ahead (also see the value of *confidence/assertiveness and arrogance* in *section 6.2.5*).

Claiming that the curriculum aimed at ‘broadening horizons’ (p. 32), Pioneer’s Program Announcement (2004-5:7) read:

The faculty ensures that the system of education at the Pioneer is a unique blend of the best in classroom instruction, case studies, role-playing, business games, class presentations, research and practical training in business organization.

Accounting and economics courses, as briefly outlined in the curriculum (Pioneer Program Announcement, 2004-5:56 and 75), also spoke of improving students’ critical thinking and analytical abilities. The Director of Pioneer saw encouraging students to have their own views and voice as one of the foremost values needed in today’s life:

Students must be allowed and encouraged to have their own views, own judgements...This is, I think, essence of modern life and society.

He illustrated the above by relating how at his school the open discussion of examination papers and giving of more liberty to students and staff to air their views and to appeal if they found they were not being treated fairly allowed them to express themselves. I also found the Director inviting students in his class to think, “‘Think for yourself; don’t follow me’ says Buddha.” He rebuked one student for not reading the newspaper, “You shouldn’t be in Pioneer,” he added. Quite a few times he also checked them for using general pronouns and not being specific.

When I asked students in a focus group about their understanding of freedom of expression at Pioneer, such as the Director had talked about in his interview and I had read in the school publication, I received mixed responses. Some students spoke of class presentations, out-of-class assignments, report writing and internships allowing them to be creative and building their self-confidence (also see the value of *confidence/assertiveness and arrogance* in section 6.2.5). In the Speech Communication lesson also, that I attended, students gave spontaneous presentations on topics not often easy to talk about, such as prayers, children going for plastic surgery, and free mingling of the sexes. On the other hand, they also complained of not being allowed to express themselves freely, for example, by being stopped from publishing a students' magazine that made fun of the administration and by having been barred several times from inviting certain guest speakers to the campus. They pointed to one-way lecturing, learning by rote, following a few prescribed text books, and obtaining no additional marks for creativity constraining freedom of expression in the institution. Qaiser related a teachers' behaviour in class on an occasion when he pointed out her mistake to her.

Miss, I think, there's a mistake. We looked in the book and it's not the right answer [students pointed out]. [In return the teacher replied], 'Don't tell me how to teach.' The thing is we give an answer that is right and her answer is different, we get marked down.

Ciran, a faculty member of Pioneer, also denied encouraging students to think critically. She said, "*We keep talking at them. There's no dialogue...Zero or negative critical thinking.*" To illustrate, she explained how American textbooks and models, that might not be fully workable in Pakistan, were rarely being taught with a critical viewpoint. Rather, they were taught as "*perfect models...challenging Brother Kotler [an internationally renowned American marketing professor][is] just not an option.*"

Maqsood, from the faculty, also showed disappointment with teachers' not allowing students to question freely in class. Among Pioneer's teachers, however, I noticed Hidayat pointing out the inapplicability of the economist Todaro's theory of population growth in Pakistan in his Development Economics class.

Despite respondents' complaining of a constraining academic environment at Pioneer, there were students who accepted the dominating or nurturing role of teachers in determining what was to be taught. For example, Omar said

80% depends, I guess, on what he [teacher] picks up from the book and relates to your mould and what he educates you about.

This reminded me of Hidayat (who is among the popular teachers) explaining a graph to his class by leading them through each detail himself, "Tell me what's on y-axis? x-axis?" I also found other teachers' going into student groups in class to answer their queries and giving them lecture handouts as indicative of Omar's viewpoint.

Classes at Pioneer were thus generally lecture-based, with teachers inviting occasional comments from students. Other methods mentioned in Pioneer's teaching methodology above, such as role-playing and business games, were used less often, as students reported and I saw. Case studies too, though not used in every course, were however recommended practice. But one of the students of Pioneer complained about the cases they were taught being usually about senior management, as is usually the case with Harvard case studies, and students being rarely acquainted with problems of non-management employees. Ikraam, a Pioneer alumnus, also vehemently critiqued the idea of teaching only foreign cases. Not only were implications of foreign concepts different in

Pakistan but the country's own success stories were as insightful as those of any other country, he stated. Unless the country's business sector reprimanded business schools for “*churn[ing] out Americanized MBAs*” and not localizing their curricula, little research would come out of local business schools, he spoke in anguish.

Hamid, from the corporate sector and from Pioneer's visiting faculty, also pointed to students' largely theoretical training at Pioneer:

When you're a business graduate you think you know your everything. You believe: four years, best business school, 90 people were chosen out of 4,000; I was one of them. But when you come in the real world, I guess reality hits you and you realize that what you learnt was very, very theoretical... That's really when the challenge comes in.

Mariam, like some other managers, also noted a lack of creativity in business graduates.

6.3.3 Research in the two business schools

Both schools seemed to be encouraging business research in their institutions. Leaders is so far the only business school in Pakistan to have a separate case preparation department. Leaders' Case Research Centre (CRC), having a database of several hundred cases on several business subjects, is responsible for preparing and distributing local cases to the MBA programme. Prepared by professors and teaching assistants, these cases are used in teaching students and also sold for a nominal fee to other business schools (interview, Saeed; school website; Leaders' CRC pamphlet). I saw at least three other research departments at Leaders researching various areas of economic development and providing consultancy to businesses. I myself felt respected here as a researcher wherever I went.

The library and computer laboratories of Leaders seemed to be frequently visited. I saw a wide variety of books on all subjects, ranging from business to literature to religion; journals, reports and newsletters of national and international organizations; national and student magazines containing short research-based articles, and several on-line databases.

Pioneer's professors, such as Rahat and Nigar, also observed at the Orientation that Pioneer engaged in research, consultancy, writing of books, and preparing of case studies. Teachers, such as Salaam, also urged students to be seekers of knowledge. All new research was being housed in the recently established (August 2005) Research Wing at Pioneer (Pioneer website). Besides, a commitment to research was also mentioned in the school's philosophy (Program Announcement, 2004-5:7). Moreover, Pioneer had been updating its library more frequently since the last five years or so. New journals, though in much fewer numbers than at Leaders, were cased in a shelf marked 'New Arrivals' in the library. Since Pioneer had very few online databases, coming of the JSTOR to the library was announced with pride in and outside of Pioneer. I saw this news in the Karachi version of the National Newspaper, Dawn, of July 13, 2004.

6.3.4 Interaction between business academia and industry

Considering interaction with industry an important part of their curricula, both schools encouraged it, though several respondents demanded more of such interaction. I became aware of this aspect of business education at the two schools as soon as I began my

research. I therefore found it useful to interview managers in industry for feedback on the values of Pioneer's and Leaders' graduates.

Pioneer staff often mentioned the need to cater to the market by sometimes referring to students as "*products*" and the corporate sector as their "*market*." Hence they believed in keeping the customer in focus if "*you're preparing a product for the market*." Dawood, from Pioneer faculty and administration, stated

We are looking to sell Pioneer to potential talented students and their families...And on the other hand we have a market which is out there, where our graduates will go and find jobs, and we must therefore pay attention to what that market is looking for.

Nigar, from the Department of Economics and Finance, reported at the Orientation meeting that his department continually introduced new courses to meet market demands. Sikandar, from the Department of Management, also stressed the imperative need to keep abreast of developments in the corporate sector, through research and consultancy activities and executive education. In addition, Pioneer's Program Announcement (2004-5: 3) stated: Pioneer is 'bringing about advancements in the curriculum to keep in line with market needs.' This was evident in some localized courses, such as Marketing Issues in Pakistan, IAS and Financial Reporting in Pakistan and several courses in the disciplines of management and economics (ibid: 39, 76).

In addition, Pioneer maintained contact with industry through executive education, providing recruits, undertaking research and consulting, inviting eminent industry personnel for participation in conferences and dinners, and encouraging organizations and alumni to provide scholarships for Pioneer's students (Program Announcement, 2004-5).

An important part of this regular interaction was sending students for internships and obtaining job placements for them in reputable companies, as I saw in my observations of school notice boards and internship and employment letters. Pioneer's interns were requested by not only multinationals, but also local companies and even government organizations, such as the State Bank of Pakistan and the office of the Government of Sindh, on account of their being 'high quality graduates' (a business firm's letter to Pioneer).

At Leaders too, inviting of eminent personnel from industry to seminars and guest lectures, internships in well-established companies, remaining in touch with alumni, and subscribing to newsletters from various organizations were some ways of maintaining contact with the corporate sector (interview, Naheed). Arranging internships and placements was a regular feature of these activities. Moreover, executive education provided in the Rizwan Executive Centre, further improved interaction with industry (interview, Maheen). Leaders' case writing initiative also seemed helpful in forging contact with industry.

6.3.5 Section summary

Summarizing the above section, I feel that the balance of curriculum development and teaching in the two schools was tilted in favour of the Western, particularly the American, model even though attempts to localize the curriculum were under way in both schools. Some thought this borrowing from the West was simply a copying of the curriculum from the developed world, while others thought it was a quest for learning from wherever one

deemed possible – an Islamic concept. I found thinking to be encouraged more by some teachers, especially in classes that were case-based, than by others. In lecture-based classes, though teachers invited comments, students and teachers often complained of constrained thinking that promoted Western ideas as “*perfect models*” and discouraged questioning and critiquing by students. On the other hand, respondents from both schools appreciated out-of-class assignments, such as company projects, reports and internships, for allowing them to build up their confidence. Research activities also seemed to be picking up in both schools, through developing of case writing and writing of research papers and books. In addition, interaction with industry was eagerly sought by both schools, who sometimes considered their graduates as “*products*” for the job market. This Western or American dominance in the curricula of my case studies seems akin to me of eighteenth and nineteenth century colonialism in India, that had brought Western ideals to the traditional education of the sub-continent. Besides, an understanding of education that considers education as a commodity to be sold and bought in the market suggests to me a technicist-managerialist thinking on the part of both educators and students. However, I will leave this discussion here to pick it up in *chapter 8* when I will discuss my arguments more fully in the light of postcolonial, management and Islamic literatures.

6.4 Non-Islamic (secular) element in the business schools (and organizations)

In *chapter 4*, I gave an account of the cultural ethos of the two schools, which included Islamic and American influences on them as well. In the following paragraphs I put forward respondents’ quotes that, in the light of these cultural influences, highlight the difference between Islamic and non-Islamic values prevalent in their schools and

organizations. Respondents often saw Western or liberal values in opposition to Islamic values and found the teaching and understanding of ethical and religious subjects a challenge. I have put together comments on such values and aspects of the curricula, calling them *non-Islamic*, in order distinguish them from the Islamic aspects of the curricula. However, because not all respondents saw these elements as contrary to Islam or “hurting” the religion in any way, I have not used the word *un-Islamic* for them. The idea is to present thoughts on those aspects of the curricula that do not address Islamic concerns, whether by consciously ignoring them or seeing them as out of the scope of business education of their schools.

The opinions and views in the following paragraphs were collected from answers to all of my research questions; however, the comments describing the teaching of ethics came mostly in response to the question on the curricula. Finding this section overarching the previous two, I have found it more suitable to present it separately. Thus the findings from this section would hopefully shed light on the work values presented in *section 6.2* and comments on the curricula presented in *section 6.3*.

6.4.1 “*Liberal*” and “*Western*” values in contrast to “Islamic” values

The following paragraphs give an account of various values – “*liberal*” and “*Western*” – prevalent in academia and industry, which respondents saw in contrast to “Islamic” values. This section is presented as a debate because respondents showed differences in their opinions and experiences regarding this matter.

The issue of Islamic versus non-Islamic values in the business school seemed to be lively debated in Leaders, perhaps because it has an image of a very liberal school in the business academia of Pakistan. When I asked Nasim, a faculty member from Leaders, to comment on this value, linking liberalism to Westernization, he asserted that this particular value was influencing the entire value system of his school and saw in the American reformatory activities a rewriting of the culture of the American institution. In almost a postcolonial vein he challenged the hegemonizing discourses of modernity and liberalism:

This is a very unique value and that is very crucial for you to understand. The reason why this was established was that when this school was established, they got a \$14 million grant from the US Aid. As soon as you enter Leaders, you'll see a memento of it...also observe Leaders' culture. When you'll describe it you will be able to link the two together. They asked us to teach boys and girls together, we were encouraged to have a liberal environment, [that] we will encourage Western culture here, we will encourage all sorts of musical, drama, etc. societies and that is basically also influencing our value system here...The problem is that if someone is giving you money, for example, the US or Europe or Russia, they don't want you to change your outlook or values [from their own], otherwise they will stop giving you the money.

Inculcating religious values was never encouraged, he added:

As long as you practise Western values, fine. If you practise Islamic values and you try to influence Islamic values in class, then you aren't acceptable.

Karim, a senior administrator at Leaders, denied any role of either Islamic or non-Islamic values in the establishment of Leaders or the formulation of its curriculum. He stated that the dress code, social interaction among genders, etc.

are ritualistic issues that don't interfere with the mainstream of the institution or with the vision and core purpose of the university...The people who founded Leaders did not have religion in mind...The core of Leaders has always been moderate and we've never let religion or religious debate affect that.

The purpose of Leaders was to produce “*productive, ethical citizens for the society,*” he emphasized, and as such it was “*not hurting Islam*” in any way.

In industry too, some managers could bridge Islamic and corporate values, while others saw the two as distinctly apart. Ifat, from a local textile company, observed

I don't think Islamic values and corporate values can go hand in hand...We have a problem in our culture. We are more westernized than the West itself.

She gave examples of some such values as socializing of men and women together, lying, competing selfishly, and not paying much significance to obligatory prayers during office hours to support her viewpoint. But Hamid, a manager in a top multinational, saw many similarities between modern marketing practices and Islamic teachings. He would not only speak about this issue to his students and colleagues but had also written on it, he said.

Speaking on the direction the Pakistani society was taking, Kabir from Leaders' faculty lamented, “*We are not a nation.*” We are a “*chaotic society.*” Elaborating on Leaders' policy regarding the Islamic element in the curriculum, he added

We happen to be in some kind of inferiority complex viz a viz the West... We are as confused as the Pakistani nation is confused. We sadly have no direction... We have a religion about which our official version is that it is from God and it has come to guide us towards the right path. But we don't take it seriously.

6.4.2 The challenge for ethical and religious subjects in the MBA curricula

Despite the dominance of the non-Islamic (secular) element in the MBA curricula, the teaching of ethics was not ignored at the two case schools. The following paragraphs

illustrate how ethical and religious subjects were dealt with in both schools and what were some of the issues in teaching religious subjects amidst the core MBA curricula.

Pioneer had ethically, socially and Islamically oriented courses to promote ethical behaviour in business. These courses, for example, 'Business and Society,' 'Business Ethics,' and 'Audit, Ethics and IS Issues' were taught to some MBA programmes as compulsory credit courses, to some as non-credit or elective courses and to others not at all. Other courses, such as Advanced Financial Accounting and International Marketing, also talked about social and ethical concerns, for example, about accounting for non-profit organizations. However, prescribed texts for such courses were usually foreign, as I learnt through my interviews, supplemented with articles and news from Pakistan. Other courses, such as 'Philosophy of Islam' and 'Islamic Finance' were Islamically oriented courses. A compulsory course for all BBA students, 'Philosophy of Islam' dealt with fundamental teachings of Islam, whereas 'Islamic Finance' was a master level elective course about economics as understood in Islam (Program Announcement, 2004-5).

All other courses occasionally included ethics but such discussions were rare. An instance when newcomers were also introduced to Pioneer's ethical values was the orientation meetings. Nevertheless, students claimed that Pioneer's teachers payed only "a passing reference" to the topic of ethics. For example, Omar observed

Usually the discussion is very general. They don't show you any specific direction. You should do this, that, have integrity. How? No one emphasizes that.

However, attending the course of 'Islamic Finance' and interning in Islamic banks had made some students more conscious of Islamic ethics which is why they were thinking of

opting for Islamic interest-free, as opposed to Western, banking, provided they could get a “*good job.*”

Recognizing that an ideal business graduate has a “*good ethical framework*” (interview, Zaheer), ethical concerns were dealt with in multiple ways at Leaders also: there was an ‘Ethics and Values Committee’ that handled ethical violations, ‘Islamic Ethics’ (IE) was taught as a compulsory course to second year MBA students and ethical issues were dealt with in several business courses as part of management problems. Moreover, students were explained the Leaders’ code of conduct in the two week summer orientation programme prior to the beginning of the academic term. Students and their parents were also required to sign a handbook detailing these (interview, Karim).

At Leaders, students gave varying opinions of the compulsory subject of Islamic Ethics. To some, it informed them about their religion, which students found useful, and made them think why they believed what they believed. Others thought it should have been taught earlier at school level for in the MBA it was too late to do so. But according to the course teacher, and as students themselves confessed, not many students succeeded in understanding the relevance of the course to their prospective careers. The course teacher, Kabir, complained that students professed “*they already know Islam*” and seemed to regard the course as “*irrelevant to modern, practical requirements of the society at large.*” Hence it was “*challenging*” to teach IE amidst the main MBA curriculum. One student from a focus group that discussed the teaching of ethics at Leaders, echoed Kabir’s concerns

Focus in Leaders for me is towards getting a good job. All the accounts courses we have, in the end what we are trying to do is to generate profits. One core value is that...But at the same time we have courses like Islamic Ethics, etc. So for me there's a big contradiction. I personally feel that our focus should be just on profit-making because that is what our real intention is. And those courses are just on the sidelines.

This comment was taken seriously by other students in his focus group who agreed with him and tried to explain the rationale behind it.

In other subjects, students informed, ethical issues were dwelt upon as the discussion flowed. But students also complained of one another's and at times faculty's dogmatic stance on religious issues. Though people were usually tolerant of one another's ideas, students found it difficult to talk through religious debates as more knowledgeable people often dismissed the ideas of the less knowledgeable ones as wanting in faith. Another student in the same focus group mentioned above, explicated the difficulty of identifying with ethical debates:

The fact is that in our culture, our society, profit making is the first and foremost objective of any organization. Values would come perhaps very low on the list...In some cases [meaning case studies] this value issue comes up. I don't think students can really associate themselves with what the discussion at that point in time is leading to.

Regarding the proposition of upholding ethical values, students talked about it alongside corporate profits or considered it workable only if it could help them obtain "a good job." A focus group student remarked that they were often told to work ethically for "there's even positive NPV¹⁹ attached to ethical behaviour." Though some other students informed that they were thinking of making careers in Islamic banks or where they would

¹⁹ Net Present Value: A concept in finance, according to which the feasibility of a project is evaluated on the basis of net profits, in terms of value of money today, it would yield over its life.

not have to compromise Islamic principles, participants from this focus group expressed doubt as to their upholding ethical values above everything else in their practical lives.

6.4.3 Section summary

The above comments from respondents suggest to me that business schools' and corporations' values were heavily influenced by Western values. Some faculty found this detrimental to the cause of Islam, while others saw nothing hurtful to Islam in promulgating such values. However, the paragraphs on the teaching of ethics, particularly Islamic ethics, show that though the schools had ethics committees and Islamically designed courses, students found such subjects "*on the sidelines,*" difficult to "*associate with*" or lightly referred to in the main curricula. Teachers too found it "*challenging*" to teach them amidst core business courses and because of students' little interest in them. Consequently some students expressed uncertainty as to their upholding of religious values in practical life. Hence this section indicates that Islamic influence in these MBA programmes, whether in values that were endorsed or the curricula that were taught, was not very significant. Respondents' opinions and experiences on the difficulty in teaching and learning of religious and/or ethics subjects also suggest the incidence of a technicist-managerialist thinking in these curricula. I will give a detail of these remarks in *chapter 8* where I will discuss them in more detail in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures.

6.5 Chapter summary

Summarizing my research so far, I have formed these impressions from my data about values endorsed in the business schools:

Section 6.2 of this chapter presented the values found in the two business schools under the four themes of: (i) Students' contrasting definitions of "a good job" (ii) Business students' and managers' images in academia and industry (iii) Respondents' understanding of "contribut[ing] to socio-economic welfare of the country" and (iv) Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people." Not all respondents indicated similar commitment to these various values about careers, self-image, social responsibility or those working for them in pursuit of their studies or careers; they also agreed and disagreed quite strongly about how certain values were being endorsed in certain schools. My observations and reading of school texts also showed different levels of commitment to different values and ideas in the two schools. It was seen that students generally preferred materially gainful jobs, though some respondents saw a streak of materialism in such pursuits. Students from these two schools had high images of themselves, as did their schools and prospective employers, though again not all students and teachers agreed to these images. Social responsibility was not a serious concern with students, though their schools were endeavouring to awaken them to this idea. Various professional and interpersonal values were made use of by students in the pursuit of their goals. The way these values were being implemented indicated to me various levels of harmony with Islam. This conflict was also pointed out by some respondents. I have

presented all these arguments so that readers can judge for themselves the intensity of prevalence of various values in both institutions.

Section 6.3 looked at the curricula of the two schools in detail by laying out students' and teachers' comments on the dominant texts and courses used in their schools and the teaching methodology employed to impart them. It was seen that the curricula had a strong influence of the Western, particularly American, MBA, though some respondents disapproved of it, and efforts were under way to localize the curricula. As far as the teaching methodology was concerned, my findings showed differences of opinion on the amount of creativity and critical thinking allowed by various methods. Interaction between academia and industry was also very much encouraged as part of regular curriculum development activity to produce curricula more in line with market needs.

Section 6.4 presented respondents' views on the distinction between Islamic and non-Islamic values prevalent in their schools or corporations. It also put forward students' and teachers' opinions about the teaching of Islamic subjects in their schools. The Islamic-nonIslamic debate and the challenges Islamic subjects were facing amidst the core business curricula indicate to me that Islamic concerns were being overshadowed by liberal or Western values. However not all respondents found this hurtful to Islam.

In the previous paragraphs I summarized the main ideas and values expressed by my respondents. I also mentioned that some respondents were not comfortable endorsing certain values or curricula popularly seen in their schools. At times, they realized this conflict during their conversations and expressed it. Before leaving this chapter, I would

like to describe this group – who I see as *mimics who refuse* in a postcolonial vein – in a little more detail so as to present a more realistic picture of the way different values and ideas were being endorsed in the two schools. For example, Omar, a final year MBA student at Pioneer, was among the very few students who felt that socialization in his MBA curriculum was encouraging materialism in students, while Ahmar and Waqar from the same school rejected the idea that they were superior to other MBA students. Omar had therefore made up his mind to make a career in journalism or at least not where his sole purpose would be to earn money, while Waqar was planning go to abroad for higher studies to gain more exposure and knowledge to combat his “*inferior[ity]*” complex, as he said.

From amongst the teachers, Ciran from Pioneer openly criticized her school’s curriculum for fostering materialism and competition and not speaking enough about self-enhancement and social responsibility. She expressed dissatisfaction with the copying of the American curriculum and teaching it without a critical stance. Hence, as she informed, she tried to encourage the critique of foreign ideas in class and inserted Islamic teachings wherever she could. Nasim and Kabir, from Leaders, also very candidly pointed out their school’s paying homage to Western values and the United States of America and neglecting Islamic values and the socio-economic needs of Pakistan. Kabir, the Islamic Ethics teacher felt this was making it difficult to teach such Islamic subjects among the core business subjects. Maqsood, another teacher at Pioneer, saw a conflict in the way some of the core values of his school were acted out. For example, teachers’ coming unprepared to class compromised integrity of the school, while the administration’s failure to allow for genuine lapses in discipline showed unforgiveness on their part.

Hence, he was not sure if the school was living up to its core values. Among the people who acknowledged these conflicts, there were some, such as Saeed and Karim from Leaders, who tried to rationalize them. Saeed acknowledged elitism on part of his students but tried to rationalize it in terms of students' family and educational backgrounds. Karim also accepted the elitist image of his school but explained his school's effort to reduce it through non-discrimination and financial support.

I have presented all of these arguments, without giving any thorough interpretation of any ideas and values. However, I did mention that I felt in the students' exhibition of various work values (ethical or unethical) and the debate in their schools on the non-Islamic element in their curricula little consideration for Islam. I also spoke of students' and their schools' looking up to the foreign MNCs, their deriving of their identity and pride from attending certain schools or working for certain companies, and the Western/American dominance in the curricula as indicating colonial thinking to me. Finally, in students' and their schools' focus with predominantly material measures of success, students' little concern for society and the modest heed they paid to the ethical element in the professional and interpersonal work values they employed in their everyday lives I see evidence of a technicist-managerial thinking. This thinking seemed to be reinforced with respondents' consideration of MBA education as a product for the market and their difficulty in the teaching and learning of ethics and/or religious subjects.

In *chapter 7* I will illuminate and critique my individual themes presented in *section 6.2* in the light of management and postcolonial literatures, as well as Islamic teachings. In *chapter 8*, I will give a more detailed discussion on all of my findings from these same

viewpoints, by looking at the themes together and bringing in views and values from *sections 6.3 and 6.4* which, as I said earlier, relate to all of the themes. This discussion will hopefully enable readers to form their own opinions as to how much each value was in harmony with Islamic, technicist-managerialist, and/or colonial thinking.

7.0	CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSIONS ON THE THEMATIC FINDINGS IN THE LIGHT OF LITERATURES	265
7.1	Values and ideas about success	267
7.2	Promoting social responsibility	273
7.3	Other professional and interpersonal work values used by students	277
7.4	Chapter Summary	288

CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSIONS ON THE THEMATIC FINDINGS IN THE LIGHT OF LITERATURES

In *chapter 6* I presented insights from data, highlighting the values being endorsed by the two chosen business schools in their MBA programmes. All values about work, as they were being talked and written about, or as I observed them, were presented in *section 6.2*, without any insights from literature or my personal comments, organized under four heads of:

- i. Students' contrasting definitions of "a good job"
- ii. Business students' and managers' images in academia and industry
- iii. Respondents' understanding of "contribut[ing] to socio-economic welfare of the country"
- iv. Other professional and interpersonal values "working for people"

Respondents' quotes regarding the formulation and teaching of curricula were presented in *section 6.3*. Finally, a few opinions about the Islamic and non-Islamic elements in the business schools and organizations were laid out in *section 6.4*. Many of the values and ideas about work, curricula or the Islamic-nonIslamic element in schools were listed in school publications, while others came up in my research conversations. Respondents, as well as observations and readings of textual data, indicated different levels of commitment to different values and ideas as well as different ways of endorsing or implementing them.

This chapter contains a summary of each of the thematic findings presented in *section 6.2* and an illumination and critique of them in the light of management, postcolonial and

Islamic literatures. *Chapter 2* discussed the two discourses in management education of today – the technicist-managerialist and Westernization/Americanization that I feel were influencing the cultures of management programmes. I would like to remind the reader of my reasons for the Islamic aspect of my critique. I mentioned in the introductory chapter that I felt MBA curricula neglected religious, in my case Islamic, teachings that I feel are an essential part of management education. This has concerned me as a Muslim educator and I had therefore set out to inquire the extent to which the values encouraged in business school curricula were in harmony with Islamic teachings. In this chapter I have therefore added excerpts and quotes from Islamic (and other religious) literature to enable the reader to determine for him/herself the extent to which each of the values found in my research reflected Islamic teachings.

I also discussed in *chapter 2* that Islamic thinking in the Indian sub-continent was overshadowed first by the colonist and then by the capitalist to integrate Muslims, for whom Islam defined all modes of conduct (whether worldly or otherworldly), into their respective machineries. Since management education still reflected imperialistic and colonial ideas and seemed neglectful of religious concerns, especially from non-Western cultures, I had found it suitable to take a postcolonial view to my research problem. This theoretical perspective also critiqued technicist-managerialist thinking, as explained in *chapter 3*. It had therefore seemed useful in addressing both the Westernization/Americanization and technicist-managerialist discourses as well as the lost Islamic values in the case of management education in postcolonial Pakistan.

Thus this chapter illuminates the each of the work values presented in *section 6.2* in the light of management, Islamic and postcolonial literatures. Since *sections 6.3 and 6.4* relate to all of the themes, I will discuss them in *chapter 8* when I will look at the themes together. Hence in this chapter I explain what I have understood by each of the four themes, what values seem to be indicated by each theme, and some of the consequences I feel are arising out of the endorsement of different values. I have based this chapter on the same four themes that were presented in *chapter 6* but have divided it into three sections (for reasons I will explain later) – values and ideas about success, about promoting social responsibility and about other work values. Though the study is not intended as a comparative analysis of either the Pioneer Academy or the Leaders Academy or of academia and industry more generally, I have pointed out the locations and contexts of the findings in order to facilitate understanding of various phenomena.

7.1 Values and ideas about success

In this section I will be discussing the two themes of ‘students’ contrasting definitions of “*a good job*” and ‘business students and managers images in academia and industry together. Seeing a close connection between students’ career aims (c.f. 6.2.1) and images painted of them by their schools (resondents, texts, artefacts) and people in industry (c.f. 6.2.2), I have found it suitable to discuss these two themes together. Views presented in the first theme were collected in response to the question:

What kinds of careers are you (or your students) looking forward to after completing your (their) MBA degree?

Responses for the second theme were extracted from students' experiences in their curricula and teachers' and managers' views about them in answer to the above mentioned question or from the question

What are the main values encouraged in your business school? Or

How would you comment on the values about work MBA graduates come endowed with when they enter practical (work) life?

I first summarize my findings about respondents' ideas and values about prospective jobs and privileged status and then illuminate them in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures.

Summarizing respondents' ideas and values about the jobs students preferred, I found that they desired ones that paid well, quickly led to managerial positions, made use of their learning in business schools, and were either in large local corporations or in the multinational corporate sector of the country. Some students and their teachers also noted students' intention of setting up businesses of their own. In addition, students and managers mentioned the significance attached to "*outward glitter*" in searching for management jobs, questions of pride involved in working for or at certain types of organizations or positions, and a sense of professional "*difference*" compared with graduates of other business schools. However, some students also saw themselves as "*inferior*" to internationally recognized MBAs. These ideas about management positions and their privileged status in academia and industry, as some respondents observed, were fostering in students materialism, concern with their one's self and adjustment problems at work on the other.

Students thought that the visualizations they had of the careers and positions they aspired for could have come to them through their acculturation in their business schools. Publications from my schools too (Leaders' general booklet; Leaders' MBA pamphlet; Leaders' Alumni Annual, 2003; Pioneer Program Announcement, 2004-5), as well as words of professors and senior students, repeatedly saw students in managerial roles in future, and according to some respondents, were giving students the idea that they would move into managerial positions immediately after graduation.

Illuminating my research participants' ideas on the nature of their prospective jobs, a Business 2.0 report (2005:99) states

More than any other prospective grad students, MBA candidates want a handsome return on investment. They want to know what kinds of salaries await them, and which schools offer the fastest route to the top.

Some management scholars hold management texts and school publications responsible for this. Explaining management students' career choices and their schools' role in putting forward such ideas, as was seen in the case of my schools, Peltonen (2000:410) writes that they are classified into normal and deviant 'freedoms,' depending on how they match corporate norms and values. Texts, in fact the whole curriculum, include hints about appropriate aims in life, not leaving it to the imagination of the individual. Fairclough (2003) calls such genres about success that promise knowledge exchange and prestigious and successful careers 'hortatory reporting' and believes they are reinforced through school publications as well.

I see such ideological ideas and values of success fostering technicist-managerial thinking that sees management reality as objective and predictable and concerned with pursuing measurable targets (see *section 2.2* for an explanation of the concept). I also find them to have a colonial bias in that the management gurus' ideas and values of success are considered more 'sterling' than those of others (c.f. 2.4.2) and therefore the only ones worth striving for. Conversely respondents' descriptions of MNCs as having better or Westernized working environments, more material comfort, better pay and growth opportunities, and their having less bureaucracy seems almost like a discourse on MNCs to me. I feel, from a postcolonial viewpoint, that they have 'consented' to the MNC hegemony over them (see *section 3.4.1* for an explanation of the concept). I will elaborate on these points in *chapter 8*.

From a religious point of view, Islam encourages people to strike out into the world to earn their living to provide for their needs. It does not forbid earning of wealth or working hard for one's career success. However, Islam does not appreciate excessive concern with material gain, which, according to Alvesson and Willmott (1996), is one of the 'priorities' of individualism. The Holy Quran rebukes obsession with earning material gains in *Surah Takathur* (chapter 102), which literally means '*The piling up – the emulous desire*' and begins:

The mutual rivalry (for piling up of worldly things) diverts you until you reach the graves (AlQuran, 102:1-2).

It then warns that had one known the consequences of becoming a slave to such desires or had faith that one would have to account for all worldly benefits on the Day of Judgement, one would not have engaged in their pursuit so relentlessly. From a

professional point of view, Kazmi (1999) remarks that groomed to be decision-makers, many Pakistani business students also receive a rude shock when they go out into the market and have to contend with a more localized business culture. This point was also raised by some of my respondents in both academia and industry.

Scholars, such as Lataif et al (1992), Boyatzis et al (1995) and Kamal (2002), also see socialization in MBA programmes as responsible for generating in students expectations about being ready to run any company, join any industry of finance and marketing, and being able to ‘parachute to the upper echelons’ of the corporate ladder. My respondent students as well as their schools’ publications and teachers too seemed to be entertaining similar ideas. In contrast to this, Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) has gently reminded people to be patient in pursuing worldly gains. Amr bin Taghlib narrates (Bukhari 2:45²⁰):

Some property or something was brought to Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) and he distributed it. He gave to some men and ignored the others. Later he got the news of his being admonished by those whom he had ignored. So he glorified and praised Allah and said, “By Allah, I may give to a man and ignore another, although the one whom I ignore is more beloved to me than the one whom I give. But I give to some people as I feel that they have no patience and no contentment in their hearts and I leave those who are patient and self-content with the goodness and wealth which Allah has put into their hearts and Amr bin Taghlib is one of them.” Amr added, “By Allah! Those words of Allah's Apostle are more beloved to me than the best red camels.”

Management education, as my research showed, also seemed to be encouraging ideas of superiority and inferiority, based on notions of educational and career success. These values and ideas too remind me of the colonial discourse on inferiority and superiority of cultures (c.f. 2.4). Deriving their identities by looking up to others, in this case superior

²⁰ www.2muslims.com

educational and corporate institutions, and stereotyping themselves and others on these bases, seems akin to the natives' looking up to the white master and mimicking him in order to be more like him (c.f. 3.3.5). This is encouraged in management education, as Marxists and postcolonialists say, by highlighting class differences and not giving equal weight to managers and workers. The emphasis is always on *management*, though the theory promotes the idea of *organizational members*. Journals such as *Journal of Management*, *Academy of Management Review* and *Journal of Management Studies* are evidence of this (Hofstede, 1993; Weiss, 2000). Husain and Ashraf (1979) also observe that modern education has created an elite, enterprising but lacking in spirituality. This, I believe, is due to the influence in the MBA curricula of technicist-managerialist thinking that marginalizes spirituality and religion from the world of business. I will pick up these points again in *chapter 8*.

Entertaining ideas of superiority is also in contrast with the Islamic spirit. Naquib Attas, a world renowned Islamic educationist and philosopher, says 'Knowledge must be approached reverently and in humility' (1979a:3). The truly knowledgeable, informs the Quran, (17:107-109), are not full of self-pride but are humble

Those who were given knowledge before it, when it is read unto them, fall down prostrate on their faces, adoring, weeping, and it increases humility in them.

From humility flows a self-critical mind and the continuous effort to improve and learn, says Lodhi (1989), who has written on Islamization of attitudes in education. The criterion for superiority, as the Holy Quran informs us, is not schooling or job position. Rather it is '*taqwa*' or fear of Allah. The Quran (49:11,13) says

O you who believe! Let not a group scoff at another group, it may be that the latter are better than the former... Verily, the most honourable of you with Allah is one who has taqwa' (piety or fear of God, to the nearest meaning).

In pursuit of their careers, one of the respondents mentioned the difficulty of retaining balance in their lives. Husain and Ashraf (1979) hold neglect of spirituality as responsible for this. Islam sees retaining such balance between moral and professional, indeed all aspects of life (as will be explained in *chapter 8*), as important for a successful life. The Quran (22:41) praises those who do not lose sight of their spiritual duties in their quest for material gains

Men whom neither merchandise nor sale beguile from remembrance of Allah and constancy in prayer and paying to the poor their due; who fear a day when hearts and eyeballs will be overturned (out of horror of the torment of the Day of Resurrection) (AlQuran, 24:37).

7.2 Promoting social responsibility

This section discusses respondents' values and ideas about social responsibility (c.f. 6.2.4) based on their responses to the question:

How would comment on the curriculum of your business school? Please include in your answer your comments on the teaching of ethics and social responsibility in your programme.

As in the previous section, I will first summarize these findings and then illuminate them with the help of comments from various literatures.

In my research, students and some teachers saw social responsibility with a wide meaning of reaching out to the community and helping the country. Senior officials from both schools considered producing graduates acceptable in job market their biggest contribution to society. Some also saw graduates' entrepreneurial activities as contributing to the economic development of Pakistan. Moreover, both schools supported less financially privileged students through a number of aid and loan schemes to enable more and more students study at their schools. School staff and publications (such as Leaders' NOP pamphlet; Leaders' Student Handbook, 2004-5; Pioneer Program Announcement, 2004-5) also exhorted students to contribute to social development of the country after graduation. Despite these efforts some students and teachers from both institutions stated that their schools had "*failed*" in fulfilling their social responsibilities. They observed that not only was the subject of social responsibility rarely mentioned in class but the schools themselves appeared geared to serving the foreign multinational sector. By catering primarily to the multinationals or sending their graduates abroad, the schools had largely ignored local industry. Students' ideas about looking forward to careers in large Pakistani or multinational companies also did not indicate much social concern on their part to me.

Most managers and some other teachers considered social responsibility as primarily demonstrating ethical behaviour at work. These teachers and managers therefore talked of social responsibility as having ethical work values as part of company core values, instituting regular ethics meetings and trainings, and paying attention to candidates' ethical orientations while hiring.

Seeing the varying conceptions of social responsibility among my research participants, I am reminded of a study of MBA students by Dolan (1997), who found that MBA graduates could not agree on the definition of social responsibility. For them, it ranged from giving charity, to volunteer work, to not working for a tobacco company. Even though all these conceptions may be correct, I believe a vague and sometimes even disparate understanding of social responsibility could come from the inadequate importance this topic is granted in technically managerialist management academe and practice. Not having a comprehensive idea of the concept, students and managers would thus contend with the topic as they desired. This point is also raised by Sherman (2003). If care and concern for others, development of personal self and promotion of intellectual thinking are common sense concepts, as some believe, then why are not business academics and managers listening to their inner voices, he questions. He is of the opinion that good intentions, rules of thumb and home-spun logic are not sufficient to resolve management problems.

In contrast, social responsibility is a cardinal part of the Islamic work ethic. In Islam 'there is no concept of personal morality or piety which does not include social action' (Husain and Ashraf, 1979:79). In the Islamic work ethic, showing mercy or responsibility to God's creation is at least as important as submission to His moral order (other formal commandments). These points are explained in the Islamic principles of *adl* and *ihsaan* (Ahmed, 1995; Attas, 1979b) (to be explained in *chapter 8*). Regarding *ihsaan*, that includes social responsibility and the sharing of wealth with others, the Holy Quran (2:267) says:

O you who believe! Spend of the good things that which you have (legally) earned...And know that Allah is rich (free from all needs) and worthy of all praise.

Failure to abide by any one of these two sets of injunctions will be a cause of regret on the Day of Judgement:

O you who believe! Let not your properties or your children divert you from the remembrance of Allah. And whosoever does that, then they are the losers. And spend (in charity) of that which we have provided you before death comes to any one of you, and he says: "My Lord! If only You would give me respite for a little while (that is, return to the worldly life), then I should give *sadaqah* (charity, to the nearest meaning) of my wealth, and be among the righteous" (63:9-10).

Saeed et al (2001), Jabr (1993) and Rice (1999a) explain the point further from an Islamic and management point of view. Sharing of one's provision with others includes not only giving *zakah* (the compulsory tax on wealth that has remained unused for one year, to the nearest meaning) and charity, but also contributing to raising the standard of living of people (Ismail, 1993) and engaging in works of public interest (Bakr, 1989). In addition to sharing one's wealth, showing *adl* and *ihsaan*, including social responsibility, also means being kind and considerate of others, ethical in one's work life and instituting the same in society to build a cohesive community. The Holy Quran (22:41) praises those who are mindful of both their professional and moral duties:

Those who, if We give them power in the land, establish worship and pay the poor-due and enjoin kindness and forbid iniquity. And Allah's is the sequel of events.

A true Muslim community gives one opportunity to express oneself as a whole, and gives members a sense of moral discrimination and direction, writes Khuri (1998). Gatto²¹, who

²¹ www.spinningglobe.net/gattopage.htm

is well known for his work on community education, observes the same about communities. For him, communities take the whole person in, both the good and bad parts of his/her personality, discourage dishonesty through close communication among members and extend family relationships to other members. How some of these objectives of mercy and responsibility were realized in the Prophet's (pbuh) time and the Umayyad and Abbasid periods of Muslim history are given in detail in *Muhammad at Madina* (Watt, 1977) and the *Cambridge History of Islam* (Holt et al, 1970).

7.3 Other professional and interpersonal work values used by students

The following paragraphs discuss values respondents used to achieve everyday goals at work (c.f. 6.2.5), relating primarily to the question:

What are the main values encouraged in your business school? Or

How would you comment on the values about work MBA graduates come endowed with when they enter practical (work) life?

They also discuss other values respondents talked of while describing careers they aspired to or some other experiences in their business schools. I had mentioned in *chapter 6* that these values were not seen as contentious as other values about work and therefore I had presented them only briefly, except those that did figure significantly debatable in respondents' conversations. Besides, I had also noted, that seeing the relations between different values, I had broadly grouped them into the professional and interpersonal categories, keeping in mind that some values would overlap the two categories. However, this grouping was done to enable the readers to better understand the connection between

various values. In the following summary and illuminatory discussion I have retained these groupings.

Among professional values, values of merit, hard work, professionalism, enthusiasm and zest, diversity, discipline, and honesty were seen at schools. However, professionalism or quality in work was occasionally compromised in the face of numerous assignments, discipline sometimes turned into inflexibility and honesty became dishonesty, for example, in the context of job search. As far as people's professional work and dealings with others were concerned, a competitive spirit was seen in business schools and industry. I thus see competition as one of the values overlapping both categories of professional and interpersonal values. Among other interpersonal values, students emphasized the need to network in order to form useful contacts, behaved arrogantly at times, and resorted to flattery and favouritism to get their way through. However, they also cared for their colleagues at other times. None the less, managers in industry found business graduates generally lacking in people management skills. Finally, only a few respondents mentioned personal development or self enhancement as part of their work ethic.

The paragraph above suggests that various kinds of commendable and not so commendable values were used by respondents to obtain their ends. Several of the values cited above were pronounced as the core values of the two business schools. Many of these values were seen in industry also. In the next few paragraphs I have problematized the different values in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures.

Professional values

Among professional values, merit was highly praised in academic circles as a just system, rewarding those who deserved to be rewarded. The Holy Quran (20:112) too speaks of God being just in rewarding people:

And he who works deeds of righteousness, while he is a believer (in Islamic monotheism), then he will have no fear of injustice, nor of any curtailment.

But Bell (1979) cautions that too much emphasis on meritocracy, without concern for the less privileged, can tantamount to technocratism or technicism.

Hard work was also emphasized by respondents in both schools and listed among their core values. It was a requirement of work in the industrial sector too. Hard work is very much appreciated in Islam. Al-Miqdam narrates that the Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) said

Nobody has ever eaten a better meal than that which one has earned by working with one's own hands. The Prophet of Allah David (pbuh) used to eat from the earnings of his manual labor (Bukhari, 3:286²²).

Respondents also stressed the need for professionalism or quality in work, though they reported occasional compromises on it in face of work pressure. Islam too places a high value on professionalism, which AbdulRahman²³ describes as:

Professionalism is the talent of taking power through God, the source of all powers, to love what we do, to improve ourselves, to add to our experiences, and do the best we can at what we promised to do.

²² www.2muslims.com

²³ www.lariba.com/lariba-book/chapter2.htm

In fact, he calls it as one of the values in business ethics that ought to be achieved by every Muslim manager. This statement is reflective to me of Hamid's observation about being zesty at work, namely, that if one takes his/her work as a hobby and is committed to it, he/she will be able to enjoy it. I thus see professionalism and enthusiasm as related concepts.

As seen in *section 6.2*, both schools also acknowledged their commitment to having a diverse student body and striking links with a diverse set of universities in both the developed and the developing world. Islam too encourages diversity, as Murad (2002), one of the most renowned Islamic scholars in the UK, testifies, 'No premodern civilization embraced more cultures than that of Islam.' Celebrating diversity, Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) has said, 'Every prophet was sent to his own people; but I am sent to all mankind' (Bukhari, Tayummum 1). But from a postcolonial point of view, Banarjee and Linstead (2001) contend that seeking diversity is seen perhaps more as a 'market opportunity' for there is actually little effort seen to reduce internal inequalities. However, even if this may be the case, my case studies were seeking to limit discrimination, on basis of financial status at least, by extending educational and financial support to a diverse student body through their various aid and loans schemes.

Discipline was also cited as a major strength of the two business schools, but respondents at times saw in it unforgiveness and inflexibility. Maybe it was being used as a means of securing control over students, or keeping them attentive to their work as Kamoche (2000) from a postcolonial standpoint and Cunningham (2004) in a critique of technicist-managerialist thinking point out in the case of employees in industry. According to these

authors, management control is secured in the corporate sector by evaluating employees' performance and offering benefits to those who achieve targets. Successful employees, perhaps like successful students, are those who agree to an organization's ideas about work, remuneration, socializing and control.

Discipline is much praised in Islam. In fact, fasting, one of the five *pillars* of the religion, is primarily an institution for spiritual discipline and self-control. Yet Islam stresses compassion and patience in all dealings, even in hard financial transactions (Gerholm, 1994). Enforcing discipline does not call for intolerance. An example of a business relationship, Muslim leadership is not dependent on autonomy and self-assertiveness to ensure discipline, but as Khadra (1990) – who is famous for his model of Islamic leadership – believes, on the maintenance of harmony within socially approved rules of behaviour. Alimo-Metcalf (1995) also points out the need for including more people sensitive criteria in assessment of leadership qualities. The Holy Quran (3:159) sums up the gentle character of a person in authority:

And by the mercy of God, you (Prophet Muhammad, pbuh) dealt with them gently. And had you been severe and harsh-hearted, they would have broken away from about you; so pass over (their faults), and ask forgiveness for them; and consult them in the affairs.

Honesty was also one of the core values written down in the publications of both schools. Many respondents spoke of practising it, though others confessed of being dishonest at times, if it appeared beneficial to do so. They also complained of unfair subjective marking and teachers' inadequate preparation at times compromising integrity at schools. Many managers also complained of business graduates' behaving dishonestly to win jobs.

Burgess (1996) feels this is so because honesty is not always encouraged in the capitalist system.

Dishonesty is considered such an abhorrent vice in Islam that Prophet Muhammad (pbuh), who was known as AsSadiq or 'the honest one,' has talked of dishonesty along with the gravest sin of associating others in worship with God:

Shall I not inform you of the greatest sins (*akbar al-kaba'ir*): Associating partners with God, disobedience to parents, bearing false witness and speaking falsehood (Bukhari: 8.8²⁴).

Relating to dishonesty, MBA graduates' job switching, in the vein of being disloyal and irresponsible, was also spoken of by managers. Burgess (1996) expresses the opinion that honesty and loyalty are values contrary to capitalism, where the concept of self-sovereignty leads to irresponsible behaviour. Commenting on some of the ills of pursuing careers blindly, Peltonen (2000:412) also says

Career teaches ruthlessness by neglecting the personal responsibility for consequences of behaviour and highlights instead norms as mere regulative rules of the game.

But disloyalty should not be seen on the part of the employees only. Research, such as Dick and Metcalfe's (2001) on UK employees, shows that organizational support too affects organizational commitment, for example, in the sense of identifying with the organization and internalizing its values. Treating employees as 'dispensable and prone to be outsourced at any time,' the metacapitalistic firm, whose business runs basically on outsourcing operations, does not value loyalty but rather short-termism (Mikhail and Ostrovsky, 2005). It is reported that due to a hypercompetitive and chaotic market, the

²⁴ www.2muslims.com

average length of a CEO in America is 4.6 years. In Europe too, 22 of the top 100 CEOs were fired in 2003 alone (Debold, 2005). I believe such ideas of short term loyalty and responsibility emanate from a technically managerialist thinking too that promotes behaviour that sounds rational to the actor. I will return to this point in *chapter 8*.

But in Islam, loyalty and responsibility towards one's work is a serious concern. Abdullah Ibn Umar (pbuh) quoted God's Apostle (pbuh) (Bukhari, 2.18²⁵) as saying

All of you are guardians and responsible for your wards and the things under your care.

In fact, regarding the issues of inculcating honesty, loyalty and responsibility among students, Attas (1979b), a notable Islamic scholar, believes that the following *hadith* (Arabic for 'quote' or 'saying') of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) should be systemized in the education process of all Muslim countries: The mark of a hypocrite is when he speaks, he lies; when he promises, he breaks the promise; and when he is entrusted with something, he betrays the trust.

Many respondents, in both academia and industry, pointed to intense competition, whether at work or in people's dealings with one another, in the field of management. Some saw fair competition as necessary for growth and innovation and praised it, while others saw it as a more aggressive strategy of survival in the business academic and practical world. Islam does not prohibit fair competition. In fact, the Holy Quran encourages healthy competition. 'So compete in good deeds' (5:48). Even the prophets (pbut) have been known to engage in games involving competition. However, since all

²⁵ www.2muslims.com

competition is not healthy and competition has been known to create other problems, one must be cautious of the competitive strategy one uses. Hashim (2003:315) from the International Islamic University, Malaysia, identifies certain conditions that must be met before competition can be called lawful or fair. Based on Islamic jurisprudence, competition must not transgress the bounds of Islamic law; must not cause inattentiveness to duties towards God; should not interfere with the needs of the state; and should strengthen the relationship among community members.

Regarding unhealthy competition, critical management authors, such as Roberts (1996), see examinations and tests, including aptitude tests, one of the reasons for such competition. By setting students in competition, they weaken the degree to which students can serve as others' learning resource. Directed inwards, rather than outwards, they reinforce conformity, yet lead to individualized mentality (also see Leavitt, 2001; Lataif et al, 1992). My respondents too confessed of working to "*beat the other guy*" or not helping one another for the fear of losing out. Thus this competition did not appear to strengthen relationships. Managers in industry too criticized business graduates for lacking in team skills.

On a larger scope, Jessop (2002) and Hirschman (2003) see competition as both a root of capitalism and an 'ideal' characteristic of rugged individualism. With its advocacy of risk-taking, courage and creativity, competitiveness is seen as the progression of individual advancement. It is increasingly being seen as imperative to survival. For example, Means and Schneider's (2000) in their book on metacapitalist firms emphasize that no one in future will be able to do without competition. Their message is that failure

to remain competitive will spell doom for companies. The concept of unhealthy competition is criticized by scholars for resulting in not only individualistic thinking and a struggle for power but also in problems of instability. For example, O'Hara (2004) believes that if competition is not followed by innovation, it leads to instability, inconfidence and less trust in the economic system. Poole (1996) reflects further on the disadvantages of competition. He believes, to be rational and to survive is to compete and thence pursue power as an end in itself. Since power of one is relative to others not having it or having less of it, there will always be some who have more power than oneself. Thus it is denied to those who value it the most.

Interpersonal values

As far as working with other people was concerned, several respondents emphasized the importance of networking and adjusting of behaviour with different people to achieve their academic and/or career goals. Similar to this is a study of a UK-based transnational (Kamoche, 2000) where many respondents underlined the importance of networking for one's career advancement and survival in industry. In this research, one Chilean commercial manager remarked

The head office is like a parliament with a lot of politicians planning and discussing the future of the company. The key executives are like senators. If you don't know the senators it's very difficult to advance. You have to constantly lobby, talk to people in private, find out what's going on, get involved. Just don't get left out (pp.760-61).

A Pakistani personnel manager in the above cited research said:

In a place that's full of very ambitious people, there's a lot of competition. That's where networking comes in – you might need someone to notice you. It happens informally, not deliberately (p.761).

Criticizing networks, Gatto²⁶ says that they give only temporary solutions. Besides, they require only part of the person, not the whole. Though they do get some work done, they do not nourish members emotionally. The Holy Quran also instructs one not to do a good deed merely for an expectation of obtaining something better in return, but to be patient in earning one's reward from God:

And give not a thing in order to have more. And be patient for the sake of your Lord (74:6-7).

In spite of the “*cut throat*” competition and calculative networking among some students, students and teachers also notified of students’ cooperating with and caring for one another and helping one another at other times. Nevertheless, in their zeal for competition, MBA graduates’ lacked the “*take along concept*,” according to some managers. Hence, they also did not consider them effective team players. Critics, such as Vince (1996) and Currie and Knights (2000), hold the excessive training in objective issues that technicist-managerialist management education imparts and the prototype management leaders endowed with competitiveness, aggression, and lack of emotions that management students are familiarized with responsible for this ineffectiveness. Prophet Muhammad (pbuh), on the other hand, has asked his followers to care for one another in order to receive mercy from God, ‘Be merciful so that you can be shown mercy²⁷.’ In fact, the Holy Quran says

²⁶ www.spinninglobe.net/gattopage.htm

²⁷ www.mountainoflight.co.uk/spiritual_hadith.html

Repel (the evil) with one which is better. Then verily he, between whom and you there is enmity, (will become) as though he was a close friend (41:34).

Business students were at times blamed for being disrespectful towards teachers and managers and behaving arrogantly with colleagues. Though they were known to be confident and assertive, I believe this does not justify their disrespect or arrogance. The Prophet (pbuh) has also said that whoever does not respect our elders, does not have mercy on our children, and does not recognize the rights of our scholars is not of us²⁸. From an Islamic point of view, AlHalveti²⁹ identifies some reasons for arrogant behaviour, including education, knowledge, wealth, achievement, and the number of one's admirers. Many of these factors were seen in the case of my respondents. According to Islamic tradition, arrogance makes one akin to Satan who was the first being to rebel against God, out of his arrogance. Ibn-e-Masud (pbuh) also reports that the Prophet (pbuh) has said, 'Whoever has an atom of pride in his heart will not enter Paradise' (Al-Halveti³⁰). Attas (1979a) considers arrogance a trait of the *Jahiliyya* (Age of Ignorance) (c.f. 2.2)

In getting their way around people or trying to win favours, respondents also mentioned use of flattery and favouritism. Islam looks down upon flattery as an abominable social vice. For example, Hammam bin al-Harith reports that a person began to praise Uthman. Miqdad, who sat upon his knee, began to throw pebbles upon his (flatterer's) face. Thereupon Uthman said, "What is the matter with you?" He replied, "Verily, God's

²⁸ www.bilalphilips.com/abouthim/artic01e.htm

²⁹ www.crescentlife.com/spirituality/arrogance_&_humility.htm

³⁰ See footnote 27

Messenger (pbuh) said, When you see those who shower (undue) praise (upon others), throw dust upon their faces” (Muslim, 42: 7143³¹).

Finally, very few respondents mentioned the topic of personal development or self enhancement in their conversations. Most of those who did, saw it primarily as the inculcation of professional skills to be used in future. I believe this could be so because as Sherman (2003) writes, concepts of personal growth, intellectual development, scholarly community, improving society and liberal education are absent from ‘fads’ that form a popular part of MBA education. In Islam, personal development, which is often called purifying of oneself in the Quran, is an act worthy of providing eternal bliss. The Holy Quran (87:14) says

Indeed whosoever purifies himself shall achieve success.

Moreover, one of the things God swears by in the Quran is the self-reproaching person (AlQuran, 75:2), highlighting the significance of constantly probing oneself.

7.4 Chapter Summary

In this chapter I have summarized the main thematic findings of my research and illuminated and critiqued them in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures. The purpose of this chapter was to critique the values endorsed in the MBA schools of Pakistan in the light of these literatures and to indicate the extent to which they were in harmony with Islamic principles. It was seen that respondents’ values and ideas about success at work were rather materialistic and engendered notions of superiority and inferiority. Students also did not show much concern for social

³¹ www.2muslims.com

responsibility, nor believed that their schools had contributed much to social welfare. In their academic or work lives, respondents also mentioned use of several values that were helping them in making their way through. Many of these ideas and values, as illuminated above, have been critiqued in management, postcolonial and Islamic scholars. Islam does not favour obsession with wealth or position, though it does not forbid working hard to provide for oneself. Islamic work ethic also places much importance on concern for others, whether at work or in society. This is at least as important as adhering to God's commandments in pursuit of one's work. The various other work values that respondents spoke of were also praised or condemned in Islam as the Islamic teachings presented above indicated. Thus, based on respondents' own words, I can say that some of the values being endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes were in harmony with Islam, some were only partially so and some not at all. I depict this state of affairs in the following table (2) to present a snapshot of it. The idea is not to confine the various values to water-tight compartments, but only to show which values are approved of in Islam and which are not.

Values endorsed in harmony with Islamic teachings	Values endorsed not in harmony with Islamic teachings
	Materialism
	Impatience
Non-discrimination	Elitism or sense of pride
Diversity	
Social responsibility (not fully endorsed; lacking)	
Merit	
Discipline	Inflexibility and unforgiveness
Tolerance	
Hard work	
Honesty	Dishonesty
Professionalism	“All goes” attitude
Enthusiasm	Disloyalty and irresponsibility (as in job-switching)
Competition (fair)	Competition (unfair)
Cooperation	
	“Get[ing] around people” (networking)
	Flattery and favouritism
Respect	“Disgust[ing]” attitude
	Assertiveness and arrogance
Personal development or self-enhancement (rarely mentioned)	

Table 2: A comparison of values mentioned by respondents

Thus it can be seen that though many values endorsed in business schools were in harmony with Islamic teachings, they were often counterbalanced by opposing values. These differences could be emerging from the different conception of work in Islam and that maintained by my respondents. In *chapter 8*, I will compare these two conceptions of work. After giving some idea of how much these values are in harmony with Islamic teachings, I would like to inquire into the incidence of technicist-managerialist and

Western/American or colonial thinking, that I pointed out at various points in this chapter, to see how the values found in my research reflected these. I will take a abroad look at all of my findings given in *chapter 6*, including those on the curricula (c.f. 6.3) and the Islamic-nonIslamic debate in the business schools (c.f. 6.4), in the next chapter to address these questions. In *chapter 9*, I hope to conclude the research with my interpretation of whether the values endorsed in the MBA programmes of the country are in harmony with Islamic teachings or are they more reflective of other discourses prevalent in management academia.

8.0	CHAPTER 8: MAJOR ISSUES EMERGING FROM THE FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS	293
8.1	A comparison of the students' and the Islamic conceptions of work	294
8.1.1	The Islamic conception of work	294
8.1.2	Students' conception of work	299
8.1.2.1	<i>Values and ideas about success</i>	299
8.1.2.2	<i>Promoting social responsibility</i>	302
8.1.2.3	<i>Other professional and interpersonal values part of students' work ethics</i>	303
8.2	Technicist-managerialist and secular thinking in the MBA curricula	306
8.2.1	Technicist-managerialist thinking in the MBA curricula	306
8.2.2	Secular thinking in the MBA curricula	311
8.2.2.1	<i>What is secularism?</i>	311
8.2.2.2	<i>A history of the concept of secularism</i>	311
8.2.2.3	<i>What has secularism led to?</i>	314
8.2.2.4	<i>Secularism in the MBA programmes</i>	315
8.3	Individualism in the MBA curricula	317
8.4	Academia and management's responses to addressing problems in present day management education and work values	326
8.5	Colonialism in the MBA curricula	331
8.6	Chapter Summary	344

CHAPTER 8: MAJOR ISSUES EMERGING FROM THE FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

In the previous chapter I summarized the main thematic findings of my research and illuminated them in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures. Illumination of the findings showed that some of the values being endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes were in harmony with Islam, some were only partially so and some not at all. Instances of technicist-managerialism and Westernization/Americanization or colonization were also observed in respondents' values. In this chapter, I hope to go into the details of these arguments by looking at the various themes together. I will also revisit the findings on the two schools' curricula (c.f. 6.3) and the Islamic-nonIslamic debate there (c.f. 6.4) which, as I said earlier, related to all the four themes and which is why I did not discuss them in my illumination of the individual themes (c.f. chapter 7). By this overall discussion on the values endorsed in the MBA programmes, I hope to suggest the major modes of thinking prevalent in these programmes and place the MBA education in Pakistan within a larger intellectual and social framework it is part of.

I have divided this chapter into four sections. In *section 1*, building on the Islamic critique (c.f. chapter 7), I give a commentary on the underlying conception of work informing respondents' work values as well as that envisaged in Islamic (and other religious) literature in order to compare the two sets of values. In *section 2* I review the incidence of technicist-managerialism in the work values endorsed in the Pakistani MBA curricula.

Section 3 presents a discussion on individualism as seen in respondents' comments, and *section 4* goes back to the issue of colonization in management education.

8.1 A comparison of the students' and the Islamic conceptions of work

The previous chapter discussed various values respondents were employing in their lives in the academia. Most students confessed to looking forward to materially beneficial careers and using whatever values they found workable in order to attain these. At the same time, not many believed they had been adequately prepared to play a socially responsible role in society. I also illuminated these values against their Islamic conceptions to show the harmony or contrast between the respondents' espoused values and those preached by Islam. I believe work values emerge from one's conception of work. Hence, in this section, I would like to comment on the conception of work in Islam (and other socio-cultural literatures) and that expressed by my respondent students to enable the readers to examine the two and determine for themselves the extent to which they are in harmony.

8.1.1 The Islamic conception of work

Recognizing man's need to furnish his needs to his satisfaction, Islam freely allows him to strive for his betterment. The Holy Quran (67:15) says

O humankind, strike out then into the world and seek of God's bounty.

But work must be governed by two principles: mercy to God's creation and submission to God's moral order. These two points are contained in the Islamic principles of *adl* and

ihsaan (Ahmed, 1995; Attas, 1979b). *Adl* means balance or justice. Reviewing several authors, such as Chapra (1992), Gerholm (1994), Sirageldin (1995), and Rice (1999a), I find that the concept of *adl* means balancing one's professional duties with moral, material goals with spiritual, and individual needs with societal. *Ihsaan* is a very comprehensive term. It can be explained as³²

To do things in the best of ways, to perfect all acts of worship and to perform them as were commanded to do so, while observing the rights of God within them. It is to be vigilant, with an awareness that God is watching you.

It thus includes sincerity and responsibility to God for one's actions. Ahmed (1995) includes compassion in this definition of *ihsaan*, while Siddiqui (2005) adds mercy and generosity, as well as doing things with excellence. Work conceived of in this way is considered worship by Prophet Mohammad (pbuh)³³. Thus it can be seen that these two terms encompass several virtuous values about work, many of which my respondents also talked about or were mentioned in their schools' publications.

From these two concepts it can be construed that work is not an end in itself but 'a means of fostering personal growth and social relationships' (Ali, 1996; also see other Islamic scholars, such as Abdul-Gader and AlBuraey, 1993). The two concepts of *adl* and *ihsaan* combat irresponsible behaviour and alert one to be conscious of God in all endeavours and maintain an ethical attitude at work. Various Islamic work values outlined in the previous chapter illustrate this point. These two concepts also indicate that Islam recognizes people as persons, not functions. There is emphasis on rights, liberty and

³² www.salaam.co.uk/themeofthemonth/june02_index.php?|=25

³³ www.muslim-canada.org/liberator.html

dignity (Khuri, 1998) and generosity and justice (Ali, 1996); at the same time self-purification and education and training of workers is also important (Rahman, 1980) – whether at official work or in interpersonal dealing. Hence, the values of honesty, hard work, professionalism, discipline, care, self-enhancement and others mentioned by my respondents come within the purview of these two terms.

Concern for balance and compassion for humanity also negates obsession with material gain. According to Imam Ghazali too, perhaps the single most renowned mystic philosopher in the history of Islam, the main vice or weaknesses of the human soul is love of the world. From it proceed all other vices, such as hypocrisy, false promises, greed, extravagance, hatred for the poor, abasement of the rich (Abul Quasem, 1975). The Quran also informs us in 34:34 and 28:8 that nations who saw wealth as a criterion of superiority perished. Instead there is emphasis on social responsibility in an Islamic organization. This comes from the role expected of managers. Managers exist not only to serve stockholders (Ali, 1990) but on the contrary, they are a part of and hence responsible to a community (Khuri, 1998). Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) has said

The believers in their mutual love, sympathy and cooperation are like the parts of the human body: when one part complains, the other parts call each other to hasten to its rescue, each sharing its pain and sleeplessness (Muslim, 32:6258³⁴).

Illustrating the above conception of work, Professor Zingales, from the University of Chicago, based on his analysis of the World Value Survey, an enormous database created by social scientists, concludes

³⁴ http://www.mountainoflight.co.uk/spiritual_hadith.html

Islam appears as the religion least conducive to capitalism. Muslims are very much against competition, against private property and less willing to trade off equality for incentives (2006:29).

After giving man instructions on how to develop his work life, the Holy Quran instructs him to ask God for the goodness of both worlds. Verse 28:77 reads

Our Lord give unto us from both worlds.

Conception of work in other religions

In other religions as well, work has a purpose higher than only supplying for one's material needs. Christianity believes in 'moral goodness constituted by being in harmony with God's plan of creation' (Williams and Houck, 1982:7). Economic activity is only a means towards the end of accomplishing a virtuous life. Luther saw a task well done as done in the service of God. The Puritan spirit also exhorts one to austerity and hard work to earn money and to live as a 'moral athlete' – hence the stress on industriousness and persistence to become and remain profitable (Williams and Houck, 1982). God praises the self-made man – middleclass, simple, hardworking, sober, free from ostentation and luxury. These ideas once formed the basis of capitalism, informs Heath (2002).

According to the Puritan ethic, too much wealth is dangerous because it produces idleness and temptation of the flesh, and can be a distraction from the pursuit of righteous life and from glorification of God (Heath, 2002). John Ruskin also believed that faith, sacrifice and piety emanated from huts, while cruelty, cowardice and idolatry proceeded from ivory towers (Nasir, undated). The Oxford Conference on Church, Community and State,

1937, repeated the same. Other Christian conferences from time to time have also kept on calling for greater justice and harmony in the economic order (Bennet, 1982).

However, labouring to be rich to serve God's creation is not only permissible, but appreciated in Christianity (Heath, 2002). Williams (1993) informs that the Catholic social thought has repeatedly emphasized the notion of the common good as the appropriate context in which to consider one's own interest. Prophet Muhammad's description of a community of true Muslims rings very close to St. Paul's analogy of society as a human body that requires everyone to perform his/her due part for the common good. According to Frey (1998), a Puritan citizen was expected to provide support for civil officers and engage in various acts of charity, including educating the less privileged. Forgiveness and kindness thus formed an important part of the Christian ethic, claim Ali, Camp and Gibbs (2000) who have written together on management from a comparative religious perspective.

According to the Rabbanic tradition also, the first question a man will be asked in the next world is whether he had been honourable in the conduct of business. In this tradition, deceiving man is akin to deceiving God, as outlined in Sifr Num, Naso, section 2. Deception is a sin worse than idolatry. The Talmud also gives details of business activities safeguarding labours' and stakeholders' rights, including that of the environment (Leiser, 1982).

In Buddhism, work is seen as a chance given to man to utilize his faculties, overcome ego-centredness by working with other people, and bring forth goods and services needed

for a becoming existence. Buddhism sees no conflict between religious values and economic progress but considers excessive attachment to wealth as a hindrance in the way of liberation. Preaching meeting given ends with minimum means, it sees the essence of civilization not in the multiplicity of wants but in the purification of human character (Schumacher, 1973).

Sacrificing self-interest is also important in Zoroastrianism. 'Zoroastrianism prizes a willingness to deny oneself, and thus constrain the pleasure, gratification, or self-interest that are at the root of strategic interests' (Worden, 2003:152).

8.1.2 Students' conception of work

Having laid out the Islamic conception of work above, I will present a general picture of my respondent students' conception of work in comparison to it. I will also give a critique of this conception from management, postcolonial and religious literatures. In presenting this argument, I will adhere to the same sub-headings I used in illuminating these values in *chapter 7*, namely, values and ideas about success, promoting social responsibility, and other professional and interpersonal values part of students' work ethics.

8.1.2.1 *Values and ideas about success*

Regarding purpose of work, most of my research participants spoke of achievement primarily in terms of recognition and social accomplishment (c.f. 6.2.1 and 6.2.2), though in an Islamic order material gain is only a part of success. Work has a broader and higher

purpose, as described in the previous section. According to Hofstede (1984), defining achievement in these ways is a characteristic of masculine cultures, on whose continuum of femininity-masculinity Pakistan falls in the middle. I believe it is also reflective of a technicist-managerial thinking that sees work defined objectively (Park, 1998) in terms of material targets (Roberts, 1996). Not only did my respondents express such materialistic and elitist ideas, but other research has also found the Pakistani society to be thinking on similar lines. Khilji's research (1999), for example, indicated that the Pakistani society is materialistic and status-conscious (employees strike relationships with managers primarily for economic reasons) and therefore individualistic. Her research on the banking sector of Pakistan showed that various banks competed in offering higher salaries and better growth opportunities to appropriate the crème of the country (including the graduates of the two schools I studied), thereby further encouraging materialistic and elitist ideas. Commenting on the above described state of affairs, Banarjee and Linstead state from a postcolonial point of view, 'In this diversity of identities, consumption is the common denominator and the negotiation of a common identity through consumption is a hallmark of a global culture' (2001:703). Since true equality is an impossibility, Rice (1999b) writes on the emergence of elitism, people end up inventing false elites based on relatively contingent points of superiority, always of a material order.

Materialism and elitism are heavily debated in management scholarship. According to Burgess (1996), pursuit of short-term profit or pleasure is one of the 'most dangerous' features of our modern way of life. He adds, 'If our self-respect depends on being better than someone else, then we have no true dignity at all. This, I believe, sums up the cultural tragedy of class-based society' (1996:36). Speaking from an economic point of

view, Schumacher (1973) contends that materialism cannot be sustained because the world resources are limited. Greed and envy of the modern system is not accidental but the cause of its expansionist success. This prevents people from seeing things in their wholeness. The concept that by single-minded pursuit of wealth we can attain peace on earth without bothering about moral and spiritual questions is unrealistic. Permanence becomes illusory as what were luxuries for our forefathers become necessities for us. This sets man against man. According to Khusro (1979), the ex-Vice Chancellor of the Aligarh Muslim University, India, an education devoid of a value system, concerned only with utilitarian needs of students, is likely to lead to such ideas and values.

Taking an opposing view, other management scholars argue that a society of liberty depends on material well-being for its cultural and political liberties. Miller (1967:181), for instance, writes that in capitalist countries money is a symbol of achievement in that it evokes an attitude of respect towards the person who has acquired it in accordance with approved ways of achieving. But this does not mean that all capitalists are materialists; self-esteem and self-respect is the desired end. Novak (1990) claims that Western Europe's and America's escape from poverty and underdevelopment, was possible because of their distinction between economic, political and moral systems. Cultures that are not democratically capitalistic do not differentiate between these functions of society. 'A just economic order in a pluralist society cannot be based solely on the concepts of virtue, innocence, and motivation taught by church leaders' (ibid: 17) for they are often not well versed in economic realities. Besides, a realistic social order, contends Novak (1990), cannot be consistently expected to promote virtue and hence has to be designed

around ideals lower than those envisaged in Christianity. Comparing modern democratic capitalist societies with traditional societies is to apply inappropriate categories.

Goulet (1982) concludes the above arguments about values and ideas about success by stating that Christians face ethical dilemmas on job because of conflict in the measures of success adopted by modern business and the Christian religion, or for that matter Islam. He further elaborates that success goes to aggressive sellers and opportunistic operators, especially if they are convivial to take care not to offend others. ‘Yet suffering, tragedy, and self-abnegation form an integral part of the Christian vision of success’(ibid: 222) Practicing Christians must endeavour to change the structures of corporate life within which they operate, for it is in the spiritual arena that real success is measured. (Burgess, 1996:39) also thinks

that true progress for Western society would mean recovering a sense of personal and communal dignity, identity and interdependence – the kind of ease and utter dismissal of economic pride and prestige and the self-validating confidence.

8.1.2.2 Promoting social responsibility

Though Islam deems social responsibility an important ingredient of work ethic, my research participants informed that other than “*passing reference[s]*” to ethical uprightness (c.f. 6.4.2), social responsibility was not given enough coverage in their business school curricula. Even if schools were contributing to social welfare, through financial support schemes for students, and occasionally stressing their students to be socially responsible in future, their efforts were not seen to be adequate by these members, especially because the same schools were sending a major proportion of their

graduates to foreign multinationals, neglecting local industry at large (c.f. 6.2.3). This state of affairs is because, as management critics often believe (see for example, Schneider, 2002; Roy and Roy, 2004), social responsibility is not considered an integral part of a technically managerialist business curriculum. Verschoor's (2003) study in the US showed that a growing number of MBA students are becoming dissatisfied with the coverage of social responsibility in their curricula. Alsop (2005) also reports that an increasing number of students are looking for business courses that pay adequate importance to social responsibility.

Responsibility is not simply sustaining status quo through TQM or BPR but 'realizing values and practices that are humanly (and ecologically) more fulfilling and less degrading' (Epstein, 1999). Tretheway (1999) emphasizes that because corporations play a critical role in influencing income distribution by deciding what resources to use and what to sell whom, management students need to be aware of service learning concepts. Involvement in community projects can be made part of their regular curricula (see also Davies, 1976; Burrell, 2002). Boulding (1971), for whom the concept of community is not limited to in space, but extends over time into the future, notes that there is copious amount of evidence that suggests that a society which loses its positive image of the future cannot deal with present problems and soon falls apart.

8.1.2.3 Other professional and interpersonal values part of students' work ethics

My research findings also indicated that students used various kinds of commendable and not so commendable values in their work lives (c.f. 6.2.4). Some of these, as I discussed

in *chapter 7*, appear to have a likening with the Islamic principles of *adl* and *ihsaan*, while some do not. But even those values which could be called to be in harmony with Islamic teachings were often not endorsed fully or counterbalanced by opposite values that negated them or at least lessened their impact. For example, though several respondents mentioned professionalism and merit, they also notified of instances when these were compromised; when respondents talked of cooperation, they also mentioned “*cut throat*” competition; when they were honest, they also behaved dishonestly at other times. Investigating the reason for such behaviour, some scholars assert that management studies often talk of work from a masculine, detached managerial spirit, which marginalizes emotional and ethical concerns in pursuit of objective rationality and managerial targets (Park, 1998). Grey and Mitev (1995) and Currie and Knights (2000), as mentioned in *chapter 2*, call such thinking ‘technically managerialist.’ Postcolonial theory too is wary of marginalization (see for example, Spivak, 1988) for such a strategy inevitably leads to the dominance of one over another (c.f. 3.4.2). Consequently, in the present conception of work, people are often seen as others to work on to realize one’s ambitions (Peltonen, 2000), especially in high masculine cultures where knowing the right people is often more important than ability (Hofstede, 1984). Pakistan was also found to be in the middle of the masculine-feminine continuum by Hofstede (1984). Feminist scholarship also feels management education needs to give more importance to emotional and ethical concerns (Smith, 2001).

Concluding the above general conception of work, Bell (1979) asserts that in its present form, work has become a means to consumption, display, and a high standard of living, all incongruent with nineteenth century Protestantism. Williams and Houck (1982) too

believe that devoid of religious and ethical meaning, work has become sport. According to Poole (1996), taken only as a means of earning income, and not as that for self-expression and self-making, work does not remain a sign of progress, but of alienation.

The section above briefly described the Islamic and my respondent students' conceptions of work. It was seen that the students' conception often differed from the Islamic conception as far as criteria for success, concern for social responsibility and other professional and interpersonal values were concerned. For example, students and their schools focused on individual material achievement (for example, high pay, managerial position, prestige) as an indicator of success, while Islam sees successful work as that which, in addition to supplying one's worldly needs, leads to one's self enhancement as well, one which includes social concern as its essential part. Moreover, students spoke of using whatever ethical and unethical values they found capable of achieving their goals, while the Islamic work ethic is based on submission to God's moral order. These principles of the Islamic work are conceived of in the concepts of *adl* and *ihsaan*. However, some values of my respondents' did agree with the Islamic values contained in the two concepts just mentioned. But they were often not promoted wholeheartedly or counterbalanced by opposing values, as explained above. This made the respondents' work ethic different in spirit from the one envisaged in Islam. This present conception of work, as expressed by my respondent students, has also been criticized by management and postcolonial scholars for neglecting ethics, leading to consumerism and elitism, and for showing little concern for others and the society. Having discussed the extent to which the work values endorsed in the business schools of Pakistan were in harmony with Islamic teachings, I will discuss in the remaining parts of this chapter the extent to which

they reflected technicist-managerialist and Western/American ideas and values. In the next section I will study the incidence of technicist-managerialism to see how it featured in my research findings.

8.2 Technicist-managerialist and secular thinking in the MBA curricula

In *chapter 7* I referred to various instances of technicist-managerialist thinking in the values my research participants spoke about or their schools' publications wrote about. In this section I would like to study these and the rest of my findings, including my respondents' views on the curricula of their schools as given in *section 6.3*, and their opinions on the Islamic-nonIslamic debate in their schools presented in *section 6.4*, in more detail to see how technicist-managerialist thinking influenced the MBA programmes I studied. Based on this, I will present an argument on how such thinking can emerge from an inclination to secular ideals.

8.2.1 Technicist-managerialist thinking in the MBA curricula

I will begin this section by taking a look at the various work values respondents talked about and then discuss the curriculum in detail to put forward my explanation as to why I find these MBA curricula technicist-managerialist.

An overview of the section on work values (c.f. 6.2.5) showed that students used various kinds of praiseworthy and condemnable values to achieve their goals. They espoused values of honesty, professionalism, hard work but also compromised them when need be.

Though they worked in cooperation they also worked competitively in order not to lose sight of their targets. At the same time, they indulged in networking, favouritism and flattery to make contacts with resourceful people to forward their ambitions. Personal development or self enhancement was a subject rarely mentioned by respondents, though a few did feel its absence in their management curricula. This led managers to criticize students for not being well trained in dealing with people and lacking in team spirit.

Management scholars mentioned in *chapter 2* (for example, Lataif et al, 1992; Poole, 1996; Vince, 1996; Currie and Knights, 2000; Lowe et al, 2002) see such obsession with objective work targets, using other people to forward one's aims and little concern with the ethical aspect of decisions as indicative of technicist-managerialist thinking.

Students' perceptions of their prospective jobs and awareness of the privileged status they enjoyed in the academia and industry (c.f. 6.2.1 and 6.2.2) also suggested a materialistic thinking on their part. Success was seen as something that could furnish them with a good job – a well paying one with ample growth and learning opportunity, comfortable working environment, and little bureaucracy – quickly. Part of this success was earning an elitist status in industry by joining well-known local and multinational organizations and reaching managerial positions in a short time. Concern for society was rarely heard among these MBA students, though their schools were attempting to play a socially responsible role in society through reminding students of their social responsibility and themselves contributing to various financial schemes for the benefit of less privileged students. Nevertheless, students and teachers felt their schools had not done enough to make students realize the importance of reaching out to the larger society, nor played their own social role effectively if their graduates aspired to foreign multinationals (c.f.

6.2.4). These concerns are also echoed by scholars, such as Epstein (1999) and Verschoor (2003), who feel management education does not concern itself adequately with notions of social responsibility. In fact, the different conceptions of social responsibility seen in academia and industry in my research could suggest that the concept is not fully explained in management circles and is seen differently by different people, with each group grasping it the way it finds useful. This concern for personal advancement to the neglect of social concerns too is suggestive to me of technicist-managerialistic thinking.

Technicist-managerialism in MBA curricula becomes more evident when we take a close look at the curricula of the two schools (c.f. 6.4). Though some ethics and Islamic subjects were taught in both schools and respondents did identify some teachers promoting the concept of social responsibility, teaching of such subjects was a “challenge” for both teachers and students because students either considered such subjects “irrelevant” to their careers ahead or did not identify with the discussions in class. Besides, as many students said, generally no more than “a passing reference” was given to ethical and religious topics, compared to the main management concepts in the curricula. Some teachers too informed that such courses were taught primarily as administrative requirements and spoke of the lack of material on the topic. This is why they had to resort to American books for teaching (Islamic) ethics. However, they added local illustrations and examples to the texts they used. Nevertheless, I saw an interest in both schools in opting for careers in Islamic banking, alongside those in multinational companies and banks. These views remind me of Baetz and Sharp’s (1999) and McDonald’s (2004) findings in *chapter 2* as to why human and ethical issues are not given due importance in management curricula: ethics are seen as irrelevant and hard to

understand and difficult to translate into practical work life. Mitroff and Denton (1999) point out similar concepts of spirituality in their research in the corporate sector. When ethics are finally mentioned, they are often so alongside material benefits, such as a “*positive NPV*”³⁵ or a “*good job*.” Roberts (1996) sees such evaluative justification of ethics in terms of opportunities and threats as ‘triggered by greed.’ From an Islamic point of view, Qutb (1979:48), Professor of Islamic studies and comparative religions at the University of Makkah, says of such a situation, ‘The fact that religion is now utterly isolated and alienated from our lives and feelings is because we do not practise it in reality.’

I also see MBA curricula as technically managerialist because of their excessive concern for market requirements. In *section 6.3* I discussed how the business schools were paying heed to the market in formulating their curricula, in fact so much so as to compromise the value-giving element in them. Such a concept of education as a commodity for sale to the market ignores the nurturing or character-building side of education, say Cope and I’Anson (2003). The use of metaphors, such as *quality assurance*, *benchmarks*, *exporting education* and the like is also at odds with the Islamic concept of education. According to Bilal Philips³⁶, a contemporary Islamic scholar of renown, Islam regards education as worship, a process of advancement in both this life and the next. Other religious models, including the Vedic, also consider education as worship. Chinese see teachers as ‘kings,’ in the words of a Chinese colleague. Such models place the teacher on a level above the student. They expect the teacher to share his/her knowledge and experience with the

³⁵ Net Present Value: A concept in finance, according to which the feasibility of a project is evaluated on the basis of net profits, in terms of value of money today, it would yield over its life.

³⁶ www.bilalphilips.com/abouthim/artic01e.htm

student in return for reverence and obedience. The idea of a material exchange is absent in classical religious texts. But when education is considered a commodity, material exchange becomes important (Business 2.0, 2005; Pring, 1998) and education becomes training (Thomas and Anthony, 1996) provided for a fee.

A synopsis of all of the above points – neglect of people and ethical concerns in one’s relentless pursuit of material gains, little interest in social welfare, difficulty in understanding and teaching ethical and religious subjects, and seeing education as a commodity for sale – indicates to me that the curricula of the two schools were significantly influenced by the technicist-managerialist discourse. Grey and Mitev (1995), Alvesson and Willmott (1996) and several other management scholars see such a thinking emanating from positivism and instrumental rationality; in other words, from a commitment to the *scientific method*. Critiquing the scientific method, Schumacher (1997) contends that it sees knowledge primarily as that which is measurable, making it difficult to reflect on questions about the purpose of life, one’s duties, and the difference between good and evil. Thus, as Poole (1996) says, such a philosophy separates the masculine from the feminine, the public from the private, work from non-work, and I think religion from non-religion. Scientific thinking is closely related to secularism, as Husain and Ashraf (1979: 14) from an Islamic point of view contend, ‘Modern education has encouraged a scientific attitude to life and hence secularism and individualism.’ In the next section I will inquire into the evolution and development of secularism and how it appeared in the values spoken of in my research.

8.2.2 Secular thinking in the MBA curricula

8.2.2.1 *What is secularism?*

Shakir (1999) defines secularism as ‘the divorcing of religious belief, religious ritual or a sense of community based on religious affiliation from the moral life of society.’ Coming from an ideological commitment to the *scientific method* or positivism, Manzoor³⁷ sees secularism as freeing man from the domination of religious institutions and symbols, and from God’s granting of identity, values, and consciousness of community. Poole (1996) sees such construction of concepts of knowledge that exclude the possibility of moral knowledge making morality a matter of subjective opinion. However Asad (2003:25) considers secularism neither as exclusive of religion, nor continuous with it. He sees it as ‘a concept that brings together certain behaviours, knowledges, and sensibilities in modern life.’ So paradoxically, secularism has generated enlightened and tolerant religion, according to him.

8.2.2.2 *A history of the concept of secularism*

According to Asad (2003), the *secular* is an epistemic category and *secularism* a political doctrine. As an historical epoch, secularism also includes an economic project. According to Bewley (2001b), the theoretical beginnings of the concept *secular* go back to Bacon when he first split religion and science and the spiritual and the material worlds.

Descartes further posited the basic dualism of object/subject and spirit/matter. For him

³⁷ www.algonet.se/~pmanzoor/Des-Sec.html

nothing was considered true unless it could be conclusively proven to the observer to be so. Hobbes reinforced these ideas by allowing only those things to be called real that could be weighed, measured or controlled in some way. Furthermore, the scientific works of Copernicus, Galileo, Newton, though no doubt significant, also changed man's perception of the universe and his position in it. Under this conception, human beings began to see themselves as only a small part of the gigantic universe and 'God became a hypothesis... dependent on argumentation for His very existence' (ibid.). Thus cut off from true knowledge, whose starting point, according to Muslim belief, is God (Attas, 1979b), peoples' knowledge became confined to the physical limits of the material universe. Concepts like spiritual and angelic realms and life after death, that gave man supremacy of position in a universe created by God, became trivial with the advent of Renaissance. Luther's nailing of his thesis on the church door (though he probably would not have realized at that time) made it possible for people to reject traditional understanding of what was right or wrong and opened the door to situational ethics, thereby indicating that anything could be right or wrong, depending upon situation. Calvin legalised usury, thereby demonstrating superiority of human law over Divine law. In Cromwell's England, religion for the first time came under the authority of the state, highlighting that from then on there would be no divinely revealed law (Bewley, 2001a).

Thus, as Asad (2003) informs, secularism emerged in response to political problems of the Christian West in early modernity. He sees modernity as a series of projects that institutionalizes a number of principles, such as consumerism, freedom of the market and secularism. Faced with wars on religion, people found the secular ethic convenient, since it allowed people from different religions to be bound together on certain common ideas.

But the architect of the modern secular state, according to Manzoor³⁸, was Machiavelli who declared that religion had to be banished from the state, not because it taught morality, but because it taught morality of a kind that did not enhance the power of the state. However, the term *secularism* was not used in English until the middle of the nineteenth century when freethinkers first used it to differentiate themselves from the atheists in what was largely a Christian society at that time (Asad, 2003).

With Napoleon's entry into Egypt in the early nineteenth century, secular ideas started filtering into Muslim countries. As secularism galloped uninhibited in the Muslim countries, it became easy to overthrow the Uthmaniya caliphate in Turkey, with the help of British forces. Secularization was thus the fate of the Muslim world (Bewley 2001 a) (see *chapter 2* for more detail).

Among more recent efforts at secularization, inform Husain and Ashraf (1979), one of the most notable was the meeting of the Presidents of some American universities in Harvard in 1957. This conference divided knowledge into three branches of humanities, social sciences and natural sciences. Divinity was excluded from compulsory teaching, relegated as a matter to be taken care of by the religious people. Thus the separation between the religious and the secular was formally institutionalized in the field of contemporary education.

³⁸ www.algonet.se/~pmanzoor/Des-Sec.html

8.2.2.3 *What has secularism led to?*

Scholars, such as Attas (1979b), Minkes et al (1999), and Weiss (2000) argue that independent of religion, secular philosophy is leading more and more people to make moral judgements based on their own needs rather than deferring to traditional religious sources. Gerholm (1994:204) says of the same

Various *isms* take man as their starting point believing that he can shape society through his own endeavour, without relying on a transcendental power, and also formulate the ethics of his own.

Schumacher (1973) explains the above situation by stating that when the available spiritual space is not filled by some higher motivations, then it will necessarily be filled by something lower – by the small, mean, calculating attitude to life that is rationalized in an economic calculus. As such, says Burgess (1996), materialism, in which lie the roots of capitalism, becomes the new dogma replacing the metaphysical. Chapra (1992) reiterates the same from an Islamic point of view.

Poole (1996) explains the above argument, by writing that secularism has led to human pride, man's belief in his self-sufficient rationality, and slavery to the self via the market. The concept of the commercial society, as given by Adam Smith, now informs the dominant conception of morality. This concept is not new, but the extent to which it has become the central feature of modern social life is alarming. Money has become the instrument for measuring pain and pleasure. If utilitarianism means satisfaction of desires or consumption, then the utilitarian balance sheet would always remain in debit, for the capitalistic mode of production is always creating new desires. Subject to external

influences, one loses his/her individuality. Forces of the new or of capitalism threaten old traditions, making the world appear contingent, vulnerable to change. In addition to the crisis of legitimacy in the late capitalist society, Manzoor³⁹ and Shakir (1999) observe that hedonism, damage to the environment, loss of responsibility to others and the law, relativism of values with a resultant crisis of individual conscience, and the cult of the self are also evident in many secular economies.

Guenon Rice (1999b) also states that giving value to only that which is rational and has practical value leads to individualism and to an involvement with matter. Devoid of standards, man becomes free to choose his doing. 'Nihilism arises in part through the collapse of objective values and the incapacity of individuals to provide their own.' Thus rationalization of society has not delivered freedom, declares Poole (1996).

8.2.2.4 Secularism in the MBA programmes

Chapter 6 presented certain values being endorsed in the MBA programmes of my two chosen business schools. It was seen that management education in Pakistan was endorsing values that appeared directly beneficial to peoples' academic and work lives. For example, if students were found to be honest at work and respectful towards others, they also indicated resorting to dishonesty and flattery to have their way through; if they worked hard and professionally, they also competed in a "cut throat" manner. Thus they were using whatever values worked for them, irrespective of how ethical or unethical their actions were. As for their career aspirations they looked forward to materially

³⁹ www.algonet.se/~pmanzoor/Des-Sec.html

satisfying and elitist jobs, even if it meant ignoring their spiritual side or their families or society. Moreover, some other values, such as social responsibility and personal development (self enhancement), that are considered in Islam as important as other professional aspects of work, were not taken as seriously as those that related directly to jobs. Thus values relating to developing students as ‘whole persons’ seemed not to be as actively endorsed as those relating to their professional lives (c.f. 6.2). *Chapter 7*, by critiquing these findings in the light of Islamic values, further illuminated how several of these values were not in complete harmony with Islam. Values that were, were either not wholeheartedly implemented or counterbalanced by opposing values.

Regarding the curricula (6.4.2), it was seen that the teaching and learning of religious subjects was proving difficult for both teachers and students. Students often did not understand the relevance of such subjects. Besides, teachers for non-Islamic subjects rarely paid attention to ethical or religious issues in class, my respondents informed. Teachers, on the other hand, encountered curriculum constraints and student resistance when teaching such courses.

In MBA students’ quest for materially successful careers and prestigious positions in academia and industry to the neglect of spiritual and social concerns (c.f. 6.2), their determining standards of behaviour on the basis of their needs (as seen in their selecting of professional values and behaviour most suitable to their goals, c.f. 6.2.5), their neglect of the personal or self- enhancing aspect of education and work (c.f. 6.2.5), their little understanding of the concept of social responsibility (c.f. 6.2.4), and their difficulty in handling ethical issues together with other management concepts in their curricula (c.f.

6.4.2), I see a split in their understanding of the professional and the personal, the material and the spiritual, the individual and the communal. This indicates a secular as opposed to an Islamic thinking, for all these distinctions are not known in Islam. I thus consider the Pakistani MBA of today largely technicist-managerialist in nature, conceived of in a secular paradigm.

The debate in business academia (c.f. 6.4.1) on whether the non-Islamic (Western, liberal) part of Leaders' ethos was hurting Islam sheds more light on this conclusion. Those who thought it was, said Islamic values were being marginalized in pursuit of non-Islamic ones, while others who believed the contrary clarified that the purpose behind the creation of their business school was not to impart Islamic knowledge. Hence they have never got into ritualistic "*religious debate*" and were certainly not "*hurting*" Islam. Thus all participants to this debate accepted that the Islamic spirit in the MBA curricula was certainly not strong. Husain and Ashraf (1979:12) reach the same conclusion about modern education:

The secularist forces released by secular education and secular thinking generated by a modern scientific approach have made man empirical in attitude and doubtful about the need to think in terms of religion. All these have started neutralizing the hierarchy of values and *Shariah* [Islamic principles codified in Islamic law] is ignored and not enforced.

8.3 Individualism in the MBA curricula

Some values endorsed in the MBA programmes of my two case schools, for example their competition in schools, their quest for material gains and their little concern for social welfare (c.f. chapters 6 and 7) indicated evidence of individualized learning (Lataif

et al, 1992; Leavitt, 2001) and concern with individual goals (Alvesson and Willmott, 1996). Perriton (2000) also expresses the view that the day-to-day activities of management education in organizations (both educational and business) are more to do with the development of the individual rather than society because the organizational training model has ‘appropriated aspects of person-centred philosophy into many of its activities’ (p. 235). Its goal seems to be to allow ‘unlimited’ but ‘unspecified’ growth to the individual manager, independently of race, gender, socio-economic concerns (p. 233).

Gosling and Mintzberg (2004:21) make the same observation:

As currently constituted, the MBA program encourages strictly personal learning...perhaps that explains why so much management has itself become self-serving.

Postcolonial scholars, such as Dirlik (1996) and Mongia (1996) and other Islamic scholars, such as Husian and Ashraf (1979) and Asad (2003), also see modernistic ideas of economy fostering individualism. These authors’ comments find support in Morris et al’s (1994) research that demonstrated a growing worldwide tendency in present day capitalistic firms towards individualism. In this study of firms from various countries, North American firms turned out to be the most individualistic but other countries followed closely.

At the same time, the values in my research that spoke of personal goals did not always seem in complete harmony with Islamic teachings (see *chapter 7; chapter 8, section 1*). In the previous section, I mentioned several authors’ (including Rice, 1999b; Manzoor, undated; and Shakir, 1999) belief that giving value to only that which is rational and has practical value leads to individualism and concern with oneself. Schumacher (1973) and

Gerholm (1994) believe this is so because a secular mind frame operates independently of any ethical authority other than oneself. This is not to say religion, for example Islam, forbids concern with the individual self. Islam recognizes the individual (Watt, 1977), as do Judaism and Christianity (Novak, 1990). In fact, ‘the purpose and end of ethics in Islam is ultimately for the individual’ in order that he/she may please God through a righteous conduct and attain eternal bliss (Attas, 1979b: 27). Islam believes in the ‘Universal Man,’ the *insaan alkamil* (ibid: 39) who is an image of God (Sharifi, 1979) and who can internalize all that is good. But Islam does not allow man to override human and ethical concerns in pursuit of personal ends. From an Islamic point of view, individualism is a characteristic of the *Jahiliyya* (Age of Ignorance) (Attas, 1979a).

Considering various scholars’ contentions about secularism promoting individualism (as given in the previous section), and the incidence of individualism in management curricula in general, in this section I will inquire into whether individualism featured in the values and ideas of my respondents. The following paragraphs explore this issue in the form of a debate on the positive and negative characteristics of individualism to see whether individualism, if prevalent in MBA cultures, was yielding any benefits for students and/or resulting in adverse consequences.

Self-directedness or selfishness: A moral dilemma

Enumerating the positive points of individualism, Miller (1967) and Ralston et al (1997) write that individualism encourages one to work freely for one’s objectives. It involves creativity and enterprise, achievement and self-directedness and allows one to live

according to the ideal he/she has prescribed for him/herself, leading to achieving socially acceptable goals and new values in that individual's group.

Some creativity and enterprising spirit was seen in my participant students' confidence levels (c.f. 6.2.5 and 6.3) and in their determination to succeed in practical life.

Respondents proudly narrated MBA graduates' achievements at work, while written accounts of schools gave ample evidence of students' success in corporations and entrepreneurial ventures (c.f. 6.2.1).

However, in their reliance upon their own selves, or their self-directedness, they employed whatever means they found useful. They demonstrated working hard for their goals, imbibed professionalism and integrity, cooperated with others but also showed dishonesty, competition, aggression, and networking to take work from others to achieve their ends (c.f. 6.2.5). Self-directedness was also seen in students' irresponsible job switching behaviour (c.f. 6.2.5). Lataif et al (1992) believe that such noncommittal attitude on part of MBA graduates, where they flit from one organization to another, without much concern for any thing other than personal success, reflects individualism on their part. This was also suggested by Khilji's (1999) research on the banking sector of Pakistan, where young employees had found the idea of loyalty traditional and instead exhibited individualistic behaviour (see also Morris et al, 1994).

Individualistic thinking was also seen in respondents' dealings with other people. Islamic (as explained by Husain and Ashraf, 1979) and other points of view (as put forward by Musson and Cohen, 1999; Lowe et al, 2002) see obsessive capitalism as a source of such individualistic behaviour that encourages narcissism, involves manipulation of

interpersonal relations (as evident in students' and managers' respecting and flattering those able to benefit them), and discourages formation of deep personal relationships (some students said they did not trust others and some were surprised to find business students really friendly). Encouraging us to assume that we are sovereign, self-determining beings, brute individualism has loosened links between individuals and eaten away at positive freedom, says Khuri (1998). Kumar's (2004) research on Indian negotiating behaviour also suggests that absolutist form of interpersonal behaviour emanate from adherence to an anarchical individualism. He believes that in anarchical individualism, individuals act out their personal views, but find it difficult to engage in mutually coordinated action to achieve shared goals. He further questions how compromise could be possible if individuals think in absolutist terms and view their own definition of a problem as the only right one. In a severe critique of capitalist philosophy, Poole (1996) puts forward that for the invisible hand to function, one has to behave impersonally, if not ruthlessly. Within this structure it becomes almost impossible to conceive of other-directed activities. This was what was feared by Mohammad Iqbal, the Indian Muslim philosopher who is considered the mastermind behind the creation of Pakistan

The seemingly aggressive, almost Nietzschean individualism which permeates his account of the human self, busy with 'self-assertion...the effort to be something...threaten[s] to alienate people from one another... and [being] quite *incompatible* with the Islamic emphasis on the community of believers, and indeed of all life (quoted in Cooper, 1996:393).

Considering the above individualistic behaviour, it can be seen that self-reliance and self-sufficiency brought with it manipulation of professional and interpersonal values, non-commitment to jobs, and inconsideration of others. Self-directedness was accompanied

by selfishness. Thus both worthwhile and not so worthwhile values were used by students in pursuit of their career aims. Hirschman (2003) puts forward the same idea that both sets of laudable and condemnable values are used by rugged individualists in the quest of their goals. The stress is always on self-sufficiency and solo performance, whether it is earning victory or meeting dangers, to the extent of not allowing anybody to detract one from one's plans and pursuits.

The unobserved logic of self-interest

A characteristic feature of capitalism is its individualistic tenet of self-interest. The logic behind this doctrine is that if each individual follows his/her own self-interest, good will ultimately be created for all. Thus, pursuing self-interest, everyone – firms and individuals – tries to become bigger and successful. Success is measured as some form of growth (Galbraith and Salinger, 1978). However, critics contend that the logic behind self-interest, that if each pursues his/her own interest, good will be created for *all*, has not been observed for *all*. Growth figures have been successively declining through the 1970s to 2000s. Global corporate system has not succeeded in propelling greater productivity, profitability, investment and growth (O'Hara, 2004). Not all companies invest in ventures that accrue greatest benefits for all. As capitalism spread, its purpose changed from the public good to the amassing of private wealth (Debold, 2005). This is because, as Frey (1998) sees it, commitment to this notion abolishes the need for morality, leading to hedonism, increased consumption, status emulation, 'being all that one can' – in contradiction to the old bourgeois values of frugality, humility, justice, industry (Bell, 1979; Ralston et al, 1997). On the social side, high levels of stress and alienation among

people are leading to a breakdown of family and community relationships. Environmental spoliation is another cost imposed by the system (O'Hara, 2004; Miller, 1967). This can create problems for the reproduction of the individualistic economic system itself, warns Bell (1979).

In the case of my respondents too, adherence to morality was not always seen in their pursuit of work targets as students used both commendable and condemnable values to make their way forward. They too confessed of working and earning primarily for themselves, emphasizing material gains and elite status (c.f. 6.2.1 and 6.2.2). One manager even spoke of the difficulty of retaining balance between family and work life. Thus in these circumstances it seems difficult to see how good was being created for *all*. Authors who have critiqued capitalism, such as Bell (1979), Greer and Patel (2000), and Moore (2004), consider these values to be based on a neo-colonial capitalist logic that focuses on the individual, rather than the society.

The sense of duty towards self and fellow men: An unrealised goal

Miller (1967) puts forward another benefit of individualism. Individualism gives one conscience and a sense of duty towards oneself and one's fellow men – leading to self-development or 'self-enhancement,' as Ralston et al (1997) call it. This occurs when one performs a social role of one's choosing and in doing that transcends what one was yesterday and what one is today. This can only be achieved in cooperation with others, in an open society that recognizes individuality.

But as we saw (c.f. 6.2.5), self or personal development or self-enhancement was seldom mentioned by respondents and those who did usually confined the topic to a professional domain. Also success was measured in purely material terms, though a few respondents spoke of the neglect of spiritual development as part of education (c.f. 6.2.1, 6.2.2 and 6.2.5). According to Hirschman (2003), such functionality, that is considering education as merely a means of survival, is also paramount in the ethic of rugged individualism. Guenon Rice (1999b) sees individualism as denying any principle superior to individuality. According to him, it is the

determining cause of the decadence of the Western, since it provides, so to speak, the driving force for the exclusive development of the most inferior possibilities of mankind...and which...at the very opposite pole to all spirituality and genuine intellectuality (ibid: 51-2)

In contrast to the sense of duty towards fellow men, students' ideas of success related primarily to personal benefit (c.f. 6.2.1), their dealings with colleagues were often motivated by self-interest (c.f. 6.2.5), and they said they were not fully prepared to undertake social or ethical responsibility in their practical lives (c.f. 6.2.4, 6.4.2). It therefore seems unlikely that their individualistic concerns were making them much conscious of either their fellow men or their intrinsic personalities. Hofstede (1984) also thinks that individualism is manifest of too much concern for one's own interests, giving one's interest precedence over group's well-being. He claims the Pakistani society to lie on the middle of his individualism-collectivism continuum.

The puzzle of 'individualism'

Before finishing the debate on individualism, I would like to point out that not all scholars see individualism in the same way. Some say the original concept was different from the present one: individualism as it is understood today was never promulgated by the Puritan ethic, but that the ethic has been 'secularized' to make way for the idea. There is another school of thought which believes a newer concept of individualism is still emerging.

Frey (1998) is among the first group, which believes that the Puritan ethic is understood in business circles to endorse individualistic values and culture traits that are compatible with market economics: it encourages self-interest to undercut the greater good of organizations and society. Single-minded devotion to work and material success is considered by business textbooks as evidence of one's spiritual standing with God. Such misconceived ideas, Frey (1998) believes, easily 'secularized ethic and made economic success an end in itself, not a sign of conformity with Divine will.' Moreover, focus on self left little room for commitment to any greater good, especially since Puritan authorities, such as Perkins (1558-1602) had designated the individual as the final judge of his/her calling. But Puritan moralists reply that one's calling directed 'toward a greater good that, while including self, transcended self.'

Wolfson (1997) differentiates between the *individual* of the old and new. He says Benjamin Franklin's individual was conceived of as having temperance, frugality, silence, order, resolution, industry, sincerity, justice, moderation, cleanliness, chastity, tranquillity and humility. Guided by self-interest, Franklin believed, he/she would not neglect public affairs. Industrialism, rise of corporations, science and technology, however, changed these ideas to a 'new individualism' that lacks spirituality. The author

feels a more realistic solution will be to 'return to an individualism that finds felicity not in personal liberation but in self-restraint; and, more ambitiously, to an individualism, the dignity of which is found not in personal idiosyncrasy but in human universality.'

On the other hand, Miner in his article entitled 'The New Individualism' (1998) claims that 'individualism is transitioning from a tug-of-war of competing individual needs to a spirit of self-sacrifice.' Americans are becoming more self-sacrificing and responsible towards community. Though they will continue to value self-expressiveness, the 'me-centred' philosophy is waning as more people are turning to non-traditional religions to connect with a 'larger whole.'

In conclusion, I would say that though I found individualistic tendencies fostering self-directedness and career advancement in my respondent students, I also noticed it leading concomitantly to selfishness, little concern with intrinsic self-enhancement, and to a marginalization of the moral and social element in their work ethic. Thus individualism in the case of my respondent MBAs seemed far from developing them into the *insaan alkamil* or the 'Universal Man' idealized in God's image.

8.4 Academia and management's responses to addressing problems in present day management education and work values

The previous sections (8.1, 8.2 and 8.3) showed the critique the present conception of work values has invited from management, postcolonial and religious scholarship. Many of these points have been acknowledged by academia and industry and are being

redressed. However, this seems only a beginning, especially in the case of my chosen schools, and there remains a long way to go before all of the above mentioned problems can be fully resolved.

Regarding material gain, research shows that a relentless pursuit of it is not without problems. For example, Eckersley (2004) informs that various researches in America and Europe are demonstrating that people are 'yearning for balance' in their lives. They are concerned not only for themselves but also for their children about the culture of material excess and misplaced values that is leading to social inequalities of race and class, society's failure to care for the elderly and the women and children, and to hedonism and cynicism. Kraut and Korman (1999) also report that work-family conflict is among the most serious of conflicts facing families and organizations in America. The sample in Heaton and McWhinney's study (1999) also complained about the 'macho culture of long hours' putting pressure on family and social life.

In response to these above mentioned problems of balance, that my interviews and illuminations also highlighted (c.f. 6.2.3), MBAs, especially women, are no longer working 'greed[il]y,' concerned only with earning wealth, but are placing more and more importance on achieving a balance between career and family, studies such as Dugan et al's (1998) suggest. Female executives, such as Ann Brinkley (1999) of the Bank of America, are also emphasizing the increasing need to balance family and work lives. Eckersley (2004) claims that more and more people are placing emphasis in their lives on relationships, communities, spirituality and real ecological sustainability. In America and Europe from 1970-2001, there has been a shift from materialism to postmaterialism,

where in addition to the desire for a high material standard of living, increasing emphasis is placed on the quality of life. In Australia too, over the last 10 years, 23% of the people aged 30-59 have taken voluntary downshifts to seek more balance and fulfilment (through emphasizing the same values listed above for the Europeans and Americans). Surveys referred to in Eckersley (2004) do not suggest that consumption is declining⁴⁰, rather it is growing, but at the same time the number of people becoming dissatisfied with material culture is also increasing (also see Miner, 1998). Such dissatisfaction was also expressed by a few of my respondents (c.f. 6.2.1).

Work values discussed above are also being investigated by scholars from varying disciplines, who are highlighting the need for more ethical and considerate work practices in management. The concept of social capital – the moral or humanistic economics that emphasizes ‘interpersonal caring, relationship building and ethical context in economic behaviour’ – is also being revisited by contemporary scholars (Carroll and Stanfield, 2003). From the corporate sector, Ann Brinkley (2005), a corporate executive of the Bank of America, underlines the necessity of inculcating ethical practice, integrity, humility and trust in business, at least to salvage the image of the US corporations that are ‘perceived to be run dishonestly’ because of their insufficient commitment to ethics and character development of employees. She further reminds of the importance of character and personal values for each person’s effectiveness and performance. Discipline, she believes, is necessary to cope with the fast speed of change; institutional integrity without

⁴⁰ Annual surveys of almost 250000 new college students in the US show that the proportion saying it was ‘very important or essential to be ‘very well off financially’ rose from about 40% in 1960s to more than 70% in 1980s. Correspondingly proportion of those considering to ‘develop a meaningful philosophy of life’ declined from 80% to about 40% (Reported in Eckersley, 2004).

individual integrity is not only 'weak and useless' but also 'dangerous and dreadful'. Managers in my research too talked of the importance of upholding ethical values in practical work life (c.f. 6.2.4.2) but also expressed the difficulty they had to face in doing so. Nevertheless employers have begun seeking people who can make ethical decisions. A few managers in my study mentioned they hired people '*for [ethical] attitudes,*' but the number of such respondents was very small. Alsop (2005) reports that in 2005's Wall Street Journal-Harris Interactive business-school survey, 84% of the corporate recruiters said it was 'very or somewhat important' that MBAs displayed 'awareness and knowledge of corporate social responsibility.' Companies, including McDonald's, Gap and Yahoo are forging connections with business schools that offer classes in social and environmental responsibility.

Verschoor (2003) reports that present day MBAs too, in the vein of Omar and Waqar and a few other of my research participants (c.f. 6.2.3 and 6.4.2), are beginning to be concerned about possible values conflicts in their careers and are unsure whether their business education is preparing them adequately for the practical life ahead. Some teachers in my study, such as Ciran and Nasim, also indicated thinking on similar lines. This upsurge in social consciousness has been particularly noticeable since the international corporate scandals of Enron, Worldcom and the like. According to Alsop (2005), more and more students are opting for programmes that cover social issues. For example, at the Haas School of Business at Berkeley, a quarter of the incoming MBA students said they chose Haas because it offered about 30 courses with social or environmental content, including 'Social Entrepreneurship' and 'Business Strategies for Emerging Markets.' MBA graduates also stated their confidence in such degrees that give

them more credibility when they try to spread social responsibility throughout their companies because they can combine the language of social responsibility with that of brand management, corporate strategy and financial analysis.

Thus business schools are introducing socially responsible elements in their curricula through including courses in ethics and even offering MBA degrees in social responsibility. Harvard Business School, for example, is incorporating ethics within a larger framework through its course 'Leadership and Corporate Accountability.' Several universities, such as Dunquese and Carnegie Mellon, require their MBA students to take courses in ethics, while some, such as Middle Tennessee State University, are building coalitions of universities to address business ethics in collaboration (Roy and Roy, 2004). Other universities are offering MBAs in social responsibility. For example, the Bainbridge Graduate Institute, near Seattle, is offering an Environmentally and Socially Responsible (ESR) MBA degree; Presidio World College, San Francisco, offers an MBA in Sustainable Management. The former is a one year full time programme, while the latter is a distance-learning two year program. Both programmes have ESR elements integrated into each of their courses (Kaemerle, 2003). Roy and Roy (2004) also report that some universities have gone even further by setting up centres for the study of ethics. For example, Carnegie Mellon has a Center for Corporate Responsibility and Columbia has a Center for Leadership and Ethics. In Canada, the University of Toronto has a Center for Business Ethics. About European programmes, Roy and Roy (2004: 23) write:

European business schools have also begun to teach ethics in their MBA programs. London Business School has a mandatory course in business ethics for its MBA program, while Durham Business School integrates ethics within core courses. The University of Navarra's IESE Business School regards ethics as so central to its mission that it has a dedicated business ethics department, and ethics is mandatory for its MBA program. Henley Management College and INSEAD have mandatory ethics requirements for their MBA programs.

My case schools too taught subjects in ethics and social responsibility (c.f. 6.3) but this effort was considered inadequate by both students and teachers.

Moreover, the *service-learning* concept, though not an integrated part of management education, also reminds students of their social responsibility. Seeing service to society as an important goal of learning, it emphasizes that the privilege of higher education is to serve the community and consider others' needs as part of one's education (Appelgate and Morreale, 1999; Droge and Murphy, 1999; Soukup, 1999) Besides, it facilitates students in understanding how stereotypes are created and perpetuated in order to stretch their minds that they may be able to identify with others not exactly like them (Bachen 1999; Perkins et al, 1999).

Other than integrating ethical content in management curricula, some business schools are also trying to solve the problem of the isolation of MBA subjects. The concept of team teaching is under experimentation, whereby two professors from different functional areas, such as accounting and organizational behaviour, teach together not only to integrate subjects, but also to obtain other advantages in programme organization and logistics and to promote interdisciplinary research (Helms et al, 2005).

The paragraphs above show that a beginning has been made in redressing some of the issues in present day work values of materialism, lack of concern for social responsibility and ethical practice in work. Management education too has begun to respond to the problems resulting from adhering to technicist-managerialist thinking, as discussed in

section 2.2.5 of this study. However, a considerable effort is needed before these problems can be satisfactorily resolved.

8.5 Colonialism in the MBA curricula

Discussions in *chapter 7* had indicated several instances of colonial thinking in the values of my respondents. In this chapter I will study these arguments in detail, along with respondents' comments on the curricula (c.f. 6.3) and the Islamic-nonIslamic debate in their schools (c.f. 6.4) from the viewpoint of postcolonial theory put forward in *chapter 3*. This theory, as I mentioned earlier, is a critique on the dominance of the Western or American models in education, that management critics regard in the same spirit as the discourse of colonialism of the previous centuries. It also criticizes some aspects of technicist-managerialist thinking, such as promotion of ideas of rationality and modernity and marginalization of ethical and emotional concerns.

Chapter 6, section 3, showed how Western, particularly American, curricula and teaching methodology dominated my two case study MBA programmes. The major reason why business schools were following the Western, particularly the American, model was to learn "*from others*," exactly what Islam has instructed, as some teachers clarified. This section takes a critical look into this issue to argue that a certain ideology is represented in this borrowing from the West – American colonialism – which is contributing to fortifying the ideology of management education and resulting in a continuation of colonization – this time through a control of the human resources of the globalized. In the

following paragraphs I refer to various characteristics of the postcolonial theory to explain how this is being achieved in the realm of current MBA education in Pakistan.

Previous sections deliberated upon the religious-secular distinction. Erkersley (2004) blames this separation on the 'imperialistic ambitions of the global market, whose foundations lie in the mechanical universe.' Entry of secularism into the Muslim world too became possible with the advent of colonialism. Thus according to this explanation secularism becomes both the cause and consequence of imperialism and capitalism. In other words, colonialism has its roots in the philosophy of secularism, just as technicist-managerialism and individualism discussed above did.

The ideology of management education

In *chapter 2* I mentioned how Western, especially American, management ideas are proliferating the globe. Western, particularly American, management curricula were also explicitly referred to by my respondents in *chapter 6, section 4*. Curricula, courses, syllabi and text books came often from America. Case studies too were also often American, though Leaders was in the process of preparing local cases for teaching purposes. Top business journals, found in these schools, were mostly American, representing the voice of primarily American scholars. Pioneer had also adopted a four year BBA programme. However, still in its inception, it did not have many courses to offer and was even considered by some respondents as an initiative after the American model. Despite increasing localization in the syllabi of the two schools, for example through preparation of local case studies and introducing Pakistan-oriented courses, there

was dissatisfaction expressed in both academia and industry with these schools' inadequate recontextualization of foreign syllabi.

I also heard statements from one of my case study school's faculty claiming that the teaching methods they used were derived primarily from the West. My observations also gave me an opportunity to see how the curricula were taught and how much freedom of thought was actually allowed in business schools. Classes I attended in one of the schools were all discussion-based, with both students and teachers seeing the significance of the case study method in encouraging students to start thinking like managers and develop critical thinking. However, several respondents felt a need for more lectures as they did not find the case method suitable for all subjects. Teaching methodology in the other school was predominantly lecture-based. Though I saw some teachers encouraging thinking and discussion in class, which students happily received, and others expressing their desire to encourage argument and facilitate learning as against one-way lecturing, students complained that not all teachers allowed them to challenge their views, keeping students away from airing their opinions. Some respondents also criticized the one-way, uncritical lecturing of the imported, particularly American, concepts taught as "*perfect models*." Thus whatever the teaching methodology and whatever critical thinking it allowed, it seemed to be inclined towards the West.

Reliance on America was indicated in the MBA programmes of not only the two chosen schools (c.f. chapters 6 and 7) and other Pakistani business schools (c.f. chapter 4), but is also true for several other business schools around the world, as suggested by Castea's (2000) research. After researching web-sites and course outlines of 45 business schools

from America, Hong Kong, Japan and Australia, key documents on the state and the role of business schools, and mechanisms of institutional frameworks (such as the AACSB and the European Foundation for Management Development, Association of MBA, etc.), Castea demonstrates the dominance of the American model in management education of today. This dominance has been possible, observes the author, because of homogenization through GMAT and standardization of US theories that have resulted in the establishment of agencies, such as the AACSB, which in turn have reduced the MBA to certain core themes and disciplines. According to Armstrong (1996) too, the MBA degree is amongst the most standardized in the world.

Reflecting on the above state of affairs, Edward Said picks up on Nye's ideas, 'rarely before in human history has there been so massive an intervention of force and ideas from one culture to another as there is today from America to the rest of the world' (Said, 1994:319). Management and postcolonial critics see a number of issues in this frequent and unhesitant adoption of the American MBA model. Scholars such as Hofstede (1984 and 1993), Ali and Camp (1995), and Clegg et al (2000) question the universal and almost blind acceptance of Western theories, case studies, and teaching methodologies in non-Western contexts. Kumar and Usunier (2001) see the standardization of the curriculum threatening to the richness of diversity by 'banish[ing]' certain perspectives from the field, especially those that challenge the capitalist agenda. Lorbiecki and Jack (2002:292) consider 'subject benchmarking [as] constitutive of an ideological agenda,' which views management education as something whose means and ends are determined by market and corporate interests. Jaya (2001:227) challenges this American preponderance and marginalization of other cultures' knowledges:

What knowledge is being transmitted through a university model that seems to follow increasingly a western/American model? Is it truly representative of a “world-class education”? Does it embrace multiple world-views, knowledges, histories and philosophies?

She further adds why only Western leaders, such as Bill Gates and Richard Branson are personified as true leaders, while non-conventional ones, like Gandhi are left out?

Explaining the consequences of such promulgating such ideas, Lorbiecki and Jack (2002:291), after Wilson, remark

Such *epistemic violence* not only gives a myopic and distorted view (of the world), wastes the knowledge of the Other, but it also captures and fixes the way in which teachers, students, managers and others see the world that they live in, within an increasingly restricted and neo-colonial rhetoric.

Grey (2002:188) sees such knowledge as ‘an unacknowledgedly politicized account not just of management but of society.’

I see this situation in management education as colonization of territory giving way to globalization of mind. I believe domination is being secured not by forcible confiscation of the native’s property, but by forceful imposition on him/her of an ideology. In giving students a certain version of the world, such as the Western/American and the technicist-managerialist, promoting certain ideas to be necessary for realizing the goal of development, while closing doors to alternative theories and philosophies, contemporary MBA education has become an ideology – a Western, more specifically an American, ideology (see Prasad and Cavanaugh, 1997).

MNC (multinational corporations) Discourse

The way multinational corporations (MNCs) were spoken of by my research participants and school publications is suggestive to me of a discourse. Fairclough (2003:124) considers discourse as a way of 'reporting aspects of the world – the processes, relations, structures of the material world, the mental world of thoughts, feelings, beliefs and so forth, and the social world.' Different discourses are different perspectives on the world, associated with different relations people have with the world and with one another. One distinguishes discourses when particular ways (partly variable, partly stable) of representing the world become of social significance, perhaps in terms of 'effectivity of discourse,' and its 'translation into non-discursive aspects of social life' (p. 126). According to Potter and Wetherell (1992) and Hollway (1989), people build up different versions of the same reality for the different audience. Discourse analysis tries to find out how a particular account was created and for what purpose or to achieve what results. Discourses very often give a limited and stereotypical view of reality and are therefore looked upon suspiciously by postcolonial, poststructural and postmodern authors. In fact, the reaction to the colonial or oriental discourse, expressed as '*Orientalism*' by Said (1995), lies at the very foundation of the postcolonial argument.

My respondents' and schools' ideas about MNCs – as being associated with prestige and power, bright future prospects, less bureaucracy, and socially liberal working environments – without pointing out any negative characteristics of them, represent to me an MNC discourse, a discourse that seems to have its roots in the objectively rational technicist managerialist and colonized thinking. Hence it is no surprise that MNCs and large companies in Pakistan are absorbing the best and the brightest talent, leaving

medium and small-sized companies largely untouched by the fruits of developmental effort (Chaudhry, 2003b).

Reproducing the subaltern

The way the curricula were formulated and taught (c.f. 6.3) in the two business schools remind me of the reproduction of the silent subaltern (their MBA students) and the fortifying of the centre-periphery or the colonizer-colonized relationship. These relationships depended on control, with the master assuring the mimic that mimicry would be to his advantage, provided he abided by the instructions he was given (Bhabha, 1994; Fanon, 1970). Today control is not imposed but negotiated, say postcolonial authors, such as Dirlik (1996), who believe colonialism is still alive. In my case-schools too, students were controlled by being socialized into a narrow vision of reality – a technicist-managerialist version of management, through foreign texts, case studies and work values – and not encouraged to think too openly but to remain dependent on teachers' instruction (c.f. 6.3). They were taught through the schools' slogans of leadership that it was in their benefit – being developed into leaders for prosperous futures – that they remained disciplined and obeyed the schools' values (some of which are discussed in *section 6.2.5*). Thus they were being improved 'partially' (Bhabha, 1994).

Management educators and developers who were reforming other mimics selectively, for example, through open discussion of examination papers but not open critique of ideas in class, seemed to me to be functioning like reformed mimics too. Though they were

perpetuating the imperial hold by paying homage to Western concepts and ideas, they too were still marginalized by the Western educational powers, for example, through a neglect of their cultural values in the management curricula they were teaching.

A 'class' encultured in certain ideas: mimicry and hybridity

Noting how business students and managers talked about themselves, considered themselves superior to others on bases of the repute of their schools and the organizations they worked for (c.f. 6.2.2), I am reminded of Grey's (2002) and Ehrensals's (2002) description of the role of business schools and organizations as producers and distributors of business language. By shaping the vocabulary and the way in which these students and employees talk about themselves, about other employees, their bosses, their customers and competitors, as well as the way they speak about the nature of the enterprise, management education and corporate organizations shape the way that their members think and interpret the world; they 'develop a certain kind of *person* deemed to be suitable for managerial work and encultured into some [usually same] version of managerial values' (Grey, 2002:187). To me such students appeared as Bhabha's (1994) cultural hybrids. They were learning concepts and values of their largely technicist-managerialist foreign curricula but also seemed cognizant of Islamic values – dressing in Pakistani clothes and speaking the Urdu language. They seemed to have found or were looking for a common space between different and incommensurable cultures (see also Mohanty, 1996).

Seeking 'imagined wholeness' from subscription to superior models

Business students and managers saw themselves superior to others on bases of prestigious schooling, their professionalism, and their acceptability in the job market (c.f. 6.2.2). Subscription to superior models was seen in faculty's and managers' references to foreign standards of work as determining their policies (c.f. 6.3). Though such borrowing may indicate an openness to change, Zubairi (1989), from an Islamic point of view, believes it is only a temporary measure that cannot lead to development (Zubairi, 1989). Hamid in industry also spoke of jobs sketching managers' identities (c.f. 6.2.2).

These concepts of identity seemed to have been processed by external forces in which the capitalist class system has assigned particular identities to particular people. This is perhaps what Hall (1994) means when he says one's statements are not wholly authored by one because people operate within given rules of language and given systems of culture. My respondent students too seemed to be socialized in a technicist-managerialist and Western dominated (in contrast to the Islamic) culture of their MBA programmes. Such references used frequently can make one dependent on others to assure oneself of his/her 'imagined wholeness' (Hall, 1994) and keep him/her from developing one's own criteria of quality. This too can lead to a reinforcing of the master-slave or centre-periphery relationship (Moore-Gilbert et al, 1997).

A 'reformed mimic' – elitist but still subservient

In stereotyping others with almost the same rigidity as the colonists did (for example, by seeing others as different on the bases of schooling, professionalism, jobs) my research

participant students appear as subaltern mimics to me who see themselves superior to the native, although they are still subservient to the master. This highlighting of differences between workers and managers is a characteristic of management education of today, according to Marxist and postcolonial perspectives (Weiss, 2000; Hofstede, 1993). The Harvard case method, that is about general management and was used widely in my case studies, is a testimony to this maintenance of class difference. My respondent students also complained of being taught managerial skills but not knowing much about workers (c.f. 6.2).

Boje (1996) paints an interesting picture of MBAs, who, in order to join the ranks of the elite have to go through intense disciplinary practice. Such training that can make students comply with the control mechanisms of their schools or degree programmes is offered by technicist-managerialist curricula, believes Roberts (1996). According to Boje (1996), being standardized, the whole MBA programme follows a strict timetable: graduation to employment in a Fortune 500 company, to retirement, to death (p. 178). Even students' bodies are conditioned to 'hear and obey' by responding mechanically to sounds of bells and appearance of lecturers in class (p. 179). Among faculty, senior faculty keeps surveillance over younger ones. Added to this is the discipline of lectures, attendance and grading. Boje (1996) sees exams as *gaze* of teacher over student (p. 183). Exams also encourage learning by rote and hence roboticization of memory (also see Currie and Knights, 2000). Hence, management education makes people docile so that they can fit into corporate machinery, just as the Indian Civil Servant was trained to fit into the colonial machinery (Alavi, 1990). It produces disciplined leaders who can in turn discipline society. Thus the whole thing operates like a 'panoptic cage' (p. 172), patterned

after Foucault's *prisons* (Boje, 1996). Durning (in Banarjee and Linstead, 2001:709) also informs of the emergence of an elite class in various developing countries that are embracing Western ideas of development

emergence of an indigenous elite, embracing Western notions of development and progress through increased consumption can already be seen in Mexico, India, Malaysia, Indonesia, Pakistan, and several other developing countries. Far from promising an integrated world, globalization can produce a new set of class divisions between and within nations.

Giving consent

According to Eagleton (1994a) and several postcolonial authors (including Said, 1993; Clegg et al, 2000) ideology depends on the consent of the subjugated for its continuation. My case schools also seemed to have consented to the Western, particularly American, hegemony in management education and practice. They were following the technicist managerialist curricula (though they marginalized their cultural contributions and values) of leading Western business schools, frequently visiting foreign syllabi and teaching methodology, instituting the four year BBA programme (which was criticized for not being of much use to students) and undertaking journeys to the West to learn from them.

Moreover, hoping for better career prospects, business students and their schools were also looking up to MNCs as their or their students' future recruiters (c.f. 6.2.1). This was allowing the latter to strengthen their control over them, as seen in business schools' development of their curricula in the light of market (often MNCs') needs (c.f. 6.3), reinforcing the relations of domination and subordination between the two parties

(Ashcroft et al, 1989). Gatto⁴¹ is also of the opinion that schools' (including business schools) promises of good jobs, good money and good things, is a way to regulate students and their parents.

A 'reformed mimic' 'looking back upon the eye of power'

Bhabha (1994) tells us that 'a reformed mimic' can sometimes realize the conflict between his/her culture and values and those of the reformers. This can make him/her feel uncomfortable with his/her new status in society as he/she tries to reconcile both worldviews. Omar and Ciran, among some others, remind me of such reformed mimics or cultural hybrids who pointed out the materialism in MBA education and its uncritical commitment to American concepts, respectively (c.f. 6.5). Refusing to mimic any further, Omar had decided to join journalism or study further after his MBA; Ciran was deliberating on how to add a more Islamic flavour to her teaching.

From the above discussion, I conclude that colonialism is still alive in the Pakistani MBA education of today through a continuation of a technicist managerialist Western, particularly American, ideology of management education and the MNC discourse. My research showed that the hybrid subaltern was being reproduced through his mimicking of the masters' ways (as regards teaching and learning of a technicist-managerialist management education and management values and *othering* of his own Muslim identity) and his helping to perpetuate the imperial hold through his teaching other mimics to

⁴¹ www.spinninglobe.net/gattopage.htm

reform in the same mould. Despite this improvement, he was still marginalized – his cultural (for example, Islamic) contributions to the curricula or values of management education was rarely visible – because he had been improved only partially. Nevertheless, he had consented in favour of this arrangement to achieve material benefits in the educational and economic set up of today. Though some mimics had begun looking back upon the eye of power, refusing to mimic any further, MBA education in Pakistan by and large appeared colonized.

8.6 Chapter Summary

In this chapter I looked at all the themes together and views that I had presented in *chapter 6* and illuminated in *chapter 7*, from the standpoint of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures. Comparing students' conception of work to that of Islam's, I felt that the two had many differences, though a few similarities too. In this overall reading of the research data, I was also able to see evidence of technicist-managerialist thinking in the MBA programmes, as far as students' work values and their schools' curricula were concerned. Since this viewpoint seemed to be emanating from a secular philosophy, I inquired into secularism and explained it in my case studies' curricula and values. Another consequence of the secular philosophy, namely individualism, also appeared relevant to my findings. I therefore argued for the presence of this philosophy in the values endorsed by the MBA programmes, before turning to Westernization/Americanization or colonialism, which I had noted in my findings. Since secularism had entered the Muslim world via colonialism, I found it easy to see how colonial thinking was still evident in the technicist-managerialist Pakistani MBA of today,

which was heavily borrowed from the West, particularly America. Thus this chapter showed that MBA education in Pakistan had a stronger presence of the secular discourses – technicist-managerialism, individualism and American colonialism – than the Islamic one. I will conclude this argument in the next chapter by pointing out a few differences in the secular and Islamic thinking as regards education. I will also note in my concluding remarks that it was socialization in these primarily secular curricula that accounted for the conflicting values exhibited by MBA students in the pursuit of their careers – they used whatever values worked for them, irrespective of their ethical content – for this is what a secular educational system is based upon – independence from religious concerns.

9.0	CHAPTER 9: CONCLUSIONS	342
9.1	Recap of research and its results	342
9.2	Critiquing this research	351
9.2.1	Strengths (including contribution) and limitations of the research topic	351
9.2.2	Strengths and limitations of the theoretical perspective	353
9.2.3	Strengths and limitations of the literature	355
9.2.4	Strengths and limitations of the methodology	356
9.3	Directions for future research	357

CHAPTER 9: CONCLUSIONS

In this last chapter, I would like to recapitulate my research and findings and mention some limitations of my work. I will end with a brief note on the implications of the study and directions for further research on this topic.

9.1 Recap of research and its results

I began this thesis by noting questions about MBA graduates that had concerned me, namely, why they demonstrated particular values, why did ethical issues seem neglected in MBA education although managers affect society in everyday life, and why did MBAs not seem very cognizant of Islamic values, which as a Muslim, I deem to be crucially important for the personal development of business graduates. Reviewing literature on current MBA education, as explained in *chapter 2*, I found the values in the contemporary MBA to be dominated by a technicist-managerialist and the Western, particularly American, mode of thinking. The former discourse marginalized emotional and ethical values by highlighting the objective and rational concerns in MBA curricula, while the latter marginalized or stereotyped other cultures (and their values) to impose its own on the recipient students. The latter state of affairs reminded me of the colonial discourse that had used the same strategies of dominance, stereotyping, and repression to rewrite the culture of the Indian Muslim native from a traditional Muslim ethos to a Western secular one. As I looked into the postcolonial argument (in *chapter 3*) reading critics' comments on Western imperialism in management education, I found it to not only challenge the dominance of the colonial constructs but also to point out to the

marginalization of morality and other cultural values of colonized races, challenge capitalistic ideas of progress and development, and address conflicts in mimicry and hybridity that the colonized people had to contend with. In fact, many of the criticisms raised by postcolonial theory about management education of today seemed similar to those raised against technicist-managerialist thinking by certain management critics. I thus found it appropriate to study my topic with a postcolonial theoretical perspective. In the light of these views I took a broad look at current management education in Pakistan (*chapter 4*). Here I found business schools making several references to Western, particularly American, programmes of study and American multinationals (in their curriculum design, in the careers of their graduates, in their building up of contacts with international universities, etc.).

With this background I began my own study of two of the leading business schools of Pakistan, which I called Pioneer Academy and Leaders Academy. Using in-depth interviews, informed by observational studies and school publications (as detailed in *chapter 5*), I asked business school faculty and students, as well as managers in industry (who were either alumni of these schools or had worked with MBA graduates from these schools) for their views on the values and curricula of their MBA programmes. The idea was to inquire into the work values that were being endorsed in MBA programmes through their syllabi, teaching methodology and cultures, to see how much they were in harmony with Islamic teachings. I did not mean to devalue any of the MBA programmes by critically analyzing their value systems; I sincerely respect their contribution to management education in Pakistan. However, I felt that unless the values endorsed in

these programmes were in harmony with Islamic teachings, they would not be able to address the socio-cultural needs of Pakistan effectively.

In *chapter 6*, I presented the results of this inquiry. They are summarized here:

a) Values about work

These were presented as the four following themes:

- Regarding MBA students' career aspirations, I found that students preferred jobs in multinationals or large local companies, as also suggested by my observations and readings of schools' official publications. Some students also spoke of setting up businesses of their own in future. They sometimes showed an impatience to climb up the corporate ladder. However, there was an acknowledgment of such "*materialistic*" mentality by both students and teachers.
- MBA schools saw their students as 'crème de la crème,' as did the students themselves, their teachers and managers in industry. At the same time, I also noticed a denial of this idea. The sense of pride derived from working in prestigious companies was also observed in industry.
- As far as social responsibility was concerned, respondents did not mention it in their description of preferred careers, nor attest to their schools' highlighting the importance of it. In fact, their schools, according to them, had "*failed*" in their social responsibility by catering primarily to MNCs. This was heard despite the schools' efforts to support financially less privileged students and, as they said, in

producing acceptable graduates for the market. In the corporate sector, social responsibility was generally understood as fair ethical conduct.

- In identifying the kind of professional values that were endorsed in their business schools, students mentioned various kinds of worthwhile and not worthwhile values. They displayed honesty, but also dishonesty; they cooperated, but also competed; if their schools professed discipline, they also became intolerant at times. Thus respondents, whether in academia or industry, seemed to employ whatever values worked for them. Nevertheless, students were criticized in industry, and even by their colleagues and teachers, for lacking in humanitarian concerns and interpersonal skills.

The reason I have notified some similar instances of findings in industry is to enable the readers to see the interrelationship in the values endorsed in the business academia and industry, especially since interaction with industry was keenly sought by both schools.

b) Development of the curricula

- As far as the curricula of the two schools were concerned, they showed a heavy inclination to Western, particularly the American, MBA model. Books and journals used were often Western, particularly American; teaching methodology, especially the use of the case study method, was also imported from the West, mostly from America. Furthermore, encouragement was not always allowed for critique of the curriculum or the teaching methodology. At the same time,

interaction with industry was encouraged, so much so that education was regarded as a commodity on sale in the management market.

c) The non-Islamic (secular) element in the business schools (and organizations)

- As far as the non-Islamic or secular element in schools and organizations was considered, some teachers and managers debated on whether it was or was not hurting the cause of Islam. Teachers, as well as their students, also complained of the difficulty in learning and teaching ethical and religious subjects amidst the core business courses.

In *chapter 7*, I illuminated and critiqued the above mentioned thematic findings in the light of management, postcolonial and Islamic literatures. Materialism and its related concept elitism were criticized in these literatures for leading to greed, selfishness, and problems of balancing work and family lives, some of which was seen in the case of my respondents too. Abandonment of ethical standards too was leading to less concern for others and the society in general, as warned by these critics. When I placed Islamic injunctions alongside my four themes, I saw that some of these values were in harmony with Islam, some only partially so, and some were not. Even values that were, were either not fully endorsed or were counterbalanced by opposing values, thus mitigating their impact.

At this point I would like to remind the reader that the values spoken of in my research were not necessarily originating in the two business schools I chose to study. These schools, as I see them, were acting only as transmitters of these values by endorsing them

through their cultures and curricula. As many of these values were also seen in the Pakistani industrial sector and society in general, they could perhaps have originated there. However, though I have notified such instances, I have not gone into any detail of the topic for I see it beyond the scope of this research.

To let the readers see for themselves the extent to which the values endorsed in the MBA academia were in harmony with Islam, I presented a brief sketch of the Islamic conception of work, in *chapter 8*, in comparison to the contemporary one expressed by my respondents. This comparison made the differences stand out more clearly. The present conception of work, as expressed by my respondents, is criticized by other non-Islamic scholars as well.

After comparing the Islamic and the present conception of work (as expressed by my respondents), I took an overall look at my data, including the four thematic findings and the comments on the curricula and the non-Islamic element in business schools, to look more thoroughly for evidence of technicist-managerialism and colonialism, that I had found in some of my themes. As mentioned earlier, technicist-managerialist thinking distinguishes between the personal and the public, the emotional and the rational, the ethical and the professional, and the religious and the non-religious aspects of work. In a closer look at the research data, I saw further evidence of such thinking in the students' persistent pursuit of material gains, sense of pride in themselves, use of other people to achieve their ends, employing of personal ethical standards in the pursuit of career goals, little concern with personal development or self enhancement and social contribution, and in schools staffs' consideration of education as a commodity for sale. This conclusion was

supported by respondents' recognition of the lack of concern for Islamic subjects and values in their management curricula and their confessions of finding it difficult to learn and teach ethical or religious subjects. Thus this technicist-managerialist thinking seemed to be emanating from a secular philosophy towards education.

Based on a worldview that separates religion from worldly life, secularism not only leads to a technicist thinking towards education, but also results in individualism, as some scholars have suggested. Individualism is a debatable concept. Not only are the definitions of the term understood differently, but the consequences such thinking leads to are also subject to controversy. Some elements of individualism, such as a sense of self-direction and selfishness, relentless pursuit of one's goals, and little concern with personal and social development, were also seen in the values and ideas spoken of by my respondents.

However, efforts have begun to redress some of the adverse consequences of materialist, elitist, and socially irresponsible thinking. Realizing some of these negative consequences of such thinking, that critics deem to be technicist managerialist, people are increasingly trying to balance their academic and professional lives by looking for more socially responsible educational programmes and jobs; academics and professionals are also calling for more ethical and spiritual awareness in management curricula.

Secularism is also known to have contributed to the imperialistic ambitions of colonialism and vice versa. An example of this is the case of the Indian sub-continent, where the colonizers' quest for worldly (secular) gains led to conquest and subjugation of territory,

while pursuit of colonial targets in turn instituted secular agendas in local education. Western, particularly American, imperialism or colonialism was also noticeable in the two MBA programmes I studied – these schools adopted and looked up to American curricula and teaching policies (despite the latter’s marginalization of voices from certain cultures) and perpetuated the American management ideology by adherence to the same thinking (for example, a technicist-managerialist) American MBA programmes have been known to adopt. Moreover, students and schools also expressed a fascination with foreign, often Western, multinational companies and a willingness to cater to them as employers or as producers of graduates for them. This consent to subordination to foreign education and corporate powers seemed to be given because of the material benefit (such as high prestige, an elitist status in management academia and industry) it accrued to the students and schools (an instance of technicist managerialist thinking).

Thus, I believe, technicist-managerialist thinking, which indicated secularism and consequently individualism, crept into the Pakistani MBA curricula from the American model. Stated differently, the values endorsed by the Pakistani MBA curricula reflected technicist-managerialistic, individualistic concerns and American colonialism. Since all of these modes of thinking point to a secular philosophy, it can be said that the values endorsed in the Pakistani MBA programmes were more in harmony with secular thinking than with the Islamic.

Before concluding this topic I would like to explain why I see secularism in contrast with Islam. Islam sees all knowledge, indeed life, as extending beyond the limits of time and space, and therefore having a purpose higher than worldly achievement. It sees the

creation of man for the purpose of worship of one true God. This concept of worship is not restricted to ritual but defines modes of conduct in all spheres of life, including personal, educational, work, and social. God says in the Holy Quran (25:1)

Blessed is He who sent down the Criterion (of right and wrong, i.e. the Quran) to His slave (Prophet Muhammad, pbuh) that he may be a warner to the worlds.

For a Muslim then, the Quran and its demonstration in the words and deeds of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) is thus the standard against which all actions are to be judged. This was what was also concluded at the First Conference on Muslim Education, 1977, in Makkah (Husain and Ashraf, 1979). Secularism, on the other hand, operates within the binds of a worldly order, confined in time and space. Secondly, distinguishing between the religious and non-religious forms of knowledge, secularism does not define an ideal mode of conduct, letting people base their moral judgements on various man-made philosophies. Products of human beings' minds, these philosophies are often short-lived, changeable and conflicting (Sharifi, 1979) and therefore not worthy of uncritical acceptance.

Thus this study answers my initial questions (mentioned in *chapter 1*) by pointing out a reason why MBA graduates exhibited conflicting values and sometimes even expressed this conflict: they were being socialized into a primarily secular value system that often worked independent of Islamic concerns. Hence students were using whatever values worked for them, basing their judgements on their own interpretation of morality (as is the case with the secular work ethic). At times these values showed harmony with Islamic teachings; at other times they ran contrary to them.

I would like to end my discussion with a few quotes I find relevant to my conclusions:

Chaudhry from Pakistan (2003b⁴²) asserts

The educational standards in the country have gone down, not due to lack of intellect, but because of abandonment of the moral and spiritual values, which were once the hallmark of Muslims.

Reflecting on this kind of situation, Boyatzis (2000:14) suggests:

Today, for example, it is accepted that the curriculum ought to address the development not only of knowledge and skills, but also of abilities and values. In other words, our challenge is to educate the whole person, not simply to add more files to a student's mind.

French and Grey (1996) also stress that management needs to be understood 'as a social, political and moral practice, rather than as a set of techniques and skills to be learned and subsequently applied.' Gosling and Mintzberg (2004:21) thus recommend 'a program woven together by values and attitudes, and by truly engaging methods of learning...in truth, the only real kind of integration.'

9.2 Critiquing this research

In the next few paragraphs I will critique my research in terms of its topic, theoretical perspective, literature and methodology.

9.2.1 Strengths (including contribution) and limitations of the research topic

In this research, I have attempted to study some of the values being endorsed in Pakistani MBA programmes. Though there have been several researches on the MBA in general,

⁴² www.pakistaneconomist.com/issue2003/issue06-07/i&e1.htm

none, to my knowledge, have inquired into the Pakistani MBA or comprehensively into the social values endorsed in MBA programmes in general. This research contributes to management knowledge by addressing both these issues. It looks into the day-to-day values exhibited by Pakistani MBAs with regard to their own selves, their careers, their colleagues, and the society at large. This study also points out to the need for studying the Pakistani MBA thoroughly, research on which so far has appeared only in popular business magazines. Moreover, this research has tried to raise questions about the potential social impact of the Pakistani MBA degree by identifying some specific value themes. However, being a broad-based exploratory study, it has not looked into the details of the themes it has highlighted. Although a limitation of this work, this aspect of the study also sets direction for further research in this area.

My purpose in highlighting the values endorsed in two leading MBA programmes of Pakistan is to draw the attention of Pakistani MBA students and educators, as well as recruiters in industry, to the various commendable and not so commendable values being endorsed in these and similar programmes. The ultimate aim of this project is to encourage management educators, curriculum developers, and policy makers to reflect on the potential social impacts of their programmes of study and develop educational programmes that can address socio-cultural needs of the country more effectively, for example, by being more in harmony with the Islamic teachings. I myself would like to take this first step by reorganizing the courses I teach and by including in them the emotional, ethical and social dimensions, especially from an Islamic point of view, that have so far been rare. I would also like to revise my teaching methodology (including class instruction, teaching methods, the system of examination) by critically looking at

the values it could be fostering, such as unhealthy competition, lack of quality in work, inconsideration for peers, and the like. I hope this study will be of use not only to MBA curriculum developers, but also to other educationists who are interested in investigating social impacts of their academic programmes, whether within or outside Pakistan.

9.2.2 Strengths and limitations of the theoretical perspective

This research took a postcolonial perspective towards the study of MBA education in Pakistan. The main value of this perspective to my research was its providing me an academic platform – by allowing me to question dominant discourses and identify marginalized cultures – from where I could make an attempt to (ultimately) recover Islamic values lost in the management education of Pakistan. Equipping me with an understanding of the relationships of domination-subordination and power of ideologies and sensitizing me to recognize issues of marginalization, stereotyping, hybridity, and dualistic constructs, the theory helped me develop my research questions, select my readings from literature and enrich my analysis. Besides, its flexible methodology allowed me to collect data from different sources and analyse it in a relatively open-ended way than that offered by positivistic research approaches. Furthermore, the theory supplemented the context of my study, since Pakistan is a postcolonial country, whose Muslim culture has been affected considerably by its colonial history.

However, my critiquing the management education of the West (from a postcolonial perspective), yet researching through a Western educational apparatus, might appear ironic. I would like to state why I do not see it as such. The postcolonial perspective, as I

see it, does not reject Western knowledge in totality; what it challenges is the Western dominance that excludes all other non-Western cultures from academia. Besides, as JanMohamed and Lloyd say (1997) postcolonial theory (especially Minority Discourse) is not aimed at 'overthrowing' Western knowledge but recovering lost cultures, for example, the Islamic, that Western management knowledge seems to have excluded.

I would also like to clarify my position as an Islamic researcher, conducting research in a non-Islamic seemingly secular educational set-up. I believe, after Prophet Muhammad and Imam Ghazali (pbuh), that worthwhile knowledge should be acquired from wherever it is available and from whomever it is available. This is because Islam sees all knowledge as interrelated (Khusro, 1979; Sharifi, 1979). As opposed to secular philosophy, it does not distinguish between religious and non-religious knowledge and therefore does not forbid the use of 'non-Islamic' knowledge to research 'Islamic' issues. Wisdom lies in extracting the beneficial from the useless or the harmful, and filling in the gaps in one source from knowledge from another (Watt, 1981). Secondly, in contrast to secularism (as mentioned earlier), Islam does not permit acquisition of knowledge only for personal or short-term purposes. It expects the student to use it to satisfy his/her needs, in addition to serving God and His creation (Husain and Ashraf, 1979). In conducting research that integrates knowledge from various sources (management and postcolonial researchers, Islamic teachings and the Holy Quran and the *ahadith* or traditions of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh)) and aiming to raise questions about the social values (both worldly and otherworldly) that MBA programmes are endorsing, I see myself as working from an Islamic, rather than a secular point of view. In fact, this is what I question Pakistani management education through my research as well: for its

using only certain types of knowledge (technicist-managerialist, without paying much attention to emotional and ethical concerns), from only a few sources (Western, primarily American, without making use of knowledges from local or other cultures) and for only limited purposes (material goals to satisfy personal needs, without showing much concern for spiritual development or needs of colleagues or society), thereby distinguishing between the material and the moral, the personal and the social and the religious and the non-religious aspects of life.

9.2.3 Strengths and limitations of the literature

In my literature review, I came across a copious amount of material on the critique of the MBA curriculum, as far as its content was concerned. For example, both the technicist-managerialist as well as the Westernization/Americanization discourses are heavily debated upon in literature. But, as I have mentioned in the introductory chapter of this research, I did not find much data on everyday work values endorsed in MBA programmes, with the exception of some researches on ethical and social orientation of MBA students and occasional references to their entertaining elitist ideas. These researches were useful in assessing the MBA situation in general, but appearing in Western journals, they did not shed specific light on the Pakistani MBA programmes. And I certainly did not find any Pakistani researches on the Pakistani MBA. However, I did see articles in Pakistani magazine websites that commented on the current state of affairs in Pakistani MBA education. Though I have referred to them in my research, I feel that not being based on thorough studies, they are not comparable to other foreign journals or books I have cited. Thus in my write-up on the current MBA situation in the

country, I have used the data provided on the websites and prospectuses of various Pakistani business schools in addition to these magazine articles. However, an advantage of this source was that it gave information on the latest developments in the Pakistani MBA.

Islamic research on values expected of managers also appeared scattered. There were a few random researches on qualities desired in leaders and marketers and on Islamic economic and financial systems, as well as a considerable amount of data on Islamic values in general, but I did not come across an integrated model of *Islamic management*. Thus the Islamic teachings I have referred to in my study are derived at least as much from the classical sources of the Holy Quran and some most celebrated books of *ahadith* as from these researches. In fact, referring to these classical sources strengthened some of my arguments.

9.2.4 Strengths and limitations of the methodology

The case study approach, informed by stakeholder analysis, turned out to be very useful in carrying out an in-depth study of a fairly broad topic that I had set out to inquire about. However, in doing so, I had to focus on a very small part of the MBA system in Pakistan. In a limited time I could look closely at only two MBA programmes in Pakistan (though I attempted to study three but could not obtain permission for studying the third). My analytical method, based on Hycner's (1985) framework of drawing out themes from data offered a valuable tool to explore the open-ended topic of work values.

However, the methodology used in this thesis and the data analysis given in this research are based on my understanding alone. I have not conducted an investigative study to discover a truth but a qualitative study to offer an interpretation. Hence, my influence on my work as a Muslim academic of a postcolonial country, one who is eager to point out and ultimately recover the lost Islamic values in the MBA education of today, also influences my research – from the selection of my topic in the beginning to my conclusions in the end. Another researcher on the same topic could have chosen a different research approach and different research methods to collect a different set of data and submit a different analysis. Hence, I do not claim to provide a statement on the values endorsed in the entire Pakistani MBA system, nor even in my two case studies; I also do not maintain that these MBA programmes are the (exclusive) source of origin of these values. I only shed light, from my vantage point as a postcolonial Muslim academic, on the values *endorsed* in two first tier business schools in the country. However, I suggest that similar observations can be made about other MBA programmes, depending on the similarity of their contexts with my chosen case studies.

9.3 Directions for future research

As mentioned earlier, a major purpose of this study has been to point out to a need for more research on the social aspect of MBA education. I believe there is a need to study each theme individually, for example, individualism or materialism in MBA programmes, the ethical training MBA students receive, and even sub-themes, such as the ‘MNC Discourse’ in the MBA programmes.

Moreover, this study provides ground for further research on the Pakistani MBA, for example, on its educational objectives, its curriculum development, its teaching methodologies, and its socio-cultural impact.

Ultimately, at a higher and more practical level, research can address some of the questions raised by this study, for example, how to provide effective ethical training in MBA programmes or how to reduce the incidence of materialism or elitism in MBA programmes.

The Managing Director of a company, who was an engineer but had attended some courses in management, also believed staunchly in the necessity of a degree in management education for attaining career success: *“Management education takes you to the height, not engineering. You will never find any engineers to be heads of that organization.”* Another of my respondent manager called MBA *“a big thing,”* while some also described it as *“a piece of paper”* or *“a jack of all trades but master of none.”*

BIBLIOGRAPHY

AlQuran (2001) translated by Khan, M.M. and Al-Hilali, M.T., Kingdom of Saudi Arabia: Darussalaam.

Articles and books

AbdulGader, A.H. and AlBuraey, M.A. (1993) 'An Islamic Perspective to Information Technology: Management Implications,' *paper presented at Arab Management Conference*, Bradford, July, 1993.

AbdulRahman, Y. *Lariba Book*. Source: www.lariba.com/lariba-book/chapter2.htm Last accessed on March 7, 2006.

AbdulWahab (2004) 'The Need For Business Schools In Pakistan,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, Aug 16 - 22, 2004.

AbulQuasem, M. (1975) *The Ethics of AlGhazali: A Composite Ethics in Islam*, Malaysia: Central Printing.

Ackroyd, S. 'Methodology for Management and Organization Studies: Some Implications of Critical Realism,' *Unpublished Paper*.

Adam, W. (1997) 'Individualism: New and Old,' Washington: *Public Interest*, Winter, Issue 126, p. 175.

Adler, P. and Adler, P. (1998) 'Observational Techniques' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.), *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage, pp. 79-109.

- Ahmad, A. (1996) 'The Politics of Literary Postcoloniality' in Mongia, P. (ed.) *Contemporary Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, London: Arnold, pp. 276-93.
- Ahmad, F. Z. (2002) 'Institute Of Business Management: Business Support Centre,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, August 26 - September 01, 2002.
- Ahmed, A. S. (1995) 'The Islamization of Knowledge' in Esposito, J. (ed.) *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Modern Islamic World*, New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 425-28.
- Ahmed, S.A. (1998) *Pakistan Society – Islam, Ethnicity and Leadership in South Asia*, Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- AlAli, K. (1998) 'Feminist Pedagogy and the Question of Difference: Understanding Kuwaiti Women's Experiences in Higher Education,' *Doctoral Thesis*, Department of Management Learning, Lancaster University, UK.
- Alavi, H. (1990) 'Authoritarianism and Legitimation of State Power in Pakistan' in Mitra, S.K. (ed.) *The Postcolonial State in Asia – Dialects of Politics and Culture*, New York: Harvester Wheatsheaf, pp. 19-73.
- AlHalveti, S.T.B.A. 'On Arrogance and Humility' Source: www.crescentlife.com/spirituality/arrogance_&_humility.htm Last accessed on March 7, 2006.
- Ali, A. J. (1990) 'Management Theory in a Transitional Society: The Arab's Experience' *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 20(3), USA: White Plains, M. E. Sharpe, Inc.
- Ali, A. J. (1995) 'Cultural Discontinuity and Arab Management Thought,' *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 25(3), USA: White Plains, M. E. Sharpe, Inc.

- Ali, A. J. (1996) 'Organizational Development in the Arab World,' *The Journal of Management Development*, 15(5), Birmingham, Ala.: MCB.
- Ali, A. J. and Camp, R. C. (1995) 'Teaching Management in the Arab World: Confronting Illusions,' *The International Journal of Educational Management*, 9(2), Bradford: MCB.
- Ali, A. J., Camp, R.C. and Gibbs, M. (2000) 'The Ten Commandments Perspective on Power and Authority in Organizations,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 26(4), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel.
- Ali, S.H. (2005) *Islamic Education and Conflict – Understanding the Madrassahs of Pakistan*, University of Vermont and Brown University, USA.
- Alimo-Metcalfe, B. (1995) 'An Investigation of Female and Male Constructs of Leadership,' *Women in Management Review*, 10(2), Bradford: MCB, pp. 3-8.
- Alsop, R. (2005) 'M.B.A. Track: Recruiters Seek M.B.A.s Trained In Responsibility,' *Wall Street Journal* (Eastern edition), New York, December 13, 2005, p. B.6.
- Altheide, D. L. and Johnson, J. M. (1998) 'Criteria for Assessing Interpretive Validity in Qualitative Research' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.), *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Alvesson, M. and Willmott, H. (1996) *Making Sense of Management: A Critical Introduction*, London: Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Amdam, R.P. and Yttri, G. (1998) 'The European Productivity Agency, the Norwegian Productivity Institute and Management Education' in Gourvish, T.R. and Tiratsoo, N. (eds.) *Missionaries and Managers: American Influences on European Management*

Education, 1945-60, Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Amin, S. (1997) *Capitalism in the Age of Globalization – The Management of Contemporary Society*, London: Zed Books.

Amir, S.M. (1989) 'Science Research in Muslim Countries' in Lodhi, M.A.K. (ed.) *Islamization of Attitudes and Practices in Science and Technology*, Herndon, Virginia: International Institute of Islamic Thought and Association of Muslim Scientists and Engineers.

Anderson, J. (1998) 'The British Tradition of Higher Education: The Challenge of National Development' in Talati, J.J., Vellani, C.W., Herberg, P., Sutton, R.A.L., Qureshi, A.F., Pardhan, S. and Bacchus, K. (eds.) *Higher Education: A Pathway to Development*, Karachi: The Aga Khan and Oxford University Press.

Angrosino, M.V. and de Pérez, K.A.M. (2000) 'Rethinking Observation from Methods to Context' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y.S. (eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, second edition, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.

Anonymous (2005), 'The Right School' *Management Today*, October 2005, London, pp. MT6, 3 pgs.

Appiah, K.A (1996) 'Is the Post in Postmodernism the Post in Postcolonialism,' in Mongia, P. (ed.) *Contemporary Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, London: Arnold, pp. 55-71.

Appelgate, J. and Morreale, S.P. (1999) 'Service-Learning in Communication: A Natural Partnership' in Droge, D. and Murphy, B.O. (eds) *Voices of Strong Democracy: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Communication Studies*, Washington: American Association for Higher Education.

Areola, M. (1998) 'Business Education in Pakistan,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, October 26-November 01, 1998.

Source: <http://www.pakistaneconomist.com/database2/cover/c98-8.asp> Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Arksey, H. and Knight, P. (1999) 'Interviewing for Social Scientists: An Introductory Resource with Examples,' London: Sage.

Armond, M. (2001) 'Look Who's Talking: A Postcolonial Critique of the Discourse on International Accounting,' *Ph.D. Dissertation*, Canada: University of Calgary.

Armstrong, R. (1996) 'The Relationship Between Culture and Perception of Ethical Problems in International Marketing,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 15(11), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, p.1199.

Asad, T. (2003) *Formations of the Secular: Christianity, Islam, Modernity*, Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.

Ashcroft, B. Griffiths, G. and Tiffin, H. (1989) *The Empire Writes Back: Theory and Practice in Postcolonial Literatures*, London: Routledge.

Ashcroft, B. Griffiths, G. and Tiffin, H. (eds.) (1995) 'General Introduction,' *The Postcolonial Studies Reader*, London: Routledge.

Atkinson, P. and Coffey, A. (2003) 'Revisiting the Relationship Between Participant observation and interviewing' in Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (eds.) *Postmodern Interviewing*, Thousand Oaks, Sage, pp. 109-222.

Atkinson, P. and Hammersley, M. (1998) 'Ethnography and Participant Observation' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *Strategies of Qualitative Inquiry*, California: Sage.

- Attas, S.M.N. (1979a) 'Introduction' in Attas, S.M.N. (ed) *Aims and Objectives of Islamic Education*, Jaddah: King AbdulAziz University, Hodder and Stoughton, pp. 1-15.
- Attas, S.M.N. (1979b) 'Preliminary Thoughts on the Nature of Knowledge and the Definition and Aims of Education' in Attas, S.M.N. (ed.) *Aims and Objectives of Islamic Education*, Jeddah: King AbdulAziz University, Hodder and Stoughton, pp. 19-47.
- Auken, S.V., Wells, L.G. and Chrysler, E. (2005) 'The Relative Value of Skills, Knowledge, and Teaching Methods in Explaining Master of Business Administration (MBA) Program Return on Investment' *Journal of Education for Business*, 81(1), Washington, D.C.: HELDREF, pp. 41-45.
- Bachen, C.M. (1999) 'Integrating Communication Theory and Practice in Community Settings: Approaches, Opportunities and Ongoing Challenges' in Droge, D. and Murphy, B.O. (eds.) *Voices of Strong Democracy: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Communication Studies*, Washington: American Association For Higher Education
- Badger, A. (1994) 'Contemporary Islamic Movements in the Arab world' in Ahmed, A. S. and Donnan, H. *Islam, Globalization and Postmodernity*, London: Routledge.
- Baetz, M.C. and Sharp, D.J. (2004) 'Integrating Ethics into the Core Business Curriculum: Do Core Teaching Materials do the Job,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 50(1), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, pp. 53-62.
- Baker, R. and Hinton, R. (1999) 'Do Focus Groups Facilitate Meaningful Participation in Social Research?' in Barbour, R.S. and Kitzinger, J. (eds.) *Developing Focus Group Research: Politics, Theory and Practice*, London: Sage, pp. 79-98.
- Bakr, A. A. (1989) 'A Blueprint for the Islamization of Attitude and Practice in Earth Sciences with Special Emphasis on Groundwater Hydrology' in Lodhi, M.A.K. (ed.)

Islamization of Attitudes and Practices in Science and Technology, Herndon, Virginia: International Institute of Islamic Thought and Association of Muslim Scientists and Engineers.

Banarjee, S. B. and Linstead, S. (2001) 'Globalization, Multiculturalism and Other Fictions: Colonialism for the New Millennium,' *Organization*, 8(4), London: Sage, pp. 683-722.

Barazangi, N. H. (1995) 'Educational Reform' in Esposito, J. (ed.) *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Modern Islamic World*, New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 420-25.

Barsoux, J. L. (1989) 'Management Education in France,' in Byrt, W. (ed) *Management Education: An International Survey*, London: Routledge.

Baylis, J. and Smith, S. (eds.) (2001) *The Globalization of World Politics*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bell, D. (1979) *The Cultural Contradictions of Capitalism*, London: Heinemann.

Bennet, C. (1982) 'Protestantism and Corporations' in Williams, O.F. and Houck, J.W. *The Judeo-Christian Vision and the Modern Corporation*, Indiana and London: University of Notre Dame Press.

Berberoglu, B. (1987) *The Internationalization of Capital Imperialism and Capitalist Development on a World Scale*, USA: Praeger.

Bertman, M.A. (1974) *Research Guide in Philosophy*, Morristown, New Jersey: General Learning Press.

Bewley, A. (2001a) 'The Decline and Fall of the Human Being' Source:

www.ourworld.compuserve.com/homepages/ABewley/decline.html Last accessed on

March 13, 2006.

Bewley, A. (2001b) 'The Darkness of the Enlightenment,' Source:

www.ourworld.compuserve.com/homepages/ABewley/darkness.html Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

Bhabha, H. (1994) *The Location of Culture*, London: Routledge.

Bhabha, H. (1997) 'Cultures' Inbetween' in Hall, S. and duGay, P. *Questions of Cultural Identity*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage.

Bhabha, H. (1998) 'The Third Space,' an Interview in Rutherford (ed.) *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*, London: Lawrence and Wishart, pp. 207-21.

Birnbaum, R. (2000) *Management Fads in Higher Education, Where They Come From, What They Do, Why They Fail*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Blunt, P. and Jones, M.L. (1997) 'Exploring the Limits of Western Management Theory in East Asia and Africa,' *Personnel Review*, 26(1/2).

Boje, D. (1996) 'Management Education as a Panoptic Cage' in French, R. and Grey, C. (eds) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage, pp.172-95.

Boulding, K.E. (1971) 'The Economics of the Coming Spaceship Earth' in Barr, J. (ed) *The Environmental Handbook*, Friends of the Earth.

Bourdieu, P. and Passeron, J.C. (1990) *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture*, California: Sage.

Boyatzis, R.E. (2000) 'Management education: Coming of Age' *Selections* 16(2), Santa Monica, pp. 14-5.

Boyatzis, R.E., Cowen, S.S., Kolb, D.A. and associates (1995) *Innovation in Professional Education – Steps on a Journey From Teaching to Learning*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- Bradley, H. and Hebson, G. (1999) 'Breaking the Silence: The Need to Rearticulate Class,' *The International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 19(9-11), Partington.
- Brigg, C.L. (2003) 'Interviewing: Power/Knowledge, and Social Inequality' in Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (eds) *Postmodern Interviewing*, Thousand Oaks: Sage, pp. 243-54.
- Brinkley, A. (2005) 'Ethics and Ethos: The Timeless Importance of Character,' *Executive Speeches*, Dayton, 19(5), pp. 21-26.
- Bryman, A. (2001) *Social Research Methods*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bryman, A. and Bell, E. (2003) *Business Research Methods*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bulmer, M. (ed) (1977) *Sociological Research Methods: An Introduction*, London: Macmillan.
- Burgess, Y. (1996) *The Myth of Progress*, Glasgow: Wild Goose.
- Burgoyne, J. G. (1994) 'Stakeholder Analysis' in Cassell, C. and Symon, G. (eds.) *Qualitative Methods in Organizational Research: A Practical Guide*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage, pp. 187-207.
- Burgoyne, J.G. and Jackson, B. (1997) 'The Arena Thesis: Management Development as a Pluralistic Meeting Point' in Burgoyne, J. and Reynolds, M. (eds.) *Management Learning: Integrating Perspectives in Theory and Practice*, London: Sage, pp. 54-70.
- Burgoyne, J.G. (1995) 'The Case for an Optimistic, Constructivist and Applied Approach to Management Education: A Response to Grey and Mitev,' *Management Learning*, 26(1), London: Sage, pp. 91-96.
- Burke, L.A. and More, T.E. (2003) 'A Perennial Dilemma in OB Education: Engaging the Traditional Student,' *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 2(1).

- Burrell, G. and Morgan, G. (1979) *Sociological Paradigms and Organizational Analysis*, London: Heinemann.
- Burrell, G. (2002) 'Twentieth-Century Quadrilles: The Aristocracy, Owners, Managers and Professionals,' *Unpublished Paper*.
- Business 2.0* (2005) 'The ROI on Your MBA: We Survey the Country's Top Business Schools to Tell You How Good an Investment They Really Are' 6(8), San Francisco, p. 99.
- Calas, M.B. and Smircich, L. (1999) 'Past Postmodernism? Reflections and Tentative Directions,' *Academy of Management Review*, 24(4), Mississippi State.
- Caldas, M.P. and Alcadipani, R. (2003) 'Postcolonialism in Latin American Management: The Genesis and Trail of North American Reference in Brazilian Culture and Management,' *paper presented at the Third Critical Management Studies Conference*, Lancaster University, July 2003.
- Carroll, M.C. and Stanfield, J.R. (2003) 'Social Capital, Karl Polanyi, and American Social and Institutional Economics,' *Journal of Economic Issues*, 37(2), Lincoln, p. 397.
- Castea, B. (2000) 'Presentations of Human Diversity in Mainstream Management Education: Critique and Development,' *Ph.D. Thesis*, Lancaster University.
- Cavanaugh, J.M. and Prasad, A. (1996) 'Critical Theory and Management Education: Some Strategies for the Critical Classroom' in French, R. and Grey, C. (eds.) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage, pp. 76-93.
- Chapra, M.U. (1992) *Islam and the Economic Challenge*, The Islamic Foundation, UK and International Institute of Islamic Thought, USA.
- Chaudhry, M.B. (2003a) 'Business Education: Studies On Local Enterprises,' *Pakistan*

and Gulf Economist, January 20-26, 2003. Source: www.pakistaneconomist.com. Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Chaudhry, M.B. (2003b) 'Education-Industry Linkages For Economic Growth,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, February 10-23, 2003. Source: www.pakistaneconomist.com/issue2003/issue06-07/i&e1.htm Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Choudhry, G.W. (1988) *Pakistan – Transition from Military to Civilian Rule*, Scorpion Pub.

Chow, R. (1996) 'Where Have All the Natives Gone?' in Mongia, P. (ed.) *Contemporary Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, London: Arnold, pp.122-46.

Christie, P.M.J., Kwon, I.G., Stoeberl, P.A. and Baumhart, R. (2003) 'A Cross-Cultural Comparison of Ethical Attitudes of Business Managers: India, Korea and the United States,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 46(3), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, pp. 263-287.

Clegg, S.R., Linstead, S. and Sewell, G. (2000) 'Only Penguins: A Polemic on Organization Theory from the Edge of the World,' *Organization Studies*, volume 21, 20th Birthday and Millennium Crackers, Berlin, pp. 103-17.

Clegg, S. R. and Ross-Smith, A. (2003) 'Revising the Boundaries: Management Education and Learning in a Postpositivist World,' *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 2 (1).

Cooper, D.E. (1996) *World Philosophy – An Historical Introduction*, Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell.

Cope, P. and I'Anason (2003) 'Forms of Exchange: Education, Economics and the Neglect of Social Contingency,' *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 51(3), pp. 219-

32.

Cornbridge, S. (1994) 'PostMarxism and Postcolonialism: The Needs and Rights of Distant Strangers' in Booth, D. (ed.) *Rethinking Social Development: Theory, Research and Practice*, Harlow: Longman Scientific and Technical, pp. 90-177.

Creswell, J.W. (1994) *Research Design: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*, Sage.

Cunningham, P.M. 'Critical Pedagogy and the Implications for Human Resource Development,' *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 6(2), San Francisco, p. 226.

Currie, G and Knights, D. (2000) 'Towards a Critical Pedagogy in MBA Education,' *paper presented at the second Connecting Learning and Critique Conference*, Lancaster University, pp. 87-105.

Currie, G and Knights, D. (2003) 'Reflecting on a Critical Pedagogy in MBA Education,' *Management Learning*, 34(1), pp. 27-49.

Danmoyer, R. (2002) 'Generalizability and the Single-Case Study' in Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P. (eds.) *Case Study Method*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage, pp. 45-68.

Davies, I.K. (1976) *Objectives in Curriculum Design*, London, New York: McGraw Hill.

Debold, E. (2005) 'The Business of Saving the World,' *Enlightenment Magazine*, Business Issue, March-May, 2005.

De Lopez, R.S. (2001) 'Education Exchange,' *Business Mexico*, 11(7), Mexico City.

Denison, D., Lief, C. and Ward, J.L. (2004) 'Culture in Family-Owned Enterprises: Recognizing and Leveraging Unique Strengths,' *Family Business Review*, 17(1), p. 61.

Denscombe, M. (1998) *The Good Research Guide*, Buckingham, Philadelphia, Pa.: Open University Press.

- Denzin, K. and Lincoln, Y. (eds.) (1998a) *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Denzin, K. and Lincoln, Y. (eds.) (1998b) *The Landscape of Qualitative Research*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Deutscher, I. (1977) 'Asking Questions and Listening to Answers: A Review of Some Sociological Precedents and Problems' in Bulmer, M. *Sociological Research Methods*, London: Macmillan.
- Dick, G. and Metcalfe, B. (2001) 'A Comparative Study of Police Officers and Civilian Staff,' *The International Journal of Public-Sector Management*, 14(2), 111-28.
- Dirlik, A. (1996) 'The Postcolonial Aura: Third World Criticism in the Age of Global Capitalism,' in Mongia, P. (ed) *Contemporary Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, London: Arnold, pp. 294-320.
- Dirlik, A., Bahl, V. and Gran, P. (2000) *History After the Three Worlds: Post Eurocentric Historiographies*, Lanham, Md.: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Dolan, K. A. (1997) 'Kinder, Gentler M.B.As,' *Forbes*, 159(11), pp. 39-40.
- Droge, D. and Murphy, B.O. (eds) (1999) *Voices of Strong Democracy: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Communication Studies*, Washington: American Association for Higher Education.
- Dugan, M.K., Payn, B., Grady, W.R. Johnson, T.R. and Baydar, N (1998) 'The New Values of MBAs: Myth or Reality?' *Selections* 14(2), Santa Monica, pp. 10-18.
- Eagleton, T. (1994a) *Ideology*, London: Longman.
- Eagleton, T. (1994b) *Ideology*, London: Verso.
- Eckersley, R. (2004) 'A New World View Struggles to Emerge' *The Futurist*, 38(5),

Washington, p. 20.

Edwards, A.D. and Westgate, D.P.G. (1994) *Investigating Classroom Talk*, second edition, London, Washington D.C.: The Falmer Press.

Ehrensals, K.N. (2002) 'Making Managers: Towards an Understanding of How Textbooks, Lectures and Management Case Studies Interact to Inculcate Linguistic and Managerial Habitus in Undergraduate Business Students,' *Conference Paper Presented at Cambridge University*, pp. 137-45.

Ellis, C. and Berger, L. (2003) 'Their Story / My Story / Our Story – Including the Researcher's Experience in Interview Research' in Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (eds.) *Postmodern Interviewing*, Thousand Oaks: Sage, pp. 157-83.

Epstein, E. M. (1999) 'The Continuing Quest for Accountable, Ethical, and Humane Corporate Capitalism,' *Business and Society*, 38(3), pp. 253-67.

Fagiano, D. (1997) 'Global Growth Amid Retrenchment,' *Management Review*, 86(4), p. 23.

Fairclough, N. (2003) *Analyzing Discourse – Textual Analysis for Social Research*, London: Routledge.

Fanon, F. (1970) *Black Skin, White Masks*, translated by Charles Markmann, London: Paladin.

Farquhar, C. (with Rita Das) (1999) 'Are focus groups suitable for *sensitive* topics?' in Barbour, R.S. and Kitzinger, J. (eds) *Developing Focus Group Research: Politics, Theory and Practice*, London: Sage, pp. 47-63.

Fineman, S. and Gabriel, Y. (1994) 'Paradigms of Organizations: An Exploration in Textbook Rhetorics,' *Organization*, 1(2), London: Sage, pp. 375-99.

- Finer, J. (2001) 'A Question of Degree' *Far Eastern Economic Review*, 164(47), Hong Kong, p. 78, 1 pg.
- Fleetwood, S. 'Critical Realism in Organization and Management Studies: A Critique of Science/Scientism and Poststructuralism,' *Unpublished Paper*.
- Fontana, A. and Frey, J. H (1998) 'Interviewing: The Art of Science' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Fox, S. (1994) 'Debating Management Learning: II,' *Management Learning*, Sage Pub., London, 25(4), 579-97.
- Fox, S. (2001) *Research Methods Module Handouts and Lecture Notes*, MA in Human Resource Development and Management Learning, Lancaster University Management School.
- Francis, J. and Globerman, S. (1992) 'The Internationalization of Management Textbooks: A Survey of the International Components of North American Management Textbooks and Support Materials' in Rugman, A.M. and Stanbury, W.T. (eds.) *Global Perspective: Internationalizing Management Education*, University of British Columbia.
- Freire, P. (1975) *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, Penguin Education.
- French, R. and Grey, C. (1996) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage.
- Frenkel, M. and Shenhav, Y. (2003) 'Decolonizing Organization Theory: Between Orientalism and Occidentalism,' *paper presented at the Third Critical Management Studies Conference*, Lancaster University, July 2003.
- Frey, D. E. (1998) 'Individualist Economic Values and Self-interest: The Problem in the Puritan Ethic,' 17(14), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, p. 1573.

- Friga, P.N., Beths, R.A. and Sullivan, R.S. (2003) 'Changes in Graduate Management Education and New Business School Strategies for the Twenty First Century, *American Management Learning and Education*, 2(3).
- Galbraith, J.K. and Salinger, N. (1978) *Almost Everyone's Guide to Economics*, Penguin.
- Gary, K. (2003) 'An Integrated Approach to Character Education in an Alternative High School,' *Current Issues in Education*, 6(18), Arizona: Arizona State University.
- Gatto, J. T 'We Need Less School, Not More – Families, Communities, Networks and the Proposed Enlargement of Schooling' Source: www.spinninglobe.net/gattopage.htm Last accessed on March 13, 2006.
- Gee, J. P. (1996) *Social Linguistics and Literacies: Ideology in Discourse*, London, Bristol, PA: Taylor and Francis.
- Gemelli, G. (1998) 'International Strategies and National Issues: The *Comitato Nazionale per la Produttività*' and Its networks' in Gourvish, T.R. and Tiratsoo, N. (eds.) *Missionaries and Managers: American Influences on European Management Education, 1945-60*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Gerholm, T. (1994) 'Two Muslim Intellectuals in the Postmodern West: A. Ahmed and Ziauddin Sardar' in Ahmed, A. S. and Donnan, H. (eds.) *Islam, Globalization and Postmodernity*, London: Routledge.
- Giroux, H. (1997) *Pedagogy and the politics of hope: Theory, culture and schooling: A Critical Reader*, Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Golden-Biddle, K. and Locke, K. (1997) *Composing Qualitative Research*, thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P. (eds.) (2002) *Case Study Method*, London:

Thousand Oaks; California: Sage.

Gosling, J. and Mintzberg, H. (2004) 'The Education of Practicing Managers,' *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 45(4), Cambridge, pp. 19-22.

Goulet, D. (1982) 'Goals in Conflict: Corporate Success and Global Justice' in Williams, O.F. and Houck, J.W. *The Judeo-Christian Vision and the Modern Corporation*, Indiana and London: University of Notre Dame Press.

Green, J. and Hart, L. (1999) 'The Impact of Context on Data' in Barbour, R.S. and Kitzinger, J. (eds.) *Developing Focus Group Research: Politics, Theory and Practice*, pp. London: Sage, 21-35.

Greer, S. (1977) 'On the Selection of Problems' in Bulmer, M. (ed.) *Sociological Research Methods*, London: Macmillan, pp. 55-64.

Greer, S. and Patel, C. (2000) 'The Issue of Australian Indigenous World-Views and Accounting,' *Accounting, Auditing and Accountability*, 13(3), p.307.

Grey, C. (2002) 'The Cultural and Political Meanings of Management Education and Their Implications for Critical Management Education,' *conference paper presented at Cambridge University*, pp. 185-92.

Grey, C., Knights, D. and Willmott, H. (1996) 'Is Critical Pedagogy of Management Possible?' in French, R. and Grey, C. (eds.) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage, pp. 94-110.

Grey, C. and Mitev, N. (1995a) 'Management Education: A Polemic,' *Management Learning*, 26(1), London: Sage, pp. 73-90.

Grey, C. and Mitev, N. (1995b) 'Neutrality, Critique and Quality: A Reply to Burgoyne, McAulay and King' *Management Learning*, 26(1), London: Sage, pp. 103-07.

- Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (2003a) 'From the Individual Interview to the Interview Society' in Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (eds.) *Postmodern Interviewing*, Thousand Oaks: Sage, pp. 21-49.
- Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (2003b) 'Active Interviewing' in Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (eds.) *Postmodern Interviewing*, Thousand Oaks: Sage, pp. 67-80.
- Hall, S. (ed.) (1994) 'The Question of Cultural Identity' in *The Polity Reader in Cultural Theory*, Cambridge: Polity Press, pp. 119-25.
- Hall, S. (1996) 'When Was the Post-colonial? Thinking at the Limit' in Chambers, I. and Curti, L. (eds.) *The Postcolonial Question: Common Skies, Divided Horizons*, London, New York: Routledge, pp. 242-60.
- Hall, S. (1998) 'Cultural Identity and Diaspora' in Rutherford, J. (ed) *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*, London: Lawrence and Wishart, pp. 222-8.
- Hameed, A. (2002) 'Distance Learning and Business Education,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, March 18-24, 2002.
- Hammersley, M. (1997) *Social Research: Philosophy, Politics and Practice*, California: Sage.
- Hammersley, M., Gomm, R. and Foster, P. (2002) 'Case Study and Theory,' in Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P. (eds.) *Case Study Method*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage.
- Haq, M. and Haq, K. (1998) *Human Development in South Asia*, Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Hashim, A.M. (2003) 'The Concept of Competition and Award in Islam,' *Arab Law Quarterly*, 18(3-4), Leiden: Koninklijke Brill NV, pp.309-25.

- Heath, E. (2002) *Morality and the Market: Ethics and Virtue in the Conduct of Business*, Boston, Mass: McGraw Hill.
- Heaton, C.A.N and McWhinney, G. (1999) 'Women in Management: The Case of MBA Graduates' *Women in Management Review*, 14(4) Bradford, p. 136.
- Helms, M.M., Alvis, J.M. and Willis, M. (2005) 'Planning and Implementing Shared Teaching: An MBA Team-Teaching Case Study' *Journal of Education for Business*, 81(1), Washington, D.C.: HELDREF, pp. 29-34.
- Henerson, M. E., Morris, L.L. and Fitz-Gibbon, G.T. (1988), *How to Measure Attitudes*, California: Sage.
- Henwood, K.L. and Pidgeon, N.F. (1997) 'Qualitative Research and Psychological Theorizing' in Hammersley, M. (ed) *Social Research: Philosophy, Politics and Practice*, California: Sage, pp. 14-32.
- Hirschman, E. C. (2003) 'Men, Dogs, Guns and Cars: The Semiotics of Rugged Individualism,' *Journal of Advertising*, 32(1), p. 9.
- Hodder, I. (1998) 'The Interpretation of Documents and Material Culture' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds) *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Hofstede, G. (1984) *Culture's Consequences: International Differences in Work-Related Values*, Beverly Hills: Sage.
- Hofstede, G. (1993) 'Cultural Constraints in Management Theories,' *Academy of Management Executive*, 7(1).
- Hollway, W. (1989) *Subjectivity and Method in Psychology: Gender, Meaning and Science*, London: Sage.

- Holt, P.M., Lambton, A.K.S. and Lewin, B. (1970) *The Cambridge History of Islam*, volume 2, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hoogvelt, A. (1997) *Globalization and the postcolonial world – The New Political Economy of Development*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hossain, S.M. (1979) 'A Plea for a Modern Islamic University: Resolution of the Dichotomy' in in Attas, S.M.N. (ed) *Aims and Objectives of Islamic Education*, Jeddah: King AbdulAziz University, Hodder and Stoughton, pp. 91-103.
- Huberman, A.M., and Matthew, B.M (1998) 'Data Management and Analysis Methods' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Huczynski, A. A. (1993) 'Explaining the Succession of Management Fads,' *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 4(2), pp. 443-63.
- Hughes, C. (1999) 'Learning to be Intellectually Insecure: The Effects of Reflexive Practice,' *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 1 (4), pp. 281-96.
- Hughes, C. (2000) 'Is it Possible to be a Feminist Manager in the Real World of Further Education?' *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 24(2).
- Hughes, C. 'Defining the Field,' *chapter in a forthcoming book*.
- Hulme, V.A. (2004) 'The MBA Boom' *The China Business Review*, 31(1), Washington, pp. 24-8.
- Husain, S.S. and Ashraf, S.A. (1979) *Crisis in Muslim Education*, Jeddah: King AbdulAziz University, Hodder and Stoughton.
- Hussaini, M. 'Islamic Attitude and Practice in Food and Nutritional Sciences' in Lodhi, M.A.K. (ed.) (1989) *Islamization of Attitudes and Practices in Science and Technology*,

Herndon, Virginia: International Institute of Islamic Thought and Association of Muslim Scientists and Engineers.

Hycner, R. (1985) 'Some Guidelines for the Phenomenological Analysis of Interview Data,' *Human Studies* 8, Netherlands.

Iqbal, M. (2004) *Islam and Science*, Lahore: Suhail Academy.

Ismail, Y. (1993) 'Unity in business and ethical considerations,' *paper presented at Arab Management Conference*, Bradford, July 1993.

Jabr, H. (1993) 'Financial Management in Islam,' *paper presented at Arab Management Conference*, Bradford, July 1993.

JanMohammad, A. and Lloyd, D. (1997) 'Toward a Theory of Minority Discourse: What is to be Done?' in Moore-Gilbert, B., Stanton, G. and Maley, W. (eds.) *Postcolonial Criticism*, London: Longman, pp. 234-47.

Jary, D. and Jary, J. (1991) *Collins Dictionary of Sociology*, Glasgow: HarperCollins.

Jaya, P. (2001) 'Do We Really "Know" and "Profess"?: Decolonizing Management Knowledge,' *Organization*, 8(2), London: Sage, pp. 227-33.

Jessop, B. (2002) *The Future of the Capitalist State*, Oxford: Polity Press.

Jones, D.E. and Jones, R.W. (1982) *Educational Policy Developments in Pakistan: Quest for a National Program* in Ahmed, M. (ed.) *Contemporary Pakistan: Politics, Economy and Society*, Karachi: Royal Book Co.

Kaemerle, K. (2003) 'Sustainability Trends in Business Education,' *Emmaus*, 25(4).

Kallinikos, J. (1996) 'Mapping the Intellectual Terrain of Management Education' in French, R. and Grey, C. (eds.) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage, pp. 36-53.

Kamal, R. (2002) 'Business Schools - Step Well Taken,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, September 16-22, 2002.

Source: <http://www.pakistaneconomist.com/issue2002/issue37/etc5.htm> Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Kamoche, K. (2000) 'Developing Managers: The Functional, the Symbolic, the Sacred and the Profane,' *Organization Studies*, 21(4), 747-74.

Kazmi, S.H. (1999) 'The Leading Business Schools of Pakistan,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, October 25-31, 1999.

Source: <http://www.pakistaneconomist.com/issue1999/issue43/cover.htm> Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Kazmi, S.H. (2000) 'The Leading Business Schools of Pakistan,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, September 25-October 01, 2000.

Source: <http://www.pakistaneconomist.com/database2/cover/c2000-39.asp> Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Kazmi, S.H. (2001a) 'The Leading Business Schools of Pakistan,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, August 13-19, 2001.

Source: <http://www.pakistaneconomist.com/database2/cover/c2001-49.asp> Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Kazmi, S.H. (2001b) 'Trying to Further Improve the Quality of Business Education: An Interview with Wali Durrani,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, August 13-19, 2001.

Source: <http://www.pakistaneconomist.com/issue2001/issue33/cover3.htm> Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Kazmi, S.H. (2002) 'The Leading Business Schools of Pakistan,' *Pakistan and Gulf*

Economist, August 26-September 01, 2002.

Source: <http://www.pakistaneconomist.com/database2/cover/c2002-48.asp> Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Kellie, J. (2003) 'Management Education and Management Development – Widening Participation or Narrowing Agenda,' *paper presented at the Third Critical Management Studies Conference*, Lancaster University, July 2003.

Khadra, B. (1990) 'The Prophetic-Caliphal Model of Leadership: An Empirical Study,' *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 20(3), USA: White Plains M. E. Sharpe.

Khilji, S. (2001) 'HRM in Pakistan' in Budhwar, P.S. and Debrah, Y.A. (eds.) *HRM in Developing Countries*, London: Routledge.

Khilji, S. (1999) 'An Empirical Study of HRM in a Developing Country – The Case of Banking Industry of Pakistan,' *Doctoral Thesis*, University of Cambridge,.

Khuri, R. (1998) *Freedom, modernity and Islam_ Towards a creative synthesis*, London: The Athlone Press.

Khusro, A.M. (1977) 'Education in the Islamic Society' in *Aims and Objectives of Islamic Education*, Jaddah: King AbdulAziz University, Hodder and Stoughton.

Kiesler, C.A., Nisbett, R.E. and Zanna, M. P. (1973) 'On Inferring One's Beliefs from One's Behaviour' in Warren, N. and Jahoda, M. (eds.) *Attitudes: Selected Readings*, Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Kincheloe, J.L. and McLaren, P. (1998b) 'Rethinking Critical Theory and Qualitative Research,' in Denzin, K. and Lincoln, Y. (eds.) *The Landscape of Qualitative Research*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.

- King, M. (1995) 'Quality and Management Education: A Response to Grey and Mitev,' *Management Learning*, 26(1), London: Sage, pp.101-02.
- Kipping, M. and Nioche, J.P. (1998) 'Much Ado About Nothing? The US Productivity Drive and Management Training in France, 1945-60' in Gourvish, T.R. and M, N. (eds.) *Missionaries and Managers: American Influences on European Management Education, 1945-60*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Kitzinger, J. and Barbour, R.S. (1999) 'Introduction: The Challenge and Promise of Focus Groups' in Barbour, R.S. and Kitzinger, J. (eds.) *Developing Focus Group Research: Politics, Theory and Practice*, London: Sage, pp. 1-20.
- Kolakowski, L. (1997) 'An Overall View of Positivism' in Hammersley, M. (ed) *Social Research: Philosophy, Politics and Practice*, California: Sage, pp. 1-8.
- Kraut, A. I. and Korman, A.K. (eds.) (1999) *Evolving Practices in Human Resource Management: Responses to a Changing World of Work*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Krueger, R.A. (1994) *Focus Groups: A Practical Guide for Applied Research*, second edition, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Kumar, J. and Usunier, J.C. (2001) 'Management Education in a Globalizing World: Lessons from the French Experience,' *Management Learning*, 32(3), US: Thousand Oaks.
- Kumar, R. (2004) 'Bramanical Idealism, Anarchical Individualism, and the Dynamics of Indian Negotiating Behaviour,' *International Journal of Cross Cultural Management*, 4(1), London, pp. 39-58.
- Lataif, L.E., Mintzberg, H., Leonard, E.W., Saka, B., Steele, L., Haruyama, A., Mitroff, I., Hendry, J., Wiseman, C., White, J., Sokolow, D. and Miller, H. (1992) 'MBA: Is the

Traditional Model Doomed?' *Harvard Business Review*, 70(6).

Law, J. (2004) 'Qualitative Methods in the Social Sciences,' *Lecture Handouts* Lancaster University, February/March, 2004.

Lazarsfeld, P. (1977) 'Evidence and Inference in Social Research' in Bulmer, M. (ed) *Sociological Research Methods*, London: Macmillan, pp. 78-90.

Leavitt, H.J. (2001) 'Socializing Our MBAs: Total Immersion? Managed cultures? Brainwashing?' *California Management Review*, pp. 127-43.

Lee, R.V., Fabish, L. and McGraw, N. (2004) 'The Value of Corporate Values,' a *Booz Allen Hamilton/Aspen Institute Survey*.

Leiser, B.M. (1982) 'The Rabbanic Tradition and Corporate Morality' in Williams, O.F. and Houck, J.W. *The Judeo-Christian Vision and the Modern Corporation*, Indiana and London: University of Notre Dame Press.

Lieberson, S. (2002) 'Small N's and Big Conclusions' in Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P. (eds.) *Case Study Method*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage.

Lincoln, Y.S. and Guba (2002) 'The Only Generalization is There is No Generalization' in Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P. (eds.) *Case Study Method*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage.

Lodhi, M. A. K. (1989) 'The Making of a Scientist: The Islamizing of a Muslim Scientist' in Lodhi, M.A.K. (ed) *Islamization of Attitudes and Practices in Science and Technology*, Herndon, Virginia: International Institute of Islamic Thought and Association of Muslim Scientists and Engineers.

Loomba, A. (1998) *Colonialism-Postcolonialism: The New Critical Idiom*, London: Routledge.

- Lorbiecki, A. and Jack, G. (2002) 'Learning, Resisting and Decolonizing Management Knowledge: Toward an Inclusive Management Education, *Conference Paper* presented at Cambridge University, pp. 287-301.
- Lowe, L. Mills, A. and Mullen, J. (2002) 'Gendering the Silences: Psychoanalysis, Gender and Organization Studies' *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 17(5).
- Mahmood, Q. M. (1985) *Islamic Encyclopaedia*, Karachi: Shahkar Book Foundation.
- Manzoor, P. 'Desacralizing Secularism' Source: www.algonet.se/~pmanzoor/Des-Sec.html Last accessed on March 13, 2006.
- Marcus, G. (1998) 'What Comes (Just) After 'Post'? The Case of Ethnography' in Denzin, K. and Lincoln, Y. (eds.) *The Landscape of Qualitative Research*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage, 383-406.
- Marshall, J. (1999) 'Living Life as Inquiry,' *Systematic Practice and Action Research*, 12(2), Centre for Action Research in Professional Practice: University of Bath, pp. 155-71.
- Mason, J. (1998) *Qualitative Researching*, London: Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- McDonald, G.M. (2004) 'A Case Example: Integrating Ethics into the Academic Business Curriculum,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 54, Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, pp. 371-84.
- McGlade, J. (1998) 'The US Technical Assistance and Productivity Program and the Education of Western European Managers, 1947-58' in Gourvish, T.R. and Tiratsoo, N. (eds.) *Missionaries and Managers: American Influences on European Management Education, 1945-60*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Means, G. and Schneider, D. (2000) *Metacapitalism: The e-business revolution and the*

Design of the Twenty First Century Companies and Markets, New York: John Wiley and Sons.

Mehar, A. (2004) 'Creation of Knowledge in Business Schools,' *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, February 23-9, 2004. Source: www.pakistaneconomist.com. Last accessed on April 6, 2006.

Metcalfe, B.D. and Rees, C.J. (2005) 'Theorizing Advances in International Human Resource Development,' *Human Resource Development International*, 8(4), pp. 449-65.

Mickhail, G. and Ostrovsky, A. (2005) 'The Metacapitlaim Quest,' *Journal of American Academy of Business*, 6(1), Cambridge, Hollywood, pp. 290-8.

Mies, M. (1991) 'Women's Research or Feminist Research? The Debate Surrounding Feminist Science and Methodology' (translated by Any Spencer) in Fonow, F.M. and Cook, J.A. (eds.) *Beyond Methodology – Feminist Scholarship as Lived Research*, Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 60-84.

Mies, M. (1997) 'Towards a Methodology for Feminist Research' in Hammersley, M. (ed) *Social Research: Philosophy, Politics and Practice*, California: Sage, pp. 64-81.

Miller, D.L. (1967) *Individualism: Personal Achievement and the Open Society*, Austin and London: University of Texas Press.

Mills, A.J. and Hatfield, J. (1999) 'From Imperialism to Globalization: Internationalization and Management text' in Clegg, S.R., Ibarra-Colado, E. and Bueno-Rodriquez, L. (eds.) *Global Management: Universal Theories and Local Realities*, California: Sage, pp. 37-67.

Minerd, J. (1998) 'The New Individualism,' *The Futurist*, 32(9), Washington, p.12.

Minkes, A.L., Small, A.W. and Chatterjee, S.R. (1999) 'Leadership and Business Ethics:

- Does It Matter? Implications for Management,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 20(4), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel.
- Mir, S. (1986) *Religion and Politics in Pakistan* in Engineer, A.A. (ed.) *Islam in Asia*.
- Mitroff, I.I. and Denton, E.A. (1999) *A Spiritual Audit of Corporate America*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Mohanty, C.T. (1994) 'On Race and Voice: Challenges for Liberal Education in the 1990s' in Giroux, H.A. and McLaren, P. (eds.), *Between Borders – Pedagogy and the Politics of Cultural Studies*, London: Routledge, pp. 145-66.
- Mongia, P. (1996) 'Introduction' in Mongia, P. (ed.) *Contemporary Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, London: Arnold, pp.1-18.
- Moore, P. (2004) 'Rethinking the Idea of Profit in Professional Communication and Cultural Capitalism,' *Journal of Business and Technical Communication*, 18(2), Thousand Oaks, pp. 233-46.
- Moore-Gilbert, B., Stanton, G. and Maley, W. (1997) *Postcolonial Criticism*, London: Longman.
- Morris, M.H., Davis, D.L. and Allen, J.W. (1994) 'Fostering Corporate Entrepreneurship: Cross-Cultural Comparisons of the Importance of Individualism Versus Collectivism,' *Journal of International Business Studies*, 25(1), Washington, p. 65.
- Mort, M. (2004) 'Qualitative Methods in the Social Sciences,' *Lecture Handouts*, Lancaster University, February 2004.
- Moulette, A. (2003) 'Crossing Identity – Reviewing the Conceptualization of Shared National Identities,' *paper presented at the Third Critical Management Studies Conference*, Lancaster University, July 2003.

- Murad, A.K. (2002) 'Faith in the Future: Islam After the Enlightenment,' *First Annual Altaf Gauhar Memorial Lecture*, Islamabad, December 23, 2002. Source: <http://www.masud.co.uk/ISLAM/ahm/postEnlight.htm>
- Murphy, M.G. and Davey, K.M. (2002) 'Ambiguity, Ambivalence and Indifference in Organizational Values,' *Human Resource Management Journal*, 12(1), London, pp.17-32.
- Musson, G. and Cohen, L. (1999) 'Understanding Language Processes: A Neglected Skill in the Management Curriculum,' *Management Learning*, 30(1).
- Myers, G. (2004) 'Qualitative Methods in the Social Sciences,' *Lecture Handouts*, Lancaster University, February and March, 2004.
- Myers, G. and Macnaghten, P. (1999) 'Can Focus Groups Be Analyzed as Talk?' in Barbour, R.S. and Kitzinger, J. (eds.) *Developing Focus Group Research: Politics, Theory and Practice*, London: Sage, pp. 172-85.
- Nasir, N.A. (undated) *Islami Saqafat*, Lahore: Ferozsons.
- Nasr, S.H. (2000) *Islamic Science – An Illustrated Study*, Lahore: Sohail Academy.
- Novak, M. (1990) *Toward a Theology of the Corporation*, Washington: AEI Press.
- Nwanko, S. (2000) 'Assessing the Marketing Environment in Sub-Saharan Africa: Opportunities and Threats Analysis,' *Marketing Intelligence and Planning*, 18(3) Bradford.
- O'Hara, P.A. (2004) 'Cultural Contradictions of Global Capitalism,' *Journal of Economic Issues*, Lincoln, 38(2), p. 413.
- Oppenheim, A. N. (1992) *Questionnaire Design, Interviewing and Attitude Measurement*, London: Pinter.

- Parameswaran, R. (1999) 'Western Romance Fiction as English-Language Media in Postcolonial India,' *Journal of Communication*, 49(3), New York, pp. 84-105.
- Park, H. (1998) 'Can Business Ethic Be Taught? A New Model of Business Ethics Education,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 17(9/10), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel.
- Patnaik, P. (1977) 'Imperialism and the Growth of Indian Capitalism' in Owen, R. and Sutcliffe, B. (eds.) *Studies in the Theory of Imperialism*, London: Longman, pp. 210-229.
- Peltonen, T. (2000) 'Elite Because Alert? Ethics, Identity and Managerial Career,' *Second Connecting Learning and Critique Conference*, Lancaster University, pp. 403-18.
- Perkins, S., Kidd, V. and Smith, G. (1999) 'Service-Learning at the Graduate Level' in Droge, D. and Murphy, B.O. (eds.) *Voices of Strong Democracy: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Communication Studies*, Washington: American Association for Higher Education.
- Perriton, L. (2000) 'Verandah Discourses: Critical Management Education in Organizations,' *British Journal of Management*, 11(3), pp.227-37.
- Perriton, L. (2001) 'Sleeping With the Enemy? Exploiting the Textual Turn in Management Research,' *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 4(1), pp. 35-50.
- Peterson, M.P. (2001) 'The Balance of Trade in International Education: A New Model of Globalization,' *Vital Speeches of the Day*, 67(20), New York.
- Poole, R. (1996) *Morality and Modernity*, London: Routledge.
- Potter, J. and Wetherell, M. (1992) *Discourse and Social Psychology – Beyond Attitudes and Behaviour*, California: Sage.
- Prasad, A. and Cavanaugh, J.M. (1997), 'Ideology and demystification: Tom Peters and

the Managerial (Sub-)Text – An Experiential Exploration of Critique and Empowerment in the Management Classroom,' *Journal of Management Education*, 21(3) USA:

Thousand Oaks, pp. 309-25.

Prasad, A. and Prasad, P. (2002) 'The Coming of Age of Interpretive Organizational Research,' *Organizational Research Methods*, 5(1), Thousand Oaks, pp. 4-11.

Pring, R. (1998) 'Liberal Versus Functional Values in Higher Education' in Talati, J.J., Vellani, C.W., Herberg, P., Sutton, R.A.L., Qureshi, A.F., Pardhan, S. and Bacchus, K. (eds.) *Higher Education: A Pathway to Development*, Karachi: The Aga Khan and Oxford University Press.

Priyadharshini, E. (2000) 'A Critical Ethnography on the Production of the Indian MBA Discourse,' *Doctoral Thesis*, Lancaster University, UK.

Qureshi, I.H. (1975) *Education in Pakistan: An Inquiry into Objectives and Achievements*, Karachi: Ma'aref Ltd.

Qutb, M. (1979) 'The Role of Religion in Education' in Attas, S.M.N. (ed.) *Aims and Objectives of Islamic Education*, Jaddah, King AbdulAziz University, Hodder and Stoughton, pp. 48-62.

Ragin, C.C. and Becker, H.S. (2000) *What is a Case? Exploring the Foundations of Social Inquiry*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Rahman, A. (1980) *Economic Doctrines of Islam*, vol. 1, Lahore: Islamic Pub. Ltd.

Ralston, D., Holt, D., Terpstra, R.H. and Kai-Cheng, Y. (1997) 'The Impact of National Culture and Economic Ideology on Managerial Work Values: A Study of the United States, Russia, Japan and China,' *Journal of International Business Studies*, 28(1), p.177.

Rasid, M.Z.A. and Ho, J.A. (2003) 'Perception of Business Ethics in a Multicultural

Community: The Case of Malaysia,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 43(1/2), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, p. 75.

Reynolds, M. (1999) 'Grasping the Nettle: Possibilities and Pitfalls of a Critical Management Pedagogy,' *British Journal of Management*, 10(2).

Rice, Gillian. (1999a) 'Islamic Ethics and the Implications for Business,' *Journal of Business Ethics* 18(4), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel.

Rice, Guenon. (1999b) *The Crisis of the Modern World*, Lahore: Suhail Academy.

Robert, A.R. 'Orientalism, Misinformation and Islam' Source:

[http://www.muslim-answers.org /orientalism.htm](http://www.muslim-answers.org/orientalism.htm)

Roberts, J. (1996) 'Management Education and the Limits of Technical Rationality: The Conditions and Consequences of Management Practice' in French, R. and Grey, C. (eds.) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage, pp.54-75.

Rosenblatt, P.C. (2003) 'Interviewing at the Border of Fact and Fiction' in Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. (eds.) *Postmodern Interviewing*, Thousand Oaks: Sage, pp. 225-41.

Roy, A.K. and Roy, L.C. (2004) 'The Importance of Teaching Ethics' *Business and Economic Review*, 50(2) Columbia, p. 22.

Rynes, S.L. Trank, C.Q., Lawson, A.M. and Ilies, R. (2003) 'Behavioral Coursework in Business Education: Growing Evidence of a Legitimacy Crisis,' *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 2(3), pp. 269-83.

Saeed, M., Ahmed, Z. U. and Mukhtar, S. M. (2001) 'International marketing ethics from an Islamic perspective: A value-maximization approach,' *Journal of Business Ethics* 32(2), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel.

Said, E.W. (1993) *Culture and Imperialism*, London: Chatto and Windus.

- Said, E.W. (1994) *Culture and Imperialism*, London: Chatto and Windus.
- Said, E.W. (1991) *Orientalism*, London: Penguin.
- Said, E.W. (1995) *Orientalism*, London: Penguin.
- Sanchez, J. and Levine, E., 'Is Job-Analysis Dead, Misunderstood or Both?' in Kraut, A. I., and Korman, A.K. (eds.) (1999) *Evolving Practice in HRM: Responses to a Challenging World of Work*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Sandberg, J. (2000) 'Understanding Human Competence at Work: An Interpretive Approach,' *Academy of Management Journal*, 43(1), Mississippi State, pp. 9-25.
- Schatzman, L and Strauss, A.L. (1973) *Field Research – Strategies for a Natural Sociology*, New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Schein, E. H. (1992) *Organizational Culture and Leadership*, second edition, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Schneider, M. (2002) 'How an MBA Can Bend Your Mind' *Business Week*, New York, April 1, 2002, (3776), p.12.
- Schofield, J.W. (2002) 'Increasing the Generalizability of Qualitative Research' in Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P. (eds.) *Case Study Method*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage, pp. 69-97.
- Scholte, J.A. (2001) 'The Globalization of World Politics' in Baylis, J. and Smith, S. (eds.) *The Globalization of World Politics*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 413-33.
- Schumacher, E.F. (1973) *Small is Beautiful – Economics as if People Mattered*, New York: Harper and Row.
- Schumacher, E.F. (1997) 'Slenderest Knowledge,' *Enlightenment Magazine*, Science Issue, 11th issue, Spring-Summer, 1997.

- Schwandt, T.A. (1998) 'Constructivist, Interpretivist Approaches to Human Inquiry' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *The Landscape of Qualitative Research: Theories and Issues*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Segreto, L. (1998) 'Skeptics and Ungrateful Friends Versus Dreaming Social Engineers: The Italian Business Community, the Italian Government, the United States and the *Comitato Nazionale per la Produttività*' in Gourvish, T.R. and Tiratsoo, N. (eds.) *Missionaries and Managers: American Influences on European Management Education, 1945-60*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Shakir, Z. (1999) 'The Changing Face of Secularism and the Islamic Response' Source: www.masud.co.uk/ISLAM/misc/sec.htm, Aylesbury, England. Last accessed on March 13, 2006.
- Shirazi, Y.H. (undated) *Distortions in Pakistan Economy*, Karachi: Ferozesons.
- Sharifi, H. (1979) 'The Islamic as Opposed to Modern Philosophy of Education' in Attas, S.M.N. (ed) *Aims and Objectives of Islamic Education*, Jaddah: King AbdulAziz University, Hodder and Stoughton, pp. 76-88.
- Sherman, H. (2003) A review of 'Management Fads in Higher Education: Where they Come From, What They Do, Why They Fail,' *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 2(3).
- Shohat, E. (1996) 'Notes on the Post-Colonial' in Mongia, P. (ed.) *Contemporary Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, London: Arnold, pp. 321-34.
- Siddiqui, A.R. (2005) *Lift your hearts*, volume 2, Leicester: Islamic Foundation.
- Siddiqui, S.A. (2005) *Pakistan Studies*, Karachi: Commerce Pub.
- Silverman, D. (2000) *Doing Qualitative Research: A Practical Handbook*, London:

Thousand Oaks; California: Sage.

Sinclair, A. (1997) 'The MBA Through Women's Eyes: Learning and Pedagogy in Management Education,' *Management Learning*, 23(3), London: Sage, pp. 313-30.

Sirageldin, I. (1995) 'Islam, Society, and Economic Policy,' *Pakistan Development Review*, 34(4).

Siyal, W.B. (2006) *Mazameen-e-Zawqi*, Karachi: Mehfil-e-Zawqiyah.

Smith, S. (2001) 'Reflectivist and Constructivist Approaches to International Theory,' in Baylis, J. and Smith, S. (eds.) *The Globalization of World Politics*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Soukup, P. (1999) 'Service-Learning in Communication: Why?' in Droge, D. and Murphy, B.O. (eds) *Voices of Strong Democracy: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Communication Studies*, Washington: American Association for Higher Education.

Spivak, G.C (1988) 'Can the Subaltern Speak?' in Nelson, C. and Grossberg, L. (eds.) *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*, Hampshire and London: Macmillan, pp. 271-313.

Spivak, G.C. (1993) *Outside in the Teaching Machine*, London: Routledge.

Spivak, G. C. (1996) 'Poststructuralism, Marginality, Postcoloniality and Value' in Mongia, P. (ed) *Contemporary Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, London: Arnold, pp. 198-222.

Sridharan, R. (2005) 'The Essential Library: Management Books That Every Manager Ought To Read' *Business Today*, August 14, 2005, New Delhi, p. 142.

Stake, R. E. (1995) *The Art of Case Study Research*, California: Sage.

- Stake, R. E. (2000) 'Case Studies' in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y.S. (eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, second edition, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Stake, R., E. (2002) 'The Case Study Method in Social Inquiry' in Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P. (eds.) *Case Study Method*, London: Thousand Oaks; California: Sage.
- Stavenhagen, R. (1997) 'Decolonizing Applied Research' in Hammersley, M. (ed.) *Social Research: Philosophy, Politics and Practice*, California: Sage, pp. 52-63.
- Steingard, D.S. and Fitzgibbons, D.E. (1995) 'Challenging the Juggernaut of Globalization: A Manifesto for Academic Praxis,' *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 8(4), Bradford, pp. 30-54.
- Suchman, L. (2003) 'Affiliative Objects,' *paper presented at the Third Critical Management Studies Conference*, Lancaster University, July 2003.
- Sunderland, J. (2004) 'Using Videos,' *lecture handouts*, Lancaster University, February/March, 2004.
- Sutcliffe, B. (1977) 'Conclusion' in Owen, R. and Sutcliffe, B. (eds.) *Studies in the Theory of Imperialism*, London: Longman.
- Szyliowycz, J.S. (1995) 'Educational Methods' in Esposito, J. (ed.) *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Modern Islamic World*, New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 416-20.
- Tayeb, M. (1997) 'Islamic Revival in Asia and Human Resource Management,' *Employee Relations*, 19(4), Bradford.
- Tenbrunsel, A.E. (1998) 'Misrepresentation and Expectations of Misrepresentation in an Ethical Dilemma: The Role of Incentives and Temptation' *Academy of Management*

Journal, 41(3), Mississippi State, p. 330.

The Economist (2005) 'Business: The State of Denial That We're in: Face Value,'
January 15, 2005, 374(8409), p. 65.

The Economist (2004) 'But Can You Teach It?' May 20, 2004 Source:
http://www.economist.com/printedition/PrinterFriendly.cfm?Story_ID=2685892

Thomas, A. (1998) 'The Collapse of the American Management Mystique,' *Management Learning*, 29(2).

Thomas, A.B. and Anthony, P.D. (1996) 'Can Management Education Be Educational?'
in French, R. and Grey, C. (eds.) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage,
pp.17-35.

Thompson, C. and Tambyah, S.K. (1999) 'Trying To Be Cosmopolitan,' *Journal of Consumer Research* 26(3), Gainsville.

Tiratsoo, N. (1998) 'What You Need is a Harvard: The American Influence on British Management Education' in Gourvish, T.R. and Tiratsoo, N. (eds.) *Missionaries and Managers: American Influences on European Management Education, 1945-60*, Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1998.

Trethewey, A. (1999) 'Critical Organizational Communication: Theory, Feminist Research Methods and Service-Learning' in Droge, D. and Murphy, B.O. (eds.) *Voices of Strong Democracy: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Communication Studies*, Washington: American Association for Higher Education.

Vaughan, D. (2000) 'Theory Elaboration: The Heuristics of Case Analysis' in Ragin, C.C. and Becker, H.S. (eds.) *What is a Case? Exploring the foundations of Social Inquiry*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 173-202.

Verschoor, C.C. (2003) 'Is Ethics Education of Future Business Leaders Adequate?' *Strategic Finance*, 85(2), Montvale, p. 20.

Vince, R. (1996) 'Experiential Management Education as the Practice of Change,' in French, R. and Grey, C. (eds.) *Rethinking Management Education*, California: Sage, pp. 111-31.

Vu, U. (2004) 'MBA Programs Turning Out "Unqualified Elite"' *Canadian HR Reporter*, 17(14), Toronto, pp. 1-2.

Watson, T. (1994) 'Managing, Crafting and Researching: Words, Skill and Imagination in Shaping Management Research,' *British Journal of Management*, 5 (Special issue).

Watt, W.M. (1977) *Muhammad at Medina*, Oxford University Press.

Watt, W.M. (1981) *The Faith and Practice of Al-Ghazali*, Lahore: S.M. Ashraf.

Webb, E.J., Campbell, D, T., Schwarz, R.D. and Sechrest, L. (1977) 'The Use of Archival Sources in Social Research' in Bulmer, M. (ed.) *Sociological Research Methods*, London: Macmillan.

Weiss, R.M. (2000) 'Taking Science Out of Organization Science: How Would Postmodernism Reconstruct the Analysis of Organizations?' *Organization Science*, 11(6).

Westwood, R.I. and Kirkbride, P.S. (1998) 'International Strategies of Corporate Cultural Change: Emulation, Consumption and Hybridity,' *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, Bradford, 11(6), pp. 554-77.

Wieviorka, M. (2000) 'Case Studies: History or Sociology?' in Ragin, C.C. and Becker, H.S. (eds.) *What is a Case? Exploring the foundations of Social Inquiry*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Williams, O., F. (1993) 'Catholic Social Teaching: A Communitarian Democratic

Capitalism for the New World Order,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 12(12), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, pp. 919-32.

Williams, O.F. and Houck, J.W. (1982) *The Judeo-Christian Vision and the Modern Corporation*, Indiana and London: University of Notre Dame Press.

Wolfson, A. (1997) 'Individualism: New and Old,' *Public Interest*, Winter 1997, Iss.126, Washington, pp. 75-88.

Worden, S. (2003) 'The Role of Religious and Nationalist Ethics in Strategic Leadership: The Case of J. N. Tata,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 47, Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, pp. 147-64.

Yin, R. K (1994) *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, Applied Social Research Methods Series, volume 5, second edition, California: Sage.

Yin, R. K (2003a) *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, Applied Social Research Methods Series, volume 5, second edition, California: Sage.

Yin, R. K (2003b) *Applications of a Case Study Research*, Applied Social Research Methods Series, volume 34, second edition, California: Sage.

Young, R. (1995) *Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race*, London: Routledge.

Younis, T. (1993) 'An Overview of Contemporary Administrative Practices and Problems in the Arab World' *paper presented at Arab Management Conference*, Bradford, July 1993.

Zeffane, R. and Rugimbana, R. (1995) 'Management in the Less Developed Countries: A Review of Pertinent Issues, Challenges and Responses,' *Leadership and Organizational Development Journal*, Bradford, 16(8), pp. 26-36.

Zingales, L. (2006) 'Gods and Mammon,' in *Global Agenda* Source: www.globalagendamagazine.com/pdfs/2006/articles/zingales.pdf, pp. 228-9. Last accessed on March 7, 2006.

Zubairi, Y. (1989) 'The Principle of Intrinsic Opportunity: Its Role in Islamization of Scientific Development,' in Lodhi, M.A.K. (ed.) *Islamization of Attitudes and Practices in Science and Technology*, Herndon, Virginia: International Institute of Islamic Thought and Association of Muslim Scientists and Engineers.

Zych, J.M. (1999) 'Integrating Ethics Issues With Managerial Decision-Making in the Classroom: Product Support Program Decision,' *Journal of Business Ethics*, 18(3), Dordrecht, Holland; Boston: D. Reidel, p. 255.

Websites

www.2muslims.com Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

www.bilalphilips.com/abouthim/artic01e.htm Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

www.careerdynamo.com/asia-mba.html Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

www.pakpositive.com/2005/03/25/page/2/pakistan-per-capita-income-jumps-up-by-160/
Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

www.salaam.co.uk/themeofthefmonth/june02_index.php?|=25 Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

www.muslim-canadaorg/liberator.html Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

http://www.mountainoflight.co.uk/spiritual_hadith.html. Last accessed on March 23, 2006.

www.aasianst.org/absts/1995abst/southasi/sases131.htm. Last Last accessed on July 15

2006.

www.islamfortoday.com/mixedcultures.htm Last accessed on July 15, 2006.

Higher Education Commission (HEC), www.hec.gov.pk. Last accessed on July 14, 2006.

Institute of Business Administration, Karachi, www.iba.edu.pk Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

Lahore University of Management Sciences, Lahore, www.lums.edu.pk Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

Institute of Business Management, Karachi, www.cbm.edu.pk Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

Institute of Business Administration, Sukkur, www.iba-suk.edu.pk Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

Hamdard Institute of Management Science, Karachi www.hamdard.edu.pk/hims.html
Last accessed on March 13, 2006.

Bahria College, Islamabad, www.bci.edu.pk/bacs Last accessed on March 20, 2006.

College of Accounting and Management Science, Karachi, www.cams.edu.pk Last
accessed on March 13, 2006.

Preston Institute of Management Science and Technology, Karachi, www.pimsat-khi.edu.pk Last accessed on March 20, 2006.

School Publications

Leaders MBA Pamphlet

Leaders Case Research Centre (CRC) pamphlet

Leaders General Pamphlet

Leaders General Booklet

Leaders National Outreach Programme (NOP)

Leaders Alumni Annual 2003

Pioneer Program Announcement, 2004-5.

Leaders Student Handbook, 2004-5

Mohammad Ali Jinnah University, Prospectus 2004.